Croatian Journal of Education
Vol.16; No.2/2014, pages: 385-420
Original research paper
Paper submitted: 28th June 2012
Paper accepted: 25th September 2012

Student Participation in Bologna Process: A Case Study from Turkey

Z. Ezgi Kahraman[1] and A. Orçun Sakarya[2]
[1]*Department of City and Regional Planning, Faculty of Architecture, Çankaya University*
[2]*Department of Management, Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, Çankaya University*

Abstract

Bologna Process studies in Çankaya University's Interior Architecture Department (INAR), Turkey have been initiated in 2008. The goal of this study is to explore students' perceptions about the new programme outcomes framed with the Turkish Higher Education Qualifications Framework and to provide a set of guidelines for the Bologna Process to be implemented. A questionnaire including semi-structured questions is conducted in the data collection process. Content analysis method is used in order to examine students' perceptual outcomes. The findings of the study display that students' perceptions underline the importance of the acquisition of knowledge, skills and competences in social, economic and managerial dimensions of the professional life. Results also reveal the need of students for the acquisition and use of communicative, collaborative and interdisciplinary aspects of the profession and their expectations on both theoretical and practical contents of INAR courses. Furthermore, this study which mainly followed a student-cantered approach concluded that it is also possible to generalize new programme outcomes through the active participation of students.

Key words: *perceptual attribute; programme outcomes; qualifications.*

Introduction

The Lisbon and Bologna Processes (BP) aim to establish the most powerful information society possible, and a lifelong learning system for the satisfaction of the required human resources potential. Here, BP[1], which intends to set up a European

[1] The study of Voegtle et al. (2010) provides a summary of the BP since its beginning.

Higher Education Area (EHEA) by harmonizing the higher education systems of the 46 countries involved (HEC, 2009) plays an important role by increasing the global awareness of the European Higher Education system. BP involves ten action lines including adoption of a system which is based on two cycles and with more easily readable and comparable degrees, establishment of the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS), increasing collaboration for assuring quality while developing mobility, improvement of European Higher Education dimension, improvement of lifelong learning, increasing EHEA's appeal while engaging students and higher education institutions in the process and, finally, connecting EHEA with European Research Area (Heitmann, 2005). Here the goal is to make European Higher Education more attractive for students and scholars from other continents, which requires a reform series (Elias, 2010). In this regard, two sister processes follow a parallel path in the areas of improving the quality of education (Saarinen, 2005) and the transparency of the higher education systems of the countries involved. The most important aspects of the BP are twofold: the overarching framework for qualifications of the EHEA (QF-EHEA) and European Qualifications Framework for Lifelong Learning (EQF-LLL) (Durman, 2010). These frameworks are two different approaches to the same goal, and are also assumed to be the ultimate references for the formulation of Turkish Higher Education Qualifications Framework (THEQF)[2] that we will mainly emphasize[3] in the next section.

Since 2001 Turkey has been one of the countries involved in BP. In that time, many changes in the current higher education system have been made, along with many others that are anticipated. However, during this period one of the most crucial topics seems to be uncertain: the formulation of a general set of guidelines that lead programme guideline renewals outside the framework provided by the EQF. To do this, students appear to be the major sources of information, being the primary parties that will be involved in the new process. Thus, student perceptions about the new programme outcomes can be assumed as a significant contribution to reach the final qualifications framework. Moreover, as curricula in different universities' equivalent departments (e.g. visual sciences and architecture) involve similar course contents, these ideas may also be assumed in order to provide an opportunity for generalizing the guidelines to be operated during the change process. Here, our rationale is based on the fact that BP mainly involves a "student centred" approach.

[2] The THEQF is the umbrella concept which connects the programme qualifications and learning outcomes to the needs of society. Including a "systems approach", it establishes a link between higher education and other areas of training (e.g. lifelong learning). With regard to cognitive and intellectual skills, subject specific competences, transferable skills and competences can be stated as elements of the THEQF.

[3] Here, it is useful to refer once again to some of the official decisions which were ratified between the years 2005 and 2010 and on which our questionnaire is also indirectly based. They were as follows: QF – EHEA also known as "Bergen Decision" accepted on 19-20th May 2005, which relates to the sixth level of license education; EQF-LLL accepted on 20th April 2008, referring to the first level of license education and finally THEQF, which was accepted in 2010. It has been formulated according to precedent frames referring to the sixth level of license education.

Within this framework, the aim of this study is to redefine the programme outcomes in accordance with student perceptions of the Department of Interior Architecture (INAR) in the Çankaya University to provide a set of guidelines in BP adoption process. Moreover, related guidelines are also aimed to be applicable in interior architecture departments of different universities involved in the BP since educational programmes include similar issues. To do this, under the THEQF, this study attempts to recompose programme outcomes of the INAR with the perceptions and subjective descriptions of INAR students. Following the theoretical background in the second part of the paper, the third section of the study overviews the BP process at Çankaya University. The following section focuses on the methodological framework of this study which involves data collection and data analysis processes. We, then, discuss the results of the analytical procedures. The student perceptual attributes lead to the end conclusions and some proposals on the undergraduate educational approach for interior architecture in the final part of the paper[4].

Theoretical Background: A Literature Review

Several authors have dealt with student participation in academic activities. The first group of examples is about "focal" issues such as academic achievement (Camp, 1990), learning process (Kelvin, 1993), specific implementation programmes (Howell et al., 2010), electronic learning tools (Mazollini & Madison, 2003), and research benefits (Wayment & Dickson, 2008). The second group examines student participation in "holistic" issues such as learning management (Visser et al., 1998), organizational citizenship (Kennedy, 2007), and university governance (Lizzio, 2009).

In accordance with our topic, student participation can also be observed as an important factor in determination of the learning outcomes (LOs) (Gijbels et al., 2005), exam performances (Quarrie, 2007), teachers' role (Bakkenes et al., 2009), as well as the impact of the learning environment on student choices (Lizzio et al., 2002; Vermuelen & Schmidt, 2008) and finally assessment of learning outcomes (Anderson et al., 2005).

It can be intuited from the literature that students' participation has been perceived as one of the efficient feedback tools for academic activities in which students are seen as the primary level stakeholders who can contribute in the process, which is in fact not the case for BP which proceeds one step further. BP basically aims a "student centred" approach, where students are observed as one of the "drivers" of the reform process. The crucial role of the students is underlined as follows: "Without involvement of students and higher education institutions the implementation would not be possible and decision taken from the administrative site only might not be accepted — the ownership of the reforms is important; otherwise there is a danger, the reforms stay only bureaucratic" (Lažetić, 2010, p. 553).

[4] We would like to express our gratitude to the Faculty of Engineering and Architecture Board and especially to INAR students for their contribution.

The theoretical background of our study in fact comes from the related political approach, in which there are two issues we have to remark. The first one is that student centred BP still seems as a new approach for Turkish institutions (Yağcı, 2010), which is seen as one of the "soft" reform areas within the structural transformation. Second, although different researchers have examined different stages of BP, such as students' perceptions of academic programme preferences (Cardoso et al., 2008), e-assessment tools (Ferrão, 2010), conceptualization of curricula design (Heitmann, 2005) and students' participation in specific Bologna Process achievements (e.g. curricula design and learning outcomes), this is seldom analyzed in literature, where Pierce and Mar Robisco's (2009) study provides an interesting example. This induced us to conduct a specific research which aims to contribute to the BP literature by providing a specific case study on student perceptions and to provide a main guideline and a set of proposals for the "soft "reform areas mentioned above.

Bologna Process Study at the INAR of Çankaya University: A Programme Qualifications Approach

The overall mission of the Çankaya University in terms of BP is mainly based on the improvement in the quality of education with reference to European Union standards. Specifically, the bundle of strategies in BP includes additional tips concerning quality measurement and improvement and the enhancement of sustainable, innovative and updated course content. Here, quality improvement activities mainly emphasize physical and technical facilities such as the laboratories and required course material. Consequently, various issues, including the graduation of students, the creation of job opportunities for new graduates and improvements of field-specific academic promotion opportunities for professors are in progress.

Çankaya University's INAR has initiated the process as of 2008. For formulating a "local strategy" in conjunction with the University's main one, a SWOT analysis was conducted within INAR. The SWOT analysis results indicated that in order to improve the department's research potential, the learning environment (Vermuelen & Schmidt, 2008) should be further developed[5] and that some new criteria should be introduced. To do this, a series of studies indicated a development agenda for the department. The most significant part of these studies was the implementation of two questionnaires referred to as the department entry questionnaire (DENQ), conducted among freshmen, and the exit questionnaire (DEXQ), conducted among graduates. The results of these two questionnaires mainly involved commonalities on the need for more application-oriented courses, and for more detailed information about the architectural profession and potential knowledge acquisition capabilities.

[5] One of the main milestones of this development is the introduction of new curricula which are mainly oriented towards a global world by considering student choices. They focus on the competence and the generic skills of the students. For related research see Öhlén et al. (2011). Additionally, programme outputs and learning outcomes (Lizzio et al., 2002; Anderson et al., 2005; Harden, 2007; Pierce & Mar Robisco, 2009) are also the points to be considered during the process.

These questionnaires were only one achievement in the first stages of the case-study of the INAR. In addition, the first stage also included other developments in the areas such as the revision of programme qualifications along with DENQ and DEXQ results; the recalculation of the INAR course credits in a way to allow them to reflect students' course performances more realistically and to be harmonized with the ECTS system, the redesign of course definition forms according to Bloom's Taxonomy (Savic, 2008), the consolidation of graduates' names for the creation of an e-mail group and the creation of a virtual social network in order to provide a better communication environment for the stakeholders. For the better conceptualization of the BP participation with the national BP, meetings by Faculty[6] and the INAR board were another integral part of the first stage study. In addition to students, department members also participated actively in the process.

By using the experience about user-centred approaches in course design[7], the second phase of improvement studies is formulated with a more "student-focused"[8] approach. In order to empower student participation, student groups have been composed from all classes, and have been presented with a questionnaire which can be considered as a "customized version" of the THEQF as it summarizes the future study agenda in the INAR. The following sections mainly discuss the methodology and findings of the study.

Methodology

Our study made use of qualitative data collection techniques to uncover students' feelings, judgments, behaviours and related features relevant to the THEQF. The data collection techniques involved analytical procedures to explore and classify the conceptualization of the sample as attributes of programme outcomes with reference to the THEQF. Following the THEQF's basics, this section which discusses the methodological framework covers information about the sample, the questionnaire preparation method and questions, and the data analysis procedure.

To be able to understand the strategic contribution of our findings, we refocus on the QF-EHEA in this section. As we mainly drew from the THEQF (which is basically an extension of the QF-EHEA) while preparing our questionnaire to underline the effects of the results on policy making, it is useful to mention the scope of the THEQF in more detail before we move on.

In the QF-EHEA's sixth level, qualifications are classified under three headings: theoretical knowledge; skills, both cognitive (including the use of logical, intuitive and creative thinking) and practical (including manual dexterity and the use of materials, methods, tools and instruments); and competences, which are described in

[6] INAR is a part of the Faculty of Engineering and Architecture.

[7] Kahraman (2010) discusses the implementation of the user-centred approach for INAR students' course design in her study.

[8] See Kelvin (1993) for a detailed analysis of student participation in the learning process.

terms of responsibility and autonomy. The respective learning outcomes are stated as advanced knowledge of a field of work or study, involving a critical understanding of theories and principles; advanced skills demonstrating mastery and innovation along with complex problem solving in a specific field; and the ability to manage complex technical or professional activities and projects, as well as taking responsibility for decision making in unpredictable work or study contexts and managing individuals'/groups' professional development. Accordingly, the national frameworks of countries differ.

The THEQF was mainly derived from the headings above. In the national framework, "knowledge" was redefined as theoretical and practical knowledge acquisition supported by up-to-date information through relevant resources and tools; "skills" were extended to using cognitive and practical abilities to define problems, conduct analyses and develop solutions; and "competences" constitute the most detailed part of the THEQF. In THEQF, there are four competences' subheadings: the ability to work independently and take responsibility; the ability to learn; the ability to communicate (social competence); and professional abilities. The first subheading includes taking responsibility as a team member and having the project development capability to develop other team members; whereas the second involves being able to critically evaluate acquired technical information along with having a positive attitude towards life-learning activities development. The third subheading includes developing oral and written skills for self-expression, sharing information with experts while supporting theses with qualitative and quantitative data, developing public awareness by being involved in social environment projects and developing foreign language skills along with computer proficiency. The last subheading deals with professional abilities, where students' ethical approaches to data collection, research implementation and dissemination of results are focal areas. Awareness acquisition in areas such as environmental protection, worker health and job security is also included.

Data Collection Process

Data collection process aimed to extract new programme outcomes for INAR through the perceptions of students about the content of general guidelines of THEQF. To do this, we made use of a semi-structured questionnaire with the INAR students which included open-ended questions.

A sample of 62 students from the 147 in total, participated in the study. We involved 14, 14, 17, and 17 students from the 1st, 2nd, 3rd and 4th years respectively, thus covering around 42 % of the total student population in the department. The selection has been made in a way to reflect the views of all levels of students, assuming that the 3rd and 4th year students are more familiar with the department curricula and that their professional expectations are more developed in comparison with the remaining students. Hence, in the selection of the number and profile of students included in

the sample, we intended to ensure the validity and reliability of the data collection process. During the questionnaire sessions, a total of 15 groups were created (seven from 1st and 2nd, eight from 3rd and 4th year students) each containing around three to four students.

Within the THEQF, as mentioned in the previous section, our questionnaire included 12 questions formulated as an extension to the THEQF which is shaped by three main sub-frames related to "knowledge", "abilities" and "competences". Knowledge and abilities guided us when it came to composing the first two questions of our questionnaire. For the remaining ten questions, we basically concentrated on "competences" which we contemplated as being more effective, especially with regard to the professional development of the students.

The first two groups of questions covered the expectations of students with regard to knowledge and abilities acquisition in the INAR. These two groups included questions such as "What type of professional knowledge would you like to acquire from INAR?" and "What type of professional talents would you like to gain from INAR courses?" The third group of questions involved competences and examined student preferences and expectations in the areas of undertaking individual or teamwork study, the acquisition of a certain degree of critical ability, field-specific planning and organizing knowledge, in addition to various research methodologies for professional life. Through these questions, we intended to measure the independent working and responsibility-taking and learning capability expectations of the students. Some examples from this group are as follows: In which projects would you prefer to pursue individual and team work in your profession? Which research methods would you prefer and need to experience in your profession? The following groups of questions were asked to reveal students' expectancies about the gain in communication skills and social competences, including business communication knowledge. This group involved questions such as "What are the professional parties whom you would like to communicate? What could be the means of communication?" In this group of questions, preferences for the different target groups and student ideas about the choice of the social responsibility projects were also intended to be revealed. Another question in this group was about the professional utilization of areas of 'English' as a foreign language. The last three questions elicited student expectancy with regard to field-specific competencies' absorption from the INAR, involving technologies and computer software knowledge, as well as aesthetic and ethical values. This group included questions such as "What are the technologies/computer software that you would like to be taught by INAR?". Finally, there was also an information intake on different issues such as worker health-security and environment. These made up the last group of questions. In this context, questions such as "Among topics such as environmental awareness, worker health and security, which are the ones you would like to acquire knowledge on? Please list other related topics on which you would like to acquire knowledge", can be given as examples.

Data Analysis Process

The data analysis process of this study followed two steps: (i) exploration of perceptual attributes of programme outcomes; (ii) statistics on frequency of citation of perceptual attributes of programme outcomes.

In the first part, to explore perceptual attributes of programme outcomes for each THEQF, the list of perceptions of the sample was driven from the raw data obtained from questionnaires. We used the content analysis which helped reveal perceptual attributes of programme outcomes from the reactions of students towards each THEQF. The content analysis converts texts of questionnaires into content categories by following systematic rules of coding, quantifies and analyses the presence, meanings and relationships of words and concepts related with programme outcomes. In other words, it counts the word frequency of concepts in the text of questionnaires which reflects the importance of matters (Berelson, 1952; Krippendorff, 1980; Weber, 1990; Kahraman, 2008).

In this process, we created tables of information to see the relationship among groups of information and list topics for programme outcomes. Then, we grouped similar topics together and labelled them as attributes of programme outcomes (Krippendorff, 1980; Weber, 1990, Druckman & Hopmann, 2002).

In the second part of data analysis process, to examine the frequency of citation of each perceptual attribute of programme outcomes we conducted descriptive statistics. To prepare the data for this analysis, we used the association matrix of perceptual attributes of programme outcomes. We used dummy coding to determine the perception of each attribute of each programme outcome for each respondent of the sample. When the sample cited the perceptual attribute, we coded the score of that attribute as "one", on the contrary, when the sample did not cite that attribute, we coded it as "zero".

Results

As it is shown in Table 1, the content analysis uncovered various numbers of perceptual attributes for each THEQF, which has the potential to reconstitute INAR's potential programme outcomes. Furthermore, in light of attributes in Table 1, descriptive statistics extracted the differences in the frequency of citation of each perceptual attribute of programme outcomes. Since these statistics constitute a long list of frequencies, Table 2 only displays the most and the least frequently cited perceptual attributes of each programme outcome of INAR students. This table guides us in the following section, while mentioning frequencies of perceptual attributes as "percentages".

With regard to qualifications, the first section which is based on the acquisition of theoretical and applied knowledge, the analysis procedure elicited 23 perceptual attributes of programme outcomes. These attributes, shown in Table 1, are related with knowledge on creativity and aesthetics; knowledge on interior architecture and

architecture[9], knowledge on other fields of design[10]; knowledge on legal, professional and social responsibility, knowledge on environmental and social psychology; knowledge on project finance and management, marketing and communication; and knowledge on technology. Among these outcomes related to the acquisition and use of theoretical and applied knowledge, as it is shown in Table 2, the most frequently cited perceptual attributes are knowledge on issues under interior architecture and architecture (materials 60 %, environmental control 53.3 %, and the history of art and architecture 53.3 %). Consequently, the first group of qualifications underpins the knowledge acquisition not only about the profession but also about different branches of design, management, marketing, technology and social issues in general.

The second group of qualifications was about the acquisition and use of cognitive and intellectual skills, where skills related with designing and the profession[11]; analytical thinking and problem solving; doing group work; and communication and marketing[12] generally describe the content of the perceived attributes of this group of programme outcomes. The acquisition of cognitive and intellectual skills on communication and marketing (93.3 %) was the most frequently cited attribute. This result shows that the acquisition and use of cognitive skills is mostly related with business making capabilities, where together with marketing capabilities, communication abilities seem as a vital skill to be acquired.

As Table 1 shows, there are two groups of outcomes regarding the acquisition and use of individual and teamwork competences. These are teamwork and individual work motivations. In this context, different stages of the design process[13] motivate students for both the acquisition and use of individual and teamwork work. Moreover, engagement in the large scale projects in teamwork and engagement in small scale projects in individual work were revealed as perceptual motivations for the acquisition and use of such competences. Table 2 indicates that engagement in different stages of the design process (teamwork in the conceptual design stage 66.6 %, and individual work in the application of the design idea into the project 73.3 % was the most frequently cited perceptual attribute for both individual and team work. It can be observed from here that the acquisition of teamwork competences as well as individual work competences may contribute to the different phases and scales of projects in the

[9] Knowledge on interior architecture and architecture includes detail, ergonomics, basic design, construction, application, manufacturing and assembly, model making, colour, mechanics, history of art and architecture, structure, conceptual design, fire safety, material, environmental control (lighting, acoustics and HVAC -heating, ventilating and air conditioning) and drawing (technical drawing, freehand, perspective and computer aided drawing).

[10] Knowledge on other fields of design includes product design, architecture, city planning and landscape architecture.

[11] Skills on designing and the profession include three dimensional perception, drawing, handcraft, model making, criticizing, and designing.

[12] Skills on management include planning, management and organization.

[13] Different stages of the design process include conceptual design, analysis and application of the design idea.

field of interior architecture. Therefore, both of these competences may help the rise of future professional interior architects.

The fourth group of outcomes was composed of results related to the acquisition and use of planning and organization competences. Perceptual attributes under these competences include planning and organizing the design process, resources[14]and time. In this group, the most frequently cited attributes were the acquisition and use of planning and organization competences in the design process (93.3 %). This result displays that planning competences may contribute to the design process in the field of interior architecture. We can recapitulate that here student perceptions reveal two stages (planning and organization) of managerial process, underlying once again the importance of students' business orientation level. We can also add that this result is in a way complementary to the second group of qualifications (marketing and communication) which shows the required cognitive and intellectual skills.

In the fifth framework of qualifications - the acquisition and use of learning and criticizing competences - the content analysis extracted 15 perceptual attributes of programme outcomes. These competences were connected with learning and criticizing interior spaces, architectural design and architectural elements[15] of a building; urban design; workmanship; aesthetical, ethical and economic dimensions of design; design products; and art pieces (see Table 1). Among these, as it is shown in Table 2, the acquisition and use of learning and criticizing competence with regard to interior spaces and design ideas was the most frequently cited attribute (53.3 %). This means that students may use learning and criticizing competences primarily in the field of interior architecture, but also in all fields and dimensions of design processes.

The sixth group of perceptual attributes involving the acquisition and use of life-long learning competences, which were related to using various research methods[16] and visual resources; following up experts and seminars; and learning by discussion and by doing. In this group of qualifications, the participants most frequently cited the acquisition and use of life-long competences on the Internet (80 %) and library searching (66.6%). This shows that as a part of life-long learning process, both modern and traditional methods of searching are accepted as tools for information access.

In the seventh group of outcomes, actors and methods constituted two classes of attributes in the acquisition and use of communication competence. As it is displayed in Table 1, professionals from various fields of design[17]; technical staff[18]; partners from the market[19]; international partners; governmental and non-governmental

[14] Resources include monetary and human (constructors, craftsmen, painters and plumbers).

[15] Architectural elements include material, colour, lighting, structure, ergonomics and usability and design details.

[16] Research methods include library and internet searching, and other research methods such as technical visits and learning by doing.

[17] Professionals from various fields of design include interior architects, architects, artists, other professional groups (industrial designers, landscape architects, city planners and engineers).

[18] Technical staff includes workers, craftsmen and technicians.

[19] Partners from the market include managers, marketers, and customers.

organizations (NGOs); and academic societies[20] described the general framework of perceived actors in the acquisition and use of communication competences. The perceptual methods of communication included face to face communication and communication via oral, visual, written and virtual sources[21]. Communication with interior architects and architects and chambers of interior architects and engineers (53.3% each) were the most frequently cited attributes. Regarding the methods, face to face communication (66.6 %) constituted the most frequently cited perceptual attributes (see Table 2). Of this group of outcomes, it can be deduced that students are mostly aware of the communication's significant role in the interior architecture education. Furthermore, their perceptions enriched this process by communicating with various professional stakeholders and via different methods.

The eighth group of programme outcomes was composed of perceptual attributes, including the acquisition and use of social responsibility competence on projects related to restoration, sustainable and ecological architecture; professional social responsibility projects; projects on urban scale[22]; design projects for public buildings and disadvantaged groups[23]; and projects on thematic issues. Taking a part in restoration projects was the most frequently cited attribute for the acquisition and use of social responsibility competence with a 60 % response. This result may be the reflection of the ongoing urban transformation practices in cities all around Turkey on this group of competences.

In the acquisition and use of competences in the use of foreign languages, perceptual attributes are related with international communication and commerce; job recruitment and educational opportunities abroad; following-up professional developments; the usage of computer software; and the acknowledgment of foreign cultures (see Table 1 for further information). As Table 2 shows, the acquisition and use of foreign language competences related to international communication (100 %) was the most frequently cited attribute, which induces the significance of students' communication ability to track professional updates in various arenas on a global scope.

The following group of programme outcomes displays two separate issues: the acquisition and use of competence in the use of technology and computer software. Nanotechnology, new technologies related to construction, manufacturing, technical equipments, materials and lighting identified the perceptual branches of technology. Additionally, MS Office applications and two and three dimensional drawing programs[24], were the kinds of computer software revealed from student perceptions.

[20] Academic societies include researchers; instructors; interior architecture students from different universities.

[21] Communication via oral, visual, written and virtual sources includes using the Internet and e-mail, telephone calls, conferences and seminars, visual resources, written resources, and visits during the communication.

[22] Projects on urban scale include squatter housing transformation, city planning, housing, and recreational projects.

[23] Projects for disadvantaged groups mainly related to the construction of orphanages and rest homes, as well as projects for disabled people. Parks and sport centres are examples of recreation areas.

[24] Two and three dimensional drawing programs include AutoCAD, Photoshop, other graphics and animation software, Corel Draw, Maya, 3DMax, Sketch-up, ArchiCAD, and Gusto.

For technology, the acquisition and use of this competence in construction and material technologies (26.6 % each) were the most frequently cited ones. Regarding computer software, the use and acquisition of this competence with regard to AutoCAD, 3DMax (93.3 % each), and Photoshop (80 %), constituted the most frequently cited attributes. These results may picture the consciousness of students of computer software and new technologies, which are facilitators for transforming the idea and/or products in minds into action, as well as disseminating professional knowledge.

The eleventh programme outcome was composed of the acquisition and use of ethical and aesthetic competences. In this group, the perceptual attributes were connected with business ethics; design ethics, social and environmental ethics (see Table 1). For the acquisition and use of aesthetic competences, perceptual attributes involved acquisition and use of design and aesthetic principles in architectural design and art and fashion projects. It has also been noted that for the acquisition and use of ethical competences, business ethics (60 %); for the acquisition and use of aesthetic competences, acquisition and use of design and aesthetic principles in architectural design and art projects (53.3 %) were the most frequently cited attributes (see Table 2). This group of outcomes displays students' perception of multidimensionality of ethics and aesthetical quest in various fields of design.

Table 1.

The THEQF and perceptual attributes of INAR programme outcomes

Turkish Higher Education Qualifications Framework (THEQF)	Perceptual attributes of programme outcomes of the INAR		
Acquisition and use of theoretical and applied knowledge	– Material – Environmental control – Marketing and communication – History of art and architecture – Detail – Drawing – Creativity – Ergonomics	– Structure – Model making – Technology – Aesthetics – Conceptual design – Basic design – Colour – Other fields of design	– Project finance and management – Application, manufacturing and assembly – Construction – Fire safety – Environmental and social psychology – Mechanics – Legal, professional and social responsibility
Acquisition and use of cognitive, and intellectual skills	– Communication and marketing – Drawing – Three–dimensional perception – Model making	– Analytical thinking and problem solving – Designing – Criticizing	– Hand craft – Planning, management and organization – Doing group work
	Teamwork motivation		*Individual work motivation*
Acquisition and use of individual and team work competences	– Conceptual design stage – Analysis stage – Designing stage – Large scale projects		– Design stage – Conceptual design stage – Analysis stage – Small scale projects
Acquisition and use of planning and organization competences	– The design process – Resources – Time		

Acquisition and use of learning and criticizing competence	– Interior spaces and design ideas – Architectural designs & historical buildings – Material and colour – Design principles and aesthetics – Art piece, theatre stage, painting	– Ergonomics and usability – Details – Design products – Workmanship and application – Student projects	– Structure – City plans – Design budgets and costs – Lighting – Ethical subjects
Acquisition and use of lifelong learning competence	– Internet search – Library search – On the job training	– Following experts and instructors – Using visual resources – Following fairs and seminars	– Learning by discussion – Using other research methods

	Actors		*Methods*
Acquisition and use of communication competence	– International offices and companies of interior architecture – Interior architects, architects – Workers, craftsmen and technicians – Customers – Artists – Instructors – Researchers	– Interior architecture students from different universities – Other professional groups – Managers and employers – NGOs – Marketers – Bureaucrats	– Face to face – Via internet and e–mail – Via telephone calls – Via conferences and seminars – Via visual resources – Via written resources – Via visits
Acquisition and use of social responsibility competence	– Restoration projects – School renewal and construction projects – Projects based on sustainable and ecological architecture – Professional social responsibility projects – Other social projects	– City planning projects – Design projects for public building – Projects for disadvantaged groups – Housing projects	– Recreational projects – Squatter housing transformation projects – Thematic projects – Prize donations
Acquisition and use of competence in the use of foreign language	– International communication – Library search – Internet search – Job recruitment abroad	– Current university education and education abroad – Following foreign architects' speeches and seminars – Usage of computer software	– Commerce – Acknowledgement of foreign cultures – Following design contests, professional developments

	Technologies	*Computer software*	
Acquisition and use of competence in the use of technology and computer software	– Construction technologies – Nanotechnology – Material technologies – Technology on technical equipment – Construction and manufacturing technologies – Lighting	– Auto Cad – 3D Max – Photoshop – Sketch–Up – Other graphics and animation software	– MS Office applications – ArchiCAD – Corel Draw – Maya – Gusto

	Ethical skills	*Aesthetic skills*
Acquisition and use of ethical and aesthetic competences	– Business ethics – Social ethics – Environmental ethics – Ethics in design	– Architectural design and art projects – Fashion projects
Acquisition of awareness in environmental issues and workers' security	– Pollution and natural disasters – Workers' health, rights and security	– Human health – Workers' insurance

Finally, the last programme outcome in Table 1 included four perceptual attributes for the acquisition of awareness in environmental issues and with regard to workers' security. These are the acquisition of this awareness with regard to pollution and natural disasters; workers' health, rights and security; and workers' insurance. Here, Table 2 displays that awareness in terms of pollution and natural disasters, along with workers' health, rights and security (73.3 % and 66.6 % respectively) were the most frequently cited attributes, which can be seen as issues to be managed in interior architectural practices and the professional life.

Table 2.
The most and least frequently cited perceptual attributes of INAR programme outcomes

THEQF	Perceptual attributes of INAR programme outcomes	N of groups	%
Acquisition and use of theoretical and applied knowledge	Material	9	60.00 %
	Environmental control	8	53.33 %
	History of art and architecture	8	53.33 %
	Basic design	2	13.33 %
	Colour	2	13.33 %
	Other fields of design	2	13.33 %
	Mechanics	2	13.33 %
	Construction	2	13.33 %
	Environmental and social psychology	2	13.33 %
	Fire safety	1	6.67 %
	Legal, professional and social responsibility	1	6.67 %
Acquisition and use of cognitive, and intellectual skills	Communication and marketing	14	93.33 %
	Drawing	9	6.00 %
	Group work	1	6.67 %
Acquisition and use of individual and team work competences	*Team work motivations*		
	Conceptual design stage	10	66.67 %
	Large scale projects	3	20.00 %
	Individual work motivation		
	Designing stage	14	73.33 %
	Analysis stage	2	13.33 %
	Small scale projects	1	6.67 %
Acquisition and use of planning and organization competences	Phases of the design project	14	9.33 %
	Resources	12	80.00 %
	Time	8	53.33 %
Acquisition and use of learning and criticizing competence	Interior spaces and design ideas	8	53.33 %
	Student projects	2	13.33 %
	Structure	2	13.33 %
	City plans	1	6.67 %
	Design budgets and costs	1	6.67 %
	Lighting	1	6.67 %
	Ethical subjects	1	6.67 %

Acquisition and use of lifelong learning competence	Internet search	12	80.00 %
	Library search	10	66.67 %
	On- the-job training	8	53.33 %
	Learning by discussion	2	13.33 %
	Other research methods	1	6.67 %
Acquisition and use of communication competence	*Actors*		
	Other professional groups	9	60.00 %
	Interior architects, architects	8	53.33 %
	Chambers of interior architects and engineers	8	53.33 %
	Employers and managers	2	13.33 %
	NGOs	1	6.67 %
	Marketers	1	6.67 %
	Bureaucrats	1	6.67 %
	Researchers	1	6.67 %
	Interior architecture students from different universities	1	6.67 %
	Methods		
	Face to face	10	66.67 %
	Via Internet and e-mail	8	53.33 %
	Via written resources	2	13.33 %
	Via visits	2	13.33 %
Acquisition and use of competence social responsibility	Restoration	9	60.00 %
	Recreation areas	2	13.33 %
	Squatter housing transformation	1	6.67 %
	City planning projects	1	6.67 %
	Thematic issues	1	6.67 %
Acquisition and use of competence in the use of foreign language	International communication	15	100.00 %
	Library search	9	60.00 %
	Internet search	8	53.33 %
	Usage of computer software	2	13.33 %
	Commerce	2	13.33 %
	Acknowledgment of foreign cultures	1	6.67 %
	Following design contests, professional developments	1	6.67 %
Acquisition and use of competence in the use of technology and computer software	*Technologies*		
	Construction technologies	4	26.67 %
	Material technologies	4	26.67 %
	Technology on technical equipment	1	6.67 %
	Manufacturing technologies	1	6.67 %
	Lighting	1	6.67 %
	Computer software		
	AutoCAD	14	93.33 %
	3D Max	14	93.33 %
	Photoshop	12	80.00 %
	Sketch-Up	10	66.67 %
	Other graphics and animation software	9	60.00 %
	Corel Draw	2	13.33 %
	Maya	2	13.33 %
	Gusto	1	6.67 %

Acquisition and use of ethical and aesthetic competences	*Ethical competences*		
	Business ethics	9	60.00 %
	Social ethics	8	53.33 %
	Plagiarism in design	4	26.67 %
	Aesthetic competences		
	Architecture, art, form	8	53.33 %
	Fashion	3	20.00 %
Acquisition of awareness in environmental issues and workers' security	Pollution and natural disasters	10	73.33 %
	Worker health, rights and security	10	66.67 %
	Human health	2	13.33 %
	Worker insurance	2	13.33 %

The frequencies (percentages) in Table 2 also put some subjects forward among all programme outcomes. The most frequently cited perceptual attributes in the entire table reflect the most popular subjects of students' expectations among all eleven programme outcomes. These subjects whose frequencies of citation are equal or greater than 80% are acquisition and use of cognitive and intellectual skills on communication and management; acquisition and use of planning and organization competences on resources (see Note 13); acquisition and use of lifelong learning competences on internet searching; acquisition and use of competences in the use of foreign language in international communication; and acquisition and use of competences in the use of computer software such as AutoCad, 3D Max and Photoshop. According to this evaluation, improvement in communication skills, not only on a national scope but also on an international one, marketing skills, and competences in internet searching and computer software usage determine the priorities of INAR in the new programme application stage.

Discussion

In this section, we go back to our research question and try to retrieve some insights on the applicable guidelines that would facilitate BP adoption process with a conceptual approach. In other words, as Cardoso et al. (2008) examined students' perceptions for academic programme preferences, we attempt to generalize student perceptions that help us reformulate programme outcomes of INAR in Cankaya University to reach some proposals on the undergraduate educational approach for interior architecture. We recapitulated these proposals under the following headings:

Course content: Students in the department of interior architecture accepted marketing as a crucial part of the professional process. In this stage, it can be deduced that the course content in interior architecture departments should also involve information about different branches and scales of design processes ranging from urban design to product design besides the ones on architectural design and aesthetics. Moreover, the findings of this study added specific information on the

role of management and technology on the course contents in the educational programme of interior architecture. This specific information shows that acquisition and use of cognitive skills is mostly related to business making capabilities, where communication abilities seem as an important skill to be acquired. Results also revealed that knowledge acquisition on socio-cultural, economic and legal dimensions of the interior design processes would enable students to have a conceptual view and be aware of multidimensionality in design processes in interior architecture. Therefore, while updating course contents, we may state that topics should support a multi-dimensional approach in the field of interior architecture, and cover information on different fields in relation to interior architecture and design in general which is consistent with the current BP philosophy. A similar finding is also deduced by Lizzio et al. (2002), stating that curricula contents should satisfy the expectations of different programme students as well as professional parties. In this context, additional field-related courses from different departments such as marketing, technology management and law can also be included in the curricula, which is again another principle mentioned within the BP framework. The overall revision of the existing course contents and proposals for new courses may lead the department towards the reformulation of the existing INAR curricula. Heitmann (2005) also supports the significant role of students' perceptions in the conceptualization of curricula design. Moreover, this finding is consistent with the studies of Pierce and Mar Robisco (2009), who evaluate curricula design as a BP achievement.

Course teaching method: To begin with, we presume that the course teaching methods should enable students to have more experience on both individual and team working capabilities, depending on the project scale in question. A solution that we can propose is to lay out interior architectural design projects as different but related phases in which students can experience both individual and group work. Another important issue is that the courses should develop students' social interaction capabilities at national and international platforms and in their university and professional lives which will serve to improve their learning abilities and benefits we mention in the following paragraph. This result converges to those discussed by Kelvin (1993) in terms of student participation and Heitmann (2005) in terms of internalization of the higher education system for the engineering case.

Life-long learning: Here, we reckon that the main issue is about information access by using technological tools and development of interaction capabilities to gather knowledge from sector professionals. Especially the former can be a significant issue for the students to be "critical consumers", as mentioned by Cardoso et al. 2008. The presence of a high technology use, computer literacy rate and familiarity with Internet (e.g. access to e-libraries and different document sources) among students provide a favourable environment for life-long learning opportunities about the fields of architecture and interior architecture. This advantage should also be leveraged by business communication and face-to-face interaction skills. In this context, close

contacts with the industry seem as a prerequisite for developing innovative ideas, and this process should be led by universities via joint projects, meetings and/or seminars with sector professionals. We can also add that such a close contact might also enable training opportunities in the related industry for the students. Finally, to develop communication abilities we mentioned that the inclusion of additional lectures (e.g. on business communication skills) into curriculum may be suitable and might provide students with a broader vision on different aspects of the market. Business communication ability should also be enriched by learning at least one foreign language and possession of occupational jargon for improving student competences on the global level.

Ethics and social responsibility: According to the results we observed, students who are involved in different professional projects should also possess knowledge on various ethical issues such as business and environmental ethics. These issues can be translated into the field in terms of architectural and urban design projects in which students may volunteer as a sign of social responsibility. It should also be noted that knowledge acquisition on worker's health and security principles is also required for further improving social responsibility motivation in the field. In order to achieve those, field related and applicable real life social responsibility projects can be included in the curricula.

Technology: It can be derived from the results that acquisition of field related technical knowledge mainly includes computer and material technologies. These two technologies combined constitute the ones for efficiently transforming design ideas into innovative products, therefore contributing to students' creativity and market orientation. Hence, we finally mention that course contents should also include up-to-date information about related technologies.

Conclusion

In order to redevelop the programme outputs of the INAR in Cankaya University, our study aimed to explore the perceptions' of students within the framework of the THEQF. The findings of the study showed that, in BP, as Gijbels et al. (2005) discussed for the determination of learning outcomes, it is possible to formulate programme outcomes of a department through active participation of the students. In the BP process, which can be accepted as a flexible reform area for Turkish institutions in higher education (Yağcı, 2010), the perceptual results seemed also to give an insight into the THEQF's future implementation guidelines. This study revealed various attributes of programme outcomes for each qualification framework as defined in EHEA and detailed for Turkish Higher Education.

The findings of the study conclude that the students expect to benefit from the INAR programme, not only in terms of technical and theoretical aspects, but also in practical terms which underlines the rationale behind BP's multi-dimensional outcome structure. Moreover, the perceptions of students underpin the importance of

the acquisition of knowledge, skills and competences in terms of the social, economic and managerial dimensions of professional life, which should be internalized in conjunction with communicative, collaborative and interdisciplinary aspects of the profession. These are included in the BP's philosophy in the area of expected outcomes, hence student perceptions have been found to be consistent with BP philosophy in general terms.

In conclusion, the participatory process in the INAR has identified two major outputs related to the content of the educational programme, and the method of education and life-long learning besides the "generalizations" made in the discussion part. Firstly, this process has the capacity to result in a shift in the education system of the INAR from a teacher-centred to a student-focused approach as one of the goals of BP. Secondly, the perceptions of students with regard to the THEQF have derived new programme outcomes for the INAR and similar disciplines, which could help the department redesign the educational programme and its course-specific contents and outcomes. Thus, the perceptions of students can orient the INAR, while integrating student needs and expectations in course contents. Through student participation, this study has identified some feedback for the enrichment of an INAR programme that would be based on the technical, practical, social, economic, managerial, legal, communicative and collaborative dimensions of the profession. By internalizing such an approach, programme outcomes and course contents formulated by the students' own expectations, may lead to a situation in which, according to their concentration and interest areas, the students more effectively and efficiently benefit from the courses offered and from the overall curriculum. Finally, we can also claim that reaching BP outcomes may allow students to use two interrelated notions: skills and knowledge in order to develop their "core knowledge and competences needed for improving competitive power in the professional life", making BP a robust tool to be used in different disciplines of the academic field.

References

Anderson, H. M., Moore, D. L., Anaya, G., & Bird, E. (2005). Student learning outcomes assessment: A component of program assessment. *American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education*, *69*(2), 256-268.

Bakkenes, I., Vermunt, J., & Wubbels, T. (2010). Teacher learning in the context of educational innovation: Learning activities and learning outcomes of experienced teachers. *Learning and Instruction, 20*, 533-548.

Berelson, B. (1952). *Content analysis in communications research*. Glencoe, IL: Free Press.

Camp, W. G. (1990). Participation in student activities and achievement: A covariance structural analysis. *Journal of Educational Research*, *83*(5), 272-278.

Cardoso, A. R., Portela, M., Sa, C., & Alexandre, F. (2008). Demand for higher education programs: The impact of Bologna Process. *CEsifo Economic Studies*, *54*(2), 229-247.

Druckman, D., & Hopmann, P. T. (2002). Content analysis. In A. V. Kremenyuk (Ed.), *International Negotiation: Analysis, Approaches, Issues.* San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass, 288-314.

Durman, M. (2010). *Yükseköğretimde ulusal yeterlilikler çerçevesi çalışmaları, Bologna uzmanları takımı projesi, eğitim ve mimarlık fakülteleri dekanları toplantısı.* [Studies on national qualifications framework, Bologna training team project, meeting of Faculty of Education and Faculty of Architectures' deans].Hatay, Turkey/online/. Retrieved on 9th March 2012 from https://bologna.yok.gov.tr/files/dd442b8ca6ba52044f3952dc5d5f7f1a.ppt

Elias, M. (2010). Impact of the Bologna process on Spanish students' expectations. *International Journal of Iberian Studies*, *23*(1), 53-62.

Ferrão, M. (2010). E-assessment within the Bologna paradigm: Evidence from Portugal. *Assessment and Evaluation in Higher Education*, *35*(7), 819-839.

Gijbels, D., Van de Watering, G., Dochy, F., & Van den Bossche, P. (2005). The relationship between students' approaches to learning and the assessment of learning outcomes. *European Journal of Psychology of Education*, *4*, 327-341.

Harden, R. M. (2007). Learning outcomes as a tool to assess progression. *Medical Teacher*, *29*, 678-682.

HEC (2009). *Türkiye Yükseköğrenim Ulusal Yeterlilikler Çerçevesi, TYYÇ Çalışma Grubu ara raporu* [Turkish Higher Education National Qualifications Framework, Interim Report of Higher Education National Qualifications Framework (HENQF) Working Group]. Ankara: The Council of Higher Education./online/. Retrieved on 13th April 2012 from https://bologna.yok.gov.tr/files/1fd58513c8ad79fe43ca1b7c1adc4a8b.pdf

Heitmann, G. (2005). Challenges of engineering education and curriculum development in the context of the Bologna process. *European Journal of Engineering Education, 30*(4), 447-458.

Howell, J. S., Kurlaender, M., & Grodksy, E. (2010). Postsecondary preparation and remediation: Examining the effect of the early assessment program at California State University. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management, 29*(4), 746-748.

Kahraman, Z. E. (2008). *The Relationship between squatter housing transformation and social integration of rural migrants into urban life: A case study in Dikmen.* [Doctoral Dissertation, Middle East Technical University, Ankara]. Ankara: Department of City and Urban Planning.

Kahraman, Z. E. (2010). Using user-centered design approach in course design. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *2*(2), 2071-2076.

Kelvin, A. (1993). Increasing student participation in the learning process. *Higher Education*, *26*, 449-469.

Kennedy, K. J. (2007). Student construction of 'active citizenship': What does participation mean to students? *British Journal of Educational Studies*, *55*(3), 304-324.

Krippendorff, K. (1980). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology*. Beverly Hills: Sage.

Lažetić, P. (2010). Managing the Bologna Process at the European Level: institution and actor dynamics. *European Journal of Education*, *45*(4), 549-562.

Lizzio, A., Wilson, K., & Simmons, R. (2002). University students' perceptions of the learning environment and academic outcomes: Implications for theory and practice. *Studies in Higher Education*, *27*(1), 27-52.

Lizzio, A., & Wilson, K. (2009). Student participation in university governance: The role conceptions and sense of efficacy of student representatives on departmental committees. *Studies in Higher Education*, *34*(1), 69-84.

Mazollini M., & Madison, S. (2003). Sage, guide or ghost? The effect of instructor intervention on student participation in online discussion forums. *Computers and Education*, *40*, 237-253.

Öhlén, J., Furaker, C., Jakobsson, E., Bergh, I., & Hermansson, H. (2011). Impact of the Bologna process in bachelor nursing programmes: The Swedish case. *Nurse Education Today*, *31*, 122-128.

Pierce, J., & Mar Robisco, M. D. (2009). Evaluation of oral production learning outcomes for higher education in Spain. *Assessment and Evaluation in Higher Education*, 1-14.

Quarrie, S. P. (2007). Student peer review as a tool for efficiently achieving subject-specific and generic learning outcomes: Examples in Botany at the Faculty of Agriculture, University of Belgrade. *Higher Education in Europe*, *32*(2/3), 203-212.

Saarinen, T. (2005). "Quality" in the Bologna process: From 'competitive edge' to quality assurance techniques. *European Journal of Education, 40*(2), 189-204.

Savic, M. (2008). One model for the reform of the architectural HE curriculum in the context of EHEA. *Oxford Conference: A re-evaluation of education in architecture.* WIT, England.

Vermeulen, L., & Schmidt, H. G. (2008). Learning environment, learning process, academic outcomes and career success of university graduates. *Studies in Higher Education*, *33*(4), 431-451.

Visser, K., Prince, K. J. A. H., Scherpbier, A. J. J. A., Van der Vlueten, C. P. M., & Verwijnen, G. M. M. (1998). Student participation in educational management and organization. *Medical Teacher*, *20*(5), 451-454.

Voegetle, E. M., Knill, C., & Dobbins, M. (2011). To what extent does transnational communication drive cross-national policy convergence? The impact of the Bologna Process on domestic higher education policies. *Higher Education, 61*, 77-94.

Wayment, H., & Dickson, K. L. (2008). Increasing student participation in undergraduate research benefits students, faculty and department. *Teaching of Psychology*, *35*, 194-97.

Weber, R. P. (1990). *Basic content analysis*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Yağcı, Y. (2010). A Different View of the Bologna Process: The case of Turkey. *European Journal of Education*, *45*(4), 588-600.

Z. Ezgi Kahraman
Faculty of Architecture, Çankaya University
06530, Çankaya, Ankara, Turkey
ekahraman@cankaya.edu.tr

A. Orçun Sakarya
Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences
Çankaya University
06790, Etimesgut, Ankara, Turkey
sakarya@cankaya.edu.tr

Sudjelovanje studenata u bolonjskom procesu: analiza turskog iskustva

Sažetak

Studiranje prema bolonjskom procesu na Odsjeku za arhitekturu interijera (INAR) turskog Sveučilišta Çankaya počelo je 2008. Cilj ove studije jest istražiti percepcije studenata vezane uz nove programske ishode unutar okvira Turskog kvalifikacijskog okvira za visoko obrazovanje te pružiti skup smjernica za provedbu bolonjskog procesa. U procesu prikupljanja podataka proveden je upitnik sastavljen od napola strukturiranih pitanja. Za ispitivanje percepcijskih ishoda studenata upotrijebljena je metoda analize sadržaja. Pokazalo se da studenti naglašavaju važnost usvajanja znanja, vještina i kompetencija u društvenim, ekonomskim i rukovoditeljskim dimenzijama profesionalnog života. Rezultati također otkrivaju potrebe studenata za usvajanjem i upotrebom komunikacijskih, suradničkih i interdisciplinarnih aspekata samog zanimanja, kao i očekivanja u pogledu kako teorijskog, tako i praktičnog sadržaja kolegija na Odsjeku za arhitekturu interijera. U ovoj studiji, koja je uglavnom slijedila pristup kojemu je student u središtu zanimanja, donesen je zaključak da je moguće generalizirati nove programske ishode aktivnim sudjelovanjem studenata.

Ključne riječi: *kvalifikacije; percepcijski atributi; programski ishodi.*

Uvod

Lisabonski i bolonjski proces (BP) kao cilj imaju ustanoviti moćno informatičko društvo, kao i sustav cjeloživotnog učenja koji će služiti potrebnim ljudskim potencijalima. U tom smislu BP,[25] kojemu je namjera uspostaviti Europsko područje visokog obrazovanja (engl. European Higher Education Area, EHEA) usklađivanjem sustava visokog obrazovanja 46 država uključenih u proces (HEC, 2009), ima važnu ulogu jer podiže globalnu svijest o europskom sustavu visokog obrazovanja. BP sadrži deset akcijskih pravaca: usvajanje sustava koji se temelji na dva ciklusa sa stupnjevima koji su jednostavniji za razumijevanje i usporedbu; uspostavu ECTS (engl. European Credit Transfer System) sustava; jačanje suradnje na području osiguranja

[25] Studija Voegtle i sur. (2010) pruža sažetak bolonjskog procesa od njegova početka.

kvalitete uz istodobni razvoj mobilnosti; unapređenje dimenzije europskoga visokog obrazovanja; unapređenje cjeloživotnog učenja; rast ugleda EHEA istodobno s uključenjem studenata i institucija visokog obrazovanja u proces te, na kraju, spajanje EHEA s Europskim istraživačkim područjem (Heitmann, 2005). Glavni je cilj učiniti europsko područje visokog obrazovanja privlačnijim za studente i akademike s drugih kontinenata, što zahtijeva niz reformi (Elias, 2010). U tom pogledu ta dva sestrinska procesa prate usporedni put na područjima poboljšanja kvalitete odgoja i obrazovanja (Saarinen, 2005) i transparentnosti sustava visokog obrazovanja uključenih zemalja. Najvažniji aspekti BP-a su dvojaki: općeniti EHEA kvalifikacijski okvir (QF-EHEA) i Europski kvalifikacijski okvir za cjeloživotno učenje (EQF-LLL). Navedena dva okvira predstavljaju dva različita pristupa prema ostvarenju istoga cilja i uzimaju se kao neprikosnovene reference za tvorbu Turskog kvalifikacijskog okvira za visoko obrazovanje (THEQF),[26] a o kojemu će govora[27] biti u sljedećem dijelu.

Od 2001. godine Turska provodi BP. U tom razdoblju došlo je do brojnih promjena u trenutnom sustavu visokog obrazovanja, a još ih se mnogo tek očekuje. Međutim, tijekom tog razdoblja jedna od ključnih tema jest oblikovanje općenitog skupa smjernica koje bi vodile program obnove smjernica izvan okvira koji pruža EQF. U njegovu ostvarenju studenti se nameću kao glavni izvor informacija, s obzirom na to da su primarna strana uključena u novi proces. Stoga se percepcije studenata o novim programskim ishodima mogu uzeti kao bitan doprinos ostvarenju konačnog kvalifikacijskog okvira. Nadalje, s obzirom na to da kurikuli na istim odsjecima različitih fakulteta i sveučilišta (primjerice vizualni studiji i arhitektura) uključuju slične sadržaje kolegija, te se ideje mogu preuzeti i kao prilika za generalizaciju smjernica koje će se provesti tijekom procesa promjena. U tom se pogledu naše razmišljanje vodi činjenicom da se BP uglavnom temelji na pristupu u kojem je student u središtu pozornosti.

Unutar navedenog okvira cilj je ove studije redefinirati programske ishode u skladu s percepcijama studenata Odsjeka za arhitekturu interijera (INAR) Sveučilišta Çankaya s ciljem iznalaženja skupine smjernica u procesu usvajanja BP-a. Štoviše, cilj je da se srodne smjernice mogu koristiti i na odsjecima za arhitekturu interijera drugih fakulteta i sveučilišta uključenih u BP budući da obrazovni programi pretpostavljaju slične teme. Kako bi to postigla u okviru THEQF-a, ova studija predstavlja pokušaj sastavljanja unaprijeđenih programskih ishoda INAR-a utemeljenih na percepcijama

[26] THEQF je krovni koncept koji spaja programske kvalifikacije i ishode učenja prema društvenim potrebama. Uključenjem „sustavskog pristupa" uspostavlja poveznicu između visokog obrazovanja i ostalih područja obuke (na primjer cjeloživotnog učenja). Uzevši u obzir kognitivne i intelektualne vještine, kompetencije specifične za zvanje, prenosive vještine i kompetencije mogu se postaviti kao sastavnice THEQF-a.

[27] U tom je smislu korisno još se jednom referirati na službene odluke ratificirane od 2005. do 2010., na kojima je naš upitnik također neizravno utemeljen. Te su odluke sljedeće: QF-EHEA, znan i kao „Bergenska odluka", usvojena 19. i 20. svibnja 2005., koja se odnosi na šesti stupanj licenciranja obrazovanja, EQF-LLL usvojena 20. travnja 2008., koja se odnosi na prvu razinu licenciranog obrazovanja i THEQF, usvojen 2010., a oblikovan prema prethodnim okvirima za šesti stupanj obrazovanja.

i subjektivnim opisima studenata s tog odsjeka. Nakon teorijske podloge u drugom dijelu članka, u trećem dijelu studije izložen je studijski pregled bolonjskog procesa na Sveučilištu Çankaya. Dio koji slijedi bavi se metodološkim okvirom studije, koji se sastoji od procesa prikupljanja i analize podataka. Studentski percepcijski atributi vode do konačnog zaključka i prijedloga za pristup obrazovanju studenata na dodiplomskom studiju u završnom dijelu članka.[28]

Teorijski pregled: literatura

Nekolicina autora bavi se pitanjem sudjelovanja studenata u akademskim aktivnostima. Prva skupina primjera tiče se „fokalnih" pitanja poput akademskih postignuća (Camp, 1990), učenja (Kelvin, 1993), pojedinih programa provedbe (Howell i sur., 2010), elektroničkih pomagala u učenju (Mazollini i Madison, 2003) i prednosti za znanstvena istraživanja (Wayment i Dickson, 2008). Druga skupina proučava sudjelovanje studenata u „holističkim" pitanjima kao što su organizacija učenja (Visser i sur., 1998), organizacijsko državljanstvo (Kennedy, 2007) i upravljanje sveučilištem (Lizzio, 2009). U skladu s našom temom, sudjelovanje studenata također se može promatrati kao važan čimbenik u određivanju ishoda učenja (Gijbels i sur., 2005), uspješnosti na ispitima (Quarrie, 2007), uloge učitelja (Bakkenes i sur., 2009), kao i učinaka okruženja učenja na odabir studenata (Lizzio i sur., 2002; Vermuelen i Schmidt, 2008), a u konačnici u procjeni ishoda učenja (Anderson i sur., 2005).

Iz literature se daje naslutiti da se sudjelovanje studenata smatra učinkovitim alatom za dobivanje povratne informacije za akademske aktivnosti u kojima su studenti primarni dionici koji doprinose procesu. BP u temelju ima pristup u čijem je središtu student. Pritom se studente smatra „pokretačima" reforme. Ključna uloga studenata naglašava se na sljedeći način: „Bez uključivanja studenata i visokoobrazovnih ustanova provedba ne bi bila moguća, pa odluke donesene isključivo od administracije možda ne bi bile prihvaćene – dakle, svojatanje reformi je bitno, a u suprotnom postoji opasnost da će se reforme odviti isključivo na razini birokracije" (Lažetić, 2010, str. 553).

Teorijska podloga naše studije zapravo proizlazi iz srodnog političkog pristupa, u kojemu postoje dva problema koje valja naglasiti. Prvi je taj što je pretpostavka BP-a o studentu u središtu pozornosti i dalje promjena koja turskim institucijama tek predstoji (Yağcı, 2010), odnosno koju smatraju jednim od područja takozvanih „mekih" reformi u sklopu strukturalne transformacije. Drugo, premda su različiti istraživači proučili raznolike stadije BP-a, kao što su percepcije studenata u pogledu preferencija u akademskom programu (Cardoso i sur., 2008), alati za e-procjenu (Ferrão, 2010), konceptualizaciju izrade kurikula (Heitmann, 2005) i sudjelovanje studenata u pojedinim dostignućima bolonjskog procesa (primjerice izrada kurikula i ishodi učenja), navedeno se u literaturi rijetko analizira, a za to je zanimljiv primjer

[28] Željeli bismo izraziti zahvalu Fakultetu strojarstva i arhitekture i studentima INAR-a na njihovu doprinosu.

studija Pierce i Mar Robisco (2009). Sve to navelo nas je na provedbu specifičnog istraživanja koje za cilj ima dati vlastiti doprinos literaturi o bolonjskom procesu putem analize točno određenih studentskih stajališta i time dati osnovnu smjernicu i niz prijedloga za spomenuto područje „mekih" reformi.

Studija bolonjskog procesa na Odsjeku za arhitekturu interijera pri Sveučilištu Çankaya: pristup programskih kvalifikacija

Glavna misija Sveučilišta Çankaya u pogledu bolonjskog procesa uvelike se temelji na poboljšanju kvalitete obrazovanja u skladu sa standardima Europske unije. Točnije, velik broj BP strategija sadrži dodatne naputke vezane uz mjerenje i unapređenje kvalitete te poboljšanje održivosti i inovativnosti moderniziranog sadržaja kolegija. U tom smislu aktivnosti vezane uz unapređenje kvalitete uglavnom su usmjerene na fizičke i tehničke objekte kao što su laboratoriji i primarni materijali za kolegije. Kao posljedica toga rad je tek počeo na pitanjima poput dovršetka studija, otvaranja novih prilika za zapošljavanje diplomanata i jačanja prilika za akademsko napredovanje profesora specifično za pojedina područja.

Odsjek za arhitekturu interijera pri Sveučilištu Çankaya započeo je provedbu bolonjskog procesa 2008. Zbog oblikovanja „lokalne strategije" usklađene s glavnom strategijom sveučilišta, na odsjeku je izvedena SWOT analiza. Rezultati su pokazali da se, želi li se ojačati istraživački potencijal odsjeka, mora nastaviti s razvojem okruženja u kojem se učenje odvija (Vermuelen i Schmidt, 2008)[29] i da se moraju uvesti neki novi kriteriji. Proveden je niz studija kojima je osmišljen razvojni program odsjeka. Najvažniji dio svih tih studija bio je popunjavanje dvaju upitnika pod nazivom upisni upitnik (DENQ) među studentima prve godine i izlazni upitnik (DEXQ) među diplomantima. Rezultati navedenih upitnika uglavnom su isticali zajedničke točke vezane uz potrebu za kolegijima koji su usmjereni praktičnoj primjeni, detaljnije informacije o zvanju arhitekta i potencijalne sposobnosti za usvajanje znanja.

Upitnici su bili tek jedno postignuće u prvim stupnjevima analize slučaja INAR-a. Osim toga, u prvoj fazi ostvaren je razvoj i na nekim drugim područjima kao što su revizija programskih kvalifikacija u skladu s rezultatima upitnika DENQ i DEXQ, ponovni izračun bodovne vrijednosti kolegija na odsjeku na način koji bolje odražava uspješnost studenata i usklađen je s ECTS sustavom, izrada novog obrasca za opis kolegija prema Bloomovoj taksonomiji (Savic, 2008), kao i konsolidacija podataka o diplomantima radi izrade grupe elektroničke pošte i svojevrsnog stvaranja virtualne društvene mreže osmišljene s ciljem boljeg komunikacijskog okružja za dionike. Radi

[29] Jedna od glavnih prekretnica ovoga razvoja jest uvođenje novih kurikula, uglavnom usmjerenih prema globalnom svijetu zahvaljujući činjenici da su u obzir uzeti i odabiri studenata. Ti su kurikuli usmjereni na kompetencije i generičke vještine studenata. Slično je istraživanje Öhléna i sur. (2011). Osim toga, programski ishodi i ishodi učenja (Lizzio i sur., 2002; Anderson i sur., 2005; Harden, 2007; Pierce i Mar Robisco, 2009) u tom se procesu također moraju pomno razmotriti.

bolje konceptualizacije sudjelovanja u BP-u s bolonjskim procesom na državnoj razini, još jedan neodvojiv dio prvog stupnja studije činili su sastanci fakultetskog vijeća[30] s predstavnicima odsjeka INAR. Osim studenata u procesu su aktivno sudjelovali i profesori s Odsjeka.

Koristeći se prethodnim iskustvima pristupa s korisnikom u središtu pozornosti u osmišljavanju kolegija,[31] druga faza unapređenja studija oblikovana je kao pristup usmjeren na studente.[32] Kako bi se povećalo sudjelovanje studenata, osnovane su skupine studenata sa svih studijskih godina, nakon čega su ti studenti ispunili upitnik koji bismo mogli nazvati „prilagođenom inačicom" THEQF-a s obzirom na to da on ukratko predstavlja buduće studijske programe na navedenom odsjeku. U nastavku ćemo se baviti metodologijom i spoznajama dobivenim u studiji.

Metodologija

U ovoj studiji koristili smo se tehnikama kvalitativnog prikupljanja podataka kako bismo kod studenata odredili osjećaje, procjene, ponašanja i vezane značajke važne za THEQF. Tehnike prikupljanja podataka sastojale su se od analitičkih postupaka za istraživanje i klasifikaciju konceptualizacije uzorka kao atributa programskih ishoda u odnosu na THEQF. Nakon predstavljanja osnova THEQF, u ovom dijelu o metodološkom okviru raspravlja se o podacima vezanima uz obrađeni uzorak, pripremi upitnika i pitanja, zatim o postupku analize podataka.

S ciljem boljeg shvaćanja strateškog doprinosa naših spoznaja, u ovom dijelu ponovno se okrećemo QF-EHEA. Kako smo se u pripremi upitnika uglavnom vodili THEQF-om (koji je zapravo nastavak QF-EHEA) da bismo naglasili učinke rezultata na donošenje odluka i politika, korisno je detaljnije obraditi obujam THEQF-a prije nego što nastavimo s detaljnijom analizom.

Na šestoj razini QF-EHEA kvalifikacije se svode na tri kategorije: teorijsko znanje, vještine, kako kognitivne (uključujući upotrebu logičkog, intuitivnog i kreativnog razmišljanja), tako i praktične (spretnost u rukovanju predmetima, korištenje materijala, metoda, alata i instrumenata), kao i kompetencije koje se opisuju s obzirom na odgovornost i autonomiju. Zasebni ishodi učenja izražavaju se kao napredno poznavanje nekog područja rada ili proučavanja uz kritičko poimanje teorije i principa. Napredne vještine pretpostavljaju majstorstvo i inovativnost, kao i sposobnost rješavanja složenih problema u nekom području, a tu je i preuzimanje odgovornosti za odlučivanje u nepredvidivom radnom ili studijskom okruženju te upravljanje profesionalnim razvojem pojedinca ili skupine. Naravno, nacionalni okviri različitih zemalja u tome se znatno razlikuju.

[30] INAR je odsjek u sklopu Fakulteta strojarstva i arhitekture.

[31] Kahraman (2010) raspravlja o provedbi pristupa usmjerenog na korisnika u kontekstu studentskog osmišljavanja kolegija.

[32] Vidi Kelvin (1993) za detaljnu analizu sudjelovanja studenata u procesu učenja.

THEQF je većim dijelom izveden iz prije navedenih kategorija. U nacionalnom okviru „znanje" je redefinirano kao usvajanje teorijskih i praktičnih znanja uz potporu recentnih informacija putem relevantnih resursa i alata, „vještine" su razvedene kao upotreba kognitivnih i praktičnih sposobnosti za određivanje problema, provođenje analize i pronalaženja rješenja, dok „kompetencije" tvore najrazrađeniji dio THEQF-a. U THEQF-u postoje četiri potkategorije kompetencija: sposobnost samostalnog rada i preuzimanja odgovornosti, sposobnost učenja, sposobnost komunikacije (socijalna kompetencija) i profesionalne sposobnosti. Prva potkategorija uključuje preuzimanje odgovornosti u svojstvu člana tima i sposobnost razvoja projekta u smislu razvoja ostalih članova tima, dok druga podrazumijeva sposobnost kritičke procjene usvojenih tehničkih informacija zajedno s pozitivnim stavom prema razvoju aktivnosti vezanih uz cjeloživotno učenje. U trećoj potkategoriji nalaze se razvoj oralnih i pisanih vještina samoizražavanja, razmjena podataka sa stručnjacima i potpora argumenata kvalitativnim i kvantitativnim podatcima, razvoj javne svijesti uključivanjem u društveno angažirane projekte, razvoj spretnosti u izražavanju na stranom jeziku, kao i upotreba računalnih tehnologija na visokoj razini. Posljednja potkategorija bavi se profesionalnim sposobnostima. Žarišne su točke etički pristup studenata prikupljanju podataka, provedbi istraživanja i analizi rezultata. Također je uključeno i podizanje svijesti na područjima poput zaštite okoliša, zdravlja radnika i sigurnosti posla.

Proces prikupljanja podataka

Procesom prikupljanja podataka željeli smo izvući nove programske ishode za INAR iz percepcija studenata o sadržaju općih smjernica THEQF-a. U tu svrhu studenti INAR-a ispunjavali su polustrukturirani upitnik s otvorenim pitanjima.

U studiji je sudjelovao uzorak od 62 od ukupno 147 studenata. Uključili smo 14, 14, 17 i 17 studenata s prve, druge, treće i četvrte godine, čime smo pokrili oko 42 posto ukupne studentske populacije na Odsjeku. Izbor smo proveli imajući u vidu način na koji ćemo najbolje odraziti stajališta svih studenata, pod pretpostavkom da su studenti treće i četvrte godine bolje upoznati s kurikulom Odsjeka i da su njihova profesionalna očekivanja razvijenija od ostalih studenata. Stoga smo u odabiru broja i profila studenata željeli zajamčiti valjanost i pouzdanost prikupljanja podataka. Studenti su upitnike popunjavali u ukupno 15 skupina (sedam s prve i druge, osam s treće i četvrte godine), od kojih je u svakoj bilo troje do četvero studenata.

S obzirom na THEQF, kao što je spomenuto u prethodnom dijelu, naš se upitnik sastojao od 12 pitanja oblikovamih kao nastavak na THEQF koji tvore tri glavne kategorije: „znanje", „sposobnosti" i „kompetencije". Prilikom sastavljanja prvih dvaju pitanja upitnika vodili smo se znanjem i sposobnostima, dok smo se kod ostalih deset usmjerili na kompetencije, za koje smo se složili da su učinkovitije, osobito imajući u vidu profesionalni razvoj studenata.

Prve dvije skupine pitanja ticale su se očekivanja studenata u odnosu na usvajanje znanja i sposobnosti na Odsjeku. U tim dvjema skupinama našla su se pitanja kao

što su: „Koji biste tip profesionalnih znanja voljeli dobiti na INAR-u?“ i „Koji biste tip profesionalnih talenata voljeli dobiti na kolegijima INAR-a?“ Treća skupina pitanja bavi se kompetencijama te ispituje preferencije i očekivanja studenata na područjima individualnog ili timskog učenja, dostizanja određenog stupnja kritičkih sposobnosti, planiranja relevantnog za područje rada, organizacije znanja i raznoraznih istraživačkih metodologija bitnih u profesionalnom životu. Preko tih pitanja namjera nam je bila mjeriti studentska očekivanja vezana uz samostalan rad, preuzimanje odgovornosti i kapacitet za učenje. Ovo su primjeri nekih pitanja iz te skupine: U kakvim timskim ili samostalnim projektima biste voljeli sudjelovati u profesionalnom radu? Koje istraživačke metode preferirate i smatrate da trebate iskušati u profesionalnom radu? Sljedeća skupina pitanja postavljena je kako bi se otkrila studentska očekivanja o razvoju komunikacijskih vještina i socijalne kompetencije, uključujući poznavanje poslovne komunikacije. U toj skupini našla su se pitanja poput: „S kojim biste profesionalnim strankama voljeli ostvariti komunikaciju? Kojim biste sredstvima ostvarili tu komunikaciju?“ Namjera posljednje skupine pitanja bila je i otkriti preferencije u pogledu različitih ciljanih skupina te ideje studenata vezane uz društveno angažirane projekte. Još jedno pitanje u ovoj skupini ticalo se profesionalne upotrebe registara engleskog kao stranog jezika. Posljednja tri pitanja u skupini pokušala su izvući očekivanja studenata vezana uz usvajanje kompetencija bitnih za područje rada na INAR-u, tehnologije i poznavanje računalnog softvera, kao i estetskih i etičkih vrijednosti. U toj skupini našla su se pitanja kao: „Koje biste tehnologije/računalne programe voljeli usvojiti na kolegijima INAR-a?“ N kraju, prikupljani su se i podaci o drugačijim pitanjima, kao što su okoliš, sigurnost i zdravlje radnika. Ta pitanja tvore posljednju skupinu. U tom kontekstu kao primjere možemo navesti: „O kojima od navedenih tema biste voljeli doznati više: svijest o zaštiti okoliša, sigurnost i zdravlje radnika? Molimo, navedite ostale teme o kojima biste voljeli doznati više u sklopu studija.“

Analiza podataka

Analiza podataka iz ove studije odvijao se u dva koraka: (i) istraživanje percepcijskih atributa programskih ishoda; (ii) statistička analiza učestalosti citiranja percepcijskih atributa programskih ishoda.

U prvom je dijelu iz neobrađenih podataka dobivenih iz upitnika izvvađen popis percepcija radi uvida u percepcijske atribute programskih ishoda za svaki THEQF. Koristili smo se analizom sadržaja, kojom smo otkrili percepcijske atribute programskih ishoda iz reakcija studenata na svaki THEQF. Analiza sadržaja pretvara tekst iz upitnika u sadržajne kategorije slijedeći sustavna pravila kodiranja, zatim kvantificira i analizira prisutnost, značenja i odnose riječi i koncepata vezanih uz programske ishode. Drugim riječima, broji se učestalost riječi i koncepata u tekstu upitnika koji odražavaju važnost određenih tema (Berelson, 1952; Krippendorff, 1980; Weber, 1990; Kahraman, 2008).

U tom smo procesu izradili tablice podataka kako bismo uvidjeli odnose između skupina informacija i popisali teme za programske ishode. Zatim smo grupirali slične teme po skupinama i označili ih kao atribute programskih ishoda (Krippendorff, 1980; Weber, 1990; Druckman i Hopmann, 2002).

U drugom smo dijelu procesa analize podataka u svrhu ispitivanja učestalosti spominjanja svakog percepcijskog atributa programskog ishoda proveli opisnu statističku analizu. U pripremi podataka za tu vrstu analize koristili smo se asocijacijskom matricom percepcijskih atributa programskih ishoda. Pri određivanju percepcije svakog atributa svakog programskog ishoda za svakog ispitanika iz uzorka upotrijebili smo kodiranje pod šifrom. Kada je neki ispitanik naveo određeni percepcijski atribut, taj smo atribut kodirali kao „jedan", a kada u uzorku atribut nije naveden, kodirali smo ga kao „nula".

Rezultati

Kao što je prikazano u Tablici 1, analiza sadržaja otkrila nam je raznolike brojke u percepcijskim atributima za svaki THEQF, što ima potencijal iz korijena izmijeniti moguće programske ishode INAR-a. Nadalje, uzevši u obzir atribute u Tablici 1, opisnom statistikom izvedene su razlike u učestalosti navođenja svakog pojedinog percepcijskog atributa programskog ishoda. Kako je statistikom izveden dug popis u pogledu učestalosti, u Tablici 2 navedene su samo najčešće i najrjeđe navođeni percepcijski atributi svakog programskog ishoda kod studenata INAR-a. Ta tablica vodi nas kroz učestalost navođenja percepcijskih atributa kao „postotaka", što je obrađeno u dijelu koji slijedi.

U pogledu kvalifikacija, prvi dio temelji se na usvajanju teorijskih i praktičnih znanja, a u postupku analize izvedena su 23 percepcijska atributa programskih ishoda. Ti atributi prikazani u Tablici 1 povezani su s poznavanjem kreativnosti i estetike, znanjem o arhitekturi interijera i arhitekturi općenito,[33] poznavanjem ostalih područja dizajna,[34] poznavanjem pravne, profesionalne i društvene odgovornosti, poznavanjem socijalne i ekološke psihologije, poznavanjem projektnih financija i menadžmenta, marketinga, komunikacija i s tehnološkom pismenošću. Od tih ishoda povezanih s usvajanjem i upotrebom teorijskih i praktičnih znanja, kao što je prikazano u Tablici 2, najčešće navođeni percepcijski atributi tiču se poznavanja problema arhitekture interijera i arhitekture općenito (materijali 60%, kontrola okoliša 53,3 %, povijest umjetnosti i arhitekture 53,3 %). Dakle, u prvoj skupini kvalifikacija ističe se usvajanje znanja ne samo o struci već i o različitim granama dizajna, menadžmenta, marketinga, tehnologije i općenitih društvenih pitanja.

[33] Poznavanje arhitekture interijera i arhitekture sastoji se od: detalja, ergonomije, osnova dizajna, građevinarstva, aplikacije, proizvodnje i sastavljanja, izrade modela, boje, mehanike, povijesti umjetnosti i arhitekture, strukture, konceptualnog dizajna, zaštite od požara, materijala, kontrole okoliša (rasvjeta, akustika i grijanje, ventilacija i klimatizacija), crtanja (tehničko crtanje, crtanje, perspektiva i računalno crtanje).

[34] Poznavanje ostalih područja dizajna uključuje dizajn proizvoda, arhitekturu, urbano planiranje i arhitekturu krajobraza.

Druga skupina kvalifikacija bavila se usvajanjem i upotrebom kognitivnih i intelektualnih vještina, pri čemu vještine koje se tiču dizajna i zvanja,[35] analitičkog promišljanja i rješavanja problema, rada u grupi, komunikacije i marketinga[36] obično opisuju sadržaj percepcijskih atributa programskih ishoda. Najučestalije navođeno bilo je usvajanje kognitivnih i intelektualnih vještina o komunikaciji i marketingu (93,3%). Prema rezultatima, usvajanje i upotreba kognitivnih vještina uglavnom se povezuje s poslovnim sposobnostima, pri čemu se uz marketinške vještine komunikacija nameće kao ključna vještina koju valja usvojiti.

Kao što je prikazano u Tablici 1, postoje dvije skupine ishoda vezanih uz usvajanje i upotrebu kompetencija za samostalni i timski rad. To je takozvana motivacija za samostalan i timski rad. U tom kontekstu, različiti stadiji u procesu dizajna[37] motiviraju studente za usvajanje i upotrebu samostalnog i timskog rada. Štoviše, angažman na velikim projektima u skupini, zatim na manjim projektima koji su izvođeni samostalno pokazali su se kao percepcijska motivacija za upotrebu i usvajanje navedenih kompetencija. Tablica 2 upućuje na to da je angažman u različitim fazama procesa dizajna (timski rad u fazi konceptualnog dizajna 66,6 %, samostalan rad u provedbi dizajnerske ideje u projekt 73,3 %) bio najčešće navođen percepcijski atribut, kako za samostalan rad, tako i za rad u skupini. Iz toga se može zaključiti da usvajanje kompetencija za timski rad, kao i za samostalan rad, može doprinijeti različitim fazama i stupnjevima projekata s područja arhitekture interijera. Stoga bi obje navedene kompetencije mogle pripomoći usponu bolje osposobljenih arhitekata interijera.

Četvrta skupina ishoda sastavljena je od rezultata vezanih uz usvajanje i upotrebu kompetencija za planiranje i organizaciju. Percepcijski atributi prema tim kompetencijama uključuju planiranje i organizaciju procesa dizajna, resurse[38] i vremensko razdoblje. U toj skupini najčešće navođeni atribut bio je usvajanje i upotreba kompetencija za planiranje i organizaciju u procesu dizajna (93,3 %). Rezultat navodi na zaključak da bi kompetencije za planiranje mogle doprinijeti procesu dizajna na području arhitekture interijera. Dakle, ovdje percepcije studenata otkrivaju dvije faze (planiranje i organizaciju) u procesu upravljanja, čime se još jednom ističe koliko su studenti poslovno usmjereni. Stoga možemo dodati da je rezultat donekle komplementaran drugoj skupini kvalifikacija (marketing i komunikacije) koja se bavi potrebnim kognitivnim i intelektualnim vještinama.

U petoj skupini kvalifikacija, usvajanje i upotreba kompetencija za učenje i kritiku, analizom sadržaja izvedeno je 15 percepcijskih atributa. Te su kompetencije povezane s učenjem o interijeru i njegovim kritičkim promišljanjem, arhitektonskim dizajnom i arhitektonskim elementima[39] građevine, urbanim dizajnom, izvedbom, estetskim, etičkim i ekonomskim dimenzijama dizajna, dizajnerskim proizvodima i umjetninama

[35] Dizajnerske vještine uključuju trodimenzionalnu percepciju, crtanje, rukotvorine, izradu modela, kritiku i dizajn.

[36] Upravljačke su vještine planiranje, rukovođenje i organizacija.

[37] Faze u procesu dizajna su konceptualni dizajn, analiza i primjena dizajnerske ideje.

[38] Resursi su monetarni i ljudski (građevinarci, obrtnici, soboslikari i vodoinstalateri).

[39] Arhitektonski elementi su materijal, boja, rasvjeta, struktura, ergonomija, upotreba i dizajnerski detalji.

(vidi Tablicu 1). Od njih, kako se vidi iz Tablice 2, usvajanje i upotreba kompetencije za učenje i kritičko promišljanje u odnosu na interijere i dizajnerske ideje predstavlja najčešće navođen atribut (53,3 %). To znači da će studenti te kompetencije koristiti ponajviše na području arhitekture interijera, ali i na svim drugim područjima, kao i u ostalim dimenzijama dizajnerskog procesa.

Šesta skupina percepcijskih atributa izlaže usvajanje i upotrebu kompetencija za cjeloživotno učenje, koje su povezane s različitim istraživačkim metodama[40] i vizualnim resursima, praćenje stručnih izlaganja i seminara, učenje posredstvom rasprave i prakse. U toj skupini kvalifikacija u uzorku je najučestalije navođeno usvajanje i učenje cjeloživotnih kompetencija na internetu (80 %) i putem knjižnične pretrage (66,6 %). To nam pokazuje da su u sklopu procesa cjeloživotnog učenja suvremene i tradicionalne metode pretrage ravnomjerno prihvaćene kao alati za pristup informacijama.

U sedmoj skupini ishoda, akteri i metode utjecali su na stvaranje dvaju podskupina atributa u usvajanju i upotrebi komunikacijske kompetencije. Kako je prikazano u Tablici 1, profesionalci iz raznolikih područja dizajna[41], tehničko osoblje[42], tržišni partneri[43], međunarodni partneri, vladine i nevladine organizacije te akademsko društvo[44] opisuju opći okvir percipiranih aktera u procesu usvajanja i upotrebe komunikacijskih kompetencija. Percepcijske metode komunikacije uključuju komunikaciju oči u oči te komunikaciju putem usmenih, vizualnih, pisanih ili virtualnih izvora[45]. Komunikacija s arhitektima interijera, arhitektima te komorom arhitekata interijera i strojara (svaka po 53,3 %) činile su najčešće spominjane atribute. S obzirom na metode, komunikacija oči u oči (66,6 %) tvorila je najučestalije navođen percepcijski atribut (vidi Tablicu 2). Iz ove skupine ishoda izvodi se zaključak da su studenti ponajviše svjesni značajne uloge komunikacije u obrazovanju na području arhitekture interijera. Štoviše, njihova viđenja obogaćuju ovaj proces komunikacijom s raznih profesionalnim dionicima putem različitih metoda komunikacije.

Osma skupina programskih ishoda sastoji se od percepcijskih atributa, uključujući usvajanje i upotrebu kompetencije vezane uz društvenu odgovornost na projektima restauracije, održive i ekološke arhitekture, profesionalnih društveno odgovornih projekata, projekata na razini grada[46], dizajnerskih projekata za javne građevine i

[40] Istraživačke metode su knjižnična pretraga i pretraga Interneta te ostale istraživačke metode poput tehničkih posjeta i učenja putem prakse.

[41] Profesionalci s područja dizajna su arhitekti interijera, arhitekti, umjetnici i ostale profesionalne skupine (industrijski dizajneri, arhitekti krajobraza, urbani planeri i strojari).

[42] Tehničko osoblje uključuje radnike, obrtnike i tehničare.

[43] Partneri s tržišta su menadžeri, prodavači i kupci.

[44] Akademskom društvu pripadaju istraživači, znanstvenici, predavači, studenti arhitekture interijera s drugih sveučilišta.

[45] Komunikacija putem oralnih, vizualnih, pisanih i virtualnih izvora uključuje internet i elektroničku poštu, telefonske pozive, konferencije i seminare, vizualne resurse, pisane resurse i posjete.

[46] Projekti na urbanoj razini su transformacija stambenih nekretnina, planiranje, stambene nekretnine i rekreacijski projekti.

nepovlaštene skupine[47] te na tematskim projektima. Sudjelovanje u restauracijskim projektima bio je najučestalije navođen atribut za usvajanje i upotrebu kompetencije vezane uz društvenu odgovornost sa 60 %. Ovakav rezultat možda je odraz tekuće urbane transformacije u gradovima diljem Turske na ovu skupinu kompetencija.

Prilikomod usvajanja i upotrebe kompetencija u stranom jeziku, percepcijski atributi povezani su s međunarodnom komunikacijom i trgovinom, poslovnim i obrazovnim prilikama u inozemstvu, nastavkom profesionalnog razvoja, upotrebom računalne tehnologije te upoznavanjem s drugim kulturama (za dodatne informacije vidi Tablicu 1). Kao što se vidi iz Tablice 2, usvajanje i upotreba kompetencija u stranom jeziku povezana s međunarodnom komunikacijom (100 %) predstavlja najčešće navođeni atribut, čime raste značaj komunikacijskih sposobnosti studenata u pogledu praćenja profesionalnog razvoja na raznolikim područjima i na globalnoj razini.

U sljedećoj skupini programskih ishoda izložena su dva odvojena aspekta: usvajanje i upotreba kompetencija u vezi s tehnologijom i računalnim softverom. Nanotehnologija, nove tehnologije u građevinarstvu, proizvodnji, tehničkoj opremi, materijalima i rasvjeti čine percepcijsku granu tehnologije. Usto, iz studentskih stajališta proizašlo je da se pod terminom računalni softver uglavnom misli na aplikacije MS Office i programe za dvodimenzionalno i trodimenzionalno crtanje.[48] Kod tehnologije, najčešće je navođeno usvajanje i upotreba te kompetencije u građevinarstvu i tehnologiji materijala (svaka po 26,6 %). S obzirom na računalni softver, usvajanje i upotrebu te kompetencije, najčešće navođeni atributi odnosili su se na programe AutoCAD, 3DMax (po 93,3 %) i Photoshop (80 %). Takvi rezultati možda nam prikazuju svijest studenata o računalnom softveru i tehnologiji, koji služe kao sredstva za transformaciju zamisli i/ili proizvoda iz svijeta ideja u stvarnost, zatim analizu profesionalnih spoznaja.

Jedanaesti programski ishod sastojao se od usvajanja i upotrebe etičkih i estetskih kompetencija. U ovoj su skupini percepcijski atributi bili povezani s poslovnom etikom, etikom dizajna, socijalnom i ekološkom etikom (vidi Tablicu 1). Prilikom usvajanja i upotrebe estetskih kompetencija, percepcijski atributi uključivali su usvajanje i upotrebu dizajnerskih i estetskih načela u arhitektonskom dizajnu, zatim umjetničkim i modnim projektima. Primijećeno je da su najčešće navođeni atributi bili sljedeći: za usvajanje i upotrebu etičkih kompetencija poslovna etika (60 %), za usvajanje i upotrebu estetskih kompetencija, usvajanje i upotrebu dizajnerskih i estetskih načela u arhitektonskom dizajnu i umjetničkim projektima (53,3 %) (vidi Tablicu 2). U toj se skupini ističe studentsko viđenje multidimenzionalnosti etike i estetskih ciljeva na raznolikim područjima dizajna.

Tablica 1.

[47] Projekti za nepovlaštene skupine uglavnom su povezani s izgradnjom sirotišta i domova za starije, kao i projekata za invalide. Parkovi i sportski centri primjer su rekreacijskih područja.

[48] Programi za dvodimenzionalno i trodimenzionalno crtanje su AutoCAD, Photoshop, ostali softver za grafiku i animaciju, Corel Draw, Maya, 3DMax, Sketch-up, , ArchiCAD, te Gusto.

Na kraju, posljednji programski ishod u Tablici 1 sadrži četiri percepcijska atributa za podizanje svijesti o pitanjima zaštite okoliša i sigurnosti radnika. To su podizanje svijesti o onečišćenju i prirodnim katastrofama, zdravlju, sigurnosti i pravima radnika, kao i osiguranju radnika. Iz Tablice 2 razvidno je da su najčešće navođeni atributi u toj skupini bili podizanje svijesti o onečišćenju i prirodnim katastrofama, zdravlju, sigurnosti i pravima radnika (73,3 i 66,6 %), čime to postaju pitanja kojima ćemo se tek trebati pozabaviti na području arhitekture interijera i profesionalnog života općenito.

Tablica 2.

Učestalost (odnosno postotci) izloženi u Tablici 2 također donose neke nove teme na čelo programskih ishoda. Najčešće navođeni percepcijski atributi u cijeloj tablici odražavaju najpopularnije predmete studentskih očekivanja od svih jedanaest programskih ishoda. Ti predmeti, čija je učestalost navođenja viša od 80 posto, su sljedeći: usvajanje i upotreba kognitivnih i intelektualnih vještina, komunikacijskih vještina i menadžmenta, usvajanje i upotreba kompetencija vezanih uz planiranje i organizaciju resursa (vidi bilješku 13), usvajanje i upotreba kompetencija vezanih uz cjeloživotno učenje za internetsku pretragu, usvajanje i upotreba kompetencija vezanih uz izražavanje na stranom jeziku u međunarodnoj komunikaciji, zatim usvajanje i upotreba kompetencija u upotrebi računalnog softvera kao što su AutoCad, 3DMax i Photoshop. Prema toj procjeni, unaprjeđenja komunikacijskih vještina, ne samo na državnoj razini, već i na međunarodnoj, zatim upotreba marketinških vještina i kompetencija vezanih uz internet i računalni softver, odrednica su prioriteta INAR-a u novoj fazi primjene programa.

Rasprava

U ovom se dijelu vraćamo istraživačkom pitanju i pokušavamo pronaći spoznaje o primjenjivim smjernicama koje bi omogućile konceptualni pristup u procesu usvajanja BP-a. Drugim riječima, baš kao što su Cardoso i sur. (2008) ispitivali studentske percepcije u pogledu preferencija vezanih uz akademski program, mi pokušavamo generalizirati studentske percepcije koje bi nam pomogle preformulirati programske ishode na INAR-u s ciljem davanja prijedloga za pristup dodiplomskom studiju arhitekture interijera. Spomenute smo prijedloge saželi u sljedećim skupinama:

Sadržaj kolegija: studenti s Odsjeka arhitekture interijera prihvatili su marketing kao ključnu sastavnicu profesionalnog procesa. U toj se fazi izvodi zaključak da bi se u sadržaj kolegija na odsjecima za arhitekturu interijera trebale uključiti dodatne informacije o različitim granama i razinama dizajnerskog procesa od urbanog dizajna do dizajna proizvoda, a ne samo na području arhitektonskog dizajna i estetike. Nadalje, rezultati studije izložili su i specifične nove spoznaje o ulozi menadžmenta i tehnologije na sadržaj kolegija u obrazovnim programima na polju arhitekture interijera. Navedene informacije pokazuju da se usvajanje i upotreba kognitivnih vještina uglavnom povezuju sa sposobnošću za poslovne pothvate, pri čemu se komunikacijske sposobnosti nameću kao vještina koju bi bilo vrlo poželjno

usvojiti. Rezultati su također otkrili da bi usvajanje znanja o društveno-kulturalnim, ekonomskim i pravnim dimenzijama procesa dizajna interijera omogućilo studentima da usvoje i konceptualni pogled te postanu svjesni multidimenzionalnosti procesa dizajna u arhitekturi interijera. Stoga smatramo da bi uz modernizaciju sadržaja teme trebale podržavati multidimenzionalni pristup na području arhitekture interijera te pokrivati informacije s različitih područja u odnosu na arhitekturu interijera i dizajna općenito, što je dosljedno trenutnoj filozofiji bolonjskog procesa. Slični rezultati dobiveni su i u studiji Lizzio i sur. (2002), pa je izveden zaključak da bi kurikularni sadržaji trebali zadovoljavati očekivanja studenata različitih programa, kao i stručnjaka. U tom kontekstu u kurikularni sadržaj mogli bi se uključiti dodatni kolegiji sa srodnih odsjeka kao što su marketing, tehnologija menadžmenta i pravo, što je još jedno od načela koje se spominje u okviru bolonjskog procesa. Opća revizija postojećih sadržaja kolegija i prijedlozi novih kolegija mogli bi pokrenuti cijeli odsjek na preoblikovanje postojećeg kurikula INAR-a. Heitmann (2005) također podržava značajnu ulogu studentskih percepcija u konceptualizaciji osmišljavanja kurikula. Nadalje, ove spoznaje dosljedne su sa studijom Piercea i Mar Robisco (2009), koji osmišljavanje kurikula smatraju jednim od dostignuća bolonjskog procesa.

Metoda poučavanja kolegija: Za početak, radimo pod pretpostavkom da bi metoda poučavanja trebala omogućiti studentima da steknu više iskustva kako u samostalnom, tako i u timskom radu, ovisno o razmjerima projekta. Rješenje koje predlažemo jest izložiti dizajnerske projekte arhitekture interijera kao različite, ali povezane faze u kojima bi studenti mogli iskusiti i samostalni i timski rad. Drugo važno pitanje tiče se činjenice da bi putem kolegija studenti trebali razviti svoje sposobnosti za društvenu interakciju na državnim i međunarodnim platformama, zatim u sveučilišnom i profesionalnom životu, što će im poslužiti kao sredstvo za poboljšanje vlastitih sposobnosti i dobrobiti koje spominjemo u ulomku koji slijedi. Ti su rezultati u skladu sa studijom Kelvina (1993) u pogledu sudjelovanja studenata i Heitmanna (2005) u pogledu internalizacije sustava visokog obrazovanja u skupini strojara.

Cjeloživotno učenje: U ovoj cjelini smatramo da se glavno pitanje tiče pristupa informacijama upotrebom tehnoloških alata i razvojem interakcijskih sposobnosti s ciljem prikupljanja znanja od profesionalaca iz struke. Osobito to posljednje može biti od velikog značaja za studente kao „ključne konzumente", kako je napomenuto i u Cardoso i sur. 2008. Prisutnost upotrebe visoke tehnologije, računalna pismenost i upoznatost s Internetom (na primjer, pristup e-knjižnicama i različitim izvorima dokumenata) u studentskoj populaciji stvara povoljno okružje za cjeloživotno učenje u području arhitekture i arhitekture interijera. Prednosti ovoga naglašavaju i poslovna komunikacija te interakcijske vještine izravne komunikacije. U tom kontekstu bliski kontakti s industrijom doimaju se kao preduvjet za razvoj inovativnih ideja, a taj proces trebali bi povesti upravo fakulteti putem zajedničkih projekata, sastanaka i/ili seminara sa stručnjacima iz struke. Takvi bi kontakti pružili studentima i prilike za praksu u poslovnom svijetu. Napokon, u cilju razvoja komunikacijskih prilika

napomenuli smo da bi se dodatak predavanja (primjerice o vještinama poslovne komunikacije) u kurikul mogao pokazati korisnim te omogućiti studentima šire viđenje različitih tržišnih aspekata. Sposobnosti poslovne komunikacije trebale bi se obogatiti učenjem bar jednog stranog jezika i baratanjem profesionalnim žargonom za unaprjeđenje studentskih kompetencija na globalnoj razini.

Etika i društvena odgovornost: Prema dobivenim rezultatima, studenti uključeni u različite profesionalne projekte trebali bi također posjedovati znanje o raznolikim etičkim pitanjima kao što su poslovna i ekološka etika. Ta se pitanja vrlo lako mogu prevesti u terminologiju projekata arhitektonskog i urbanog dizajna u kojima studenti mogu volontirati, čime bi pokazali i osjećaj za društvenu odgovornost. Isto tako, za daljnje unaprjeđenje motivacije za društvenu odgovornost na ovome profesionalnom polju potrebno je i upoznati se s načelima sigurnosti i zdravlja radnika. U svrhu ostvarenja navedenoga, u kurikul bi trebalo uključiti primjenjive i stvarne društveno odgovorne projekte iz srodnih područja.

Tehnologija: Rezultati upućuju na zaključak da se usvajanje srodnih tehničkih znanja uglavnom odnosi na računalnu tehnologiju i tehnologiju materijala. Te dvije tehnologije zajedno predstavljaju temelj za učinkovitu pretvorbu dizajnerskih ideja u inovativna rješenja, čime doprinose kreativnosti studenata te ih usmjeravaju prema tržištu. Dakle, na kraju je bitno napomenuti da bi sadržaj kolegija trebao uključiti najnovije informacije s područja relevantnih tehnologija.

Zaključak

Naša studija imala je za cilj istražiti percepcije studenata u okviru THEQF-a s ciljem preinake programskih ishoda odsjeka INAR pri Sveučilištu Cankaya. Rezultati su pokazali da, kao i u slučaju rasprave o određenju ishoda učenja kod Gijbels i sur. (2005) zaista jest moguće osmisliti programske ishode odsjeka putem aktivnog sudjelovanja studenata. U bolonjskom procesu, koji se može prihvatiti kao fleksibilno područje reformi za turske ustanove visokog obrazovanja (Yağcı, 2010), percepcijski rezultati također su omogućili uvid u buduće provedbene smjernice THEQF-a. Ovom studijom otkriveni su razni atributi programskih ishoda za svaki kvalifikacijski okvir prema odrednicama EHEA za tursko visoko obrazovanje.

Zaključak koji se nameće iz rezultata studije jest da studenti očekuju koristi od programa INAR-a, ne samo u obliku tehničkih i teoretskih znanja i vještina, već i u praktičnom smislu, čime se naglašavaju temeljna počela mutidimenzijske strukture ishoda u bolonjskom procesu. Nadalje, studentske percepcije ističu i važnost usvajanja znanja, vještina i kompetencija u društvenoj, ekonomskoj i upravljačkoj dimenziji profesionalnog života, koje bi se trebale steći i razviti uz komunikacijske, suradničke i interdisciplinarne aspekte ovoga zvanja. Sve navedeno uključeno je i u filozofiju bolonjskog procesa na području očekivanih ishoda te su stoga studentske percepcije dosljedne općoj filozofiji bolonjskog procesa.

Na kraju, sudjelovanjem studenata istaknula su se dva glavna ishoda povezana sa sadržajem obrazovnih programa, kao i metoda poučavanja i cjeloživotno učenje, osim generalizacija koje smo naveli u raspravi. Prvo, ovaj proces ima sposobnost pokrenuti promjenu u obrazovnom sustavu INAR-a s pristupa usmjerenog na nastavnika ka pristupu usmjerenom na studenta, što je jedan od ciljeva bolonjskog procesa. Drugo, percepcije studenata o THEQF-u izvele su nove programske ishode za INAR i slične discipline, što bi moglo pomoći odsjeku u unaprjeđenju obrazovnog programa, kao i sadržaja i ishoda pojedinih kolegija. Stoga viđenja studenata mogu usmjeriti INAR i istodobno integrirati studentske potrebe i očekivanja u sadržaj kolegija. Zahvaljujući sudjelovanju studenata, ovom studijom otkrili smo određene povratne informacije za obogaćenje programa INAR-a koje bi se temeljilo na tehničkim, praktičnim, društvenim, ekonomskim, upravljačkim, pravnim, komunikacijskim i suradničkim dimenzijama zvanja. Usvajanjem takvog pristupa, programski ishodi i sadržaj kolegija oblikovani na temelju očekivanja studenata dovest će do situacije u kojoj će studenti moći ostvariti veću korist od kolegija i kurikula općenito, prema vlastitim područjima interesa. U konačnici, tvrdimo i da bi ostvarenje ishoda bolonjskog procesa omogućilo studentima upotrebu dvaju uzajamno povezanih fenomena: vještina i znanja s ciljem razvoja „ključnog znanja i kompetencija potrebnih za poboljšanje konkurencijske moći u profesionalnom životu", čime bolonjski proces postaje snažan alat u različitim područjima akademskog života.