Differences in Opinion about the Type of Education Necessary to Implement Music Teaching in View of Song Teaching Variants

Tamara Jurkić Sviben¹ and Nikola Margetić²
¹Faculty of Teacher Education, University of Zagreb, ²4th Primary School Bjelovar

Abstract

Within the Croatian education system there is a great awareness of the need for quality education of future teachers and of the need to continually enforce teachers’ competencies. The actual implementation of music education shows quite a different and uneven quality of work in music classes. This research aims to investigate the teachers’ opinions regarding different possibilities of teaching songs within music classes in relation to the education required for 1st to 4th grade primary school teachers. The assumption is that those teachers who introduce songs in class by playing it on an instrument would state that an additional music education would be needed to manage music classes (subject teacher education), whereas those teachers who introduce songs by mere mechanical reproduction would state the opposite. The research was conducted on a group of 160 teachers by using a questionnaire with a Likert scale, and for testing the difference a t-test was used. As a result, the initial hypothesis was rejected and it was concluded that far more of those teachers who do not introduce songs by playing them on some instrument deemed that an additional music education (subject teacher education) for primary school 1st to 4th grade teachers is necessary than those who do. The situation demonstrates the need for continuous systematic work on strengthening teachers’ competencies in the area of music teaching.

Key words: music education; music lessons; song teaching variants; teacher competencies
Introduction

The influence of the elements of music on human beings was acknowledged already among the peoples of ancient civilisations. In his Politics Aristotle argued that “music conduces to virtue” because it has “also some influence over the character and the soul. It must have such an influence if characters are affected by it. And that they are so affected is proved in many ways, and not least by the power which the songs of Olympus exercise; for beyond question they inspire enthusiasm, and enthusiasm is an emotion of the ethical part of the soul.” (Aristotle, 2000, b. VIII., para. 5). In his work Tuksar (1978, p. 100) traces this traditional belief in Croatia by tracing the educational function of music back to the sixteenth century, more precisely, to the work of the Dubrovnik humanist Nikola Vitov Gučetić who, in his Dello stato delle Repubbliche, says: “Children are not taught music primarily for amusement and refreshment of the soul, which they should not even know, instead they are taught music for what they will be doing in the years to come...” (Tuksar 1978, p. 103). Additionally, analysing the influence of Aristotle’s ideas on Gučetić, Tuksar concludes “that an appeal was made (already in Croatian renaissance, A/N) that music education be so conducted that the youth can be taught to play music and sing, as well as to participate in musical performances to an extent” (1978, p. 104).

In order to introduce the art of music to present-day children through music, a modern teacher is expected to possess the knowledge of musical elements and methodological procedures required to raise and educate future devotees of culture and this type of art by employing music and with music itself.

In the Republic of Croatia and at the Faculties of Teacher Education at Croatian universities, there is a great awareness of the need for quality education of future teachers who are a backbone of education, as well as formation of new generations of young Croatians.

The design of the curriculum, including the National Curriculum Framework, “constitutes a complex and time-consuming process that implies a permanent evaluation and self-evaluation of the course of education for those who learn and those who teach, and a constant connection between education policy and science and education practice” (NCF 2011, p. 10).²

It was precisely this principle of permanent evaluation and self-evaluation of the course of education of those who learn and those who teach music education that motivates this research, as we are attempting to see whether there is a difference

---

¹ The translations of the Croatian/Italian originals were made for the purpose of this article, unless otherwise indicated.
² This as well as all subsequent translations of paragraphs from the National Curriculum Framework are taken from the official translation published at the web page of the Croatian Ministry of Science, Education and Sports. See Literature below.
in opinions about the education required to teach music classes between teachers depending on the applied method of song teaching in music classes.

The National Curriculum Framework attributes great importance to the art area because the “purpose of art is to improve students’ understanding of art and their active response to art by participation. Students will learn to see and understand themselves and the world through works of art, as well as how to use art to express their feelings, experiences, ideas and attitudes” (NCF 2011, p. 153).

In order for students to be able to “master elements of musical art and musical creation", according to the NCF (2011, p 156), they should have well educated and competent teachers.

**Education of Class Teachers for Music Teaching**

According to Svalina-Škojo (2009), music can be taught in primary schools in accordance with the approach formulated in the new curriculum, provided great attention is devoted to practical engagement with music and the introduction of music itself in the music education of future teachers. Students can be given a quality introduction into various music activities only if the teachers themselves have acquired certain musical skills.

In teaching practice, in lower grades of primary school music education is conducted by class teachers; the task of music teaching from the fourth grade onwards may be taken over by subject teachers, according to the National Educational Standard for Primary Schools (NESPS, 2006).

Whether fourth-graders are to be taught music by a class teacher or a subject teacher is a decision to be made by the principal, based on the weekly workload of his or her teachers. The freedom of choice as to who is to teach music in the fourth grade leads to a situation whereby neighbouring schools in the same town have differing practices. In one, fourth-graders are taught music by a subject teacher, and in the other, by a class teacher. The question is whether class teachers feel competent enough to teach fourth-graders music, or they prefer to leave the task to subject teachers.

The curriculum of the Faculty of Teacher Education makes sure that future teachers acquire competencies required to prepare them well for professional development and the enhancement of their teaching competencies. According to Svalina-Škojo, “in order to acquire competencies for music teaching, students should actively participate in the following activities: listening and introduction of music, singing, playing music, rhythm and melody improvisations, and performing music games” (2009, p. 71).

**Teachers’ Active Music-Making**

Since music teaching places musical activity at the centre, all musical knowledge needs to come from music itself, be it reproduced from a CD, or some other form of active music-making. Active music-making denotes a musically active teacher who encourages music activity in students in a quality manner. In addition to competencies
of listening, introduction of music, and singing, according to Svalina-Škojo, “future teachers should learn to play music because working with children they will often have to accompany the children’s singing by playing a harmony musical instrument (for example, a piano, a guitar, or a synthesizer)” (2009, p. 72).

In all of his or her activities a teacher should provide a model example; all that is undertaken in the educational process should be performed as conscientiously as possible, and to the best of his or her abilities. Playing music in music classes presupposes well practiced music-playing skills.

At the Faculties of Teacher Education in the Republic of Croatia students are instructed in music playing which enables their harmonic accompaniment of either their own, or children’s singing, in courses under various names (Music playing, Music practicum, Instrument, etc.) during either three or four semesters, depending on respective curricula.

**Methodological Aspects of Music Teaching**

Theory of teaching methods in the art fields incorporates a number of communication methods and methodological procedures. Methods implemented by Sam (1998) in the educational process of preschool children are applicable to teaching music in class teaching. A child (a pupil, A/N) experiences a song through listening, singing, music playing and movement. Those are the visible, that is, external activities, performed by a pupil - receiver in the educational process. Experience, perception, thinking and imagination are internal activities, i.e. activities that cannot be externally perceived. Both external and internal aspects of experience are intertwined in the musical process, having a strong influence on one another. According to Sam (1998, p. 64), the interaction between external and internal activities in a music situation generates the reception method. In the reception method, methodological procedures enable a teacher to express his or her skill in mediating a piece of music. In an actual situation, in the classroom, a teacher’s competencies can be fully realised only when his or her musical reception reveals two levels: the ability in reproducing music, which includes singing and music playing, and the knowledge of the basics of music theory, music in the historical context, introduction to music aesthetics, the basics of aesthetic communication, developmental psychology, general educational principles, and procedures of the methodology of music teaching (Sam 1998, p. 64). The teacher’s competency, and his or her singing and playing skills are of supreme importance in the quality mediation of a piece of music.

**Song Teaching Method**

The current open principle in music teaching enables the use of different teaching aids, including a musical instrument for harmony accompaniment (piano, keyboard, guitar), a sound recording medium with musical versions of the songs included in the textbook, as well as different multimedia.

Rojko (2004, p. 148) points out that
“in the first phase, when a song is taught by rote, introduction of a song refers primarily to the introduction of a melody. To this end a teacher shall nicely, with expression, sing the whole song accompanying him/herself on an instrument. Following this option, instead of the teacher singing, a song can be introduced via a recording, or, as a third option, it can be only played on an instrument”.

Rojko (2008) singles out the first option as the best, while the third option is the least preferable solution. Thus, ideally, teachers should sing out the whole song with expression, accompanying themselves on an instrument.

Students at the Faculties of Teacher Education are educated in singing and music playing; however, teaching practice reveals great differences in the method of song introduction.

At this point it is worthwhile to draw attention to the use of musical instruments in Slovenia. In their research Črčinovič Rozman and Kovačič (2008) point out that the use of keyboard in song introduction is the second most used teaching aid, following a CD player commonly used by students, i.e. future teachers. The authors also draw attention to the fact that Slovene students use the keyboard for song introduction, accompaniment and intonation. The use of the keyboard is closely related to, and depends on the subject matter to be introduced; however, according to Črčinovič Rozman and Kovačič (2008), the keyboard should always be there for the teacher to use and practice on. The above given information evidently reveals that in Slovenia, in spite of a great effort invested in the promotion of contemporary mechanical and multimedia teaching aids, the use of a musical instrument in music teaching is still accentuated.

In song teaching in music classes, the reproduction of a song poses numerous musical, aesthetic and creative demands before a teacher (cf. Sam 1998, p. 68). Musical demands, in addition to immaculate interpretation, that is singing in pitch, in appropriate tempo, with a feeling for rhythm, dynamics, and agogics, include also harmonic accompaniment of singing (on a piano or keyboard), or accompaniment on percussion instruments (rhythmic or melodic). A teacher should also communicate aesthetic value to the pupils/children with his or her performance, which comes as a result of the experience of music and content, as well as the emphatic interpretation of the teacher. Teachers should prepare themselves well for the mediation of music and communication of its aesthetic value. In addition to the musical elements, a child/pupil is influenced by the quality of teacher’s mediation, his or her competency and interpretation skill (cf. Sam 1998, p. 69).

It is evident from the above that in order to be able to teach music classes properly, a teacher must have quality music education which includes a background in music theory, enabling him or her to analyse and understand musical and theoretical elements of children’s songs included in the curriculum for the lower grades of primary school, and he or she should also be skilled in playing a tune with harmonic accompaniment on either a keyboard or a guitar.
In higher education in the Republic of Croatia there is a great awareness of the need to enforce teachers’ competencies. However, in the actual teaching practice we do not always come across such great awareness of teachers as mediators in the teaching process that their music education is, in fact, one of the highly important characteristics of a competent teacher. The research which follows reveals different opinions of teachers related to music teaching and to the competencies required from them.

**Research Aim and Problem**

The aim of this research was to examine opinions about the required education to perform song teaching depending on preferred method of song teaching, using either a musical instrument or a mechanical reproduction. The problem studied in this research was to see if there are any differences in opinion about the required education for teaching music classes considering the applied method of song teaching.

**Hypothesis**

The hypothesis tested in this article is that the teachers teaching songs by playing an instrument will believe that additional music education (subject teacher education) is necessary to teach music classes, while those who teach songs using mechanical reproduction will deem it unnecessary.

Class teachers teaching songs by playing an instrument will believe that education of subject teachers is necessary to teach music classes, because subject teachers use an instrument to teach songs (Brdarić, 1986; Požgaj, 1988), while teachers teaching songs aided by a mechanical reproduction will deem it unnecessary since they teach songs differently from subject teachers.

**Methodology**

**Sample and Tools**

One hundred and sixty class teachers participated in the research. The sample is appropriate since the participant schools were those of the Bjelovar-Bilogora County (the respondents were from both central and regional schools).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary School</th>
<th>No. of teachers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>III PS Bjelovar</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Berek</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Čazma</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Đulovac</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Garešnica</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Ivanska</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Mate Lovraka Veliki Grđevac</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary School</th>
<th>No. of teachers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PS Mirka Pereša Kapela</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Nova Rača</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Sirač</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Štefanje</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Trnovitički Popovac</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Velika Pisanica</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Veliko Trojstvo</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. List of primary schools included in the research

The questionnaire was based on the study of relevant literature (Požgaj, 1988; Brdarić, 1986; Rojko, 2004) and years-long experience in music teaching. The
questions used in this research are a part of longer questionnaire used in a research for master’s degree (Margetić, 2010). The part of questionnaire used in this paper has two contentions relevant for the examination of teachers’ opinions, and two contentions regarding the method of song teaching.

The task of the respondents was to express the level of their agreement with each contention on the Likert scale. The meaning of numbers was given at the beginning of the questionnaire; below each contention a scale of 1 to 5 was offered with respective descriptions of the meanings of each end of the scale (1 – I strongly disagree; 5 – I strongly agree). Respondents were instructed to check only one number.

The teachers completed the questionnaire in about ten minutes. At the beginning of the examination, teachers were informed about the purpose of this research. Also, anonymity of data was guaranteed.

Table 2. Frequencies of responses - opinions about teaching music classes and preferred method of song teaching 
(N = 160)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>I strongly disagree</th>
<th>I disagree</th>
<th>I do not know</th>
<th>I agree</th>
<th>I strongly agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the 4th grade of primary school</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>music classes should be taught by</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>15.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>subject teachers exclusively.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject teacher should teach music</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>classes from the 1st grade of primary</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>32.9</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>school.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When teaching songs in music classes I</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mostly do it using a musical instrument.</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>17.8</td>
<td>27.6</td>
<td>23.0</td>
<td>21.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When teaching songs in music classes I</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mostly do it using mechanical</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>55.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demonstration.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 reveals that 65.1% of class teachers “strongly agree” with the contention that “In the 4th grade of primary school music classes should be taught by subject teachers exclusively” while only 7.6% of them “strongly agree” with the contention that “Subject teacher should teach music classes from the 1st grade of primary school.” Most teachers disagree with the opinion that a subject teacher should teach music from the first grade of primary school (Table 2). The bottom two contentions relate to the method of song teaching in music classes. Most teachers teach songs using mechanical demonstration, not a musical instrument (Table 2). In relation to other contentions, the greatest number of teachers either “does not know” or disagrees with the contention “When teaching songs in music classes I mostly do it using a musical instrument” (23%).
Table 3. Overview of descriptive data of the opinions about teaching music classes and preferred method of song teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>Max</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the 4th grade of primary school music classes should be taught by subject teachers exclusively.</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>1.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject teacher should teach music classes from the 1st grade of primary school.</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>1.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When teaching songs in music classes I mostly do it using a musical instrument.</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>1.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When teaching songs in music classes I mostly do it using mechanical demonstration.</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>1.04</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Examination Whether There Is a Difference in Opinion about the Education Required to Teach Music Classes Considering the Method of Song Teaching

In order to deal with the issue we have devised additional independent variables because the used questions were not appropriate to investigate the frequency of the applied method. In this way some of the respondents were excluded from the research (41 for the first independent variable and 5 in the second one), but this was the most appropriate way to transform the existing variables.

The variable “Teaching songs using a musical instrument” was, instead of into five categories, this time divided into only two: “YES” and “NO”. The “YES” variable encompassed respondents who selected “I agree” or “I strongly agree” with the variable “Teaching songs using a musical instrument.” The “NO” variable encompassed the respondents who selected “I disagree” or “I strongly disagree” for the variable “Teaching songs using a musical instrument.” The respondents who selected “I do not know” or “I am not sure” responding to the “Teaching songs using a musical instrument” variable were not taken into consideration in the statistical data processing because we are not sure what they meant when choosing that answer.

The variable “Teaching songs using mechanical demonstration” was also divided into two above mentioned “YES” and “NO” categories. The “YES” variable encompassed respondents who selected “I agree” or “I strongly agree” for the variable “Teaching songs using mechanical demonstration.” The “NO” variable encompassed the respondents who selected “I disagree” or “I strongly disagree” for the variable “Teaching songs using mechanical demonstration”. The respondents who selected “I do not know” or “I am not sure” responding to the “Teaching songs using mechanical demonstration” variable were not taken into consideration in the statistical data processing because we are not sure what they meant when choosing that answer.

Frequencies of the two additional variables are given in the figures below. Figure 1 reveals a negative distribution of teachers with regard to the method of song teaching with a musical instrument. This means that a greater number of teachers did not use a musical instrument when teaching songs (N=69).
Forty-eight class teachers who teach songs using a musical instrument participated in the research.

Figure 2 reveals a positive distribution of teachers with regard to the method of song teaching using a mechanical demonstration.

This means that a greater number of teachers teach songs using mechanical demonstration (N=125). Twenty-three class teachers who teach songs using mechanical demonstration participated in the research.

In order to test our hypothesis and determine if there is a difference in opinion about the education required to teach music classes in view of the method of song teaching a t-test was administered.

Table 4 reveals that the average values for the variable “In the 4th grade of primary school music classes should be taught by subject teachers exclusively” are comparable. The t-ratio obtained (t=0.72; p>0.05) was not statistically significant, which indicates that there is no statistically significant difference found in the average values of the teachers’ opinion on whether music classes should be taught by subject teachers exclusively in the fourth grade of primary school, and the fact whether they teach songs using a musical instrument or not.
Table 4. Overview of descriptive data analysis and differences in average values of variables “In the 4th grade of primary school music classes should be taught by subject teachers exclusively” and “Subject teacher should teach music classes from the 1st grade of primary school” with regard to the method of song teaching using a musical instrument

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching songs using a musical instr.</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p=0.05</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the 4th grade of primary school music classes should be taught by subject teachers exclusively.</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>0.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject teacher should teach music classes from the 1st grade of primary school.</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>2.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 reveals a higher average value of the variable “Subject teacher should teach music classes from the 1st grade of primary school” in class teachers who did not teach songs using a musical instrument (M=2.5; SD = 1.29). The t-ratio obtained (t=2.03;p<0.05) was statistically important, which indicates that there are statistically important differences between teachers’ opinions on whether music classes should be taught by subject teachers from the first grade of primary school depending on whether they taught songs using a musical instrument or not.

Table 5 shows a higher average value of the variable “In the 4th grade of primary school music classes should be taught by subject teachers exclusively” in teachers who teach songs using mechanical demonstration (M=4.4; SD = 1.09). The t-ratio obtained (t=0.89; p>0.05) is of no importance statistically, which indicates that there is no statistically significant difference found in the average values of teachers’ opinions on whether music classes should be taught by subject teachers exclusively in the fourth grade of primary school, and the fact whether they teach songs using mechanical demonstration or not.

Table 5. Overview of descriptive data analysis and differences in average values of variables “In the 4th grade of primary school music classes should be taught by subject teachers exclusively” and “Subject teacher should teach music classes from the 1st grade of primary school” with regard to the method of song teaching using mechanical demonstration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching songs using mech. demonst.</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p=0.05</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the 4th grade of primary school music classes should be taught by subject teachers exclusively.</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>0.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject teacher should teach music classes from the 1st grade of primary school.</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.27</td>
<td>1.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 shows a higher average value of the variable “Subject teacher should teach music classes from the 1st grade of primary school” in teachers who did not teach songs using mechanical demonstration (M=2.5; SD = 1.27). The t-ratio obtained (t=1.04; p>0.05) is of no importance statistically, which indicates that there is no statistically significant difference found in average values of the teachers’ attitudes on whether music classes should be taught by subject teachers from the 1st grade of primary school,
and the fact whether they teach songs using mechanical demonstration or not.

Based on the above presented detailed results, the initial hypothesis is rejected and it can be concluded that teachers who do not teach songs by playing a musical instrument believe to a much greater extent that additional music education (subject teacher education) is required for teaching music classes in the lower grades of primary school.

**Discussion**

When teaching songs in music classes, class teachers more commonly used mechanical demonstration than a musical instrument (Table 4). According to the results shown in Table 2, only about 30% of the teachers used a musical instrument to teach songs in music classes, while 80% used some form of mechanical demonstration. A number of authors (Novačić, 1987; Požgaj 1988; Rojko, 2004) deem the use of mechanical demonstration positive, especially when a teacher does not have a musical instrument available, or does not know how to teach songs using one. Discussing a multimedia music textbook, Kršek (2006) argues that the CD is an indispensable aid, which, accompanying a textbook, should be employed in teaching songs, and which can also be used by pupils at home to listen to the song they have learned in school. We believe that in today's world of technology, it is easier for teachers to teach songs using mechanical demonstration. Furthermore, with songs taught in this way, the children have an opportunity to listen to the songs at home every day, hence they may be able to understand them better.

Of particular interest is the high percentage of class teachers who were not sure of how they feel about teaching songs using a musical instrument, no less than 23% percent of them expressed uncertainty. It is possible that some teachers simply could not teach songs using a musical instrument, whether because they lacked musical skills, or because they did not have a musical instrument available. Those could be the reasons for such a high percentage of teachers teaching songs using mechanical demonstration (Table 2).

*Finding a Difference in Opinion about the Required Education for Song Teaching in View of the Method of Song Teaching Used to Teach Music Classes*

The research of eminent music teaching specialists (Požgaj, 1988; Rojko, 1987) mentions the possibility of music teaching by a subject teacher in lower grades of primary school. The above mentioned authors, as well as a series of others (Atanasov 2003; Brdarić 1986; Novačić 1987; Njirić 1994; Požgaj 1988; Rojko 2004), claim that both a musical instrument, as well as mechanical reproduction (CD, tape) can be used when teaching songs in music classes. As Figures 3 and 4 demonstrate, most class teachers did not teach songs using a musical instrument; instead, they taught them using mechanical demonstration.
Given that theory mostly supports both ways of song teaching in music classes, we have decided to examine if there is a difference in opinion about the education required to teach music classes in view of the method of song teaching in music classes. Since music education is, according to CNES (2006), the only subject for which subject teaching begins as early as the fourth grade of primary school, we have decided to examine class teachers’ opinions about the education required to teach music classes in two ways: we tested whether they believe that a subject teacher should be teaching music from the first grade, or whether it should start from the fourth grade of primary school.

Our initial hypothesis was that the teachers teaching songs by playing an instrument will believe that additional music education (subject teacher education) is required to teach music classes, while those who teach it using mechanical reproduction will deem it unnecessary. However, the results in Tables 4 and 5 do not confirm the hypothesis. Research (t=0.72; p>0.05) did not find a difference in opinion about required education in the fourth grade of primary school for teaching music classes considering used method of song teaching with a musical instrument. Teachers who teach songs using a musical instrument, as well as those who do not, equally agree (Table 4) that a subject teacher should teach music classes from the fourth grade of primary school. These results correspond to earlier theories (Brdarić 1986; Novačić 1987; Njirić, 1994), which pose proper intonation as the greatest problem in song teaching. Proper intonation for singing cannot be given without an appropriate instrument and music education. Unlike the curriculum in the first three grades, the fourth grade curriculum has a quite demanding material to be taught in music classes, and it can be said that class teachers are happy to concede teaching to subject teachers in accordance with CNES which stipulates subject teaching of music from the fourth grade of primary school onwards.

The teachers have different opinion (statistically significant) about music education from the first grade of primary school in view of the method of song teaching using a musical instrument (t=2.03; p<0.05). Teachers who stated that they do not teach songs using a musical instrument to a somewhat higher degree agree with the contention that music should be taught by a subject teacher from the first grade of primary school. A possible explanation for this is the awareness of class teachers of the need to use a musical instrument to provide proper intonation. However, they are aware that they do not have the opportunity, nor do they feel comfortable enough to use a musical instrument to give intonation, and therefore they believe that a subject teacher should teach music also in lower grades of primary school.

Although there is no statistically significant difference with regard to the method of song teaching via mechanical demonstration (t=0.89; p>0.05), Table 5 shows that teachers teaching songs using a mechanical demonstration agree with the contention that a subject teacher should teach music classes in the fourth grade of primary school to a greater extent. A possible explanation for this is that teachers realise that in the
fourth grade more than a simple mechanical demonstration is required to introduce songs to the pupils, and to increase their motivation for music education, greater competency thus being required to introduce songs than that employed using mere mechanical demonstration.

If we were to assume that most teachers who said that they do not teach songs using mechanical demonstration teach it using a musical instrument, the results referring to the variable “Subject teacher should teach music classes from the 1st grade of primary school” thus obtained and given in Table 4 can be explained with the following assumption. Teachers who use musical instruments to teach songs obviously possess the required knowledge and skills to teach songs, are able to confidently provide proper intonation in class teaching of music, and thus do not deem it necessary for a subject teacher to teach music in lower grades of primary school.

In this part of the paper we will go through possible limitations of the survey and recommendations for further research. The first limitation refers to the manner in which the respondents were selected. Schools were chosen according to availability so the sample is convenient and does not allow any generalization. It is very important to mention limitation regarding the following questionnaire statements: “Teaching songs using a musical instrument” and “Teaching songs using a mechanical demonstration”. Instruction for these statements was the same as for all other statements which examined the respondents’ opinions about particular issues while those statements should have actually investigated the respondents’ perception on the frequency in using specific teaching method (musical instrument or mechanical demonstration). Due to this limitation it cannot be ascertained what the respondents meant especially for answers: “I do not know” or “I am not sure”. This is the most important limitation which can seriously affect research validity. The following problem is the loss of respondents due to dichotomizing statements: “Teaching songs using a musical instrument” and “Teaching songs using a mechanical demonstration”.

Recommendation for further research is to choose a more representative sample of teachers and be more careful when constructing the questionnaire in order to get more valid data.

**Conclusion**

According to Svalina-Škojo: “We can say that students will be successful future teachers if the practical and theoretical skills acquired in the course of their education come together and are applied in their teaching practice. Successful teachers are those who have confidence in the acquired knowledge and skills, who fulfil their educational tasks responsibly and conscientiously, who can motivate pupils and help them realise their potential, those who love their pupils” (2009, p. 71).

Bežen points out that the term teaching specialist colloquially refers to every successful teacher, irrespective of his or her education. When applied to teachers, the term refers to their successful teaching skills, i.e. their performance of given
educational tasks in an interesting and efficient way, making the pupils especially motivated (2008, p. 278).

In other words, if a teacher is provided with quality music education in the course of his or her studies at the Faculty of Teacher Education, and if he or she has adopted musical knowledge and skills available and transmitted to him or her in the process of higher education, this should result in quality teaching in music classes, with the teacher playing music, transferring emotion, and communicating aesthetic impression to the satisfaction of both, the teacher and students.

This research revealed that most teachers disagree with the contention that a subject teacher should teach music classes from the first grade of primary school (M = 2.3), while the score was much higher for the contention referring to a subject teacher taking over music classes from the fourth grade onwards (M = 4.3). This research found that class teachers considered themselves competent enough to teach music up until the fourth grade of primary school.

The actual implementation of music education which is currently applied in Croatia, i.e. teaching practice reveals different ways music classes are being taught, which can be explained by differences in teachers’ education and years of professional experience. The goal of higher education of future teachers is to have a greater number of quality teachers whose creativity and confidence in their musical competencies create a motivating atmosphere in music classes, and whose positive example of active music-making directs new generations towards enjoyment in the art of music.

References


Margetić, N. (2010). Mišljenja učitelja o ocjenjivanju u nastavi glazbe i hrvatskog jezika u četiri početna razreda suvremene osnovne škole. (Master's degree, Učiteljski fakultet Sveučilišta u Zagrebu) [Faculty of Education, University of Zagreb].


---

**Tamara Jurkić Sviben**  
Faculty of Teacher Education, University of Zagreb  
Savska cesta 77, 10000 Zagreb, Croatia  
tamara.jurkicsviben@ufzg.hr

**Nikola Margetić**  
4th Primary School Bjelovar  
Poljana Dr. Franje Tuđmana 1  
43000 Bjelovar, Croatia  
nikola.margetic@skole.hr
Razlike u mišljenju o potrebnom obrazovanju za nastavu glazbene kulture s obzirom na način obrade pjesme

**Sažetak**

U hrvatskom obrazovnom sustavu postoji velika svjesnost o potrebi kvalitetnog obrazovanja budućih učitelja i kontinuiranog jačanja učiteljskih kompetencija. Nastavna praksa izvođenja sata glazbene kulture pokazuje različitu i neujednačenu kvalitetu izvođenja nastave glazbene kulture. Ovo istraživanje želi ispitati mišljenja učitelja s obzirom na način obrade pjesme na satu glazbene kulture o potrebnom obrazovanju za izvođenje nastave glazbe od 1. do 4. razreda osnovne škole. Pretpostavlja se da će učitelji koji obrađuju pjesmu sviranjem na instrumentu smatrati da je za izvođenje potrebno dodatno glazbeno obrazovanje (obrazovanje predmetnih nastavnika), a oni koji obrađuju s pomoću mehaničke reprodukcije da nije. Istraživanje koje se provodilo na 160 učitelja putem anketnih upitnika koji sadrže Likertovu skalu i ispitivanjem razlike u mišljenjima putem t-testa dovelo je do odbacivanja postavljene hipoteze i zaključka da učitelji koji ne obradjuju pjesme sviranjem na instrumentima u većoj mjeri od onih koji obradjuju smatraju da je potrebno dodatno glazbeno obrazovanje za izvođenje nastave glazbene kulture u razrednoj nastavi. Stanje pokazuje kako je potreban daljnji sustavni rad na jačanju učiteljskih kompetencija u glazbenome području.

**Ključne riječi:** glazbena nastava; glazbeno obrazovanje; kompetencije; način obrade pjesme