Biocatalytic Synthesis of Polyglycerol Polyricinoleate: A Comparison of Different Commercial Lipases

S. Ortega, J. L. Gómez, J. Bastida, M. F. Máximo, M. C. Montiel*, and M. Gómez
Department of Chemical Engineering, University of Murcia, 30071 Murcia, Spain

This paper describes the studies carried out to select the most suitable lipase as catalyst for the esterification of polyglycerol with polyricinoleic acid to yield polyglycerol polyricinoleate (PGPR), a value-added, bio-based food emulsifier. The enzymes assayed were lipases from Rhizopus arrhizus, Rhizopus oryzae and Mucor javanicus, previously selected because of their suitable activity and moderate cost. First, the reaction was catalyzed by free lipases in a batch reactor and the influence of different operating conditions (initial water content, amount of enzyme and temperature) on the progress of the reaction was studied. Next, the three lipases were immobilized by physical adsorption on the anion exchange resin, Lewatit MonoPlus MP 64, providing derivatives with a high activity and stability. Recovery of the immobilized derivative from the reaction medium was conducted with very good yields (≥ 99 %) and no loss of activity of the derivative with successive uses was proved. Finally, a high performance reactor, operating at low pressure and a dry atmosphere, was used to synthesise PGPR using the immobilized enzymes. Both Rhizopus arrhizus and Rhizopus oryzae lipases allowed the production of a PGPR which fulfils the “specific purity criteria on food additives other than colours and sweeteners” established by the Commission of the European Communities (AV ≤ 6 mg KOH/g), with an acid value of 4.91 and 5.31 mg KOH/g respectively.

Key words:
Polyglycerol polyricinoleate, lipase, immobilized enzymes, heterogeneous reaction, enzyme biocatalysis, vacuum reactor

Introduction

Polyglycerol polyricinoleate (PGPR, E-476) is a powerful water-in-oil emulsifier 1–5 used to manufacture stable pan release agents for the bakery industry and to stabilize low fat margarine systems with high water content. However, its main application is in the chocolate and confectionery industry,6,7 since it improves the flow properties of chocolate and vegetable fat coatings by lowering the friction between the particles suspended in the liquid fat phase. This way, the yield stress value is reduced and the liquid chocolate mass flows easily even at a low total fat content. Moreover, PGPR decreases the susceptibility of solidified chocolate to suffer fat bloom,8–10 a physical defect that appears during chocolate storage as a greyish-white film on the surface of the product. This has been a significant problem in chocolate ever since the industry began, since it leads to sensory defects.

Known methods for preparing this compound involve two steps: the autocatalytic condensation of ricinoleic acid (or castor oil fatty acids) and the alkali-catalyzed reaction between the condensed ricinoleic acid and polyglycerol to give polyglycerol polyricinoleic fatty acid esters.1 However, these methods have the disadvantage of requiring very long reaction times and thus involve a large financial outlay and high energy costs. The long reaction times also adversely affect the quality of the final product, which presents problems of coloration and odour.11

Enzymatic synthesis might be regarded as an alternative for overcoming these problems since enzymes act favourably in mild temperature and pressure conditions and at neutral pH. For this reason, an enzymatic PGPR synthesis process is being developed by our research group using lipase (E.C.3.1.1.3) as catalyst. The enzymatic procedure consists of two steps. Firstly, the ricinoleic acid is polymerized by the action of Candida rugosa lipase to obtain the estolide. The optimization of this reaction step was described in previous manuscripts.12–14 Secondly, the obtained polyricinoleic acid (PR) is esterified with polyglycerol through the action of a different lipase (Fig. 1). In a previous work, twenty-four lipases were tested to catalyze this second
step, and three of them were selected because of their good results and moderate cost: Rhizopus arrhizus lipase, Rhizopus oryzae lipase and Mucor javanicus lipase.15 The objective of the present study was to compare the behaviour of Rhizopus oryzae and Mucor javanicus lipases with that of Rhizopus arrhizus lipase, published previously,16 in order to choose the most suitable for the production of PGPR, while complying with the “specific purity criteria on food additives other than colours and sweeteners” established by the Commission of the European Communities.

Materials and methods

Enzymes and substrates

Lipases from Mucor javanicus (10 units/mg solid), Rhizopus arrhizus (10 units/mg solid) and Rhizopus oryzae (≥ 30 units/mg solid) were purchased from Fluka. The ricinoleic acid estolide, also called polyricinoleic acid (PR) (with acid value (AV) ≤ 50mg KOH/g, which corresponds to an average degree of polymerization of around 3.7, and with weight-average molecular weight ($M_w$) ≥ 1838 g mol$^{-1}$) was obtained by enzymatic polymerization of ricinoleic acid as described previously.12–14 Polyglycerol-3 (PG-3), kindly provided by Solvay, is a glycerol oligomer based on an average of three glycerol groups ($M_w$ = 246.66 g mol$^{-1}$). It contains a minimum of 80 % di-, tri- and tetraglycerol and has a very low level of cyclic by-products. More information about polyglycerol-3 can be found in its product data sheet.17

Immobilization support and reagents

The anionic exchange resin Lewatit MonoPlus MP 64 (Fluka) was used as immobilization carrier. The soybean lecithin used as support activator was of commercial grade from Santiveri S.A., Spain. Other chemicals (acetic acid, sodium acetate, bovine serum albumin, sodium carbonate, sodium hydroxide, Folin-Ciocalteu reagent, potassium-sodium tartrate, cupric sulfate pentahydrate, potassium hydroxide, ether, ethanol, phenolphthalein, anhydride acetic, pyridine, sodium thiosulfate, starch wheat, chloroform, potassium dichromate, Wijs solution, potassium iodide, Hydranal® Composite 5, Hydranal® Methanol Dry and tetrahydrofuran) were of analytical grade and used without further purification.

Immobilization by physical adsorption

Enzymes were immobilized in an anion exchange resin (Lewatit Monoplus MP 64) following the immobilization protocol previously optimized and described.15 Five grams of support were mixed with 50 mL of a soybean lecithin suspension in distilled water (20 mg mL$^{-1}$ H$_2$O) in an Erlenmeyer flask and placed in an orbital shaker (120 rpm) overnight at room temperature. The activated support was washed with 50 mL of distilled water and then transferred to a jacketed column reactor (2.5 cm i.d. and 30 cm length) equipped with a sinterized glass plate placed 5 cm from the bottom. The enzyme solution (50 mL, 10 mg mL$^{-1}$ in 0.1 mol L$^{-1}$ acetate buffer, pH 5) was then added to the reactor and recirculated for 2 days at 4 ºC. The immobilized derivative was washed twice with the same buffer and stored at 4 ºC in the acetate buffer. The
amount of protein initially offered and the protein remaining in the supernatant and wash-liquid was determined by Lowry’s procedure, as modified by Hartree,18 using bovine serum albumin as standard. The amount of coupled protein was the difference between the amount of the initial protein added and the amount of protein in the supernatant and the wash-liquid. The immobilisation yield describes the percentage of total coupled protein from the initial amount of protein.

**Atmospheric reactor experiments**

The enzymatic reaction was carried out in an open-air glass-jacketed batch reactor (250 mL total volume). Complete mixing was achieved by means of a four-bladed propeller stirrer. The amount of polyricinoleic acid added in each experiment was 30 g, and the amount of polyglycerol was adjusted, depending on the polyricinoleic acid molecular weight, in order to keep the PR/PG molar ratio at around 3 (which means that approximately three of the five hydroxyl groups of the polyglycerol could be esterified). The relative humidity was about 40–50 %. Unless otherwise stated, when the reaction was carried out with free lipase, 500 mg of lipase (Mucor javanicus/Rhizopus arrhizus/Rhizopus oryzae) were dissolved in 5 mL of distilled water and added to the reactor before the substrates. This implies a ratio of 10 µL H2O/mg enzyme in the reactor at the beginning of the reaction. To optimize the water content, the initial amount of water added to the reactor was adjusted to obtain ratios of 1.5, 10 and 20 µL H2O/mg enzyme. All the experiments of optimization of reaction conditions were carried out by using free lipase. Additional experiments with immobilized lipase were conducted by using 5 g of immobilized derivative and the only water in the reaction system was that soaked into the support (0.6 g of water per g of dry resin). All these experiments were carried out at 40 ºC. When influence of temperature was studied, temperatures of 50 and 60 ºC were tested.

**Vacuum reactor experiments**

Reactions were carried out under controlled moisture conditions using a Parr 5100 series low-pressure reactor. The reaction vessel (100 mL total volume) is made of glass and is equipped with a water circulating jacket to heat the vessel. The stainless steel reactor head accommodates the reactor controls and instrumentation. The reactor is equipped with a magnetic drive to provide an internal stirrer, which is a turbine-type impeller. The reactor top also includes a vacuum meter, an internal thermocouple, an internal cooling loop, a rupture disk, a liquid sample valve, a gas inlet valve and a gas release valve. Temperature, stirring speed and positive pressure are managed by a controller. The amounts of polyricinoleic acid, polyglycerol-3 and immobilized lipases in the reactor at the beginning of the reaction were the same as those reported for the atmospheric jacketed batch reactor with immobilized lipases (Section 2.4). All the experiments were carried out at 40 ºC, and the stirring rate was kept constant at 350 rpm. The pressure was set at 160 mmHg and dry air (90 L h–1) was blown through the reaction mixture to facilitate water removal. Relative humidity of the air flow was reduced by passing atmospheric air through a silica gel column.

**Recovery of the immobilized derivative**

When immobilized derivatives were tested for reusability, the reactor content was placed in a sintered glass filter (Pyrex®, number 0) to separate the derivative from the product. After 8 h at room temperature, the immobilized derivative was placed in the reactor for a new reaction cycle without further purification.

**Measurement of the acid value**

The acid value (AV)19 is the number of milligrams of potassium hydroxide necessary to neutralize the free acids present in 1 g of sample. AV corresponds to the carboxyl-group concentration in the reaction mixture.

**Measurement of the hydroxyl value**

The hydroxyl value (HV) is expressed as the milligrams of potassium hydroxide required to neutralize acetic acid coupled with the hydroxyl group of the substance when 1 g of sample is acetylated. It is determined by acetylating the hydroxyl group with acetic acid and titrating the remaining acid against KOH, following the standard method described in the Food Chemical Codex.19

**Determination of iodine value**

As regards the iodine value (IV), PGPR has to comply with the recommendations given in the Food Chemical Codex,19 i.e., IV = 70–90 g I2/100 g, as determined following the protocol described in the same Codex.19 This parameter is a measure of unsaturation and guarantees its emulsifying properties. In this work, it was evaluated as a check to confirm the absence of side reactions.

**Refractive index**

The refractive index of the obtained PGPR was measured with an ABBE refractometer (2WAJ model, Optika, equipped with water recirculation and temperature control), at 65 ºC according to the legal
specification of the refractive index for this food additive.20

**Determination of water content**

The water content of reactor samples was measured with a Karl-Fischer automatic titrator (701 KF, Metrohm), using Hydranal® composite 5, from Riedel-De-Häen.

**Determination of relative humidity**

Environmental relative humidity was measured by means of a thermohygrometer Testo 645 (Testo AG, Germany).

**Gel permeation chromatographic analysis**

Gel permeation chromatographic (GPC) analysis was carried out to determine the average molecular weight of products using a modular system from Waters, with an automatic injector model 717 PLUS and a 600 E quaternary-gradient pump. The system was equipped with a refractive index detector (model 2414) and a 7.8 mm id x 300 mm GPC Styragel® HR 1 THF column from Waters. The analysis was performed at 35 ºC using THF as solvent at a flow rate of 1 mL min⁻¹. The calibration curve (log$_{M_w}$ vs retention time), which is used to estimate the molecular weight of samples, was constructed using the retention times of the resolved peaks for the monomers, dimers, trimers, and tetramers of ricinoleic and polyricinoleic acid. The number- and weight-average molecular weight ($M_n$ and $M_w$, respectively) were calculated by dividing the chromatogram area into trapezoids and using the formulae:

$$M_n = \frac{\sum A_i M_i}{\sum A_i} \quad (1)$$

$$M_w = \frac{\sum A_i M_i^2}{\sum A_i M_i} \quad (2)$$

where the subscript $i$ refers to the $i$th trapezoid of $A_i$ area and $M_i$ to the average molecular weight of this trapezoid. The $M_w/M_n$ ratio is the polydispersity index, PDI.

**Results and discussion**

The reaction course in all the experiments was monitored by measuring the acid value, which decreased due to the esterification of polyricinoleic acid ($AV\leq50$) by polyglycerol-3. According to the standard EC specifications of PGPR, this parameter has to be lower than 6 mg KOH/g.

**Biocatalytic synthesis of polyglycerol polyricinoleate with free lipases**

Preliminary studies were carried out in the atmospheric reactor, in which several experiments were catalyzed by free lipases in order to optimize the water content, biocatalyst concentration and temperature. The effect of these operating variables was studied following the decrease in the Acid Value (AV) during the esterification reaction.

**Influence of initial water content**

The literature describes the important role of water as regards the catalytic activity of lipases, since water participates in all non-covalent interactions that maintain the conformation of the catalytic site of the enzymes.21–23 However, in esterification reactions, the water produced in the reaction medium can negatively affect the equilibrium as well as the distribution of products in the medium. Therefore, optimization of the initial amount of water to be added to the reaction mixture was deemed necessary.

For this purpose, experiments were carried out for each assayed lipase (Rhizopus arrhizus, Rhizopus oryzae and Mucor javanicus) varying the initial amount of water added to the reactor (1.5, 10 and 20 µL H₂O/mg enzyme), as indicated in Section 2.4. The progress of the reaction was quantified by AV measurements, and no differences were observed for the different initial amounts of water assayed with each lipase (Fig. 2). In the three experiments using Rhizopus oryzae lipase as catalyst, a decrease in the acid value of 17 mg KOH/g in 24 h was observed, while the corresponding decreases for Rhizopus arrhizus lipase and Mucor javanicus lipase were 21 mg KOH/g and 15 mg KOH/g, respectively. Taking into account these results, it can be stated that the activity of each lipase is independent of the amount of water initially added. However, the acid value of the PGPR obtained is still far from the EC specification.

As described in previous works,14,16 relative humidity influences the equilibrium of this esterification process. In this case, additional experiments conducted with different values of relative humidity (from 25 % to 80 %) showed that lower relative humidity values led to higher acid values decreased, and the differences observed were about 25 %, in the same controlled-experimental conditions (data not shown).

As a consequence and to avoid this effect, all the experiments to optimize an individual variable were carried out simultaneously, at a relative humidity of 40–50 %.
Influence of the amount of enzyme

For the synthesis of polyglycerol polyricinoleate, the influence of different amounts of added lipase on the esterification reaction was studied in five experiments using 1.39, 2.78, 6.94, 13.89 and 27.28 mg enzyme/g substrate. The results obtained are shown in Fig. 3.

In the case of Rhizopus arrhizus lipase, small differences in the final acid value can be seen between experiments carried out with enzyme/substrate ratios lower than 6.94 mg enzyme/g substrate. However, no differences were noticed when higher ratios were studied; so that 6.94 mg enzyme/g substrate can be considered the optimal ratio. In regards to Mucor javanicus lipase and Rhizopus oryzae lipase, it can be said that the optimal ratio is 13.89 mg enzyme/g substrate.

Influence of the temperature

The temperature influences the enzymatic reaction rate, enzyme stability, the velocity of water evaporation from the reaction medium and its viscosity. Consequently, the effect of temperature on the reaction course was investigated, by carrying out experiments at three different temperatures: 40, 50 and 60 °C. The results obtained are shown in Fig. 4.

First, it can be seen that 60 °C is not a suitable temperature for carrying out the esterification of polyglycerol with polyricinoleic acid catalyzed by Mucor javanicus lipase or Rhizopus arrhizus lipase,16 because the reaction progressed slowly and the acid value reached was quite high. These results clearly show the thermal deactivation of these lipases due to their denaturation. It is well known
that most proteins tend to denature at temperatures above 50 °C. The most common cause for the inactivation of enzymes at high temperatures is loss of the native, catalytically active, conformation through thermodenaturation. In contrast, the higher the temperature used with *Rhizopus oryzae* lipase, the lower the acid value obtained, indicating that this enzyme is more thermostable. These results demonstrate differences in the thermal stability of the lipases studied. Thus, lipases from *Rhizopus arrhizus* and *Mucor javanicus* should not be used at temperatures above 50 °C, because higher temperatures provoke the thermal deactivation of these lipases and a decrease in catalytic activity. However, *Rhizopus oryzae* lipase is still active at 60 °C, and can be used at this temperature.

The bibliography contains different references to the optimum operating temperature for each of the biocatalysts used. For *Rhizopus arrhizus* lipase, operating temperatures of 30–40 °C, with maximum activity at 35 °C, have been mentioned. However, in our case, using a temperature below 40 °C would be unsatisfactory, because of the negative effect on the viscosity of the reaction medium. For the lipase from *Mucor javanicus*, a temperature of 50 °C was found to be optimal. For both the above lipases, the results obtained in our study are very similar to those reported in the literature. However, in the case of *Rhizopus oryzae* lipase, the optimum temperatures of 40 °C and 37 °C and drastic decrease in activity when used above 50 °C reported by other authors, differ from the results obtained here.

The use of relatively high temperatures in this process may lead to the appearance of side products due to the degradation of fatty acids. Therefore, the products obtained in experiments at different temperatures were analysed to determine their degree of unsaturation. The iodine values corresponding to the end products, such as those calculated theoretically from substrates values, are shown in Table 1. The differences observed between the experimental and theoretical values obtained for this parameter suggested that 60 °C caused the partial degradation of the double bond of the fatty acid so that this temperature must be considered unsuitable in the experimental conditions used in these assays. Given that the presence of air can strongly affect degradation, this problem could be avoided by using a sealed reactor with an inert atmosphere. Since lower temperatures decreased the tendency to develop side reactions, 40 °C was considered a suitable temperature for further investigations. In addition, from the standpoint of its industrial application, this temperature would be a better choice because it implies lower energy costs and simplification of the process, since this is the temperature used in polyricinoleic acid production, the first stage of the process.

Comparing processes catalyzed by these three free lipases in an atmospheric reactor at the selected temperature (40 °C), no significant differences were found. However, *Rhizopus arrhizus* and *Rhizopus oryzae* lipases showed a lower acid value at 40 °C, and this temperature was considered unsuitable in the experimental conditions used in these assays. The use of relatively high temperatures in this process may lead to the appearance of side products due to the degradation of fatty acids. Therefore, the products obtained in experiments at different temperatures were analysed to determine their degree of unsaturation. The iodine values corresponding to the end products, such as those calculated theoretically from substrates values, are shown in Table 1. The differences observed between the experimental and theoretical values obtained for this parameter suggested that 60 °C caused the partial degradation of the double bond of the fatty acid so that this temperature must be considered unsuitable in the experimental conditions used in these assays. Given that the presence of air can strongly affect degradation, this problem could be avoided by using a sealed reactor with an inert atmosphere. Since lower temperatures decreased the tendency to develop side reactions, 40 °C was considered a suitable temperature for further investigations. In addition, from the standpoint of its industrial application, this temperature would be a better choice because it implies lower energy costs and simplification of the process, since this is the temperature used in polyricinoleic acid production, the first stage of the process.

Comparing processes catalyzed by these three free lipases in an atmospheric reactor at the selected temperature (40 °C), no significant differences were found. However, *Rhizopus arrhizus* and *Rhizopus oryzae* lipases showed a lower acid value at 40 °C, and this temperature was considered unsuitable in the experimental conditions used in these assays. The use of relatively high temperatures in this process may lead to the appearance of side products due to the degradation of fatty acids. Therefore, the products obtained in experiments at different temperatures were analysed to determine their degree of unsaturation. The iodine values corresponding to the end products, such as those calculated theoretically from substrates values, are shown in Table 1. The differences observed between the experimental and theoretical values obtained for this parameter suggested that 60 °C caused the partial degradation of the double bond of the fatty acid so that this temperature must be considered unsuitable in the experimental conditions used in these assays. Given that the presence of air can strongly affect degradation, this problem could be avoided by using a sealed reactor with an inert atmosphere. Since lower temperatures decreased the tendency to develop side reactions, 40 °C was considered a suitable temperature for further investigations. In addition, from the standpoint of its industrial application, this temperature would be a better choice because it implies lower energy costs and simplification of the process, since this is the temperature used in polyricinoleic acid production, the first stage of the process.

Comparing processes catalyzed by these three free lipases in an atmospheric reactor at the selected temperature (40 °C), no significant differences were found. However, *Rhizopus arrhizus* and *Rhizopus oryzae* lipases showed a lower acid value at 40 °C, and this temperature was considered unsuitable in the experimental conditions used in these assays. The use of relatively high temperatures in this process may lead to the appearance of side products due to the degradation of fatty acids. Therefore, the products obtained in experiments at different temperatures were analysed to determine their degree of unsaturation. The iodine values corresponding to the end products, such as those calculated theoretically from substrates values, are shown in Table 1. The differences observed between the experimental and theoretical values obtained for this parameter suggested that 60 °C caused the partial degradation of the double bond of the fatty acid so that this temperature must be considered unsuitable in the experimental conditions used in these assays. Given that the presence of air can strongly affect degradation, this problem could be avoided by using a sealed reactor with an inert atmosphere. Since lower temperatures decreased the tendency to develop side reactions, 40 °C was considered a suitable temperature for further investigations. In addition, from the standpoint of its industrial application, this temperature would be a better choice because it implies lower energy costs and simplification of the process, since this is the temperature used in polyricinoleic acid production, the first stage of the process.

Comparing processes catalyzed by these three free lipases in an atmospheric reactor at the selected temperature (40 °C), no significant differences were found. However, *Rhizopus arrhizus* and *Rhizopus oryzae* lipases showed a lower acid value at 40 °C, and this temperature was considered unsuitable in the experimental conditions used in these assays. The use of relatively high temperatures in this process may lead to the appearance of side products due to the degradation of fatty acids. Therefore, the products obtained in experiments at different temperatures were analysed to determine their degree of unsaturation. The iodine values corresponding to the end products, such as those calculated theoretically from substrates values, are shown in Table 1. The differences observed between the experimental and theoretical values obtained for this parameter suggested that 60 °C caused the partial degradation of the double bond of the fatty acid so that this temperature must be considered unsuitable in the experimental conditions used in these assays. Given that the presence of air can strongly affect degradation, this problem could be avoided by using a sealed reactor with an inert atmosphere. Since lower temperatures decreased the tendency to develop side reactions, 40 °C was considered a suitable temperature for further investigations. In addition, from the standpoint of its industrial application, this temperature would be a better choice because it implies lower energy costs and simplification of the process, since this is the temperature used in polyricinoleic acid production, the first stage of the process.
oryzae lipases were slightly better catalysts than Mucor javanicus lipase.

**Immobilization of lipases by physical adsorption**

Based on the study carried out with the free lipases, operating conditions (initial amount of water, amount of lipase and temperature) were optimized, but the final product obtained was far from the EC specification concerning the acid value. In previous works on the synthesis of ricinoleic acid estolide \(^{12-14}\) and the screening of lipases for PGPR production,\(^{15}\) it was demonstrated that the use of immobilized lipases improves the results and can be considered advantageous because it permits continuous operation of the reactors and/or reusability of the immobilized enzymes, both of which diminish operating costs. Therefore, the three chosen lipases were immobilized by physical adsorption onto an anion exchange resin (Lewatit Monoplus MP 64), as described in Section 2.3. The immobilization of *Mucor javanicus* and *Rhizopus oryzae* lipase led to higher yields and enzyme loading than obtained with *Rhizopus arrhizus* lipase.\(^ {15}\)

To study the activity of the immobilized lipases, experiments catalyzed by free and immobilized lipases were carried out under the same reaction conditions, using the same amount of total protein as catalyst; that is, one experiment was performed with the immobilized derivative of each lipase, and the other was carried out with an amount of protein equivalent to that adsorbed on the support, dissolved in 3 mL of buffer, a volume that corresponds to the volume of water soaked into the 5 g of support.

As can be seen in Fig. 5, both immobilized and free lipases from *Rhizopus oryzae* and *Rhizopus arrhizus* \(^{16}\) produced the same decrease in acid value. However, when immobilized *Mucor javanicus* lipase was used, a lower final acid value was reached than with free lipase, which reflects an increase in stability. Variations in enzyme stability as well as in properties such as activity and selectivity, as a result of immobilization, are described in the bibliography.\(^ {29,30}\)

**Re-use of immobilized derivatives**

To further examine the effect of immobilization on enzyme stability and to determine the possibility of reusing the immobilized derivative, three successive PGPR synthesis experiments catalyzed by each of the immobilized derivatives were performed. The conditions were kept constant in the three experiments. The biocatalysts were recovered from products as described in Section 2.6. The results show that the three immobilized derivatives studied were very stable, with no substantial loss of activity, and almost the same change in the acid value was obtained for the three runs of each lipase (Fig. 6). Moreover, since no buffer was added before re-use, the amount of water that remains in the support can be considered sufficient to maintain the protein catalytically active.

**Vacuum reactor experiments**

As mentioned above, the European Commission Directive 2008/84/EC\(^ {20}\) establishes as a requirement for PGPR an acid value lower than 6 mg KOH/g. In all the experiments described above, the final acid value was far from this objective and, as a consequence, it was necessary to shift the equilibrium towards the esterification pathway by improving the removal of water from the reaction medium.

On the other hand, it was observed that environmental relative humidity played an important role in the enzymatic synthesis of PGPR in the atmospheric reactor and, as this parameter takes on a wide range of values depending on the air-condi-
tioned system used, it was considered to be the main cause of the poor reproducibility obtained in the atmospheric reactor. To solve this problem and to compare these three immobilized lipases (Mucor javanicus, Rhizopus arrhizus and Rhizopus oryzae lipases) more accurately, PGPR was synthesized under a controlled atmosphere in a vacuum reactor, in which the amount of water in the reaction medium can be controlled and reduced through pressure and the entry of dry air, rendering it independent of environmental conditions. Measurements of the water content in the reaction medium showed that it decreased as the reaction progressed, reaching a final value of about 1300–1900 ppm.

As can be seen from Fig. 7, the higher final acid value was obtained when using Mucor javanicus lipase as biocatalyst; furthermore, that value was far from that specified by EC (≤ 6 mg KOH/g). However, both Rhizopus arrhizus and Rhizopus oryzae lipases were able to catalyze the reaction to give acid values lower than 6 mg KOH/g. Therefore, both of them can be considered suitable for obtaining PGPR, and the yield of the reaction calculated from the initial and final acid value, was higher than 90%. The main difference between these two enzymes lies in the reaction time required to reach the lowest acid value: around 100 h in the case of Rhizopus arrhizus lipase, and around 225 h in the case of Rhizopus oryzae lipase. However, as regards the cost, lipase from Rhizopus arrhizus costs 10 times more than lipase from Rhizopus oryzae, which would mean a high impact on the overall process costs.

Additional studies with Rhizopus oryzae lipase were carried out to check the possibility of shortening the reaction times by increasing the loading of the immobilized derivative. An immobilized derivative was obtained from a 50 mg mL⁻¹ enzyme solution, and the immobilization yield was 67.62 %, the derivative containing 39.4 mg protein/g support. PGPR production was carried out in the vacuum reactor and the results were compared with those obtained in the reaction carried out using an immobilized derivative with 16.36 mg protein/g support, described above. Fig. 8 shows the evolution of the acid value for both experiments, and points to a notable reduction in the reaction time needed. In addition, if we compare these results with those obtained with Rhizopus arrhizus lipase (Fig. 7), it is seen that the process catalyzed by Rhizopus oryzae lipase is economically more feasible than using Rhizopus arrhizus lipase. Since the reaction time using the high-loading derivative of Rhizopus oryzae lipase was slightly shorter than the reaction time for Rhizopus arrhizus lipase, the enzyme consumption was five times higher, but the price per mg of enzyme was ten times lower, so the overall cost was still lower.
Characterization of PGPR obtained using lipases from *Rhizopus arrhizus* and *Rhizopus oryzae* as catalysts

From the study developed so far, it can be concluded that both *Rhizopus arrhizus* lipase and *Rhizopus oryzae* lipase are suitable enzymes for catalyzing the esterification of polyglycerol with polyricinoleic acid to yield a PGPR which complies with European specifications concerning the acid value. Therefore, the complete characterization of these products was carried out in order to prove the purity and quality of the PGPR obtained.

As a food additive, PGPR has to comply with several purity specifications, besides its acid value, that are set in European directives. These purity specifications, as well as the results obtained in the characterization of the final products synthesized are shown in Table 2. As can be seen, the PGPR obtained from the esterification of polyricinoleic acid with polyglycerol catalyzed by *Rhizopus arrhizus* or *Rhizopus oryzae* lipases complied with these specifications, demonstrating that the enzymatic process developed in this research work is suitable for producing PGPR for use as food additive.

GPC analyses demonstrated that the PGPR obtained using these lipases had an almost identical composition, a low level of low molecular weight compounds and high purity. From the values of the weight-average molecular weight and taking into account the molecular weight of polyricinoleic acid, it can be established that the final product was a mixture of mono- and di-esters, in which polyricinoleic acid is attached to -OH end groups of polyglycerol due to the selectivity of the lipases used. The polydispersity indexes were 1.11 and 1.13, respectively, values close to unity, confirming the high uniformity of the obtained products.

**Conclusions**

This contribution describes the studies carried out to select the most suitable lipase for catalysing the esterification of polyglycerol with polyricinoleic acid to yield polyglycerol polyricinoleate, a value-added, biobased food emulsifier. The enzymes assayed were lipases from *Rhizopus arrhizus*, *Rhizopus oryzae* and *Mucor javanicus*, previously selected because of their proved suitability to catalyze the studied reaction and their moderate cost. Experiments carried out in the atmospheric reactor and using free lipases demonstrated that *Rhizopus oryzae* lipase was the most thermostable, reaching lower acid value in shorter reaction time when used at 60 ºC. *Mucor javanicus* lipase had an optimum temperature of 50 ºC, while *Rhizopus arrhizus* lipase behaved identically at 40 and 50 ºC, being unable to catalyze this reaction at 60 ºC. *Rhizopus arrhizus* lipase showed higher specific activity because similar acid values were reached using lower amounts of biocatalyst. Immobilization yields were higher for *Mucor javanicus* lipase and *Rhizopus oryzae* lipase. However, the best acid value results were obtained for *Rhizopus arrhizus* lipase even though its immobilization yield was the lowest.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EC specification</th>
<th>Rhizopus arrhizus lipase</th>
<th>Rhizopus oryzae lipase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acid Value (mg KOH/g)</td>
<td>&lt; 6</td>
<td>4.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hydroxyl Value (mg KOH/g)</td>
<td>80–100</td>
<td>90.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iodine Value (g I₂/100 g)</td>
<td>70–90</td>
<td>74.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refractive Index</td>
<td>1.4630–1.4665</td>
<td>1.4655</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$M_c$ (g mol⁻¹)</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>2879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$M_w$ (g mol⁻¹)</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>3242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDI (dimensionless)</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Fig. 8 – Evolution of acid value in the esterification of polyglycerol with polyricinoleic acid in the vacuum reactor, using different enzyme-loading derivatives of *Rhizopus oryzae* lipase. Experimental conditions: reaction mixture, molar ratio PR/PG ≈ 3; temperature, 40 ºC; pressure, 160 mmHg; dry air flow, 90 L h⁻¹; catalyst, 5 g of the immobilized derivative (♦) 16.36 mg protein/g support, (■) 39.4 mg protein/g support and the amount of water soaked into the support (3 ml).](image-url)
When the process was catalyzed by immobilized *Rhizopus arrhizus* or *Rhizopus oryzae* lipases in a high performance reactor, the obtained PGPR complied with the purity criteria set by the EC. It is worth mentioning that the acid value decreased faster when the biocatalyst was *Rhizopus arrhizus* lipase. However, using an immobilized derivative of *Rhizopus oryzae* lipase with a higher enzyme loading, the reaction time was shortened. Despite the higher biocatalyst consumption, the overall cost for using *Rhizopus oryzae* lipase instead of *Rhizopus arrhizus* lipase was still lower due to its lower price.

The number- and weight-average molecular weights, determined by GPC analysis, along with the polydispersity index, indicated the high uniformity and purity of the obtained products, which contained a low concentration of low molecular weight compounds.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study was partially supported by European Union (FEDER) and MICINN project CTQ2011-24091, Spain.

**List of symbol**

- AV: Acid value, mg KOH/g
- EC: European communities
- GPC: Gel permeation chromatography
- HV: Hydroxyl value, mg KOH/g
- i.d.: Internal diameter
- IV: Iodine value, g 12/100 g
- \( \bar{M}_n \): Number-average molecular weight, g mol\(^{-1} \)
- \( \bar{M}_w \): Weight-average molecular weight, g mol\(^{-1} \)
- PGPR: Polyglycerol polyricinoleate
- ppm: Parts per million, w/w
- PR: Polyricinoleic acid
- r: Polydispersity index (dimensionless)

**References**