# LÁSZLÓ DOBSZAY'S RESEARCH OF MEDIAEVAL CHANT SOURCES FROM THE ZAGREB BISHOPRIC — ITS IMPORTANCE AND RECEPTION IN THE CONTEXT OF THE MUSIC HISTORY OF THIS REGION<sup>1</sup>

#### HANA BREKO KUSTURA

Odsjek za povijest hrvatske glazbe HAZU Opatička 18 10 000 ZAGREB UDK/UDC: 78.072: 78.033 (497.5Zagreb) Dobszay

Pregledni rad/Review Paper Primljeno/Received: 10. 4. 2015. Prihvaćeno/Accepted: 8. 5. 2015.

#### Abstract

One of the most important Hungarian musicologists, chant scholar and conductor, Prof. László Dobszay, PhD (1935-2011), made a significant contribution to our knowledge about Mediaeval chant practice of the Zagreb bishopric in  $11^{\rm th} - 18^{\rm th}$  century period. He discovered and labelled its new liturgical sources, drew up and edited inventories of the antiphonaries from Mediaeval Zagreb, and drew new conclusions that have changed the general view about the peculiarities of *ritus et consuetudo almae ecclesiae zagrabiensis*.

This paper deals with the role of his research on the Zagreb Mediaeval rite. Furthermore, it presents reception of Dobszay's

scientific work in the writings of Croatian music historians and musicologists from 1995 onwards, and rethinks the importance of his discoveries in the context of the general music history of the Hungarian-Croatian region in the Middle Ages.

Key words: László Dobszay, chant manuscripts, Mediaeval Zagreb liturgy, the oldest missal from Zagreb: Gü 1/43 (13<sup>th</sup> century), CAO-ECE Kalocsa-Zagreb

Ključne riječi: László Dobszay, srednjovjekovne glazbene knjige biskupije Zagreb, najstariji zagrebački missal: Gü 1/43, 13. stoljeće, CAO-ECE Kaloča-Zagreb

<sup>1</sup> This article is an expanded version of my paper presented in Budapest, on October 11-13, 2012 at the 9<sup>th</sup> International Conference of the Hungarian Musicological and Music Critics' Day — »In memoriam László Dobszay.« My thanks go to Prof. Dr. László Vikarius and Dr. Gábor Kiss for their kind invitation to this conference.

#### Introduction

The aim of this contribution is to present an overview of the most important research results and discoveries by Prof. László Dobszay<sup>2</sup> about Mediaeval chant manuscripts from the Zagreb bishopric.

The main goal is to analyse their importance for the history of music of southern Hungary, and especially their importance for a new historical view on the history of liturgy and music in the Mediaeval bishopric of Zagreb. I have tried to summarize the importance of his work, not only from the aspect of Hungarian historiography, but also from the point of view of today's Croatian Mediaeval music history and liturgy.

It was impossible to write such a contribution without personal comment and insight into his writings. My collaboration with Prof. Dobszay opened up to me »new horizons« on the Church history of our regions and gave me the impulse for new investigations. It was during the »Cantus planus« meeting of the IMS in Sopron, in late August 1995 when I first met Prof. László Dobszay. This was beginning of our long-term collaboration that lasted for almost seventeen years, until his death in 2011.

My first acquaintance with his *oeuvre* dedicated to liturgical sources of the Mediaeval bishopric of Zagreb was during a study trip to the Institute for Musicology in Budapest in 1996 that was supported by the Research Support Scheme (Open Society Foundation). I learnt not only a huge number of new facts concerning the formation of the Zagreb liturgical rite during that visit, but, what is most important, it was the personal dialogue with him that enriched my research methods and ways of thinking. His doctoral students and I have experienced several important issues with him: his methods of scientific research, his approach to every single problem in the repertoire and historical investigations of the chant sources, and finally his detailed knowledge about Mediaeval Latin language, the

<sup>2</sup> »L. Dobszay was born in Szeged in 1935. He studied history and literature at the Lóránd Eötvös University in Budapest and music (composition and piano) at the Franz Liszt Academy of Music in Budapest. He also studied folk music with Zoltán Kodály and the history of music. For a decade from 1956 he was principally occupied with pedagogical activities, writing papers, composing music and compiling materials as part of a wide-ranging reform of the Hungarian music teaching system. In 1966 he was invited by Kodály and Benjamin Rajeczky to join the Folk Music Research Group of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences, which was integrated in 1974 into the newly formed Institute for Musicology. As well as undertaking field collection in North-East Hungary and Transylvania he worked on the classification of melody and comparative studies in the history of folksong on the one hand, and that of written European melodic traditions on the other. At the same time, Laszló Dobszay was making equally fundamental contributions to liturgical chant studies, surveying sources and repertoires and classifying their contents on a systematic melodic basis, with the result that when the call came to compile a new history of Hungarian music the chapters on chant could be written with unique authority ... « David HILEY: Laudatio, in: Laborare fratres in unum, Festschrift László Dobszay zum 60. Geburtstag (ed. by J. Szendrei, and D. Hiley), Spolia Berolinensia: Berliner Beiträge zur Mediävistik, vol. 7, Weidmann, Hildesheim 1995, VII-VIII. For a bibliography of Dobszay's most important works see: http://earlymusic.zti.hu/dl\_bibl.htm (updated on August 14, 2013).

Mediaeval liturgy and musical repertoire of the Hungarian regions, including those of the Zagreb bishopric, too. Most fascinating with Prof. Dobszay was his profound knowledge about the repertoire peculiarities of each source from the southern Hungarian regions, mostly those of the bishopric of Kalocsa and its southern provincial churches — namely, those belonging to the bishopric of Zagreb, established in 1094.<sup>3</sup>

#### The most important studies on Zagreb medieval rite by L. Dobszay

Let me mention Dobszay's most important studies on the Zagreb Mediaeval rite and music, in chronological order:

# László Dobszay: Árpád-kori kottás misekönyvünk provenienciája. [Provenance of our 13<sup>th</sup> century missale notatum from the Árpád period], *Zenetudományi Dolgozatok*, Budapest 1984, 7-12.

In his article published in the Hungarian language in 1984, L. Dobszay announced for the first time the »discovery« of a *new* source for mass-liturgy in the 13<sup>th</sup> century Zagreb bishopric. The mass book dated 1230<sup>4</sup>, known and labelled before as *Missale Güssingense*<sup>5</sup> was newly determined for the first time in this Dobszay study as being »the oldest mass-book written in Zagreb and for usage in one of the Zagreb (parish) churches«.<sup>6</sup>

The main arguments hinting at the Zagreb bishopric as the provenance of this missal are:

Firstly: Dobszay states that »in the main corpus of this chant book names of the Hungarian saints are missing.«<sup>7</sup> Prayers for the feasts of Stephen and Ladislaus

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Cf. György GYÖRFFY: Zur Frage der Grundung des Bistums von Zagreb, in: Zagrebačka biskupija i Zagreb 1094.-1994. [Zagreb Bishopric and Zagreb 1094-1994], Zbornik u čast kardinala Franje Kuharića [Proceedings in honour of Cardinal Franjo Kuharić] (ed. by Antun Škvorčević), Nadbiskupija zagrebačka — KBF Sveučilišta u Zagrebu, Zagreb 1995, 103-107; Nada KLAIĆ: Zagreb u srednjem vijeku [Zagreb in the Middle Ages], Sveučilišna naklada Liber, Zagreb 1982; Franjo ŠANJEK: Crkva i kršćanstvo u Hrvata, Srednji vijek [Church and Christianity among the Croats, the Middle Ages], Kršćanska sadašnjost, Zagreb 1993, 126-127.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> For datation of this codex see Polycarpus RADÓ: *Libri liturgici manuscripti bibliothecarum Hungariae et limitropharum regionum*, Akadémiai Kiadó, Budapest 1973, 78-83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Arnold MAGYAR: 340 Jahre Franziskaner in Güssing (1638-1978), Selbstverlag Franziskanerkloster, Güssing 1980, 252; Arnold MAGYAR: Missale, (vor 1230), XIII. Jhds, 1/43, Description of the oldest Zagreb missal, manuscript; Janka SZENDREI: A magyar középkor hangjegyes forrásai [Notated Sources of the Hungarian Middle Ages], Mühelytanulmányok a Magyar Zenetörténethez 1, [Studies to Hungarian Music History], Catalogue of Sources, MTA Zenetudomány intézet, Budapest 1981.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> László DOBSZAY: Árpád-kori kottás misekönyvünk provenienciája [Provenance of our missale notatum from the Árpád period], *Zenetudomány Dolgozatok*, Budapest 1984, 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Cf. L. DOBSZÂY: *Ībid*, 11-12.

are written in the calendar of the book, and only *in margine*, i.e. as later additions, in the main corpus of this manuscript.

Secondly: the feast of St George is commemorated on April 23. It is notable that the Hungarian Archbishopric of Esztergom venerated its saint patron Adalbert on the same day.<sup>8</sup>

Finally, in the votive-prayer that recalls the intermediation of all Saints, known as *A cunctis-prayer* in which the name of St Maria, Paul and Peter and All Saints are mentioned, an official rule was to insert the name of the church patron immediately after name of St Paul. In our case it was a name of St Stephen, a patron of Zagreb bishopric: *»Beatis apostolis tuis Petro et Paulo et beato Stephano rege et confessore tuo et omnibus sanctis.*«<sup>9</sup> At that time, the bishop of Zagreb was Stephen II (1225-1247), who contributed greatly to the improvement of the education system in Zagreb and to the arrival of the monastic orders, especially those of Dominicans and Franciscans.<sup>10</sup>

Dobszay shows that this chant book was used in Zagreb even after the reform of Bishop Augustin Kažotić in the 14<sup>th</sup> century,<sup>11</sup> since later additions in this missal testify to this fact very clearly.<sup>12</sup>

What is the importance of this discovery by Dobszay?

In the context of that what he calls the »System of Hungarian Plainsong Sources«,<sup>13</sup> this chant book represents the oldest example of the »Hungarian Esztergom Music Notation.«<sup>14</sup> At the same time, this manuscript represents the oldest chant book belonging to the southern Hungarian province of Kalocsa-Bacs.<sup>15</sup> Together with the Missal MR 70 kept today in Zagreb Metropolitan Library, whose

<sup>10</sup> Cf. Baltazar Adam KRČELIĆ: Historiarum cathedralis ecclesiae zagrabiensis partis primae tomus primus, Zagrabiae 1770, hrvatski prijevod Z. Šešelj: Povijest stolne crkve zagrebačke, Institut za suvremenu povijest, Zagreb 1994; Hana BREKO: Misal MR 70 zagrebačke Metropolitanske knjižnice, Kontekst nastanka i primjene srednjovjekovnoga glazbenoga rukopisa, [Missal MR 70 of the Zagreb Metropolitan Library], HMD, Zagreb 2003, 59-61; Marijan BIŠKUP: Augustin Kažotić u riječi i slici [Augustin Kažotić in Words and Pictures], Izdavačka naklada Istina, Zagreb 2013.

<sup>11</sup> Cf. N. KLAIĆ: Zagreb u srednjem vijeku, 494-498; Miho DEMOVIĆ: Glazbena djelatnost Augustina Kažotića (1260?-1323), Sveta Cecilija, 39 (1969) 3, 76-78; F. ŠANJEK: Crkva i kršćanstvo u Hrvata, Srednji vijek, 170-177.

<sup>12</sup> Cf. L. DÓBSZAY: Árpád-kori kottás misekönyvünk provenienciája, 11.

<sup>13</sup> László DOBSZAY: The System of the Hungarian Plainsong Sources, *Studia musicologica* Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae, 27 (1985), 37-65.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Chant books from Esztergom celebrate the feast of St George on April 24. Cf. *ibid.*, 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> *Ibid.,* 10. See also: László DOBSZAY (with the help of Gergely Bartha, Miklós Földváry and Janka Szendrei): *Historia Sancti Stephani regis* 1190-1270, The Institute of Mediaeval Music, Ottawa 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> For detailed analysis of the neumatic notation from this Zagreb missal see in: Janka SZENDREI: Die Geschichte der Graner Choralnotation, *Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae*, 30 (1988), 76-80.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Dobszay pointed out that the most probable way in which this chant manuscript could have arrived in Güssing is that it was brought to Austria by some Zagreb cleric during the Turkish invasion of the Croatian lands in the 16<sup>th</sup> century. Cf. L. DOBSZAY: Árpád-kori kottás misekönyvünk provenienciája, 11.

marginal additions are of local, Zagreb origin,<sup>16</sup> »this chant book represents the only preserved relic used in the Zagreb Mediaeval rite in the 13<sup>th</sup> century.«<sup>17</sup>

For the history of the Zagreb Mediaeval rite, practised till the year 1788,<sup>18</sup> this manuscript fills the gap of notated Mediaeval mass manuscripts in the 13<sup>th</sup> century. Namely, almost all Zagreb missals originating from the 14<sup>th</sup> century onwards employ the »Graner Choral Notation«<sup>19</sup> only in recitations: *Exultet, Praefatio*, etc. László Dobszay points out a »controversy« connected with this source. Namely, the main corpus of the missal follows an »old layer« of liturgy. Argumentation for this statement derives from the presence of the rubric for the Octave of Pentecost. At the same time, all other contemporary missals from the 13<sup>th</sup> century have instead at this point a mass for Trinity Sunday.

He posed a very important question that should be answered in our future research of this chant book from Zagreb: namely, how is it possible that a book written according to an old layer of the Hungarian rite, using advanced Esztergom neumatic notation that he calls »Hungarian revolution«, leaves out in the Sanctorale the masses for the important Hungarian Saints?

# László Dobszay: The System of the Hungarian Plainsong Sources, Studia musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae, Tomus XXVII, 1985, 37-65.

This article was meant primarily as an outline of the manuscripts representing the Hungarian Gregorian practice.<sup>20</sup> In this study Dobszay mentions three oldest manuscripts brought from Hungary to the newly established diocese of Zagreb — Sacramentary MR 126, Benedictionale MR 89 and Pontificale MR 165.<sup>21</sup> All three

<sup>18</sup> Cf. Dragutin KNIEWALD: Iluminacija i notacija zagrebačkih liturgijskih rukopisa [Illumination and Notation of Zagreb Liturgical Codices], *Rad HAZU*, 279, Zagreb 1944, 7; H. BREKO: Mittelalterliche liturgische Gesangbücher der Diözese, 10.

<sup>9</sup> J. SZENDŘEI: Die Geschichte der Graner Choralnotation, 5.

 <sup>20</sup> László DOBSZAY: The System of the Hungarian Plainsong Sources, Studia musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae, Tomus XXVII, 1985, 37.
<sup>21</sup> On these chant manuscripts cf. N. KLAIĆ: Zagreb u srednjem vijeku, 487-491; Dragutin

<sup>21</sup> On these chant manuscripts cf. N. KLAIĆ: *Zagreb u srednjem vijeku*, 487-491; Dragutin KNIEWALD: Zagrebački liturgijski kodeksi XI.-XV. stoljeća. Codices liturgici manuscripti zagrabiensis a saeculo XI. usque ad finem s. XV, *Croatia Sacra, Arhiv za crkvenu povijest Hrvata*, 10 (1940) 19, 7-16, 26-30; D. KNIEWALD: Iluminacija i notacija zagrebačkih liturgijskih rukopisa, 11-15, 18-21; Albe VIDAKOVIĆ: Sakramentar MR 126 Metropolitanske knjižnice u Zagrebu [Sacramentary MR 126 of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Hana BREKO: Misal MR 70 zagrebačke Metropolitanske knjižnice..., 60-61.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Ibid., 61. Cf. Hana BREKO: Mittelalterliche liturgische Gesangbücher der Diözese Zagreb, Arti musices, 28 (1997) 1-2, 3-17; Hana BREKO: Zur Frage des Entstehungs- und Verwendungskontextes von Codex MR 70 der Zagreber Metropolitanbibliothek, *Cantus Planus*, Proceedings from the meeting of the Cantus planus study group of the IMS held in Esztergom and Visegrád, Budapest 1998, 29-43; Hana BREKO: Srednjovjekovne liturgijsko-glazbene veze nadbiskupije Ostrogon i biskupije Zagreb: sličnosti i razlike [Mediaeval Liturgical and Musical Connections of the Archbishopric of Esztergom and the Bishopric of Zagreb: Similarities and Differences], in: *Croato-Hungarica, uz 900. godina hrvatskomađarskih povijesnih veza* [Croato-Hungarica, on the occasion of the 900<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of Croatian and Hungarian Historical Connections] (ed. by M. Jauk-Pinhak, G. Cs. Kiss, I. Nykomarkay), Katedra za hungarologiju Filozofskog fakulteta Zagreb and Matica hrvatska, Zagreb 2002, 129-140.

chant books are kept today in the Metropolitan Library in Zagreb, and notated with German neumatic notation. Earlier, it was still difficult to »identify their provenance with certainty.«<sup>22</sup>

In 1984 Dobszay, as shown above, had already identified the provenance of »missale notatum« kept in Güssing, as being the oldest chant book made for Zagreb diocese. In this text he points out that the cultural orientation of Croatia that had lived in close confederation with Hungary for centuries »varied according to the two regions into which she was culturally divided.«<sup>23</sup> The music of coastal Dalmatia was characterized by the Beneventan and middle-Italian influences that corresponded with the general outline of this regional culture, »while the territory of Zagreb diocese developed in the wide cultural environment of the Mediaeval Carpathian Basin.«<sup>24</sup> Accordingly, the *missale notatum zagrabiense* »fits in well with the coherent group of Hungary's musical sources«<sup>25</sup> writes Dobszay.

At the time as he wrote this article, Hungary still appeared as a »blank spot« on the map presenting Mediaeval notations and music.<sup>26</sup> This investigation served as a general survey of Gregorian chant sources from this region. It presented methods for their future investigation. Dobszay divided the types of Hungarian sources into four groups.

Zagreb sources that represent an example of Mediaeval musical practice of the archbishopric of Kalocsa belong, according to Dobszay, to the second group of sources. This means they are »uniform in general with the first group, and represent the *mos patriae* in the broader sense of word.«<sup>27</sup> On the other hand, they have their own liturgical and musical variants!<sup>28</sup>

<sup>23</sup> L. DOBSZAY: The System of the Hungarian Plainsong Sources, 38.

<sup>24</sup> Ibid.

<sup>25</sup> Ibid., 38.

<sup>26</sup> *Ibid.*, 38. Cf. Janka SZENDREI: Choralnotation als Identitätsausdruck im Mittelalter, *Studia Musicologica*, 27 (1988), 139-170.

<sup>7</sup> L. DOBSZAY: The System of the Hungarian Plainsong Sources, 42.

<sup>28</sup> H. BREKO: Mittelalterliche liturgische Gesangbücher der Diözese Zagreb, 7. Cf. Hana BREKO KUSTURA: Hrvatski srednjovjekovni glazbeni kodeksi — na razmeđi različitih kulturnih tradicija [Croatian Medieval Chant Codices — at Crossroads of Different Cultural Traditions], *Svečani zbornik u čast Tomislava Raukara* [Essays Presented in Honour of Tomislav Raukar] (ed. by N. Budak), Filozofski fakultet u Zagrebu, Zagreb 2005, 107-120.

the Zagreb Metropolitan Library], *Rad JAZU*, 287, Zagreb 1952, 53-85; Zoran HUDOVSKY: Razvoj muzičke kulture u Zagrebu od 11. do konca 17. stoljeća [Development of the Musical Culture in Zagreb from 11th till the End of the 17th Century], *Rad JAZU*, 351, Zagreb 1969, 5-61; J. SZENDREI: A magyar középkor hangjegyes forrásai 18-24; Katarina LIVLJANIĆ: *Exultet zagrebačke stolnice od osnutka biskupije 1094. do godine 1511.*, [The *Exultet* of Zagreb Cathedral in the 1094-1511 Period], Master Thesis, Library of the Music Academy in Zagreb, 1992, manuscript; Katarina LIVLJANIĆ: Skica o glazbenomu životu zagrebačke stolnice u srednjemu vijeku [Sketch about Musical Life of the Zagreb Cathedral in the Middle Ages], *Zagrebačka biskupija i Zagreb 1094.-1994.* (ed. by Antun Škvorčević), Zagreb 1995, 521-526.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> László DOBSZAY: The System of the Hungarian Plainsong Sources, Studia musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae, 27 (1985), 38. Cf. Ivan ŠAŠKO: Zagrebački pontifikal MR 124 (Metropolitanska knjižnica u Zagrebu, MR 124) [Pontifical MR 124 of the Zagreb Metropolitan Library], diplomatičko izdanje rukopisa i prikaz liturgijskoga ozračja, Tkalčić, Zagreb 2005.

Dobszay points out local melodic variants from the Zagreb codices. He shows that they have been »motivated perhaps by strivings for national independence...«29

#### László Dobszay: Plainchant in Mediaeval Hungary, Journal of the Plainsong and Medieval Music Society, 1990, vol. 13, 49-78.

In 1990, Dobszay published in a Cambridge journal an overview about introduction of the Gregorian chant in Mediaeval Hungary. He pointed out the most important sources of musical and liturgical repertoire with focus on notated manuscripts and the sociological circumstances under which this kind of musical culture flourished.<sup>30</sup> He analysed the sociological context of the chant practice in Hungary, and described in detail educational curriculums in Mediaeval Hungarian chapters, that »run as 'ars modulandi' and were trained especially with purpose of participating in liturgical services«.<sup>31</sup> In this context he mentions one very important hypothesis: »The Hungarian chant tradition is homogeneous but not a monolithic chant tradition«.<sup>32</sup> Furthermore, he explains the importance of the oldest notated missal from Zagreb, and draws attention to its notation as being a »representative of the whole Kalocsa archbishopric.«<sup>33</sup>

The importance of this paper at an international level lies in fact that we find for the first time, in one place:

• a detailed description of the research phases of the Hungarian chant traditions;

• a list of chant peculiarities familiar to the Hungarian churches;

• description of the local interpretations of the chant, and their melodic characteristics.

This important article figured at the time as the most recent presentation of scientific literature about the Hungarian Gregorian chant, and served as a practical 

<sup>30</sup> László DOBSZAY: Plainchant in Medieval Hungary, Journal of the Plainsong and Medieval Music *Society*, 13 (1990), 49-78. <sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*, 54.

<sup>34</sup> Ibid., 50-51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> L. DOBSZAY: The System of the Hungarian Plainsong Sources, 42.At this point, in the context of local liturgical rites as »symbols of independence«, one could draw a parallel with the long life of the Beneventan chant tradition in mediaeval Dalmatia. Namely, as indicated recently: »While the phenomenon of the Beneventan culture in southern Italy was gradually replaced after the mid-11th century by the Gregorian chant and Roman liturgy, in Dalmatia, this phenomenon continued its life until the end of the 13th century. The reason for the long life of the Beneventan chant and script in Dalmatia (whose 'ordo', for example, in the Dubrovnik Pontifical from the late 13th century is clearly called 'secundum Dalmatinos'!) was explained by Richard F. Gyug in the year 2000. The Beneventan chant meant different things in Dalmatia than it had in the eight-century Benevento. It was a kind of a symbol of the aspirations of the Dalmatian cities for Church independence in relation to the territorial claims of Venice and Norman Italy.« Hana BREKO KUSTURA: Introductory word, Arti musices, 45 (2014) 2, 142

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Ibid., 52.

## Corpus Antiphonalium Officii — Ecclesiarum Centralis Europae: (CAO-ECE), 6A (Temporale), 6B (Sanctorale), Kalocsa-Zagreb, ed. by L. Dobszay and A. Kovács, Zenetudomaányi Intézet, Budapest 2008.

Dobszay was the initiator and founder of the Corpus Antiphonalium Officii-Ecclesiarum Centralis Europae (CAO-ECE) series. The main idea of this project was to give a historical survey of the rich varieties of the Offices tradition in medieval Europe. The 6<sup>th</sup> volume of the CAO-ECE project is dedicated to the Office chant tradition in Mediaeval Kalocsa and Zagreb. Two volumes — Temporale (6A) and Sanctorale (6B) represent inventory of the up-to-date but unknown Office chants sung for more than seven centuries in Zagreb Cathedral. Sixteen sources related to the Zagreb liturgical rite are listed and thoroughly analysed for the first time in this edition. This work is an inescapable base for future investigations of the particularities of the Sanctorale and Temporale in the Zagreb Office manuscripts.

## László Dobszay and Janka Szendrei: Hungarian Gregorian Chant, in: Music in Hungary, an illustrated history, ed. by János Kárpáti, Rószavögyi and Co., Budapest 2011, 30-43.

In his latest article, »Hungarian Gregorian Chant« printed in the book Music in Hungary, Dobszay (as co-author with Janka Szendrei), stresses the place of the Esztergom chant tradition as »being the most homogeneous, and at the same time, the most Hungarian tradition of the country.«<sup>35</sup> On this very occasion he points out that in the dioceses of the southern provinces, Kalocsa and Zagreb developed their local musical traditions.

I would stress once more at this point that the Mediaeval church in Zagreb preserved its local tradition longer than all other parts of the kingdom, namely until the second half of the 18<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>36</sup>

In 1788, Bishop Maksimilijan Vrhovac forbad the usage of »ritus et consuetudo almae ecclesiae zagrabiensis« and hinted at introduction of the Roman rite. In the same article, Dobszay continues his analysis of the chant sources from Mediaeval Hungary, with chronology of the Mediaeval ones. He focuses again on the earliest sources from the late 11<sup>th</sup> century that are preserved at the cathedral of Zagreb.<sup>37</sup> In this text we find his argumentation that a manuscript known as Benedictionale MR 89 kept in the Zagreb Metropolitan library is in fact Benedictionale of Esztergom, meant for the usage »of Esztergom Cathedral, a head of the Hungarian

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> László DOBSZAY and Janka SZENDREI: Hungarian Gregorian Chant, in: Music in Hungary, An Illustrated History (ed. by János Kárpáti), Rószavögyi and Co., Budapest 2011, 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Cf. H. BREKO KUSTURA: Srednjovjekovne liturgijsko-glazbene veze nadbiskupije Ostrogon i biskupije Zagreb: sličnosti i razlike. <sup>37</sup> Ibid., 33.

Church.«<sup>38</sup> He presents strong arguments that support the hypothesis about the Esztergom origins of this book since win the ordination ceremony, the name of a patron saint of Esztergom Cathedral — domus sancti Adalberti, occurs twice!«39 Interestingly, this chant book notated with German neumatic notation, came to Zagreb in the late 11<sup>th</sup> century and was used in Zagreb Cathedral.<sup>40</sup>

In this contribution, Dobszay analyses the 16<sup>th</sup> century chant codices from Zagreb and stresses that Zagreb tradition »preserved in the 14<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup> centuries the ancient repertoire almost untouched, with increasingly enriched material and modernized scripts — Metz Gothic-Hungarian mixed notation«.41 The text points out that even in the 16th century »the desire to perpetuate the early Mediaeval musical heritage in representative codices grew in Zagreb as well«42 and shows as an example for this statement the case of the famous Zagreb Codex by Oswald Thuz.

#### Reception in Croatia of the Musicological Research by László Dobszay

Scientific work by L. Dobszay has been presented in Croatia for the first time in 1995 in my article printed in the *Vijenac* journal.<sup>43</sup> In this preliminary report a major part of the discourse is dedicated to presentation of Dobszay's discovery of the oldest Zagreb missal. After this article, from 1997 up to the present, a new chronology and profile of the Zagreb Mediaeval mass sources from 11th-15th century based on his research has been officially accepted in works by Croatian scholars, mostly those of Katarina Livljanić,44 and in my contributions.45

<sup>38</sup> Ibid.

<sup>39</sup> Ibid.

<sup>40</sup> H. BREKO KUSTURA: Mittelalterliche liturgische Gesangbücher..., 3-17.

<sup>41</sup> L. DOBSZAY: Hungarian Gregorian Chant, 39. See Janka SZENDREI: Die Geschichte der Graner Choralnotation; J. SŽENDREI: Čhoralnotation als Identitätsausdruck im Mittelalter, 139-170. <sup>2</sup> L. DOBSZAY: Hungarian Gregorian Chant, 39.

<sup>43</sup> Cf. Hana BREKO: Najstariji zagrebački missal [The Oldest Missal from Zagreb], Vijenac, 3 (1995)

50, 25. <sup>44</sup> Katarina LIVLJANIĆ: Skica o glazbenomu životu zagrebačke stolnice u srednjemu vijeku,

<sup>45</sup> Cf. H. BREKO KUSTURA: Mittelalterliche liturgische Gesangbücher der Diözese; H. BREKO KUSTURA: Proceedings from the meeting of the Cantus planus Study Group of the IMS held in Esztergom and Visegrád; H. BREKO KUSTURA: Das Missale MR 70 der Zagreber Metropolitanbibliothek — Untersuchungen zum Entstehungskontext, in: Slovene Medieval Music and Its European Connections, Papers Read at the Conference in Ljubljana, June 19-20, 1997 (ed. by J. Snoj), ZRC-SAZU, Ljubljana 1998, 133-145; Hana BRÉKO KUSTURA, »Liber Hospitij Sanctae Elisabeth«: Na tragu mogućeg lokaliteta uporabe misala MR 70 zagrebačke Metropolitane u srednjovjekovnom Zagrebu [Tracing the Possible Place of Usage of the Missal MR 70 of the Zagreb Metropolitan Library], in: Glazba, riječi i slike. Svečani zbornik za Koraljku Kos [Music, Words and Images: Essays in Honour of Koraljka Kos], HMD, Zagreb 1999, 165-175; H. BREKO KUSTURA: Srednjovjekovne liturgijskoglazbene veze nadbiskupije Ostrogon i biskupije Zagreb: sličnosti i razlike; H. BREKO KUSTÚRA: Misal MR 70 zagrebačke Metropolitanške knjižnice, Kontekst nastanka i primjene srednjovjekovnoga glazbenoga rukopisa.

Musical activity by L. Dobszay and the Hungarian ensemble »Schola Hungarica« are known in Croatia due to the radio shows »Musica sacra«<sup>46</sup> and »Tragom glazbe« (Paths of music)<sup>47</sup> broadcast on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Channel of Croatian National Radio. In the 1997-2015 period, several broadcasts were dedicated to the history of the Gregorian chant in Mediaeval Hungary and its reflections in the Croatian lands, especially in the Bishopric of Zagreb.

Finally, his scientific *oeuvre* were included in the university curriculum meant for Croatian students in Musicology at the Academy of Music (University of Zagreb). Namely, in the period preceding Bologna reform, i.e. from 1998-2004, as obligatory teaching literature for a seminar called »Early Croatian history of music«,<sup>48</sup> writings by Prof. Dobszay on the Zagreb Mediaeval rite written in English, were a condition for passing the oral exams of the course. From 2006 onwards, his works have also been listed as referential literature in the doctoral seminar in Mediaeval Studies, at the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences in Zagreb<sup>49</sup> in the framework of the preliminary examination — Introduction into the Research of Mediaeval Music.<sup>50</sup>

In the broader European context of Gregorian chant sources, research by Prof. Dobszay opened up a wide range of new topics about repertoire features of the Eastern European chant — unknown at that time — especially those belonging to the Hungarian »pentatonic« dialect. Starting with the meetings of the »Cantus planus« study group of the International Musicological Society (IMS) held in Hungary,<sup>51</sup> he established his country as a centre for Mediaeval chant studies. His works based on comparison of different office-manuscripts from Hungarian central and provincial regions and their comparison with numerous non-Hungarian traditions opened up new insights into a previously unknown portion of Hungarian liturgical repertory that Dobszay depicts as »consuetudo hujus regni« — or — *mos patriae* and, more recently, as the »Hungarian Gregorian Chant«.

Seen from the Croatian point of view, I must add a personal note here, a still vivid memory of a teacher and colleague who contributed greatly to my scientific formation and my own dedication to research into chant repertoire from the Zagreb Mediaeval area and, nowadays, to Dalmatian sources as well.

His profound knowledge of Mediaeval Latin, liturgy, cultural and sociological history, and finally, the Church history of the Central European area, and especially

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Editor of this show was Tatjana Čunko, author Hana Breko.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Editor of this radio show is Gordana Krpan, author Hana Breko Kustura.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> The holder of this Seminary was Prof. Stanislav Tuksar. Hana Breko was teaching assistant at the time.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> The head of doctoral studies in mediaeval history is Prof. Neven Budak.

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 50}$  The holder of this seminar is adjunct associate Prof. Hana Breko Kustura.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Meetings took place in: Veszprém (1984), Tihany (1988), Pécs (1990), Eger (1993), Sopron (1995), Eszterom/Visegrád (1998), Lillefured (2004), and Dobogókö (2009).

Cf. the list of the proceedings from this meetings on: http://www-app.uni-regensburg.de/ Fakultaeten/PKGG/Musikwissenschaft/Cantus/CANTUSPLANUS/publications.htm last visited on March 20, 2015.

that of chant repertoire from the Hungarian Kingdom, gave me a basic scholarly model and taught me methods with which to deal with the Zagreb Mediaeval chant sources and their repertoire.

His advice was always friendly, his hypothesis were principally based on strong and very concrete arguments concerning repertoire, and his erudition was so remarkable that we all admired and adored him. He was a remarkable teacher, an excellent scholar, and most of all, an unselfish and tireless advisor and mentor. His working energy and respectful authority will be forever kept in our memory.

Seen from the aspect of Croatian history of music one could conclude that all the features of Dobszay's scholarly work make him one of the most important figures in the chant scholarship of the Hungarian and Croatian Mediaeval regions. His writings about *ritus et consuetudo almae eccelsiae zagrabiensis* changed the profile of this Church, and contributed greatly to a new chronology of the Zagreb Mediaeval rite. His writings are essential literature in the modern investigation of the Zagreb *ritus* in the Middle Ages. At the same time, they represent an eternal inspiration for further comparative research of those rites in a broader European context.

IFR.X pe eleyson. ine eleyson Kirrye eleyson unc epc & eleyson. ternant le inoratione confectandi Kincipiat peaudinof aluator mundi adiuna not care luid Sca Maria orapnober Sce Lacober m matti 620 Syniou Sce Michahet a Unif for apli etemente op S ce Cabriel 0x orate pronobil. & S ce Stephane pto m og See Raphahel Omf for angels & archan Sce Adalberte RZ geli onne probif. Sce beorgi Omerabing him ordies % Sie clames 5. Johns Bajiting ?? Sie clames 7 Sie Lauver OR1 or2 Omf fei patriarche &p S ce Corgoni R See Useener phone orate probif. a De Mauricia fogs bus or S ce Leure S ce Laule or Osif fer martyref orat pn og S ce Silvetter Sce Andrea og See S ce Lotis Bertholoc R og sce M s ce lacobe irtyne R Sce Philippethoma æ ORT S ce A

Zagreb, Metropolitan library, Codex MR 89, Benedictional from Esztergom, 11th century, fol 83v (with permission)

#### Sažetak

#### ISTRAŽIVANJA LÁSZLA DOBSZAYA O SREDNJOVJEKOVNIM GLAZBENIM RUKOPISIMA ZAGREBAČKE BISKUPIJE — NJIHOVO ZNAČENJE I RECEPCIJA U KONTEKSTU POVIJESTI GLAZBE REGIJE

Rad predstavlja kritički pregled istraživanja, prikaz najvažnijih rezultata i otkrića što ih je na području srednjovjekovne glazbe i liturgijskog obreda zagrebačke biskupije ostvario mađarski muzikolog, dirigent, filolog i liturgičar prof. László Dobszay.

Gledano iz perspektive suvremenog hrvatskog glazbenog historičara i medievista, rad evaluira važnost i značenje njegovih znanstvenih radova posvećenih povijesnorepertoarnoj analizi gregorijanskih napjeva i njihovih posebnosti što ih je, počam od osnutka biskupije godine 1094, kao rijetko koja europska biskupija gotovo punih sedam stoljeća njegovala zagrebačka biskupija. Prof. Dobszay je bio prvi znanstvenik koji je otkrio najstariji misal koji je pisan u Zagrebu i za uporabu u zagrebačkoj biskupiji, a koji datira iz 1230. godine. Rukopis se danas čuva kao dio fonda franjevačkog samostana u austrijskom Güssingu pod signaturom Gü 1/43. U svojem recentnom radu ovaj je autor potvrdio novu, ostrogonsku provenijenciju najstarijeg benedikcionala koji je bio u uporabi u zagrebačkoj biskupiji od 11. stoljeća (Zagreb, Metropolitanska knjižnica, kodeks MR 89). Nadalje, Dobszay je, zajedno s Andreom Kovács, bio redaktor i urednik serije CAO-ECE iz 2008. posvećene rukopisnim antifonarijima nadbiskupije Kaloča i zagrebačke biskupije.

László Dobszay je kontinuirano pridonosio suvremenim spoznajama o repertoarnim posebnostima liturgije, obreda i gregorijanskog pjevanja u zagrebačkoj biskupiji. To ga čini jednim od najvećih autoriteta na području suvremene glazbene medievistike ove regije. Njegovi napisi o zagrebačkom obredu što ga liturgijske knjige bilježe kao »ritus et consuetudo almae eccelsiae zagrabiensis« predstavljaju nezaobilaznu referencijalnu literaturu, te istodobno model i nadahnuće na koji način pisati novu povijest mađarske i hrvatske srednjovjekovne glazbe.