

# A Retrospective on Educational Policies and Their Implementation in the Vocational Teacher Education Provision

Didik Nurhadi<sup>1</sup>, Siti Zahro<sup>2</sup> and Nyan-Myau Lyau<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Faculty of Engineering, State University of Malang

<sup>2</sup>Graduate School of Technological and Vocational Education, National Yunlin University of Science and Technology

## Abstract

*Long-standing gaps of teachers' academic qualifications persist despite changes and developments of educational policies the government has continually been making. The gaps eventually result in a gradual decrease in the quality of vocational school graduates, which has recently caused grave national concern. The decrease is evident in Indonesian vocational students' lack of competitive spirit and skills in the national labor market. In an attempt to find a creative and effective solution to this problem, this paper seeks to explore and describe the educational policies and the implementation of standards by vocational subjects teachers in a developing country and those in a developed county, hoping that it will help vocational school graduates acquire professional qualifications. Using a critical ethnography, in-depth analyses on the professors' commentaries reveal that it is common in most universities in both countries to select vocational teachers by following educational policies in order to establish reliable criteria for qualified teachers in the future. This teacher certification program seems to have positively influenced the welfare of teachers in both countries, but other daring innovations in improving skills and qualifications of teachers are still a great need.*

**Key words:** certification; government; preparation; professional qualifications; quality.

## Introduction

Vocational schools are deemed responsible for the quality of their graduates' competencies and competitiveness in the labor market because they are among the

supporting factors of the economic development of their nation (Agrawal, 2013; Buligina & Sloka, 2013; Casner-Lotto & Barrington, 2006; Davies & Adnett, 1999; Lowden, Hall, Elliot, & Lewin, 2011; Middleton, Ziderman, & Van, 1993; Perin, 2013; Wu, 2012; Ziderman, 1997; Zrno, 2012). Vocational school teachers have a decisive role in making their school-leavers highly competent in their field because the quality of the teachers is the single most important factor influencing student achievement (AITSL, 2011; Matijević, 2005; Maksimović, 2010; Palekčić, 2005). Therefore, schools need to have qualified teachers able to improve their students' achievement and the quality of their graduates (Al-Musawi & Karam, 2011; Mincu, 2015; Musau & Abere, 2015; Šimić Šašić, & Sorić, 2011).

Moreover, it is important that teachers have not only educational experiences but also professional qualifications to work in industry, that is, pedagogical skills meeting industrial needs, with which it is possible for them to keep school curricula relevant to industrial requirements (Kemmis & Green, 2013). Several research results have explained that the components of teachers' competencies that determine students' comprehension are teacher learning, teaching practices, and student learning (Hattie, 2012; Kang, Cha, & Ha, 2013; Purković & Jelaska, 2014). Furthermore, according to TDA (2007), the competency of professional teachers is considered to be up to standard if they have thorough knowledge, good comprehension and teaching skills to fulfill any student's needs well and if they can explain any topic through the content of their lessons and curricula. In addition, teachers should make effort and learn effective strategies for their learning program, using and transforming their knowledge into content clear enough for their students to understand (AITSL, 2011; Barron & Darling-Hammond, 2008; Felder & Brent, 2005; Fry, Ketteridge, & Marshall, 2008).

The standards of teachers' qualifications and competencies are determined by the result of their proficiency tests in each field (Cao & Luo, 2015). According to Guskey (2002), the standards are needed to support the evaluation and better development of their teaching profession. However, arbitrarily established standards of teaching competencies in evaluation programs can result in graduates' lack of competitive spirit and skills to compete in labor market. Agrawal (2013) presented evidence that schools do not have certain standards for professional teachers, making it impossible for the schools to satisfy industrial needs for skilled and productive laborers in the work market.

The government as the policy planner needs to establish some clear policies to fulfil the quality standards of professional teachers through training of state schools teachers (Middleton et al., 1993; Steyn, van der Walt, & Wolhuter, 2015). Since 2007, the Indonesian government has implemented many programs, such as professional teacher training, to improve teachers' quality (Nipper, Ricks, Kilpatrick, Mayhew, Thomas, Kwon, Klerlein, & Hembree, 2011).

Furthermore, higher education institutions, as providers of certification programs, sometimes work out a compromise on the implementation of teacher certification

standards, which are explored in this paper according to the commentaries of university professors as educators and experts in vocational teachers' certification. The idea is to explore the educational policies and the implementation of teacher certification standards, as disclosed in some of the realities and interpretations of certified teachers based on their biography, geographic background, and cultural lives in the middle of the complex and competitive education in Indonesia as a developing country and in Taiwan as a developed country.

The purpose of this study is to identify the governmental policies and the implementation of the vocational teacher education according to professors' commentaries in Indonesia and in Taiwan. Particularly, this study systematically compares these policies and their practical strategies in both countries to understand the more effective policies as an important consideration for sustainable development of the quality of vocational teachers' competencies, especially in Indonesia.

## **Literature Review**

### ***Roles of Vocational Teachers***

A vocational teacher is expected to have teaching proficiency in each of his/her vocational fields. To be good teachers, they should understand and have academic qualifications, work skills and occupational dynamics of teaching, be familiar with the intellectual structure of education studies, and have the overall comprehension of vocational education (Connell, 2009). A good teacher is more than a mere lecturer. There are six professional services they have to provide. A good teacher lets himself/herself become an information provider, a role model, a facilitator, an assessor, a planner, and a resource developer. Moreover, the teachers with such meritorious services play an important role, making themselves work most effectively in a teacher-student relationship and within educational norms, values, and behavior patterns building that relationship (Chappell & Johnston, 2003).

In the parts of the early programs of vocational teacher education provision, the real conditions in vocational schools and the working environment of vocational teachers also constitute determining factors of their professional performance. Establishing a great many varieties of traditions of vocational education and learning, these factors make it difficult to detect the contributing factors that make up their local practice. Nevertheless, the work that teachers are confronted with can be clustered into a number of tasks: (1) supporting the technical or professional learning processes of students, which requires teachers to integrate knowledge about the content and the appropriate methods into the forms of learning; (2) providing students with basic skills which prepare them for work by developing learning processes leading to general work-related attitudes and competencies, as well as their active role in social life; (3) making preliminary assessment and evaluation of students' learning processes; (4) performing administrative tasks regarding the organization and the curriculum, and (5) performing counseling functions for students belonging to other target groups,

like employers, adult learners, teacher community, and so on (Bader, 1995). According to Volmari, Helakorpi, and Frimodt (2009), administration, training, development of competency, quality assurance, and networking will help increase teachers' academic qualifications, pedagogical skills, and professionalism of vocational teachers.

These tasks are affected by conceptual changes in the role and functions of education and learning in schools in general, and in vocational schools in particular. The changes in labor markets and work organizations affect the practice of vocational education and learning at a very practical level, in terms of what is available and what vocational schools can conduct (Agrawal, 2013). By classic standards of professionalism, vocational teachers in some European countries, such as Germany and France, have reached a relatively high degree of professionalism in comparison with their colleagues in general education. However, in response to peremptory challenges in the future, vocational schools still need to increase their level from local to regional one and seek to have full autonomy in order to rank higher.

### ***The Educational Policies and Their Implementation and Experiences of Vocational Teachers in Indonesia and Taiwan***

So far, several Indonesian educational policies have been issued in terms of vocational teacher education provision: the law in 2005 concerning teachers and lecturers; the Government Regulation of 2005 concerning the national standard of education; the Regulation of the Minister of 2007 concerning certification for in-service teachers; the Government Regulation of 2008 concerning teachers; the Government Regulation of 2009 concerning functional allowance for teachers and lecturers; the Regulation of the Minister of 2013 concerning the educational program for pre-service teachers; the Regulation of the Minister of 2010 concerning the professional education of in-service teachers, and Decree of the Minister about the establishment of educational Institutions providing professional education for in-service teachers. Meanwhile, the Government of Taiwan has issued policies to prepare teachers through the Law of 1979, which concerns teacher education, and Act concerning teachers from 1995. The Act of teacher education regulates the phases of teacher education, and the Act of Teacher regulates the qualifications, jobs, rights and obligations, salary, services, and teacher organization.

Since 2007, the government of Indonesia has implemented the teacher certification program as an effort to improve the teachers' quality. This program is expected to improve the quality of learning and teachers' competencies in Indonesia. The certification program is conducted by stating requirements that teachers must fulfil and submit their portfolio, and by giving them professional training. In 2015, the implementation of the teacher certification program was focused on the professional vocational education of teachers. This change was conducted based on the evaluation of the previous implementation (MOEC of Indonesia, 2015). Meanwhile, The Ministry of Education of Taiwan (2010) stated that the educational system of Taiwan filters

potential teacher candidates to prepare the pool of qualified teacher candidates. The teacher education is carried out to improve the professional knowledge and skills in effective teaching, and evaluation is made based on the gap between the teachers' knowledge and their needs in the classroom (Brown, Horner, & Scanlon, 2014). Vocational teachers are also trained by the local professional practitioners through the training program in a university to enable them to solve problems they face in the classroom.

Indonesian vocational teachers are given vocational and instructional training, as well as grants and scholarships for advanced studies. The government also gives them research grants, equipment, and enables rehabilitation of school buildings to provide the service and comfort during learning process in schools, which later brings about the improvement of the graduates' quality to be competitive in the national labor market. Taiwanese government, in the meantime, provides a periodic training and advanced studies to increase teachers' knowledge about various problems they will face. Research is also carried out by vocational teachers collaborating with university professors to solve the learning problems in classrooms and improve the quality of learning outcomes in accordance with the demands of the competency development based on labor standards in global markets.

### ***Curricula of Professional Training and Standards of Vocational Teachers' Certification in Indonesia and Taiwan***

In Indonesia, vocational teacher education curriculum is designed for two groups – one is focused on the study program, while the other is focused on field experience with 30 – 40 credits. The curriculum for the first group contains competencies, strategies, methods, media, and evaluation. The program is organized in the form of pedagogic workshops for specific subjects and field work experiences. The experiences consist of teaching practice, micro-teaching class, and the field study practice. Meanwhile, the curriculum for the other group is basically a six-month internship program conducted at school. At the end of the program, a competency test is administered in the form of oral and performance tests. This program is still implemented for future vocational teachers teaching in border regions and remote areas.

In Taiwan, the teacher education curriculum is intended for two groups - a group of students focusing on cognitive skills and a group of those focusing on pedagogical skills. The first group stresses the subjects relating to professional teacher career. The members of the other group, on the other hand, follow the pre-service teacher training and internship program in schools for 6 months. Both groups have to get 28-40 credits. If they have a very good appraisal, they can take a written test administered by the government to allow them to have teaching certificates (Teacher Education Act, 1979).

Meanwhile, the certification requirements for Indonesian vocational teachers are classified into general and specific requirements. General requirements include having no previous certifications as a teacher. Besides, teacher candidates must have

2 years of teaching experience and still be active in teaching at school. They must also have a bachelor's degree or Diploma 4 from accredited institutions. In contrast to the previous requirement, the specific one concerns the teachers holding functional position as the controller of the education units. These teachers have to get academic qualification of master's or doctoral degree from accredited and associate institutions (Certification for in-service teacher, 2007). However, only after they have managed to pass the competency test, do vocational teachers receive their teaching certificate (MOEC of Indonesia, 2015).

## **Methodology**

### **Research Methods**

The design of this research uses the qualitative research method. The qualitative research refers to the multiple methods involving interpretation and natural approach to a certain issue. This concept explains the investigation field using many methods such as case studies in politics and ethics, participative investigation and observation, interviews, visual methods, and interpretative analyses.

The research used ethnography as its approach or strategy. The ethnographic approach was chosen to recognize the influence of norms and ideals, habits, discourses, practices, and activities of particular groups on the teacher certification program a state college is implementing. The researchers began with addressing research questions, identifying educational policies and implementing them in relation to the certification program of vocational schools in Indonesia and Taiwan. In addition, the approach was also used to make a critical analysis of the implementation of the policy for vocational teacher provision by placing emphasis on the relation between cultural aspects and the process of implementing the policies. The research design is expected to deeply explain the vocational teacher education provision through teacher certification process in Indonesia and Taiwan.

### **Target Population and Research Sample**

Professors in Indonesia and Taiwan compose the target population for the purposes of this study. They have more than 20 years of teaching experience at the university level, both as teachers in the professional education program for teachers, and as examination questions developers of the professional vocational teacher education. The sample of this study consisted of university professors of two public universities with such characteristics as having education faculties for vocational teachers, receiving full accreditation, and implementing the teacher competency tests in accordance with the policy for teacher certification. They are senior lecturers and experts in vocational fields and teach vocational teachers about the certification program. The research involved 14 professors, ten of whom are from Indonesia while the others are from Taiwan, with the experience and background relevant to the research sample. Since they covered representative sample of the target population and gave a saturated sample, it was unnecessary for the researchers to involve other informants.

### **Research Instrument**

The researchers used a number of interview questions to gain an in-depth understanding of the phenomenon in question. The research questions focused on the educational policies and the strategies for implementing teacher certification programs in Indonesia and Taiwan. The identification of the qualitative method is related to the fundamental roles of ideology, the inner dynamics of the organization and socio-political processes in formulating policies and practices in the field of education.

Interview questions were classified into two groups to facilitate data processing and analysis. The first question is related to educational policies, including the certification policy for vocational teachers to encourage the young generation to become enthusiastic vocational teachers and the policies to evaluate and to ensure the quality of teachers in Indonesia and Taiwan. The second question is related to the implementation of certification program for vocational teachers conducted by the government in order to increase nationwide standardization in teachers' competencies. Some of the questions which may be addressed by the teachers are: "What is the requirement for someone to take the competency test of the teacher certification program?"; "What is the process of the implementation of the teacher certification program like?"; "Is the development program of teachers' quality only introduced through teacher certification?"; "How does the government give assurance of teachers' quality?"; etc.

### **Data Collection**

The necessary data were collected by the researchers using the in-depth investigation to understand the commentaries and professional experiences of university professors in each implementation of the teacher certification program that their university carries out. Researchers started the research by reviewing literature and documents. Subsequently, they made a list of research questions, identified most of the cases from the observed phenomena, and investigated each case. While carrying out the research, they used a repetitive process to question the aimed phenomena and proposed an explanation until obtaining a complete description of the narratives. Then, researchers made a theoretical assessment and analysis of the qualitative data.

Purposes and questions of the research were used as the guidelines for data collection and analysis to sort the research findings and realize the underlying implications. Researchers tried to present the data by directly quoting the notes of the onsite observation from the informants and reconstruct their meaning. Afterward, they drew a comparison of the data collected from the observations with those gathered from interviews in order to obtain the most reliable meaning. In order not to make subjective and misconstrued interpretations, they avoided distorting the data and tried to hold consultations with some experts in vocational education to verify the interpretation of the collected data validly.

The data were collected and then documented. Research data resulted from interviewing some informants about the educational policies and the implementation

of vocational teacher provision program. Researchers documented the commentaries of the informants in this study and coded them to facilitate the analysis. The commentaries provided by universities were coded A and B: A for state universities of Indonesia, and B for those of Taiwan. Researchers then coded the other Indonesian informants 1-10, and other Taiwan informants 11-14. Concrete examples of such codes will be given below.

### **Data Analysis**

An in-depth analysis was carried out by the researchers to manage the research findings and to reveal the implications of the background of this research. The researchers attempted to present the authentic data by directly quoting the interview notes of research informants. They also reconstructed interpretation and systematic implication using the comparison of data collected from a number of informants to achieve the best internal excellences. This was a method to gather highly valid data.

Afterwards, subjective and misconstrued assumptions were avoided by maintaining the constant and objective reflection by referring to the sources and the background in which they were documented. The researchers also made an explanation and a comparison between the Indonesian and Taiwanese governments regarding their teacher certification policy and its implementation to provide vocational teachers with academic and professional qualifications.

## **Results and Discussion**

Themes identified from the research purpose were divided into three groups: the impact of educational policies on the preparatory program for vocational teachers, the implementation of the teacher certification policies to provide a greater number of vocational teachers, and a comparison between the educational policies on the vocational teacher provision programs in Indonesia and in Taiwan.

### ***The Impact of Governmental Policies for Vocational Teachers' Preparation***

#### **Indonesian Case**

Indonesia is a developing country, but unlike other developing countries, the development of government policy has recently increased the interest of young generation in becoming teachers in general as well as vocational school teachers. Such increase in interest, which is significantly subject to educational policies, of course, does not necessarily create a pool of prospective teachers in universities, and this will affect the availability of highly qualified teachers.

More than three quarters (85%) of the participants believe that educational policies have an essential role in enhancing the interest of young generation in becoming vocational school teachers, e.g.:

*"The government issued the laws relating to teachers, which are expected to enhance the dignity of professional teachers that have a formal recognition from*



*the state through teacher certification, for the previous educational policy could not significantly influence the teachers' interest and give complete assurance of teachers' qualification.” (University A, Informant 1)*

This is in line with the purpose of ensuring that all students are given equal opportunity to learn and grow in an educational environment staffed by exemplary professional educators. The next answer, given by three-quarters (75%) of the informants, was that the policies have a significant impact on the younger generation's interest in becoming teachers. Herein, informants mention that “the government policy regarding professional teacher's incentive has encouraged young generations to be teachers. After the establishment of policies, the increased number is more than 100%” (University A, Informant 3). Meanwhile, another informant (25%) states “this policy has an impact on ... a positive impact, which indirectly influences teachers' quality” (University A, Informant 6).

In the theoretical framework presented by Middleton et al. (1993), it is mentioned that the strategies of the policy the government applies to improve teachers' abilities become far better and more productive. The certification policy issued by the Indonesian government to set a national standard for teachers correspondingly strengthens professional ethics and teaching competency and supports the development of great potential of teachers for professional jobs (Cao & Luo, 2015). A teacher regulation explains that the minimum standard of cognitive behavior and pedagogical and psycho-motor skills for teachers is measured with a state teacher certification test (Jalal, Samani, Chang, Stevenson, Ragatz, & Negara, 2009). After passing the national certification test, teachers are given additional salary as professional teachers.

Holistic explanation and conceptualization of informants' comments concluded that the development of the Indonesian government's policy has generally increased young people's interest in becoming teachers, formed the pools of the prospective teachers at the university, created highly qualified teacher candidates, and indirectly influenced the availability of qualified teachers in Indonesia. In particular, the policies on teacher certification and professional teacher incentives are formulated by the government to standardize teacher competencies, and adopted as a strategy for developing professional teachers. Consequently, on the one hand, these policies pay the welfare benefits for teachers, but, on the other hand, they have little impact on the professional job of vocational teachers. The government needs to establish an educational policy to regulate specifically the standard of highly qualified teachers meeting industry wide standards.

### **Taiwanese Case**

Taiwan is a developed country, but unlike any other developed countries, amendments to the government's policy have been regularly improving teachers' quality in vocational schools. This is strictly determined by the law. The government has made a pool of prospective teachers at universities and obtained prospective

teachers with high qualifications, which influences the heavy competition to become a teacher.

It is not easy for university graduates to become teachers, as claimed by all respondents (100%), e.g. "... to be a teacher requires very high and competitive qualifications of graduates..." (University B; Informant 12). An informant explained there are numerous stages for becoming a teacher:

*"Certification for the qualification of vocational school teachers is conducted through two phases: initial certification and secondary certification. The requirements for initial certification for teacher candidates include holding a bachelor's or master's degree from a domestic or foreign university. The candidates should first complete teacher education program, and then they will follow the secondary certification process conducted in accordance with the needs of teacher candidates stated in the admission form. They will be given a status of permanent school teachers after passing the test. The process of becoming a teacher is not simple and easy because the state guarantees better wages for them, as well as allowances, and periodic competency enhancement."* (University B; Informant 14)

An informant added that the laws are crucial policies for improving the quality of teachers' performance:

*"...to ensure teachers' competitiveness at the international level, some regulations governing teachers and teacher education are references to evaluate and guarantee teachers' quality. The government has set some qualification requirements to be a teacher: administrative requirements, apprenticeship, review, research, and advanced study. Meanwhile, the regulation of teacher education arranges establishment, planning, implementation, and evaluation for permanent development of teachers."* (University B, Informant 6)

A creative design for professional development is needed by the government to educate teachers with a certain quality level. Guskey (2002) mentioned that this design should be made carefully and thoroughly in order that the professional development programs for teachers' quality become more effective and powerful. Thus, it is expected that a professional teacher can perform such primary roles as a good teacher in teaching and learning, as an information provider, a role model, a facilitator, an assessor, a planner, and a resource developer (Chappell & Johnston, 2003).

The conclusion of the holistic explanation and conceptualization of informants in Taiwan is that, in general, the development of educational policies has an impact on intense competition to work as a teacher. In particular, the amendment of the policies on teachers and on teacher education produces a beneficial effect on the welfare and professional performance of teachers and vocational teachers today. In conclusion, the government needs to develop a policy on vocational teachers to improve the quality of teachers that the global market and industry need.

## **The Implementation of Teacher Certification Policies for the Provision of Vocational Teachers**

### **In Indonesia**

Teacher certification program is the first step the government takes to define the standard quality of teachers' competencies. The Indonesian government implements teacher certification through portfolio strategy and training for in-service teachers. This strategy, which is commonly implemented in developing countries, is known as the traditional teacher certification. Another strategy is the development of professional education for pre-service teachers in remote areas, which is widely known as an alternative teacher certification. The government has done everything in order to improve the quality of teachers to form highly qualified and competitive graduates in the national labor market.

More than three quarters (80%) of the informants stated that the implementation of teacher certification is an effective strategy to advance the level of teacher quality. An informant explained:

*“Since 2007, the government has implemented certification program through two phases: portfolio assessment and training for in-service teachers. Portfolio assessment refers to showing teachers’ professional knowledge by assessing their documents that indicate academic qualifications, degrees of education, training and teaching experiences, planning and learning implementation, assessment from superiors and supervisors, academic achievements, professional development, participation in scientific forums, experiences in educational and social organizations, and relevant awards in education. If teachers pass this phase of assessment, they get a certification. Otherwise, they should join the training for in-service teachers. The competency test, including pedagogical, social, professional, and personality competencies, is conducted at the end of the activities. Teachers who pass the test will receive a certificate, while teachers who do not pass the test will be given an opportunity to retake the exam. If they fail again, they are still given another opportunity to join the next certification program two years later.” (University A, Informant 3)*

Meanwhile, another informant mentioned a new strategy for teacher certification:

*“Since 2013, the government has conducted certification of teachers through professional education programs for prospective teachers to teach in remote areas. The program was conducted for a year at universities that were chosen by the minister of education. For the first semester, they learnt the theory and practice on campus. In the next semester, they taught students in a vocational school for three months. And in the last stage, they will take the teacher certification test administered by the university in cooperation with the industry related to their fields.” (University A, Informant 10)*

Literature on teacher certification mentions that teacher certification strategies had significantly contributed to the government's understanding of education provision for teachers (Heinen & Scriber, 2007), especially vocational school teachers. For better implications, Cochran-Smith and Villegas (2015) explained that a review can be written on the accountability of the education provision, effectiveness, and policies for teachers, while identifying strengths and weaknesses is a key to the development of teachers' quality in developing countries.

In general, the policies on vocational teacher certification are implemented through some strategies, like compiling a portfolio and conducting training for in-service teachers, and professional education program for prospective teachers in remote areas. This implementation seems to have a significant result in improving the performance of teachers at the local level, and it is also expected to help improve the quality of vocational school graduates even at the national level.

### In Taiwan

Teacher certification process has been conducted by the government of Taiwan through teacher education programs and pre-service training for prospective teachers. This type of certification is known as the alternative teacher certification, which is broadly conducted in developed countries. This implementation is important to improve the quality of vocational teachers in order to meet the needs of the workforce, in the national and international markets.

More than three-quarters (90%) of the informants, when asked about the process of becoming a permanent teacher, gave such responses as: "When university graduates want to become permanent teachers, they should follow several stages, i.e. teacher education, school internship, the first-phase test for teaching certificate and the second-phase test for teacher certifications." (University B, Informant 11).

Another informant made a statement about what kind of training program vocational teachers should periodically undertake. He stated that:

*"Another effective strategy to be applied to enhance teachers' quality is providing vocational training for teacher candidates and making them take advanced studies either at local universities or at universities abroad.... Besides, the government also needs to provide necessary data through the development of information technology like MOOCs, e-Learning, and distance learning. Furthermore, an online data base, which contains reports of research results, research instruments, libraries, journal articles, e-books, seminars, and any other information related to education, is greatly instrumental in accomplishing this purpose" (University B; Informant 14).*

As the improvement program committee, university professors need to make an evaluation. This is a statement given by an informant:

*"An evaluation process is conducted annually and facilitated by the central government to determine the development of appropriate and effective programs*

*to guide the quality improvement of teachers by growing an internationally competitive educational culture.” (University B, Informant 13)*

The evaluation of policies on teacher certification programs, vocational training programs, and advanced studies constitutes effective strategies to strengthen the government policy on teacher quality (Aluede & Idogho, 2014). In order to establish the core practice for professional teacher provision, education administrator should set the teaching practices within the contemporary teacher education curriculum which focuses not only on beliefs and knowledge, orientations and commitments, the context of policy concerned with recruitment and retention, but also on the teaching tasks and activities based on challenges and resources needed in the labor market (Ball & Forzani, 2009).

In general, an integrated program has been made by the Taiwanese government to improve the quality of vocational teachers, starting with teacher education at the university, pre-service training to obtain teachers' initial certificate, and state certification test to obtain the permanent teachers' certificate. This process has a positive impact on improving the quality of vocational school teachers in order to build graduates' character based on the needs of labor competencies in the national and international markets.

### ***Comparison between Policies on the Provision for Vocational Teachers' Preparation in Indonesia and in Taiwan***

According to the commentaries of professors, vocational teacher education provision in both countries is conducted based on the educational policies. Commonly, the state issues a policy on teacher education provision to acquire the qualified teachers through the teacher certification process. Its implementation is influenced not only by the needs of teacher competency standards, but also by the political conditions throughout the country and the background of the participants of teacher certification program. As an example, the quota of teachers who can follow the certification program is determined by the budget approved by the government (Jalal et al., 2009). As mentioned by Littleton (2009), provision of professional teachers was also affected by individual experiences of trainers and participants, and cultural, socioeconomic, and linguistic differences. Eventually, the teacher certification program is expected to have direct influence on the increase of teachers' wealth and indirect influence on the improvement of students' achievements (Wiseman & Al-Bakr, 2013).

The strategy of the vocational teacher certification in Indonesia is implemented through a portfolio and in-service training for permanent teachers for one month. The teacher certification functions as a measure to ensure a minimum level of teachers' skills guaranteed by the certifying agency (Littleton, 2009). The underlying reason of the program is that there had previously been no professional standards for teachers in Indonesia. If they passed the in-service training test, they had a teacher certificate issued by the certification committee. Also, they were given incentives

from the state. In 2010, the government issued a new policy on the implementation of certifications through professional education for in-service and pre-service teachers. The requirement to follow the teacher certification program for in-service teachers is that they should pass the nationally organized test of teacher competency (Jalal et al., 2009). However, the professional education program for pre-service teachers is intended for teachers who have attended an undergraduate program to teach in remote or even frontier areas (MoRTHE, 2015).

In Taiwan, the vocational teacher certification program is designed for graduates from undergraduate, master's and doctoral degrees who are eager to be teachers. Teacher candidates need to follow some selection processes to have teacher certificate and to become school teachers (Conrad & Stone, 2015). The first step of the selection process is the examination of administrative documents of potential candidates by the committee for the review of their competencies. If the candidates pass the administrative selection, in the next step, they will be involved in the teacher education program and the internship program in a vocational school. The candidates with a very good result can take the following step of the assessment– a written test set by the state. If the teachers pass, they will receive a teaching certificate, and then they are allowed to undergo a selection test of school teachers. The teaching certificate will be given to those who manage to pass a set of tests (Feng-Jui, Pi-Jen, Guoheng, & Ting-Ying, 2009). After that, periodical training is undertaken to improve the knowledge and vocational competencies of teachers, both in the country and abroad. It is in line with the thoughts on vocational education and training in developing countries mentioned by Middleton et al. (1993).

In general, the vocational teacher education provision normally carried out by universities in both countries is subject to educational policies to establish appropriate certification criteria of the future vocational teachers' quality. The implementation strategies of teacher certification generally employ the alternative strategy of teacher certification. Besides, Indonesian government also applies traditional certification strategy for vocational teacher candidates as mentioned by Littleton (2009). In Indonesia, teacher certification is designed for the in-service teachers to have the national competency standards (Conrad & Stone, 2015), and professional education is administered for pre-service teachers who have attended an undergraduate program to teach in frontier and remote areas (MoRTHE, 2015). On the other hand, teacher certification in Taiwan is aimed at the provision of teacher candidates who have potential and high quality enabling them to increase their competencies and to make internationalization of education in their vocational schools (Cummings & Bain, 2009; Teichler, 2009; Wiseman & Al-Bakr, 2013).

## **Conclusions**

The paper concludes that the governments of Indonesia and Taiwan implement a standardization of teachers through certification to ensure the quality of future

vocational teachers. The Indonesian government has set the standard for teachers based on the national teacher standards, while the Taiwanese government has established teacher standards based on the standards of international teachers. The difference is in accordance with the cultural aspects of Indonesia as a developing country. In contrast, Taiwan is a developed country. Not only does the Indonesian government use a strategy of alternative certification like Taiwan, but it also uses a traditional certification through the creation of a portfolio and in-service training.

The study, which was thoroughly conducted in airing differences in government policies and the implementation of vocational teacher education, provides policy planners with some directions in developing policies and implementation strategies for teacher education (Virtue, 2007). The development program of teacher quality can offer insight to enhance vocational teachers' quality in creative and innovative ways through certification program of internationally licensed teachers (Kane, Rockoff, & Staiger, 2008). What is more, the quality of Indonesian teachers needs to be improved so that their vocational competencies in accordance with the national and international standards can bring about significant changes, that is, the growth of professionalism in their schools, and make them competitive. Finally, highly qualified teachers can make graduates of vocational schools more competent and competitive in the national and international job market (Agrawal, 2013; Middleton, Zideman, & Van, 1993).

Here are some recommendations to be taken into account. The policy on the quality of the future vocational teachers needs to be focused on the development of the certification process and on the establishment of competency standards of licensed vocational teachers. The Indonesian government should amend educational policies systematically and periodically by making in-depth study of the implementation of teacher certification program in Taiwan concerning the improvement of the alternative certification and the development of programs in support of the improvement of teachers' quality relevant to the needs of the global market. Herein, teachers are ready to provide graduates of vocational schools with special skills and competencies and make them more competitive in the labor markets. In addition, they are also expected to improve regularly their vocational competencies in accordance with the needs of the national and international labor markets through training programs at local universities or abroad. Meanwhile, the chief administrators of vocational schools need to evaluate and develop the performance program of teachers in collaboration with university professors. Increased knowledge through further studies is needed in order to develop the potential of teachers and students in their schools.

## References

- Agrawal, T. (2013). Vocational education and training programs (VET): An Asian perspective. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Cooperative Education*, 14(1), 15-26.
- AITSL. (2011). *National professional standards for teachers*. Australia: Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership (AITSL).
- Al-Musawi, N., & Karam, E. M. (2011). Humanistic qualities of the teacher as perceived by undergraduate students in Bahrain and Kuwait. *Journal of Education for Teaching: International Research and Pedagogy*, 37(2), 183-197.
- Aluede, O., & Idogho, P. O. (2014). Refocusing teacher education for Nigeria's national development: Issues and policies for implementation. *International Studies in Educational Administration (Commonwealth Council for Educational Administration & Management (CCEAM))*, 42(3), 103-113.
- Bader, R. (1995). Lehrer an beruflichen Schulen. In R. Arnold, & A. Lipsmeier (Eds.), *Handbuch der berufsbildung* (pp. 319–333). Opladen: VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-322-93636-3\\_25](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-322-93636-3_25)
- Ball, D. L., & Forzani, F. M. (2009). The work of teaching and the challenge for teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 60(5), 497–511. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487109348479>
- Barron, B., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2008). *Teaching for meaningful learning: A review of research on inquiry-based and cooperative learning. Book Excerpt*. San Francisco, CA: George Lucas Educational Foundation.
- Brown, E. L., Horner, C. G., & Scanlon, C. L. (2014). United States teachers' emotional labor and professional identities. *KEDI Journal of Educational Policy*, 11(2), 205-225.
- Buligina, I., & Sloka, B. (2013). Matching vocational training and labour market demands – the opinion of public administrations. *Ekonomika istraživanja, Special issue* (1), 299-310. Retrieved from <http://hrcak.srce.hr/133134>
- Cao, P., & Luo, Z. (2015). Research on the training mode reform of mathematical education professionals in higher vocational college under the background of national teacher certification examination. In *International Conference on Education, Management and Computing Technology (ICEMCT-2015)* (pp. 1480-1483). France: Atlantic Press. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icemct-15.2015.311>
- Casner-Lotto, J., & Barrington, L. (2006). *Are They Really Ready to Work? Employers' Perspectives on the Basic Knowledge and Applied Skills of New Entrants to the 21st Century US Workforce. Partnership for 21st Century Skills*. Washington, DC: The Conference Board, Inc.
- Chappell, C., & Johnston, R. (2003). *Changing work: Changing roles for vocational education and training teachers and trainers*. Leabrook, Australia: National Centre for Vocational Education Research.
- Cochran-Smith, M., & Villegas, A. M. (2015). Framing teacher preparation research: An overview of the field, part 1. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 66(1), 7–20. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487114549072>
- Connell, R. (2009). Good teachers on dangerous ground: Towards a new view of teacher quality and professionalism. *Critical Studies in Education*, 50(3), 213-229. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17508480902998421>



- Conrad, D., & Stone, C. (2015). Connecting the Dots in Preservice Teacher Education: Focusing on Literacy Instructional Strategies to Prepare Teacher Candidates for Curriculum and Certification Challenges. *Delta Kappa Gamma Bulletin*, 81(4), 41-49.
- Cummings, W. K., & Bain, O. (2009). The internationalization of the U.S. academy in comparative perspective: A descriptive study. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 10(1), 107-115. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-009-9005-4>
- Davies, P., & Adnett, N. (1999). Quasi-market reforms and vocational schooling in England: An economic analysis. *Journal of Education and Work*, 12(2), 141-156. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1363908990120202>
- Felder, R. M., & Brent, R. (2005). Understanding student differences. *Journal of Engineering Education*, 94(1), 57-72. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2168-9830.2005.tb00829.x>
- Feng-Jui, H., Pi-Jen, L., Guoheng, C., & Ting-Ying, W. (2009). *Policy and practice of mathematics teacher education in Taiwan*. Taiwan: Taiwan Teacher Education and Development Study in Mathematics.
- Fry, H., Ketteridge, S., & Marshall, S. (2008). *A handbook for teaching and learning in higher education: Enhancing academic practice*. Abingdon, UK: Routledge.
- Guskey, T. R. (2002). Professional development and teacher change. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 8(3), 381-391. <https://doi.org/10.1080/135406002100000512>
- Hattie, J. (2012). *Visible learning for teachers: Maximizing impact on learning*. Abingdon, UK: Routledge.
- Heinen, E. B., & Scriber, J. P. (2007). Bureaucratic discretion and alternative teacher certification: Understanding program variation in Missouri. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 15(13), 1-22. <https://doi.org/10.14507/epaa.v15n13.2007>
- Jalal, F., Samani, M., Chang, M. C., Stevenson, R., Ragatz, A. B., & Negara, S. D. (2009). *Teacher certification in Indonesia: A strategy for teacher quality improvement*. Jakarta: Ministry of National Education and World Bank.
- Kane, T. J., Rockoff, J. E., & Staiger, D. O. (2008). What does certification tell us about teacher effectiveness? Evidence from New York City. *Economics of Education Review*, 27(6), 615-631. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econedurev.2007.05.005>
- Kang, H. S., Cha, J., & Ha, B. (2013). What should we consider in teachers' professional development impact studies? Based on the conceptual framework of desimone. *Creative Education*, 4(4), 11-18. <https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2013.44A003>
- Kemmis, R. B., & Green, A. (2013). Vocational education and training teachers' conceptions of their pedagogy. *International Journal of Training Research*, 11(2), 101-121. <https://doi.org/10.5172/ijtr.2013.11.2.101>
- Littleton, M. (2009). Teacher certification. In E. F. Provenzo, Jr. (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of the Social and Cultural Foundations of Education 2* (pp. 783-786). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.
- Lowden, K., Hall, S., Elliot, D., & Lewin, J. (2011). *Employers' perceptions of the employability skills of new graduates*. London: Edge Foundation.
- Maksimović, D. (2010). Obrazovanje u obrtništvu. *Andragoški glasnik: Glasilo Hrvatskog andragoškog društva*, 14(2(25)), 133-139. Retrieved from <http://hrcak.srce.hr/103667>

- Matijević, M. (2005). Evaluation in education. *Pedagogijska istraživanja*, 2(2), 279-280. Retrieved from <http://hrcak.srce.hr/139323>
- Middleton, J., Ziderman, A., & Adams, A. A. (1993). *Skills for productivity: Vocational education and training in developing countries*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Mincu, M. E. (2015). Teacher quality and school improvement: what is the role of research?. *Oxford Review of Education*, 41(2), 253-269. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03054985.2015.1023013>
- MOE of Taiwan. (2010). *Education in Taiwan 2010/2011*. Taiwan: Ministry of Education of ROC.
- MOEC of Indonesia. (2015). *Sertifikasi guru melalui pendidikan profesi guru dalam jabatan tahun 2015: Buku 1 pedoman penetapan peserta*. Jakarta: Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC) of Indonesia.
- MoRTHE. (2015). *Panduan program pendidikan profesi guru prajabatan pasca SM-3T, Edisi 3*. Jakarta: Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education (MoRTHE).
- Musau, L. M., & Abere, M. J. (2015). Teacher qualification and students' academic performance in science mathematics and technology subjects in Kenya. *International Journal of Educational Administration and Policy Studies*, 7(3), 83-89. <https://doi.org/10.5897/IJEAPS2014.0386>
- Nipper, K., Ricks, T., Kilpatrick, J., Mayhew, L., Thomas, S., Kwon, N., Klerlein, J., & Hembree, D. (2011). Teacher tensions: Expectations in a professional development institute. *Journal of Mathematics Teacher Education*, 14(5), 375-392. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10857-011-9180-1>
- Palekčić, M. (2005). The effect of quality on pupils' achievements. *Pedagogijska istraživanja*, 2(2), 209-210. Retrieved from <http://hrcak.srce.hr/139324>
- Perin, V. (2013). Strukovno obrazovanje i tržište rada: koncept fleksigurnosti. *Život i škola: časopis za teoriju i praksu odgoja i obrazovanja*, LIX(30), 147-154. Retrieved from <http://hrcak.srce.hr/131976>
- Purković, D., & Jelaska, I. (2014). The impact of selected contextual factors on the teachers' perception of the achievement of goals and objectives in teaching technical culture. *Croatian Journal of Education*, 16(4), 977-997. Retrieved from <http://hrcak.srce.hr/132968>
- Steyn, S., van der Walt, H., & Wolhuter, C. (2015). A generic model of "the" education system for the purposes of making critical comparisons and policy. *Croatian Journal of Education*, 17(4), 1131-1158. Retrieved from <http://hrcak.srce.hr/151230>
- Šimić Šašić, S., & Sorić, I. (2011). Kvaliteta interakcije nastavnik-učenik: povezanost s komponentama samoreguliranog učenja, ispitnom anksioznošću i školskim uspjehom. *Suvremena psihologija*, 14(1), 35-54. Retrieved from <http://hrcak.srce.hr/83107>
- TDA. (2007). *Professional standards for teachers, why sit still in your career?*. London: Training and Development Agency for Schools.
- Teichler, U. (2009). Internationalisation of higher education: European experiences. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 10(1), 93-106. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-009-9002-7>
- Virtue, D. C. (2007). Middle level teacher certification in South Carolina: A case study in educational policy development. *Research in Middle Level Education Online*, 30(10), 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19404476.2007.11462043>

- Volmari, K., Helakorpi, S., & Frimodt, R. (Eds). (2009). *Competence framework for VET professions: Handbook for practitioners*. Helsinki, Finland: Finnish National Board of Education.
- Wiseman, A. W., & Al-bakr, F. (2013). The elusiveness of teacher quality: A comparative analysis of teacher certification and student achievement in Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) countries. *PROSPECTS*, 43(3), 289-309. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11125-013-9272-z>
- Wu, Y. (2012). Schooling experiences and career aspirations of indigenous vocational high school students: a case study in Taiwan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 32(1), 1-15. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2011.621686>
- Ziderman, A. (1997). National Programmes in Technical and Vocational Education: economic and education relationships. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 49(3), 351-366.
- Zrno, J. (2012). Obrazovanje strukovnih nastavnika u hrvatskoj i europskim zemljama. *Andragoški glasnik: Glasilo Hrvatskog andragoškog društva*, 16(1(28)), 43-54. Retrieved from <http://hrcak.srce.hr/103413>

---

**Didik Nurhadi**

Faculty of Engineering, State University of Malang  
Jalan Semarang 5 Malang 65145, East Java, Indonesia  
[didiknurhadi.um@gmail.com](mailto:didiknurhadi.um@gmail.com)

**Siti Zahro**

Graduate School of Technological and Vocational Education,  
National Yunlin University of Science and Technology  
123 University Road, Section 3, Douliou, Yunlin 64002, Taiwan  
[sitizahrovivi@gmail.com](mailto:sitizahrovivi@gmail.com)

**Nyan-Myau Lyau**

Graduate School of Technological and Vocational Education,  
National Yunlin University of Science and Technology  
123 University Road, Section 3, Douliou, Yunlin 64002, Taiwan  
[lyaunm@yuntech.edu.tw](mailto:lyaunm@yuntech.edu.tw)

# Osvrt na obrazovne politike i njihovu provedbu u obrazovanju strukovnih nastavnika

---

## Sažetak

Dugogodišnji propusti u akademskim kvalifikacijama nastavnika ne nestaju usprkos promjenama i unaprjeđenju obrazovne politike koju vlada stalno izrađuje. Ti propusti u konačnici rezultiraju postupnim smanjenjem kvalitete učenika strukovnih škola, što u posljednje vrijeme izaziva ozbiljnu zabrinutost na nacionalnoj razini. To smanjenje kvalitete manifestira se u činjenici da indonezijski učenici nemaju natjecateljski duh ni vještine na domaćem tržištu rada. S ciljem pronalaska kreativnog i učinkovitog rješenja tog problema, ovaj rad pokušava istražiti i opisati obrazovne politike i provedbu obrazovnih standarda od strukovnih nastavnika u zemlji u razvoju i u razvijenoj zemlji, u nadi da će to pomoći učenicima koji završe strukovne škole u stjecanju stručnih kvalifikacija. Primjenom kritičke etnografije, detaljne analize komentara profesora otkrivaju da je na većini sveučilišta u objema državama uobičajena praksa pri odabiru strukovnih nastavnika ta da se poštuje obrazovna politika kako bi se uspostavili pouzdani kriteriji za kvalificirane nastavnike u budućnosti. Čini se da takav program licenciranja nastavnika ima pozitivan utjecaj na dobrobit nastavnika u objema državama, no još uvijek postoji velika potreba za ostalim smjelim inovacijama bitnima za razvoj vještina i kvalifikacija nastavnika.

**Ključne riječi:** stručne kvalifikacije; licenciranje; vlada; priprema; kvaliteta.

## Uvod

Strukovne se škole smatraju odgovornima za kvalitetu kompetencija svojih učenika i za njihovu konkurentnost na tržištu rada jer su oni među glavnim čimbenicima koji prate i pružaju podršku ekonomskom razvoju svoje nacije (Agrawal, 2013; Buligina i Sloka, 2013; Casner-Lotto i Barrington, 2006; Davies i Adnett, 1999; Lowden, Hall, Elliot, i Lewin, 2011; Middleton, Ziderman, i Van, 1993; Perin, 2013; Wu, 2012; Ziderman, 1997; Zrno, 2012). Nastavnici zaposleni u strukovnim školama imaju odlučujuću ulogu u obrazovnom procesu koji njihove učenike čini iznimno kompetentnima u struci, jer je kvaliteta nastavnika jedini i najvažniji faktor koji utječe na postignuća učenika (AITSL, 2011; Maksimović, 2010; Matijević, 2005; Palekčić, 2005). Stoga škole moraju imati kvalificirane nastavnike kako bi poboljšale postignuća

svojih učenika i kvalitetu učenika koji tu školu završe (Al-Musawi i Karam, 2011; Mincu, 2015; Musau i Aber, 2015; Šimić Šašić i Sorić, 2011).

Štoviše, važno je da nastavnici imaju ne samo iskustvo u području obrazovanja nego i stručne kvalifikacije koje im omogućuju rad u industriji, tj. pedagoške vještine koje odgovaraju potrebama industrije, što im omogućuje usklađivanje školskih kurikula s potrebama industrije (Kemmis i Green, 2013). Rezultati nekoliko istraživanja objasnili su da sastavni dijelovi nastavničkih kompetencija koje određuju mjeru u kojoj će učenici razumjeti gradivo uključuju i samo učenje od nastavnika, nastavnu praksu i učenički proces učenja (Hattie, 2012; Kang, Cha i Ha, 2013; Purković i Jelaska, 2014). Nadalje, kako je 2007. godine navela Agencija za obrazovanje i razvoj u školama (TDA), smatra se da kompetentnost stručnih nastavnika odgovara standardima ako oni posjeduju detaljno znanje, veliko razumijevanje nastavnog procesa i vještine poučavanja koji odgovaraju svim potrebama učenika te ako mogu bilo koju temu objasniti putem sadržaja svojih nastavnih sati i kurikula. K tomu, nastavnici bi se trebali potruditi i naučiti učinkovite strategije poučavanja kako bi se svojim znanjem koristili i kako bi ga pretvorili u sadržaj koji je učenicima jasan i razumljiv (AITSL, 2011; Barron i Darling-Hammond, 2008; Felder i Brent, 2005; Fry, Ketteridge, i Marshall, 2008).

Standarde nastavničkih kvalifikacija i kompetencija određuju rezultati koje postignu na stručnim testovima u svakom području (Cao i Luo, 2015). Kako navodi Guskey (2002), standardi su neophodni kako bi se provela evaluacija i omogućio bolji razvoj nastavničke profesije. Međutim, proizvoljno određeni standardi nastavničkih kompetencija u evaluacijskim programima mogu rezultirati nedostatkom natjecateljskog duha i vještina konkurentnosti na tržištu rada. Agrawal (2013) je predočio dokaze da škole nemaju određene standarde za stručne nastavnike, čime škola ne može odgovoriti na potrebe industrije za kvalificiranim i produktivnim radnicima na tržištu rada.

Vlada bi, kao organizacija koja planira politiku, trebala izraditi jasnu politiku kojom bi se postavili standardi kvalitete stručnih nastavnika obrazovanjem nastavnika zaposlenih u državnim školama (Middleton i sur., 1993; Steyn, van der Walt, i Wolhuter, 2015). Od 2007. godine indonezijska je vlada provela mnoge programe, poput stručne izobrazbe nastavnika, kako bi se podigla razina kvalitete nastavnika (Nipper, Ricks, Kilpatrick, Mayhew, Thomas, Kwon, Klerlein, i Hembree, 2011).

Nadalje, visokoškolske ustanove, koje provode programe licenciranja, ponekad pronađu kompromis pri provedbi standarda licenciranja nastavnika. Ti standardi u ovom se radu analiziraju prema komentarima sveučilišnih profesora koji su u isto vrijeme i edukatori i stručnjaci u postupku licenciranja strukovnih nastavnika. Glavna je ideja istražiti obrazovnu politiku i provedbu standarda licenciranja nastavnika, onako kako su one prikazane u zbilji i tumačenjima licenciranih nastavnika na temelju njihove biografije, geografskog podrijetla i kulturnog života usred kompleksnog i konkurentnog obrazovanja u Indoneziji kao zemlji u razvoju i na Tajvanu kao razvijenoj zemlji.

Svrha je ovog istraživanja prepoznati vladinu politiku i način provedbe izobrazbe strukovnih nastavnika prema komentarima profesora iz Indonezija i s Tajvana. Ono sustavno uspoređuje ove politike i njihove praktične strategije u objema zemljama kako bi se odredila učinkovitija politika kao važan čimbenik održivog razvoja kvalitete kompetencija strukovnih nastavnika, posebno u Indoneziji.

## **Pregled literature**

### ***Uloge strukovnih nastavnika***

Od strukovnih nastavnika očekuje se kompetentno poučavanje u njihovim područjima struke. Kako bi bili dobri nastavnici, trebali bi razumjeti i imati akademske kvalifikacije, radne vještine i profesionalnu dinamiku poučavanja, poznavati intelektualnu strukturu obrazovnih znanosti i globalno shvaćati sustav strukovnog obrazovanja (Connell, 2009). Dobar je nastavnik više od pukog predavača. Postoji šest stručnih usluga koje on mora pružiti. Dobar nastavnik lako postaje pružatelj informacija, uzor, pomoćnik, procjenitelj, planer i može razvijati resurse. Štoviše, nastavnici s takvim zaslugama imaju važnu ulogu te su spremni učinkovitije raditi s učenicima i unutar obrazovnih standarda, vrijednosti i obrazaca ponašanja koji izgrađuju takvu vezu s učenicima (Chappell i Johnston, 2003).

U dijelovima početnog programa izobrazbe strukovnih nastavnika stvarni uvjeti u strukovnim školama i radna okolina strukovnih nastavnika također predstavljaju odlučujuće faktore u njihovu stručnom radu i uspjehu. Ti faktori također predstavljaju i raznolikost tradicije strukovnog obrazovanja i učenja, pa ujedno i otežavaju uočavanje onih pozitivnih faktora koji sačinjavaju lokalnu praksu. Ipak, rad nastavnika može se grupirati u brojne zadatke: (1) poticanje tehničkog i stručnog učenja kod učenika, što od nastavnika zahtijeva integraciju znanja o stručnom sadržaju i prikladnih metoda u različite oblike učenja; (2) razvijanje osnovnih vještina kod učenika koje će ih pripremiti za rad tako što se razvija takav proces učenja koji kod učenika izgrađuje opće stavove prema poslu i opće kompetencije, kao i svijest o njihovoj aktivnoj ulozi u društvenom životu; (3) provođenje preliminarnog procjenjivanja i ocjenjivanja procesa učenja kod učenika; (4) odrađivanje administrativnih zadataka vezanih uz organizaciju kurikula i (5) savjetodavni rad s učenicima iz drugih ciljnih skupina, kao što su poslodavci, odrasli učenici, nastavnici itd. (Bader, 1995). Kako navode Volmari, Helakorpi i Frimodt (2009), administracija, edukacija, razvoj vještina, osiguranje kvalitete i umrežavanje pomoći će u razvoju i povećati akademske kvalifikacije nastavnika, njihove pedagoške vještine i stručnost strukovnih nastavnika.

Na sve te zadatke utječu konceptualne promjene u ulozi i funkciji obrazovanja i učenja u školama općenito, a posebno u strukovnim školama. Promjene na tržištu rada i u radnim organizacijama utječu na praksu strukovnog obrazovanja i učenja na vrlo praktičnoj razini, što se tiče onoga što je ostvarivo i onoga što strukovne škole mogu provesti (Agrawal, 2013). Prema klasičnim standardima struke, strukovni nastavnici u nekim europskim zemljama, poput Njemačke i Francuske, dosegнули su relativno

visok stupanj stručnosti u usporedbi s kolegama u području općeg obrazovanja. Međutim, da bi odgovorile na velike izazove u budućnosti, strukovne škole još uvijek trebaju proširiti svoju razinu s lokalne na regionalnu i tražiti punu autonomiju kako bi mogle dosegnuti viši rang.

### **Obrazovne politike i njihova implementacija i iskustva strukovnih nastavnika u Indoneziji i na Tajvanu**

Do sada je izdano nekoliko obrazovnih dokumenata u Indoneziji koji se tiču organiziranog obrazovanja strukovnih nastavnika: Zakon iz 2005. godine koji se odnosi na nastavnike i predavače; Vladina odredba iz 2005. godine koja se odnosi na nacionalne standarde obrazovanja; Odredba ministra iz 2007. godine koja se odnosi na licenciranje nastavnika koji su već zaposleni u struci; Vladina odredba iz 2008. godine koja se odnosi na nastavnike; Vladina odredba iz 2009. koja se odnosi na funkcionalni dodatak na plaću nastavnika i predavača; Odredba ministra iz 2013. godine koja se odnosi na program obrazovanja budućih nastavnika; Odredba ministra iz 2010. godine koja se odnosi na stručno usavršavanje nastavnika koji već rade u školama i Ministrov dekret o uspostavi obrazovnih institucija koje provode stručno obrazovanje i usavršavanje nastavnika koji već rade u školama. U međuvremenu je tajvanska vlada donijela politike kojima se određuje priprema nastavnika, i to Zakonom iz 1979. godine, koji se odnosi na obrazovanje nastavnika i Zakonom iz 1995. godine koji se odnosi na nastavnike. Zakon o obrazovanju nastavnika određuje faze obrazovanja nastavnika, a Zakon o nastavnicima određuje kvalifikacije, posao, prava i obveze, plaću, službu i organizaciju nastavnika.

Od 2007. godine indonezijska vlada provodi program licenciranja nastavnika kako bi pokušala poboljšati kvalitetu nastavnika. Očekuje se da će taj program poboljšati kvalitetu učenja i kompetencije nastavnika u Indoneziji. Program licenciranja provodi se određivanjem uvjeta koje nastavnici moraju ispuniti i dokazati to svojim portfolijom te pružanjem stručne izobrazbe nastavnicima. 2015. godine provedba programa licenciranja nastavnika bila je usredotočena na kompetentno strukovno obrazovanje nastavnika. Ta je promjena provedena na temelju evaluacije prethodnih provedbi licenciranja nastavnika (Ministarstvo obrazovanja i kulture Indonezije, 2015). U međuvremenu je Ministarstvo obrazovanja Tajvana (2010) navelo da obrazovni sustav na Tajvanu filtrira potencijalne buduće nastavnike kako bi pripremio bazu kvalificiranih budućih nastavnika. Obrazovanje nastavnika provodi se kako bi se poboljšala stručna znanja i vještine potrebne za učinkovito poučavanje, a evaluacija se provodi na temelju razlike između znanja nastavnika i njihovih potreba u nastavi (Brown, Horner, i Scanlon, 2014). Strukovne nastavnike također educiraju i iskusni lokalni stručnjaci tijekom obrazovnog programa na sveučilištu, kako bi im pomogli rješavati probleme s kojima se suočavaju u razredu.

Strukovnim nastavnicima u Indoneziji omogućeno je strukovno i nastavničko obrazovanje, a dostupne su im i stipendije za daljnje obrazovanje. Vlada im također

daje stipendije za istraživanje i opremu, a renovira i škole kako bi omogućila udobnost i poboljšala rad u procesu učenja u školama, što poslije rezultira boljom kvalitetom učenika koji završe školu pa oni tako mogu biti konkurentni na nacionalnom tržištu rada. S druge pak strane, tajvanska vlada organizira povremenu obuku i daljnje obrazovanje kako bi proširila znanja nastavnika o različitim problemima s kojima će se suočiti. Strukovni nastavnici također provode istraživanja u suradnji sa sveučilišnim profesorima kako bi riješili probleme u učenju i poboljšali kvalitetu ishoda učenja u skladu s potrebnim kompetencijama na globalnom tržištu rada.

### ***Kurikuli stručnog obrazovanja i standardi licenciranja strukovnih nastavnika u Indoneziji i na Tajvanu***

U Indoneziji je kurikulum za obrazovanje strukovnih nastavnika izrađen za dvije skupine – jedan je usmjeren na studijski program, a drugi na terensko iskustvo i donosi 30 – 40 bodova. Kurikulum za prvu skupinu sadrži kompetencije, strategije, metode, medije i evaluaciju. Program je organiziran u obliku pedagoških radionica za određene predmete i stjecanje iskustva na terenu. Ta iskustva sastoje se od nastavne prakse, kolegija o mikropoučavanju i terenske prakse. Kurikulum za drugu skupinu u principu je šestomjesečni program stažiranja koji se provodi u školi. Na kraju programa provodi se testiranje u obliku usmenog testa i testa uspješnosti. Takav se program još uvijek provodi u obrazovanju budućih strukovnih nastavnika u pograničnim i udaljenim područjima.

Na Tajvanu je kurikulum za obrazovanje nastavnika izrađen za dvije skupine – skupinu studenata koji se usmjeravaju na kognitivne vještine i skupinu onih koji se usmjeravaju na pedagoške vještine. U prvoj je skupini naglasak stavljen na predmete koji su bitni za profesionalnu nastavničku karijeru. Studenti u drugoj skupini, međutim, hospitaraju za vrijeme studija i stažiraju u školama 6 mjeseci. Obje skupine moraju ostvariti 28 – 40 bodova. Ako imaju dobre ocjene, mogu pristupiti pismenom ispitu koji provodi vlada i koji im omogućava nastavničku licencu (Zakon o obrazovanju nastavnika, 1979).

Međutim, uvjeti za nastavničku licencu koji se postavljaju pred strukovne nastavnike u Indoneziji dijele se na opće i posebne uvjete. Jedan od općih uvjeta jest taj da kandidati već nemaju nastavničke licence. Osim toga, kandidati za buduće nastavnike moraju imati dvije godine nastavničkog iskustva i još uvijek aktivno poučavati u školi. Također moraju imati i diplomu sveučilišnog prvostupnika ili Diplomu 4 izdanu od akreditirane ustanove. Za razliku od prethodnog uvjeta, posebni uvjet odnosi se na nastavnike koji ujedno obavljaju i dužnost kontrolora obrazovnih jedinica. Ti nastavnici moraju imati magistarski ili doktorski akademski stupanj i diplomu izdanu od akreditirane ili pridružene ustanove (Licenciranje nastavnika koji su već u službi, 2007). Međutim, tek nakon što uspiju položiti test kojim se provjerava kompetentnost, strukovni nastavnici mogu dobiti svoju nastavničku licencu (Ministarstvo obrazovanja i kulture Indonezije, 2015).



## **Metodologija**

### **Metode istraživanja**

Dizajn ovog istraživanja koristi se kvalitativnom metodom istraživanja. Kvalitativno istraživanje podrazumijeva višestruke metode koje uključuju interpretaciju i prirodan pristup nekom problemu. Taj pojam objašnjava zašto su za područje koje se istražuje potrebne mnoge metode kao što su studije slučaja iz politike i etike, participativna istraživanja i opažanja, intervjui, vizualne metode i interpretacijske analize.

U istraživanju se kao pristup ili strategija koristila etnografija. Etnografski pristup odabran je kako bi se prepoznao utjecaj normi i ideala, navika, diskursa, prakse i aktivnosti određenih skupina na program licenciranja nastavnika koji provodi državno sveučilište. Istraživanje je počelo analizom pitanja istraživanja, prepoznavanjem obrazovnih politika i njihove provedbe u odnosu na program licenciranja u strukovnim školama u Indoneziji i na Tajvanu. K tomu, taj se pristup isto koristio kako bi se napravila kritička analiza provedbe obrazovne politike za strukovne nastavnike stavljanjem naglaska na odnos između kulturoloških aspekata i procesa provedbe obrazovne politike. Očekuje se da će dizajn istraživanja detaljno objasniti način pripremanja strukovnih nastavnika putem procesa licenciranja u Indoneziji i na Tajvanu.

### **Ciljna populacija i uzorak istraživanja**

Ciljnu populaciju za potrebe ovog istraživanja čine profesori iz Indonezije i s Tajvana, koji imaju više od 20 godina nastavnčkog iskustva na sveučilišnoj razini, i kao nastavnici u programu obrazovanja profesionalnih nastavnika i kao sastavljači ispitnih pitanja za profesionalne strukovne nastavnike. Uzorak u ovom istraživanju sastojao se od sveučilišnih profesora s dva državna sveučilišta koja imaju fakultete za strukovne nastavnike, punu akreditaciju i provode testove za utvrđivanje kompetentnosti nastavnika u skladu s politikom licenciranja nastavnika. Oni su ujedno i viši predavači i stručnjaci u strukovnom području te poučavaju strukovne nastavnike o programu licenciranja. U istraživanju je sudjelovalo 14 profesora, od kojih je 10 iz Indonezije, a ostali su s Tajvana. Imaju iskustvo i biografije relevantne za uzorak istraživanja. S obzirom na to da su oni pokrili reprezentativan uzorak ciljne populacije i da predstavljaju zasićen uzorak, nije bilo potrebe da istraživači u istraživanje uključe i druge ispitanike.

### **Instrument istraživanja**

Istraživači su se koristili intervjuom s više pitanja kako bi za potrebe istraživanja detaljno upoznali fenomen. Istraživačka pitanja bila su usmjerena na obrazovne politike i strategije za provedbu programa licenciranja nastavnika u Indoneziji i na Tajvanu. Kvalitativna metoda bitna je za uočavanje temeljnih uloga ideologije, unutarnje dinamike organizacije i društveno-političkih procesa u oblikovanju politike i stvaranju prakse u slučajevima iz područja obrazovanja.

Istraživači su podijelili instrumente intervjua u dvije skupine kako bi olakšali obradu i analizu podataka. Prvo se pitanje odnosi na obrazovnu politiku, a uključuje i postupak licenciranja strukovnih nastavnika kako bi se mlađa generacija potaknula na dobrovoljan izbor karijere strukovnog nastavnika, kao i na strategije evaluacije i osiguranja kvalitete nastavnika u Indoneziji i na Tajvanu. Drugo se pitanje odnosi na provedbu programa licenciranja strukovnih nastavnika za koji je nadležna vlada, kako bi se u cijeloj državi poboljšala standardizacija nastavničkih kompetencija. Neka od pitanja koja su postavili nastavnici bila su: „Pod kojim se uvjetima može polagati test iz kompetentnosti u sklopu programa licenciranja nastavnika?“, „Kako izgleda proces provedbe programa licenciranja nastavnika?“, „Uvodi li se preko programa licenciranja nastavnika i program unapređenja kvalitete nastavnika?“, „Kako vlada može osigurati kvalitetu nastavnika?“ itd.

### **Prikupljanje podataka**

Potrebni podaci prikupljeni su primjenom detaljnog istraživanja kako bi se razumjeli komentari i profesionalna iskustva sveučilišnih profesora u svakoj provedbi programa licenciranja nastavnika na njihovim sveučilištima. Istraživači su započeli istraživanje pregledom literature i dokumenata. Nakon toga su sastavili popis pitanja koja će biti postavljena u istraživanju, izdvojili većinu slučajeva iz promatranih fenomena te ispitali svaki slučaj. Dok su provodili istraživanje, koristili su se repetitivnim procesom kako bi ispitali ciljane pojave i predložili objašnjenje dok se ne dobije potpun opis usmenih komentara. Tada su istraživači napravili teorijsku procjenu i analizu kvalitativnih podataka.

Svrha i pitanja istraživanja koristili su se kao smjernice kod prikupljanja podataka i analize kako bi se razvrstali rezultati istraživanja i shvatile implikacije koje iza njih stoje. Istraživači su pokušali prikazati podatke izravno citirajući bilješke o komentarima ispitanika napravljene tijekom promatranja na licu mjesta te rekonstruirati njihovo značenje. Nakon toga su usporedili podatke prikupljene tijekom promatranja s podacima prikupljenima putem intervjua da bi došli do najpouzdanijeg značenja. Kako bi izbjegli subjektivne i krivo postavljene interpretacije, istraživači nisu izvrtali podatke i pokušali su se konzultirati sa stručnjacima u području strukovnog obrazovanja kako bi valjano potvrdili interpretaciju prikupljenih podataka.

Podaci su prikupljeni, a zatim i dokumentirani. Rezultati istraživanja dobiveni su putem intervjua s ispitanicima o obrazovnim politikama i provedbi programa stvaranja baze strukovnih nastavnika. Istraživači su zabilježili komentare ispitanika i kodirali ih sa svrhom lakše analize. Komentari koje su dala sveučilišta kodirani su kao A i B: A za državna sveučilišta u Indoneziji, a B za državna sveučilišta na Tajvanu. Zatim su istraživači kodirali ostale indonezijske ispitanike brojevima od 1 do 10, a tajvanske ispitanike brojevima od 11 do 14. Konkretni primjeri bit će prikazani u daljnjem tekstu.

## **Analiza podataka**

Istraživači su proveli detaljnu analizu kako bi uspjeli iskoristiti rezultate istraživanja i otkriti implikacije koje su u pozadini ovog istraživanja. Pokušali su i prikazati autentične podatke tako što su izravno citirali bilješke napravljene tijekom intervjua s ispitanicima. Također su rekonstruirali i implikacije koje nastaju interpretacijom tih podataka služeći se komparacijom podataka prikupljenih od mnogobrojnih ispitanika kako bi postigli najbolju internu izvrsnost. To je bila metoda prikupljanja iznimno valjanih podataka.

Nakon toga su se izbjegle subjektivne i krivo postavljene pretpostavke tako što se stalno provodila objektivna refleksija vraćanjem na resurse i sredinu u kojoj su bile zabilježene. Istraživači su također objasnili i usporedili vlade Indonezije i Tajvana u smislu njihove strategije licenciranja nastavnika i provedbe te strategije kako bi se strukovnim nastavnicima omogućile akademske i stručne kvalifikacije.

## **Rezultati i rasprava**

Teme koje su prepoznate iz svrhe istraživanja podijeljene su u tri skupine: utjecaj obrazovnih politika na program pripreme strukovnih nastavnika, provedba politike licenciranja nastavnika kako bi se stvorio veći broj strukovnih nastavnika i usporedba obrazovnih politika o programima educiranja većeg broja strukovnih nastavnika u Indoneziji i na Tajvanu.

### ***Utjecaj vladinih politika na pripremu strukovnih nastavnika***

#### **Situacija u Indoneziji**

Indonezija je zemlja u razvoju, no za razliku od drugih takvih zemalja, stvaranje vladine politike u posljednje je vrijeme dovelo do većeg interesa mlađih generacija za nastavničko zanimanje u općem području, ali i u području strukovnog obrazovanja. Takav povećan interes, za koji je u velikoj mjeri zaslužna obrazovna politika, naravno, ne stvara sam po sebi bazu budućih nastavnika na sveučilištima, pa će to utjecati na dostupnost visokokvalificiranih nastavnika.

Više od tri četvrtine (85 %) sudionika smatra da obrazovna politika ima ključnu ulogu pri povećanju interesa mlađe generacije za nastavničko zanimanje, tj.:

*„Vlada je izglasala zakone o nastavnicima, a od tih zakona se očekuje da će putem postupka licenciranja povećati dostojanstvo stručnih nastavnika koje država formalno priznaje. Prethodna obrazovna politika nije mogla znatno utjecati na zainteresiranost nastavnika niti dati puno jamstvo njihovih kvalifikacija”*  
(Sveučilište A, Ispitanik 1).

To je u skladu s namjerom da se svim učenicima pruže jednake mogućnosti da uče i odrastaju u obrazovnom okruženju u kojem su zaposleni vrhunski, stručni nastavnici. Sljedeći odgovor, koji su dale tri četvrtine ispitanika (75 %), bio je taj da politika ima znatan utjecaj na interes mlade generacije za nastavničko zanimanje. Tu su ispitanici

spomenuli da je „vladina politika u vezi s poticajima za stručne nastavnike potaknula i mlađu generaciju da se odluče za nastavničko zanimanje. Nakon donošenja politike, njihov broj povećan je za više od 100 %.” (Sveučilište A, Ispitanik 3) U međuvremenu je drugi ispitanik (25 %) naveo da „takva politika ima utjecaj na... pozitivan utjecaj, koji indirektno utječe na kvalitetu nastavnika.” (Sveučilište A, Ispitanik 6)

U sklopu teorijskog okvira koji su predstavili Middleton i suradnici (1993) spominje se da su se strategije politike koju vlada primjenjuje kako bi poboljšala sposobnosti nastavnika poboljšale i postale produktivnije. Politika licenciranja koju je izdala indonezijska vlada kako bi postavila nacionalni standard za nastavnike u isto vrijeme osnažuje i profesionalnu etiku i nastavničke kompetencije te podržava razvoj većeg potencijala nastavnika za stručne poslove (Cao i Luo, 2015). Odredba o nastavnicima objašnjava da se minimalni standard kognitivnih obrazaca ponašanja i pedagoških i psihomotornih vještina nastavnika mjeri testom koji nastavnici u državnim školama moraju pisati kako bi dobili licencu (Jalal, Samani, Chang, Stevenson, Ragatz, i Negara, 2009). Nakon što polože državni test za licencu, nastavnici dobivaju poticaje kao stručni nastavnici.

Sveobuhvatno objašnjenje i konceptualizacija komentara ispitanika vode do zaključka da je razvoj politike indonezijske vlade općenito povećao interes mladih za nastavničko zanimanje, stvorio veći broj potencijalnih nastavnika na sveučilištu, obrazovao visokokvalificirane buduće nastavnike i indirektno utjecao na dostupnost kvalificiranih nastavnika u Indoneziji. Posebno valja istaknuti da je politiku o licenciranju nastavnika i poticaje za profesionalne nastavnike oblikovala vlada kako bi standardizirala kompetencije nastavnika i usvojila strategiju obrazovanja profesionalnih nastavnika. Rezultat toga, s jedne strane, je da takva politika pokriva socijalne izdatke za nastavnike, no s druge strane ona ima malen utjecaj na profesionalni rad strukovnih nastavnika. Vlada treba uvesti obrazovnu politiku kako bi posebno regulirala standarde visokokvalificiranih nastavnika koji udovoljavaju brojnim zahtjevima industrije.

### **Situacija na Tajvanu**

Tajvan je razvijena zemlja, no za razliku od bilo koje druge razvijene zemlje amandmani na vladinu politiku redovito poboljšavaju kvalitetu profesionalnih nastavnika, uključujući i one koji rade u strukovnim školama. To je strogo određeno zakonom. Vlada je stvorila bazu potencijalnih nastavnika na sveučilištima i došla do potencijalnih visokokvalificiranih nastavnika, što utječe na veliku konkurenciju za nastavničko zanimanje.

Diplomiranim studentima nije lako postati nastavnicima, kako su naveli svi ispitanici (100 „...biti nastavnik zahtijeva od diplomiranih studenata visoke i zavidne kvalifikacije...” (Sveučilište B, Ispitanik 12) Ispitanik je objasnio da postoje brojne faze koje je potrebno proći da bi se postalo nastavnikom:

*„Licenciranje za stjecanje kvalifikacija za strukovne nastavnike provodi se u dvije faze: inicijalno licenciranje i sekundarno licenciranje. Uvjet za inicijalno licenciranje budućih nastavnika je da su sveučilišni prvostupnici ili da imaju magisterij s državnog ili stranog sveučilišta. Kandidati najprije moraju završiti program izobrazbe nastavnika, a nakon toga slijedi proces sekundarnog licenciranja koji se provodi u skladu s potrebama kandidata navedenim u pristupnom obrascu. Nakon što polože test, kandidati će dobiti status stalnog nastavnika. Proces dobivanja nastavničkog znanja nije ni jednostavan ni brz jer im država garantira bolje plaće, kao i dodatke te povremeno usavršavanje kompetencija” (Sveučilište B, Ispitanik 14).*

Jedan ispitanik je dodao da su zakoni ključna politika kojom se poboljšava kvaliteta rada nastavnika:

*„...kako bi se nastavnike potaknulo da budu konkurentni na međunarodnoj razini, neke odredbe koje se odnose na nastavnike i obrazovanje nastavnika jesu referentni dokumenti kojima se procjenjuje i jamči kvaliteta nastavnika. Vlada je postavila neke uvjete za stjecanje nastavničkih kvalifikacija: administrativne uvjete, strukovno naukovanje, preispitivanje, istraživanje, daljnje obrazovanje. Osim toga, odredbom o obrazovanju nastavnika regulira se uspostava, planiranje, provedba i evaluacija permanentnog stručnog usavršavanja nastavnika” (Sveučilište B, Ispitanik 6).*

Potrebno je da vlada izradi inovativni oblik profesionalnog usavršavanja kako bi se nastavnici obrazovali na kvalitetnoj razini. Guskey (2000) je spomenuo da bi se takav oblik usavršavanja trebao pažljivo i detaljno izraditi kako bi programi stručnog usavršavanja koji doprinose kvaliteti nastavnika bili učinkovitiji i snažniji. Dakle, očekuje se da stručan nastavnik može obavljati neke osnovne poslove kao što su biti dobar nastavnik u poučavanju i učenju, pružati informacije, biti uzor, pomoćnik, ocjenjivač, moći dobro planirati i izrađivati nastavne materijale (Chappell i Johnston, 2003).

Zaključak sveobuhvatnog objašnjenja i konceptualizacije ispitanika na Tajvanu je da, općenito govoreći, razvoj obrazovne politike ima utjecaja na jaku konkurenciju u nastavničkom zanimanju. Pogotovo je očito da amandmani na politiku o nastavnicima i obrazovanju nastavnika u današnje vrijeme imaju pozitivan učinak na dobro stanje i profesionalni rad nastavnika i strukovnih nastavnika. Zaključak je da vlada treba razviti politiku o strukovnim nastavnicima kako bi poboljšala kvalitetu nastavnika koja je potrebna svjetskom tržištu i industriji.

### ***Provedba politika o licenciranju strukovnih nastavnika***

#### ***U Indoneziji***

Program licenciranja nastavnika je prvi korak koji vlada poduzima kako bi definirala standarde kvalitete nastavničkih kompetencija. Indonezijska vlada provodi

licenciranje nastavnika putem strategije portfolija i edukacije nastavnika koji već rade u školi. Takva strategija, koja se već uobičajeno provodi u zemljama u razvoju, poznata je kao tradicionalno licenciranje nastavnika. Druga je strategija razvoj programa stručnog obrazovanja budućih nastavnika u udaljenim područjima, što je poznato kao alternativno licenciranje nastavnika. Vlada je poduzela sve kako bi poboljšala kvalitetu nastavnika koji bi tako obrazovali visokokvalificirane i konkurentne radnike na domaćem tržištu rada.

Više od tri četvrtine (80 %) ispitanika navelo je da je provedba licenciranja nastavnika učinkovita strategija za unapređenje razine kvalitete nastavnika. Jedan je ispitanik objasnio:

*„Od 2007. godine vlada je provela program licenciranja u dvjema fazama: ocjenjivanju portfolija i edukaciji nastavnika već zaposlenih u školama. Ocjenjivanje portfolija znači da se ocjenjuje nastavnikovo stručno znanje ocjenjivanjem dokumenata koji pokazuju njihove akademske kvalifikacije, stupanj obrazovanja, nastavničko iskustvo, planiranje i provedbu procesa učenja, ocjene dobivene od nadređenih, akademska postignuća, stručno usavršavanje, sudjelovanje u znanstvenim forumima, iskustvo u obrazovnim i društvenim organizacijama, važne nagrade u području obrazovanja. Ako nastavnici prođu tu fazu ocjenjivanja, dobivaju licencu. U suprotnome, upućeni su na edukaciju za nastavnike koji već rade u školama. Test kompetencija, koji uključuje pedagoške, društvene, stručne i osobne kompetencije, provodi se na kraju svih aktivnosti. Nastavnici koji polože test dobit će licencu, a nastavnicima koji ne polože test bit će pružena prilika da ponovno izađu na ispit. Ako ga ni tada ne uspiju položiti, još uvijek imaju mogućnost upisati se u sljedeći program licenciranja nakon dvije godine” (Sveučilište A, Ispitanik 3).*

Međutim, drugi je ispitanik spomenuo novu strategiju licenciranja nastavnika:

*„Od 2013. godine vlada provodi licenciranje nastavnika putem programa stručnog obrazovanja budućih nastavnika koji će raditi u udaljenim područjima. Program se godinu dana provodio na sveučilištima koje je odabrao ministar obrazovanja. Tijekom prvog semestra polaznici su učili o teoriji i praksi na sveučilišnom kampusu. U sljedećem su semestru tijekom tri mjeseca poučavali učenike u strukovnoj školi. U posljednjoj fazi izašli su na test za licencu koji je provodilo sveučilište u suradnji s industrijom vezanom uz njihova područja struke” (Sveučilište A, Ispitanik 10).*

Literatura o licenciranju nastavnika navodi da su strategije licenciranja znatno doprinijele načinu na koji vlada shvaća organizaciju obrazovanja nastavnika (Heinen i Scriber, 2007), posebno strukovnih nastavnika. Kako bi se postigli što bolji rezultati, Cochran-Smith i Villegas (2015) su objasnili kako se može napisati osvrt o pouzdanosti obrazovanja koje se organizira i o njegovoj učinkovitosti te politikama koje se odnose na nastavnike, a da je prepoznavanje njegovih snaga i slabosti ključno za razvoj kvalitete nastavnika u zemljama u razvoju.

Općenito govoreći, politike o licenciranju nastavnika provode se putem nekoliko strategija, kao što je pripremanje portfolija i provedba obuke za nastavnike koji već rade u školama, kao i program profesionalne izobrazbe budućih nastavnika u udaljenim područjima. Čini se da takva provedba politike ima značajne rezultate u poboljšanju rada nastavnika na lokalnoj razini pa se očekuje da će ona pomoći popraviti kvalitetu učenika strukovnih škola čak i na nacionalnoj razini.

### Na Tajvanu

Proces licenciranja nastavnika provodi tajvanska vlada putem programa obrazovanja nastavnika i organizacije praktičnog rada za buduće nastavnike. Takva je vrsta licenciranja poznata kao alternativno licenciranje, koje se uvelike provodi u razvijenim zemljama. Njegova je provedba bitna kako bi se poboljšala kvaliteta strukovnih nastavnika s ciljem odgovaranja na potrebe radne snage, i na domaćem i na stranom tržištu rada.

Više od tri četvrtine (90 %) ispitanika, kada smo ih upitali o procesu koji su morali proći da bi postali nastavnici u trajnom zvanju, dali su odgovore poput ovoga: „Kada diplomirani studenti žele postati nastavnicima, moraju proći nekoliko faza: obrazovanje nastavnika, stažiranje u školi, prvo testiranje za nastavničku licencu i drugo testiranje za licenciranje” (Sveučilište B, Ispitanik 11).

Drugi je ispitanik istaknuo kakav bi oblik edukacije povremeno trebali proći strukovni nastavnici. Naveo je sljedeće:

*„Druga učinkovita strategija koja se može primijeniti kako bi se povećala kvaliteta nastavnika jest pružiti strukovnu edukaciju budućim nastavnicima i potaknuti ih da se upišu u daljnje studijske programe na lokalnim ili stranim sveučilištima... Osim toga, vlada bi također trebala omogućiti pristup potrebnim podacima putem razvoja informacijske tehnologije poput MOOC-a, e-učenja i učenja na daljinu. Nadalje, za postizanje tog cilja od velike bi koristi bila i online baza podataka, koja bi sadržavala izvješća o rezultatima istraživanja, instrumente istraživanja, knjižnicu, članke iz stručnih časopisa, e-knjige, seminare i sve ostale informacije povezane s područjem obrazovanja” (Sveučilište B, Ispitanik 14).*

Profesori koji čine povjerenstvo za program poboljšanja moraju provesti evaluaciju. Ovakvu je informaciju dao jedan ispitanik:

*„Proces evaluacije provodi se na godišnjoj bazi, a organizira ga središnja vlada kako bi odredila odgovarajuće i najučinkovitije izrađene programe prema kojima će se provoditi poboljšanje kvalitete nastavnika stvaranjem međunarodne obrazovne kulture koja će biti konkurentna na globalnoj razini” (Sveučilište B, Ispitanik 13).*

Evaluacija politike o programima licenciranja nastavnika, programima strukovnog obrazovanja i naprednijim studijskim programima tvori učinkovite strategije kojima se osnažuje vladina politika o kvaliteti nastavnika (Aluede i Idogho, 2014). Kako bi

se uspostavila osnovna praksa izobrazbe većeg broja stručnih nastavnika, nadležni za obrazovanje trebali bi odrediti nastavnu praksu u sklopu suvremenog kurikula za obrazovanje nastavnika koji će se fokusirati ne samo na uvjerenja i znanje, orijentacije i obveze te kontekst politike o uvođenju i zadržavanju kandidata u nastavničkoj profesiji, nego i na poučavanje i zadatke utemeljene na izazovima i resursima potrebnima na tržištu rada (Ball i Forzani, 2009).

Tajvanska vlada izradila je integrirani program kako bi poboljšala kvalitetu strukovnih nastavnika, počevši od obrazovanja nastavnika na sveučilištu, preko stručne prakse prije izlaska na tržište rada kako bi nastavnici dobili početnu licencu, pa do testa za licencu kojim nastavnici dobivaju stalnu nastavničku licencu. Taj je proces imao pozitivan utjecaj na kvalitetu nastavnika u strukovnim školama, koji su mogli obrazovati svoje učenike u skladu s potrebnim kompetencijama na tržištu rada na državnoj i međunarodnoj razini.

### ***Usporedba politika o organiziranju pripreme strukovnih nastavnika u Indoneziji i na Tajvanu***

Sudeći po komentarima profesora, obrazovanje strukovnih nastavnika u objema zemljama provodi se na temelju obrazovnih politika. Najčešće država stvara politiku o obrazovanju nastavnika kako bi osposobila određen broj kvalificiranih nastavnika putem procesa licenciranja. Na njezinu provedbu utječu ne samo standardi nastavničkih kompetencija nego i politički uvjeti u cijeloj državi, kao i podrijetlo polaznika programa licenciranja nastavnika. Na primjer, kvota nastavnika koji se mogu upisati u program licenciranja određena je budžetom koji odobrava vlada (Jalal i sur., 2009). Littleton (2009) navodi da na edukaciju stručnih nastavnika također utječu osobna iskustva polaznika i edukatora, kao i kulturološke, socioekonomske i jezične razlike. Osim toga, od programa licenciranja nastavnika očekuje se da će izravno utjecati na veću dobrobit nastavnika, a neizravno na poboljšanje učeničkih postignuća (Wiseman i Al-Bakr, 2013).

Strategija licenciranja strukovnih nastavnika u Indoneziji provodi se s pomoću portfolija i jednomjesečne praktične edukacije nastavnika koji već rade u školama. Licenciranje nastavnika služi kao mjera kojom se osigurava minimalna razina nastavničkih vještina koju jamči agencija za licenciranje (Littleton, 2009). Implicitan razlog zbog kojega se provodi takav program jest taj što prije u Indoneziji nisu postojali profesionalni standardi za nastavnike. Ako su položili test nakon praktične obuke u školi, dobili su nastavničku licencu koju im je izdalo povjerenstvo za licenciranje. Osim toga, država im je davala poticaje. 2010. godine vlada je izradila novu politiku o provedbi postupka licenciranja, koja je obuhvatila stručno obrazovanje i nastavnika koji će tek raditi u školama i onih koji već rade u struci. Uvjet pod kojim su nastavnici koji već rade u školama mogli polaziti program licenciranja bio je da su položili državni ispit iz nastavničkih kompetencija (Jalal i sur., 2009). Međutim, program stručnog obrazovanja nastavnika koji će tek raditi u školama namijenjen je onim



polaznicima koji su već pohađali dodiplomski studij kako bi radili u školama u udaljenim ili čak pograničnim područjima (MoRTHE, 2015).

Na Tajvanu je program licenciranja strukovnih nastavnika izrađen za polaznike koji imaju diplomu iz diplomskih studija, magisterija ili doktorata, a koji žele biti nastavnici. Takvi kandidati moraju proći određeni proces selekcije kako bi dobili nastavničku licencu i postali nastavnicima (Conrad i Stone, 2015). Prvi korak u postupku selekcije jest pregledavanje dokumenata potencijalnih kandidata od povjerenstva za kompetencije. Ako kandidati prođu taj dio selekcije, u sljedećem će dijelu pohađati program obrazovanja nastavnika i program stažiranja u strukovnoj školi. Kandidati s jako dobrim rezultatima mogu krenuti na sljedeću fazu – pismeni državni ispit. Ako ga polože, dobit će nastavničku licencu i tada smiju proći test selekcije nastavnika. Nastavnička licenca bit će dodijeljena onima koji prođu set testova (Feng-Jui, Pi-Jen, Guoheng, i Ting-Ying, 2009). Nakon toga se provodi povremeno stručno usavršavanje kako bi se unaprijedilo znanje i strukovne kompetencije nastavnika, i u zemlji i u inozemstvu. Ono je u skladu s idejama o strukovnom obrazovanju u zemljama u razvoju, kako su spomenuli Middleton i sur. (1993).

Općenito, obrazovanje strukovnih nastavnika uglavnom se provodi na sveučilištima u objema zemljama te se provodi prema obrazovnim politikama kako bi se uspostavili odgovarajući kriteriji licenciranja koji bi doveli do bolje kvalitete nastavnika u budućnosti. Strategije provedbe licenciranja nastavnika uglavnom uključuju alternativnu strategiju licenciranja strukovnih nastavnika, kako je spomenuo Littleton (2009). U Indoneziji je licenciranje nastavnika namijenjeno nastavnicima koji već rade u školama kako bi dosegli nacionalni standard kompetencija (Conrad i Stone, 2015), a stručno obrazovanje provodi se za buduće nastavnike koji su završili dodiplomski studij, kako bi mogli poučavati u udaljenim i pograničnim područjima (MoRTHE, 2015). S druge strane, licenciranje nastavnika na Tajvanu ima za svrhu stvoriti veći broj kandidata za nastavničko zanimanje, onih koji imaju potencijal i kvalitetu koji im omogućuju razvijanje kompetencija i internacionalizaciju obrazovanja u strukovnim školama (Cummings i Bain, 2009; Teichler, 2009; Wiseman i Al-Bakr, 2013).

## **Zaključci**

Zaključak ovog rada jest da vlade Indonezije i Tajvana provode standardizaciju nastavničkog zvanja putem licenciranja, kako bi osigurali kvalitetu budućih strukovnih nastavnika. Indonezijska je vlada postavila standard za nastavnike na temelju nacionalnih nastavničkih standarda, a tajvanska je vlada postavila standarde za nastavnike na temelju međunarodnih nastavničkih standarda. Razlika je u skladu s kulturološkim aspektima Indonezije kao zemlje u razvoju, a Tajvan je razvijena zemlja. Indonezijska se vlada ne koristi samo strategijom alternativnog licenciranja kao Tajvan nego se također koristi i tradicionalnim licenciranjem putem izrade portfolija i obukom nastavnika već zaposlenih u školama.

Istraživanje koje je detaljno provedeno s obzirom na općepoznate razlike u vladinim politikama i provedbama obrazovanja strukovnih nastavnika pruža kreatorima

obrazovnih politika uvid u njihovu provedbu i provedbu strategija obrazovanja nastavnika (Virtue, 2007). Program razvoja kvalitete nastavnika može pružiti uvid u kreativne i inovativne načine podizanja kvalitete strukovnih nastavnika putem programa licenciranja nastavnika s međunarodnom licencom (Kane, Rockoff, i Staiger, 2008). Štoviše, potrebno je podići kvalitetu indonezijskih nastavnika kako bi njihove strukovne kompetencije koje su već u skladu s nacionalnim i međunarodnim standardima mogle pokrenuti značajne promjene, tj. kako bi dovele do većeg profesionalizma u njihovim školama i učinile ih konkurentnima. Na kraju, visokokvalificirani nastavnici mogu učiniti učenike strukovnih škola kompetentnima i konkurentnima na domaćem i međunarodnom tržištu rada (Agrawal, 2013; Middleton, Ziderman, i Van, 1993).

Dajemo nekoliko preporuka koje bi se trebale uzeti u obzir. Politika o kvaliteti budućih strukovnih nastavnika treba se usmjeriti na razvoj procesa licenciranja i na uspostavljanje standarda kompetencija licenciranih strukovnih nastavnika. Indonezijska vlada trebala bi sustavno i povremeno nadopunjavati obrazovne politike nakon provedbe detaljnog istraživanja o provedbi programa licenciranja nastavnika na Tajvanu s obzirom na poboljšanje procesa alternativnog licenciranja i izradu programa koji doprinose podizanju kvalitete nastavnika u skladu s potrebama globalnog tržišta. Ovdje su nastavnici spremni pružiti učenicima strukovnih škola posebne vještine i kompetencije i učiniti ih konkurentnima na tržištu rada. K tomu, od njih se također očekuje da će redovito razvijati svoje strukovne kompetencije u skladu s potrebama domaćeg i međunarodnog tržišta rada putem programa edukacije na lokalnim sveučilištima ili u inozemstvu. U međuvremenu bi rukovoditelji strukovnih škola trebali evaluirati i razviti program rada nastavnika u suradnji sa sveučilišnim profesorima. Potrebno je proširivati znanje putem daljnjeg obrazovanja na studijskim programima kako bi se razvio potencijal nastavnika i učenika u školama u kojima ti nastavnici rade.