Liberal Globalization & Combating Terrorism

Krunoslav Antoliš

Terrorism, which is a global threat in the world today, can be efficiently combated only by organized movement principles. It opens the possibility to mobilize overall intellectual resources needed to create and implement the whole concept of efficient combating of terrorism. Terrorism cannot and must not become legal means to fight evolutional changes coming with liberal organization of the world, which on September 11, 2001 it definitely tried to be. Liberal globalization as a world trend will definitely undermine the existing relations in the world especially in anarcho-patriarchally established states. Yet, at the same time it is necessary to include all intellectual potential even through the NGO Think-Tank system of the same states, to create adaptable algorithms enabling evolutional transformation of the society. The goal is the benefit to all the people of the same states and not only minorities which mainly seized the power militarily and submitted it to their narrow interests presenting them at the same time, as national interests. More often than not, the minority's interests defined as national, undermined by unstoppable evolutional processes of liberal globalization result in terrorism encouraged not only by individuals and groups but, now it can be explicitly said by the state terrorism, as in the case of Iraq and unfortunately some other states of the same region which, for similar reasons support various sorts of terrorism. Creation of the system presented in this paper tries to establish pre-emptive mechanism enabling as painless evolutional transformations of today's world as possible, with the goal of implementing more honest and just world of tomorrow.

Key words: terrorism, liberal globalization, NGO, Think-Tank, cooperation, information exchange, pre-emptive prototype approach, momentary reaction.

1. Introduction

Giving my simplified interpretation of a quotation from one of the greatest books of the world wisdom the Bible, I will try to describe the situation in which the world has found itself under the threat of global terrorism and the approach that we should implement if we want to win that war.

"Keep awake, then, for you do not know on what day terrorists will come. Remember, if the householder had known at what time of night the burglar was coming, he would have stayed awake and not let his house be broken into. Hold yourselves ready, therefore, because the terrorists will come at the time you least expect him."

So, not to be caught unprepared, it is necessary to define our main global goal in combating terrorism: to research and build global permanently prepared pre-emptive GP3CT system of combating terrorism with efficient curative forces for multinational momentary reaction FM^R, based on the UN SC resolutions, especially Resolution 1373 (2001) brought by the UN SC at its 4385th session held on 28 September 2001, led by the partner who won the leadership in a competitive way. Some articles of the UN SC Resolution 1373, call nations and member states – partners of anti-terrorist movement to find the fashion how to exchange the information and coordinate their activities in combating terrorism as follows:
"...3. All states are called:
(a) to find a way to intensify and step up exchange of operative information,...
(b) to exchange information in accord with the international and national law and to cooperate in dealing with administrative and judicial issues in order to pre-empt terrorist acts;...
(c) to cooperate, especially through bilateral and multilateral arrangements and agreements,...
(d) to become parties of all valid international conventions and protocols referring to terrorism,...
(e) to intensify cooperation and comply with all valid international conventions and protocols referring to terrorism as well as the SC Resolutions 1269 (1999) and 1368 (2001);

2. Cooperation in combating terrorism

I regard the following issue as the greatest scientific, professional and even moral challenge to be considered today:

HOW PiP concept can support combating terrorism regarding GP3CT vision?

PiP Consortium mission to improve military and defense education and research through cooperation between institutions and nations and the idea to establish a common network of experts in the domain of defense and security studies in order to exchange practical achievements and solutions to standard challenges and problems is, I hold, facing a great test today. Its organizational and conceptual grounds, its practical application and efficiency in a particular task should be tested through a concrete project of combating terrorism. Totality of this project approach should result in the project achievements which, regarding its structure, include the following three levels: theoretical-conceptual, educational and operative-tactical. I think that the integration of PiP Consortium resources, primarily WG into such a joint task could give a new interoperable dimension to PiP Consortium. PiP Consortium needs this interoperable approach in order to work out and establish GP3CT system as much as the joint task is needed in integration and testing military forces, i.e. their training for the joint actions regarding concrete operations on a battlefield.

Primary challenge of the cooperation among PiP Consortium member states is gaining unity of efforts despite differences in culture, and seemingly rival interests and different priorities for some nations and national organizations trying to preserve their relative independence, freedom of actions and inseparability concerning the concept of combating terrorism. However, national organizations often lack either structure and resources needed to support working groups or advanced technology. In such environment and the lack of formal commanding relations, the future of joining resources in combating terrorism must be focused on improving communications, planning, interoperations and mutual cooperation with potential members within GPlCT system, especially in the context of direct threats to citizens and institutions of democratic states. Cooperation with high degree cohesion among PiP Consortium working groups (WG) is essential for working out theoretical and practical concept of detecting terrorism, defense from terrorism and structuring a suitable response to such future attacks. FM,R joint forces must be ready to give support to civil authorities by entirely integrated approach to meet the needs of citizens of each of the member states-partners in the anti-terrorist movement and achieve goals in combating terrorism, specified by the UN resolutions. It is necessary for all members states-partners of anti-terrorist coalition to have a unique information set which can contribute to relevant operational image and support unity in approach to action. Also, it is necessary to have a uniform need for information based on theoretical and operative concept to which primarily a development through joint multidisciplinary PiP Consortium project can contribute to combating terrorism. Information exchange among the members of anti-terrorist coalition and information integration of all sources is essential. Understanding the needs of others is also vital. It is important to develop, through training with potential member states-partners of anti-terrorist coalition, alliances to support permanent cooperation and work out common cooperation plans for crisis situation and define compatible processes and procedures. The above mentioned concept should not be based on the methods of making likely threat scenarios, so-called suppositions, which could divide interactions among the employed multinational forces in combating virtual terrorists but on practicing real procedure which could be applied in case of real terrorist threats. Interoperability in all domains of interaction is essential for cooperation among the member states-partners of anti-terrorist coalition with the final goal of obtaining efficient combating terrorism. Already spotted need for cooperation among
WG of PnP Consortium would be good to start with creating PnP Consortium project with the basic goal to analyze the problem of combating terrorism through theoretical, operational-tactical and educational dimensions. It would be good to start with essays and articles which, from the view of basic mission of PnP Consortium working group, offer scientific and expert response to the challenge of combating terrorism. Regarding the mission of particular PnP Consortium working groups, it would be necessary to divide them into two groups with respect to the kind of support. The first would be theoretical approach to the issue of combating terrorism, including civil and military relations and concrete consequences and suggestions, which could be analyzed and proposed regarding their mission in PnP Consortium, and combating terrorism. The other group of tasks would be support based on the results of some working groups like LMS of ADL WG and similar programs developed by the group for S&M or CD WG products, i.e. this group would include PnP Consortium working groups whose participation would be based on their back-up program for informatization of concrete tasks resulting from PnP Consortium combating terrorism. These tools could be used at courses for remote learning, for enabling and training units of FM,R type for joint actions in combating terrorism or in simulation prognostic methodology such as: “Development of methodology for risk assessment and early warning of terrorism-initiated political-security crises”\(^2\), which could be based on the results and parameters found out by research of the other group, namely, on the study of the remaining WG of PnP Consortium so that they can extrapolate models of behavior like “Development of simulations for modelling reactions on terrorism initiated crises”\(^4\), offering in that way efficient pre-emptive tools to combat terrorism.

As a result, combating terrorism project of PnP Consortium would make an educative platform for education of the members-partners of anti-terrorist movement to combat terrorism. The platform would be applied through theoretical education and supposition practice that would promote joint actions of the members-partners of anti-terrorist movement in combating terrorism entirely complying with the PnP Consortium mission.

Equally great cooperation challenge is created by PnP Consortium vision imposing demand for joint expert network in the field of defense and security studies in order to exchange practical achievements and solutions to usual challenges and problems. The vision includes governmental and, more importantly, non-governmental organizations whose teams or experts in combating terrorism can join the above mentioned expert network of organizations and individuals.

Why is such importance given to NGOs in theoretical analyses of combating terrorism?

This is issue of great importance since, for example, in transitional states, for many reasons, unfortunately only a minor intellectual potential of the state is included in the government system which would be necessary and useful to include in building theory and analysis of the combating terrorism. Basic problem still present in most of these states is that western democracy concept is taken over and implemented by copy-paste method, without taking into account the necessary prerequisites having been built in the western states for many past decades. Democratic tradition is based on three grounds: legislative, executive and judiciary taken over by transitional states is questionable from the point of efficiency for two important reasons. Unlike western democracies where the conditions for this three-pillar approach had been met before it was established, democracies in transitional states have established western-type formal structures but without previously making prerequisites, objective evaluation of political selection, public impact on decision making and non-governmental organizations in public input. To make the concept of authorities acceptable and fair in practice as it is in western states, it should be enlarged with two more pillars, i.e. the pillar of independent press and media and the pillar of policy based on knowledge. Independent press and media would promote and support democratic values, encourage political commitment of the public in creating policy and secure credibility of the government. The pillar of knowledge-based policy creates a policy grounded on objective analyses, enables independent political infrastructural analyses and “Think Tanks” as a part of political expression and analyses making along with the previous three pillars a new five-pillar concept of democracy which becomes acceptable. How is five-pillar-concept based democracy related to establishment of legal system for sanctioning terrorism and terrorists, will be illustrated in the following example. Legal changes within the existing legislation regarding terrorism and terrorists, must be made in accordance with the constitution-defined government authority. Changes in national legislation to achieve balance between freedom and security should include legal frame including all relevant components of government.
Law on combating terrorism will be a basis to achieve efficient change in making balance between freedom and security as long as it protects civil rights. Legal standards of civilized nations must be taken into account and changes should include all relevant parts of government: legislative part to make a new law supported by citizens, executive part to enforce new laws and finally, judiciary to supervise and decide if the new laws observe the human right standards and civil freedom and if they are fairly interpreted and acceptable. Above all, any legal change imposed by terrorism, must be made known to public in order to be discussed and analyzed. Independent and free press is of vital importance to monitor the changes to influence the public opinion and establish public trust that the change is a judicial procedure in accordance with legal standards both domestic and international, for instance: to adjust to European Court for Human Rights or in the case of the USA with the US Constitution.

This law will also define, preserve and protect special roles of the following parts of society: legislation, administration, executive authority, courts, citizens and press².

3. Global Think Tank Network for Combating Terrorism & GP²CT Vision

Regarding global experience and organised combat against terrorism especially the United Nations (UN) and the Office for Drug Control and Crime Prevention (ODCCP) as well as some organisational Global Think-tank Network for Combating Terrorism (GTTN for CT) concepts, I am trying to structure organisational forms and relations to enable involvement of all available scientific potential in combating terrorism. In transitional states, the role of experts who can and want to deal with this issue is, unfortunately, still politically determined so that theoretical study of this issue is still a privilege of the scientists loyal to the ruling party as their members or to the group of politicians who claim their right to judge on terrorism from the view of their current policy interest. Concepts which could organize independent experts, non-governmental teams and independent institutes dealt with as a solution, are significant contribution in creating a scientific basis necessary for further development of theory of systematic anti terrorist combat. The present situation in Croatia, for example, might be attributed to the fact that the governing coalition is very week while facing a lot of problems. A lot of sometimes-unfair opposition from the MPs belonging to previous government and from the servants and bureaucracy, who remained in the office even after their party lost power. They are still in position to sabotage any steps towards transparency and accountability. That is why the problem of correct auditing came up linked with the problem of judiciary as well. There are some encouraging signs but more from the part of media than from the part of civil society, especially NGOs. That refers more to judiciary devastated during the previous government, which replaced relevant experts with party eligible judges, whose expertise was not on an appropriate level. All these provoked high level of general uncertainty among politicians, especially those who are in charge of dealing with so sensitive sectors as security sector and combating terrorism. In some other circumstances, perhaps in some other countries, which are not encumbered with such legacy, some non-governmental interest groups, NGO’s or some other institutions of civil society – can provide some mediating backing. The assistance of the better-educated journalists would also be beneficial. As it was illustrated beforehand, such a possibility is rather meek to the written than to the electronic media. There are indications that in some newspapers, which are more or less independent, some competent experts are able to analyse combating terrorism problems taking into account all their sensitivity. On the other hand there are less hints that some new NGO’s, capable of dealing with this issue, will be promoted. For the conclusion, it is not very likely, at least at the moment, that civil society in Croatia is qualified enough and positioned to serve as a supporter or relevant partner in addressing all these problems. Southeast Europe has a shortage of institutions that can perform CT Policy research and analysis. CT Policy makers make decisions without proper analysis. One of the biggest problems in CT policy formulation in emerging states is the lack of tradition of value placed on objective analysis. Due to this lack of analysis, decisions are too often based on a general sensing of what is to be done rather than on detailed analysis. Government turnover further complicates the role of think tanks! Many strategic decisions have been done in a “shoot from the hip” manner. This makes failure avoidance methodology more important than formal searching for optimal solutions. Current government culture and falling funding are the main threats to establishment and survival of think tanks in the newly emerging democracies. Regional stability and security must be
self sustaining and cannot depend only on external stabilizing mechanisms (such as peace keeping) indefinitely. Rather, this depends on developing internal and regional think tanks to ensure the governments develop the needed competence to solve and resolve internal and regional CT problems with international cooperation.

Regarding the above mentioned, I hold that only organization of Global Think Tank Network for Combating Terrorism (GTTN for CT) of all member states-partners of anti-terrorist movement could make the necessary organizational minimum which could serve as a basis for scientific and expert team work on the issue of combating terrorism. With the TT for CT approach, each member states-partners of anti-terrorist movement would take responsibility of a particular state concerning the world project dealing with CT, i.e., of scientists, experts, logistic needed to carry on with the project and within the project coordination, both in a particular state and with the member states-partners working on the joint projects which would take part with their teams in the afore mentioned projects. In accordance with their capacities, i.e., intellectual and other resources, any of the local TT for CT of the member states-partners, would, depending on their interests, intellectual capacities and other resources, recognize CT projects of its interest, nominate itself to take over those for which it would fight on equal terms with other scientists and experts as partners interested in TT for CT from all GTTN for CT. This approach, could enable TT for CT of the member states-partners to be given a leading role in some projects entirely or partly, or to be coordinators in carrying out some projects or finally, to participate in project implementation as team members. The work of GTTN for CT and projects in the CT domain for all anti-terrorist movement would be coordinated generally by CT WG of PFP Consortium making in that manner scientific and expert foundation to study combating terrorism. The foundation would help in making curriculum as a basis for uniform education of high-ranking officials of the member states-partners while concrete software-aided prognostic models developed through this cooperation, would have important place in operative pre-emption of unwanted situations throughout the world, contributing in the best possible manner to combating terrorism. Results of the projects would encourage the member states-partners to practice according to given scenarios of possible threats, so-called suppositions, organizing and training joint operations in combating terrorism. Scientific results of combating terrorism projects could serve as propositions and bases in defining international criteria, conventions and new resolutions which should be more precisely observed by the member states-partners of anti-terrorist movement, making a larger space for wide international action to combat terrorism in the world. CT WG of PFP Consortium would encourage and coordinate work of international conferences to follow particular projects in combating terrorism aimed at promoting and evaluating the obtained results and their wider legal and official acceptance through international conventions and then coordinate implementation of the agreement.

4. Information exchange

After making organizational and communication prerequisites based on GTTN for CT and explicating the vision to research and develop GPICT system with efficient FM,R, based on the UN SC resolutions and international convention referring to CT led by the authorized partner, we can hold that we have made prerequisites to create infrastructure basis necessary for analytic discussions. The information exchange problem concerning the mission and vision of PFP Consortium and building GPICT system represents the problem of defining uniform data set in each of the CT sub-domains separately that will be structured through multidisciplinary projects aimed at researching and analyzing the CT sub-domains within WG of PFP Consortium or with reference to GTTN for CT.

Such uniform data set on CT is necessary to the anti-terrorist movement to structure protocol, conventions and resolutions in the CT domain. I hold that separate approach dealing with structuring bilateral/multilateral agreements on information exchange is not suitable at the moment as it would have only a limited success.

There are many reasons for that. Modest success in the field so far indicates a lot of problems following the process. Yet, I think that uniform parameters in the CT domain would be high quality and necessary structural prerequisites solving a number of dilemmas such as: what issues can be considered when making bilateral / multilateral agreements on information exchange, which data and information should be monitored regarding terror-
ism and therefore secured for exchange. Currently, not all domains referring to CT have been clearly defined, structured and given parameters, which is the first thing to be done. Therefore, regarding information exchange, the objective goals to be achieved in the period ahead are as follows: setting uniform criteria in approach to CT sub-domains, uniform set of data classes giving parameters for each of the CT domains, parameters of data prerequisites for building and structuring strategic information center for combating terrorism.

I think that only by accepting this approach the results of project research and analyses will be relevant data-aided information which enable scientific and expert analysis of the information exchange issue and their exchange through defined infrastructural network based on agreed protocol of bilateral/multilateral cooperation.

Data structures determining a multidisciplinary field like terrorism is hard to be structured and monitored and I hold that the problem should be approached concerning the following:

- data classes implicitly and explicitly determined by Resolution 1373,
- data classes as a result of tasks within CT WG of PpP Consortium data classes coming out of the domains of the remaining WG of PpP Consortium

By the set cross-section of the mentioned classes it is possible to define database class model which can be given parameters and semantically analyzed to make information data that can be used as a database. Only then we can speak about information and data exchange as the means of combating terrorism.

Already established data bases systems monitor criminals-terrorists and criminal-terrorist behavior, their networks connecting them with criminal-terrorists acts. Regarding structuring information support for combating terrorism, the data that have been collected for long and will continue to be collected in the future by usual procedures and actions, are extremely valuable. Yet, new theoretical researches which, due to new threats, have just started, generate numerous new parameters which should be incorporated in data bases when likely terrorist threats are to be assessed. The field being researched within the project team in Croatia is biological warfare agents (human, animal and plant pathogens, toxins, vectors, pests and bioregulators as biological terrorism agents). This example is presented by prototype methodology, i.e. by the method of example which should be applied in other fields yet to be structured and interesting to be analyzed from the point of terrorist threats or cause and effect connection with terrorist threats.

5. Croatia’s model – combating biological terrorism

Many human, animal and plant pathogens, toxins, bioregulators, vectors and pests can be used as terrorism and warfare biological agents and cause illness. All of that shows that it is very hard to make a final decision on criteria and the final list of the molecular agents (bioregulators) for the needs of future Protocol to the BTWC based on these criteria.

Therefore, this paper proposes that lists and criteria for human, animal and plant pathogens, toxins, bioregulators, vectors and pests, should be well studied and that an opinion by scientists and experts should be obtained, because the lists should be scientifically based.

Although many human, animal and plant pathogens, toxins, bioregulators, vectors and pests can be used to cause illness, they can truly threaten civilian population on a large scale. If released upon civilian population, these agents would pose the most significant challenge for public health and medical responses.

The criteria for ranking potential human, animal and plant pathogens, toxins, bioregulators, vectors and pests and listing those of greatest public health concern could be used for determination of priority biological threat agents for national public health preparedness efforts for bio-terrorism.

Having a defined method for evaluating biological threat agents allows for a more objective evaluation of newly emerging potential threat agents, as well as continued re-evaluation of established threat agents. Using this prioritisation method can help focus public health activities related to bio-terrorism detection and response and assist with the allocation of limited public health resources.

Transmissible animal diseases classified under A and B List have the potential for very serious and rapid spread, irrespective of national borders which are of serious socio-economic or public health consequence and which are of major importance in the international trade of animals and animal products. Those transboundary animal diseases are of sig-
significant economic, trade and security importance. This method of evaluation can help focus public health activities, agriculture activities related to bioterrorism detection and response.

Equally important problem is to define and structure the set of criteria parameters, that can be recognized as the means of biological warfare, i.e.: Human pathogens (viruses, bacteria, rickettsiae, protozoa and fungi), Toxins, Bioregulators, Animal pathogens (Viruses, Bacteria, Mycoplasmas), Plant pathogens (Fungi, Bacteria, Viruses), Vectors, Pests.

The next step was to make the lists successively, in accordance with the mentioned criteria, i.e.: Human pathogens (viruses, bacteria, rickettsiae, protozoa and fungi), Toxins, Bioregulators, Animal pathogens (Viruses, Bacteria, Mycoplasmas), Plant pathogens (Fungi, Bacteria, Viruses), Vectors, Pests, the list of terrorist agents.

Finally, the Table is created showing the results of final researches based on the tables from:

Human pathogens (viruses) assessment according to criteria for selecting pathogens as biological terrorism agents. Human pathogens (bacteria, rickettsiae, protozoa and fungi) assessment according to criteria for selecting pathogens as biological terrorism agents. Toxin assessment according to criteria for selecting toxins as terrorism agents. Animal pathogens assessment according to criteria for selecting pathogens as terrorism and warfare agents. Plant pathogens assessment according to criteria for selecting pathogens as terrorism and warfare agents. Vectors assessment according to criteria for selecting as terrorism and warfare agents. Pests assessment according to criteria for selecting as terrorism and warfare agents. Bioregulator assessment according to criteria for selecting bioregulators as terrorism agents.

Presented and worked out by the method of prototype, the general task points out to a very efficient fashion of giving parameters of the problem that can be explicitly connected with likely terrorist threats.

Project results of Croatia’s research team have helped several times so far with passing some international conventions and we hope to contribute to the passing of the future conventions and protocols of BTWC and similar ones.

Project team that worked out and carried out project tasks in this field takes part and presents Croatia in a number of international organizations whose goal is to establish conventions and similar protocols in order to monitor and pre-empt abuse of anything in this domain that can threaten humanity. To promote their results and assess them scientifically, Croatia’s project team has already presented their works and projects at organized conferences (two international so far and the third to be held this year) and numerous workshops such as: conference CBRMTS – Industry III: “The Second World Congress on Chemical, Biological and Radiological Terrorism”, in Dubrovnik, Croatia, from 7-12 September 2003.

Methodology of approach and general knowledge in CBRMTS field is valuable contribution of Croatia to combating terrorism regarding that domain. In the next period, work on the project will continue along with very intensive work on implementation of the knowledge into teaching program. If cooperation with PfP Consortium via CT WG is established, expert coerces could be organized to teach about terrorist threats and protection from biological terrorism.

6. Conclusion

This paper deals with modular structuring and builds GTTN for CT system analyzing it as a communication form and starting prerequisites in CT. It explicates the vision aimed at research and development of GPlCT system with efficient curative FM,R based on the UN SC resolutions and international conventions from CT domain led by the partner who won the leadership in a competitive way.

Concerning the information exchange in the period ahead, the paper outlines and suggests the following goals: setting up a unique criteria approach for each of CT sub-domains, determining a unique data set of data class which gives parameters for each of CT domains making in that fashion data prerequisite for building and structuring strategic information system for combating terrorism.

The proposed methodology is based on the principle of prototype aided by concrete example taken from a very interesting CT domain – biological terrorism. Project approach applied in case of Croatia is very illustrative, scientifically and professionally based, which can transparently show how to implement proposed methodology and the results that can be expected and obtained on operative-tactical and educational level if complied with the proposed methodology.
NOTES

1 All statements made in this article are solely those of the author and in no way reflect the official positions or policies of the Republic of Croatia, Croatia's Government or Ministry of defence.


6 Elisabeth Rindskopf-Parker: Legal issues and cooperation: Legal lessons from the first Year of GWOT, Conference: Countering Terrorism in Southeast Europe: Future Directions in SEDAM Cooperation, 8-13 December, 2002, Garmish Parten Kirhen, Germany.


8 Slavko Bokan, Biological warfare agents (human, animal and plant pathogens) toxins, vectors, pests and bioregulators as biological terrorism agents, “The Second World Congress on Chemical, Biological and Radiological Terrorism”, in Dubrovnik, Croatia, from 7-12 September 2003.


BIBLIOGRAPHY


S. Bokan: Biological warfare agents (human, animal and plant pathogens) toxins, vectors, pests and bioregulators as biological terrorism agents, “The Second World Congress on Chemical, Biological and Radiological Terrorism”, Dubrovnik, Croatia, from 7-12 September 2003.


Elisabeth Rindskopf-Parker: Legal issues and cooperation: Legal lessons from the first Year of GWOT, Conference: Countering Terrorism in Southeast Europe: Future Directions in SEDAM Cooperation, 8-13 December, 2002, Garmish Parten Kirhen, Germany.