

Children and youth's acquisition of the civic competence: a comparative analysis of the Republic of Croatia and England

Marina Diković & Marta Zečević

To cite this article: Marina Diković & Marta Zečević (2020) Children and youth's acquisition of the civic competence: a comparative analysis of the Republic of Croatia and England, Economic Research-Ekonomika Istraživanja, 33:1, 1222-1239, DOI: [10.1080/1331677X.2019.1710235](https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2019.1710235)

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2019.1710235>



© 2020 The Author(s). Published by Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group.



Published online: 13 Jan 2020.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



Article views: 387



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)

Children and youth's acquisition of the civic competence: a comparative analysis of the Republic of Croatia and England

Marina Diković  and Marta Zečević

Faculty of Educational Sciences, Juraj Dobrila University of Pula, Pula, Croatia

ABSTRACT

The civic competence implies the acquisition of knowledge, skills and attitudes by active citizens who will promote the protection of human rights and civic freedom and thus contribute to their narrower and wider community. It is important to start acquiring the civic competence at the beginning of a child's schooling, but also to continue with it at all educational levels. This paper's aim was to analyse the acquisition of the civic competence in two countries: The Republic of Croatia and England. Since Citizenship Education has started to be institutionalised in both countries only lately, the paper presents, compares and analyses the current status of Citizenship Education in the national educational documents of the Republic of Croatia and the United Kingdom which exclusively relate to England.

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 17 September 2019
Accepted 23 December 2019

KEYWORDS

Citizenship Education; the Croatian and English educational system; learning outcomes; competences

JEL CLASSIFICATIONS

I2; I21

Introduction

Preschool education in the Republic of Croatia encompasses education and care of the children of preschool age, realized through educational, health care, nourishment and social care programmes for children from six months of age until school age.¹ According to the *Ordinance on the Content and Duration of Pre-Preparatory Programme* (NN 107/14), the pre-preparatory programme is a compulsory educational programme for children in the year preceding their enrolment into primary school, and is a part of the education system in the Republic of Croatia. Eight-year elementary education (called primary education) is compulsory for all children between the ages of 6 and 15. Secondary education enables everyone, under equal terms and according to one's capabilities, to acquire knowledge and skills required for work or continuation of education. Quality higher education is a prerequisite for a successful society. University study programmes are in accordance with the Bologna

CONTACT Marta Zečević  marta.zecevic.sb@gmail.com

© 2020 The Author(s). Published by Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group.

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

system. Within the Curricular reform in Croatia the compulsory education will be extend to nine years.

In England the compulsory school ages are 5 to 16. From age 4 to 5, most children attend a primary school reception class full time. Primary education consists of Key Stage 1 for ages 5 to 7 and Key Stage 2 for ages 7 to 11. Primary schools are either maintained schools or academies. Key Stage 3 is for ages 11 to 14. It is provided in secondary schools catering for students from 11 to 16 or 18/19. Students normally continue at the same secondary school for Key Stage 4, which is for ages 14 to 16. From age 16 to 18/19, young people must be in full- or part-time education or training. In England students receive “efficient full-time education suitable to their age, ability, aptitude, and to any special educational needs they may have, by regular attendance at school or in some other appropriate manner; although education is compulsory, school is not, and parents may educate their child at home without seeking approval”². There is also a requirement on the young person (16+) to participate in one of the following until reaching the age of 18: full-time education, an apprenticeship or traineeship, 20 hours minimum per week of work or volunteering while in part-time education or training. Higher education institutions in England are heading for internationalization (Toyoshima, 2007). Within the progress of globalization, the mobility of students and academic staff at universities has drastically increased in the past few decades, both in Croatia and England.

Acquiring the civic competence

Acquisition of the civic competence means preparing children and young people for an active participation in the democratic society (Diković et al., 2016). Civic competence includes three interrelated functional dimensions: civic knowledge and understanding, civic skills and abilities, and civic values and attitudes. These dimensions are set out on the basis of the *2002 Recommendation of the Council of Europe on Education for Democratic Citizenship* and the *Charter of the Council of Europe on Education for Democratic Citizenship and Human Rights Education of 2010*, which are important for the training of citizens for active participation in civic, political, economic, legal and cultural sphere of society (Ministry of Science and Education, 2012).

„In order to develop the civic competences of young people, it is important to give more attention to areas that have been neglected so far: human rights, equality and combating discrimination, interculturality, politics and political systems, democracy, citizenship, public policy, rule of law, responsibility and transparency of public work administration and the fight against corruption, political culture and political socialization, populism, globalization “(Kovačić & Horvat, 2016, 26). Moreover, if we want to emancipate citizens and encourage their activity, young people need to understand the notion and role of citizens in a democratic society, and it is important to encourage them to become aware of the importance of volunteering and socially beneficial action.

Klemenčić (2007) points out that a joint model of education for democracy cannot be discussed. This means that there are various dimensions of ‘education for democracy’. The Council of Europe Programme calls this concept in the name of education

for democratic citizenship which can describe activities in the context of acquiring civic competence, activities that are guidelines to reach European citizens, and that are the midpoints of common educational trends in EU documents.

Education for citizenship in Croatia: history and contemporary context

In the Republic of Croatia programmes of citizenship education have been introduced in the educational system in 1999. The Government of the Republic of Croatia, as an answer to the UN Resolution on the *Decade of Education for Human Rights 1995-2004*, founded the National Committee for the Education on Human Rights. The aim of this institution was coordinating the design, conduction and evaluation of the national programme in this area. The National Programme of Education for Human Rights (1999) consists of the programme for human rights for pre-school education, general class teaching, specific class teaching in primary school and of the high schools' programme for human rights (Diković, 2010). Years after 1999, Citizenship Education was not systematically introduced into the education system and implementation depended on the teachers' selection and their competences. In the *National Program on Primary Education* (Croatian Ministry of Science, Education and Sports, 2006), which is still in force, this area of EC was included within integrated, but optional school subjects. The problem of this kind of introduction is the electoral character of this programme. This curriculum prescribes that all teachers should be familiar with the Human Rights and Citizenship Education programme and be able to use the method of integration and correlation in teaching. Human Rights Education and Citizenship Education enable the application of active learning methods and teaching, such as project learning, collaborative learning, etc.

In some secondary schools in the Republic of Croatia the subject named Politics and Economics is taught. In the curriculum of Politics and Economics³ it is emphasized that a political culture is being developed for active participation in the political system, that in a democratic world, political education of the youth has become an indispensable part of every education and that developing a democratic way of thinking with the subject Politics and Economics should create the opportunity to take positions on current political developments. Considering that Citizenship Education develops active citizens not only in political, but also in social terms, the course Politics and Economics only covers its part, and in that sense it cannot be said that these programs are equivalent.

The 2009 survey of the Istrian County showed that this programme was carried out to a lesser extent in schools because teachers did not feel competent (Diković, 2012). *National Framework Curriculum for Pre-school Education and General Compulsory and Secondary School Education* (Croatian Ministry of Science, Education and Sports, 2011) introduced Citizenship Education as a cross-curricular content implemented through the whole period of obligatory education, but also as an optional school subject and integrated content within the area of humanities and social sciences themes. However, the implementation of EC has remained unclear.

In the school years 2012/2013 and 2013/2014 the *Curriculum of Citizenship Education* (Ministry of Science, Education and Sport, Education and Teacher

Training Agency, 2012) was conducted experimentally in some primary and high schools of the Republic of Croatia, and the models of inclusion in primary and secondary schools were: intercurricular theme (interdisciplinary), extracurricular, school and social community's projects as parts of the school curriculum with the possibility of choosing a modular approach, and as an elective subject. This document is spirally-developmentally set and it includes the development of structural dimensions: human-legal, political, social, cultural, economic and ecological. Considering that the students' citizenship knowledge and understanding, civil skills and abilities and civil values and attitudes can be evaluated, the *Curriculum* is based on the anticipated schedule of content realisation depending on the model of implementation and on outcomes or educational achievements. Outcomes represent a standard which is measured at the end of particular educational cycles and students must achieve these standards which are not strictly related to one year (one school class). It offers guidelines for the development of students' democratic consciousness and promotes the active and efficient participation in the development of democratic relations in schools, local communities and societies as a whole, with a prop on principles of human dignity, democracy, justice and pacifism (Ministry of Science and Education, 2012).

Based on the experimental implementation of the Curriculum (Diković et al., 2016, 12), "especially on the conducted evaluation of students' educational achievements and the evaluation of educational co-partners⁴, the *Programme of Intercurricular and Interdisciplinary Contents of Citizenship Education for Primary and High Schools* (Ministry of Science, Education and Sport, 2014) appeared". In the beginning of the realisation of this programme it has been realised in all primary and high schools as a compulsory content after the model of intercurricular implementation. Teachers have been offered with units and themes, contents and correlations regarding dimensions: human-legal – knowing and realising rights and responsibilities; political – participating in decision and rules making; social – development of interpersonal relations; intercultural – respecting differences and values, dedication to pluralism; economic – promoting the economic interdependence and solidarity; ecological – promoting the global interdependence in an ecological context (Ministry of Science and Education, 2014). This document is also based on the time schedule for each level of education but not for one school year.

In 2015 the Comprehensive curricular reform⁵ began. The first stage of the mentioned reform, devoted to the development of curricular documents, was completed in February 2016. During February 2016 all documents (a number of curricular documents related to various educational levels, curricular areas, cross-curricular topics and subject curricula) were made publicly available online. After a lengthy public debate on all documents, to coordinate the documents with the comments given in the public debate, including also the Curriculum of Citizenship Education, a decision on the new curriculum according to which it will be taught in the 2019/2020 school year 2019 was made⁶ in January 2019. This document is based on three domains (Human Rights, Democracy and Social Community) and the content is learning outcomes that are divided into cycles according to their domains. Learning outcomes indicate what the students should know after a particular cycle, which skills and

attitudes are adopted. Besides, this document contains recommendations for the realization of Citizenship Education and the proposed themes (contents), but it also describes the learning experiences, the role of the teachers, the materials and resources, the environment and the time needed for learning and teaching Citizenship education. Particularly in this document the evaluation of this inter-topic theme is pointed out (because Citizenship education is not a separate subject) with emphasis on students' progress monitoring in order to successfully acquire the civic competence. In this moment all Croatian teachers are trained to carry out all curriculums. An overview of Citizenship Education in the Croatian educational system was provided by authors Kovačić and Horvat (2016) who emphasize that it is important to prepare and support primary and secondary school teachers, to define clear responsibilities, and to provide them guidelines for implementing Citizenship Education in the Croatian educational system.

The extent to which the dimension of intercultural education is incorporated into the citizenship curricula at the level of compulsory education in the countries of South Eastern Europe: Bosnia and Herzegovina, Serbia, Montenegro, Macedonia, Slovenia, and Croatia was conducted in 2013 (Diković, 2014). Education policy and practice in the South Eastern European countries, including Croatia, are still far from introducing intercultural education (as well as Citizenship Education) as a separate field of instruction and there are no specific guidelines for its implementation, despite the fact that these guidelines have been developed by UNESCO, the Council of Europe and the European Union.

A major obstacle is teacher competence in school practice. Namely, many faculties which prepare primary and secondary schools teachers do not have Citizenship Education included in their curricula. Citizenship Education is a course that is usually offered as an optional subject or does not exist at all. In the year 2012 the research was conducted on the interculturalism, human rights and citizenship courses presence in studies' educational courses of initial teacher's education at universities of the Republic of Croatia (Diković & Piršl, 2014). This analysis has shown the need for systematically implementing these areas from the initial educational level.

"A more recent analysis (from 2014/2015) has shown that in the time when Citizenship Education is introduced in schools as a compulsory content (intercurricular), instead of introducing pre-service teacher education and training as a compulsory course, this important field becomes/remains (or neither) an elective content" (Diković et al., 2016, 23).

International and European context, based on researches done by Spajić-Vrkaš and Čehulić (2016, 182), shows "a number of weaknesses in the preparation of students for active and responsible citizenship of cultural pluralist democracies, and those weaknesses are most pronounced in the countries of South East Europe". The gap between these countries' educational systems "between the policies and practices of civic education is considerably deeper, which is primarily related to the absence of implementation strategies, programmes and/or plans, which also addresses the issue of initial education and professional development of teaching staff in the field". Unlike most of Europe's "old" and "new" democracies, which in Citizenship education increasingly seem to be an important factor for empowering citizens "as a key

prerequisite for strengthening democracy, in the countries of South East Europe the potential for learning for citizenship has not yet been recognized and used in a satisfactory manner”.

Eurydice, the European Commission (2017) study about *Citizenship Education at Schools in Europe* shows some extensive researches on Citizenship Education and describes some educational systems and organizational processes in some European countries. The general objective of this report is “to provide a current and comprehensive picture of national policies in the area of citizenship education in schools across Europe, at a moment when increasing demands are being made on education and training systems to promote this area of learning” (Eurydice, European Commission, 2017, 9-10). The analysis shows that “in the majority of European countries national curricula tend to be broad in scope covering most of the competences related to democratic and socially responsible action, critical thinking and interpersonal interactions”.

Comparative analysis of the republic of Croatia and England

Implementation of citizenship education

In 2013 the Department for Education in England provided the *Citizenship Programmes of Study: Key Stages 3 and 4*. The mandatory implementation of Citizenship Education in the Republic of Croatia starts with the first year of elementary education with students aged about 7 while in England it starts in the seventh year of learning (high school) with students aged about 11. It is evident that the English education system prescribes the compulsory implementation of Citizenship Education for only five school years while the compulsory implementation in the Republic of Croatia is for the whole elementary and high school education, from 11 to 12 school years.

In the Republic of Croatia, Citizenship Education is considered a cross-curricular theme and it is compulsory in elementary education (8 years) and secondary education (3 to 5 years). One part of the content of Citizenship Education (according to Eurydice, European Commission, 2017) is taught separately within the Politics and Economics⁷ subject in some secondary schools and as an elective subject in some elementary schools. For primary education in England (in key stages 1 and 2) it is not prescribed that Citizenship Education should be carried out either as a separate subject or an integrated or cross-curricular theme. Likewise, the English authorities do not determine how the school approaches to Citizenship Education will be implemented neither for the two final grades of upper secondary education nor for the academy⁸. Only in the key stages 3 and 4 (in high school) the government sets the mandatory implementation of the prescribed content of Citizenship Education. For this reason, in Eurydice’s report issued by the European Commission (2017) England is ranked among the few countries where Citizenship education is not specified in curricula for each level of general education, either as a cross-curricular theme or as a mandatory integrated or separate subject. It is necessary to mention that there is a *Citizenship programme of study for key stages 1 and 2*⁹ that prescribes the interdisciplinary content of Citizenship Education for English elementary education, but it is

not compulsory and schools are not obliged to follow it, but has been offered to schools to plan the entire curriculum¹⁰. Since the English national curriculum provides only the framework content of the Citizenship Education which should be taught, for assistance in curriculum development, it is recommended to refer to the Association for Citizenship Teaching (ACT) which provides schools with guidelines and tools to implement the content of Citizenship Education. It is clear that access to Citizenship Education in the two countries is largely different. First of all, there is a noticeable difference in the specification of the approach where it can be seen that in Croatia the approach is specified at all educational levels, and in England, in relation to Croatia, only in five grades of secondary education. Schools in England have autonomy in the selection of access to Citizenship Education at particular educational levels as well as at academies that, according to Eurydice, European Commission (2017, 31), “are attended by 70% of high school students”. Bearing in mind that the academies¹¹ make up the majority of secondary schools in England, it can be concluded that, apart from the mentioned elementary education and the two final grades of upper secondary education, for most of the secondary schools (academies) the English authorities do not determine access to Citizenship Education, but schools decide on it. Although Citizenship Education in England, as already mentioned, is conceived as a separate subject in five grades, schools can still independently choose access as long as the prescribed content is covered (Eurydice, European Commission, 2017). It could therefore be said that the acquisition of citizenship competences in England is not determined by the state authority to a great extent. Schools have the freedom to choose the approach to Citizenship Education, but also the duty to create a curriculum that should “balance and promote the spiritual, moral, cultural, mental and physical development of students in school and society” (Eurydice, European Commission, 2017, 44). Speaking of the approach clearly defined by state authorities, in the Republic of Croatia Citizenship Education is mostly considered a cross-curricular theme while in England at a compulsory level (state schools) it is considered as a separate subject. In other words, while in Croatia the content of Citizenship Education is considered an interdisciplinary content, in England it is considered to be a disciplinary separate content that is independently taught.

Teaching hours for the cross-curricular implementation of Citizenship Education in the Republic of Croatia are precisely defined and prescribed at the national level for both elementary and secondary education. For elementary school education it is prescribed to have 35 hours a year: 15 hours cross-curricular, 10 hours integrated in the subject of Class Period and 10 hours through extra-curricular activities. For secondary education, the situation is almost the same (35 hours a year), except that the content of Citizenship Education is taught as cross-curricular for 20 hours, and integrated into the subject of Class Period for five hours. Related to considering Citizenship Education as a separate subject (Politics and Economy¹²), according to the Eurydice Report, the European Commission (2017), Croatia has the smallest recommended minimum number of teaching hours in elementary and secondary education compared to 20 other European education systems. On the other hand, England stands out as the only country that does not determine the number of lessons for any curricular area; so is for Citizenship Education. Schools are obliged to follow a

national curriculum, but can independently organize their classes as they find it appropriate. In fact, the state does not require specific teaching hours for any school subject (Roberts, 2018). Although the Association for Citizenship Teaching¹³ in England recommends teaching Citizenship Education through a separate subject, it also indicates that in many schools (though not recommended) it has been taught through existing subjects, most often: Informed and Responsible Action, Personal, Social, Health and Economic Education (PSHE¹⁴), English, Geography and History for KS3, Information and Communication Technology (ICT) and Religious Education (RE). According to Šalaj (2005), due to the long democratic tradition, institutionalization of Citizenship Education as a mandatory part of education policy in England started pretty late¹⁵ and Croatia is mentioned as one of the few European countries that in that time (more than ten years ago) neglected the development of Citizenship Education.

Aims and contents of citizenship education

The mentioned Croatian and English programmes are primarily aimed at acquiring knowledge of different aspects of the area of Citizenship Education and developing the skills and abilities needed for active citizen participation in society. Within the Croatian programme, the content of Citizenship Education is divided into six dimensions: human-legal, political, social, intercultural, economic and ecological with an indication that every dimension is associated with other dimensions. Such a structure suggests that in Croatia the content of Citizenship Education is viewed as interdisciplinary. Those six dimensions are implemented through the comprehensive elementary and secondary education with differences in the content scope depending on the educational level. Within these dimensions the content is specified with exact learning outcomes. On the other hand, the English education system for compulsory implementation of Citizenship Education in key stages 3 and 4 (secondary school)¹⁶ provides only curricular guidelines for general and (specific) goals, but not learning outcomes. It can be concluded from that fact that the Croatian educational system tends to a more recent approach to the curricular structure of Citizenship Education. Taking into account the previous citation (Šalaj, 2005) that Croatia neglects the development of Citizenship Education, it has been noted that since 2005, great progress has been made, and that Citizenship Education in Croatia is becoming increasingly important.

In general, both of the Citizenship Education programmes have similar content. It can be noticed that the term “European Union” is not mentioned in the English programme, although at the time when the document was published, the United Kingdom (England) had been in the European Union for 40 years (since 1973¹⁷). Only the relations of the United Kingdom (England) with the rest of Europe, The Commonwealth,¹⁸ the United Nations and the rest of the world are mentioned. In the Croatian programme the term European Union (within framework themes) is mentioned in the context of the role of citizens in Croatia and the European Union. With regard to the implementation of the program of Citizenship Education as assistance to teachers there is a document *Znam, razmišljam, sudjelujem: Priručnik za*

nastavnike: *Pomoć u provedbi građanskog odgoja i obrazovanja* (Zenzerović Šloser, 2014). In 2014 Citizenship Education Expert Group supported by the Department of Education in England has published a document *Resources and Materials to Support the Revised National Curriculum for Citizenship 2014 – a Digest for Teachers*¹⁹ to promote best practices in teaching a revised National Curriculum for Citizenship Education. It is also worth to mention here the website *Educate Against Hate*²⁰ which also provides some guidance for teaching Citizenship Education in England.

Comparison of competences in citizenship education

Eurydice report, the European Commission (2017), defines four areas of citizenship competences: *Interacting effectively and constructively with others*, *Thinking critically*, *Acting in a socially responsible manner* and *Acting democratically*. These competences were viewed through a matrix to allow comparative analysis and draw conclusions important for the development of the Citizenship Education program. There are 45 specific citizenship competences defined within these areas, such as for example *Respect for different opinions or beliefs*, *Respect for human rights*, *Emotional awareness*, *Understanding the present world*, *Conflict resolution*, *Non-discrimination*, *Media literacy*, *Environmental protection*, *Knowledge of fundamental political and social concepts*, *Respect for democracy* etc. This report analyses the curricula of Citizenship Education in 42 European Education Systems²¹. For the purposes of the analysis, the report will outline and present the representation of specific citizenship competences according to the areas of citizenship competences in the educational systems of the two countries - the Republic of Croatia and England²².

According to the European Commission (2017, 48) there are 13 specific citizenship competences defined in the area of *Interacting effectively and constructively with others*: *Interacting effectively and constructively with others*, *Self-confidence*, *Responsibility*, *Autonomy (personal initiative)*, *Respect for different opinions or beliefs*, *Cooperation*, *Conflict resolution*, *Empathy*, *Self-awareness*, *Communicating and listening*, *Emotional awareness*, *Flexibility or adaptability* and *Inter-cultural skills*. In the content of the Croatian Curriculum for Citizenship Education, 11 of these specific citizenship competences can be found, and in the content of English Curriculum for Citizenship Education nine of them. In the area of *Thinking critically* there are 10 specific citizenship competences: *Thinking critically*, *Multiperspectivity*, *Reasoning and analysis skills*, *Data interpretation*, *Knowledge discovery and use of sources*, *Media literacy*, *Creativity*, *Exercising judgement*, *Understanding the present world* and *Questioning*. There is the same number of these specific competences present in the Croatian and English documents – six of them. The area of *Acting in a socially responsible manner* is defined through 12 specific citizenship competences: *Acting in a socially responsible manner*, *Respect for justice*, *Solidarity*, *Respect for other human beings*, *Respect for human rights*, *Sense of belonging*, *Sustainable development*, *Environmental protection*, *Cultural heritage protection*, *Knowing about or respecting other cultures*, *Knowing about or respecting religions* and *Non-discrimination*. In the Croatian content of Citizenship Education there are almost all (except one) specific citizenship competence present in this area, while in the English content they are

represented much less – only six of them. The area of *Acting democratically* is defined through 10 specific citizenship competences: *Acting democratically*, *Respect for democracy*, *Knowledge of political institutions*, *Knowledge of political processes (e.g. elections)*, *Knowledge of international organisations treaties and declarations*, *Interacting with political authorities*, *Knowledge of fundamental political and social concepts*, *Respect for rules*, *Participating*, and *Knowledge of or participation in civil society*. Of these 10 specific citizenship competences in the Croatian content of Citizenship Education there are six of them, while in the English there are eight of them. It can be noticed that in the Croatian educational documents almost all specific citizenship competences pertaining to the area of *Interacting effectively and constructively with others* are present, while in English documents only half of these are present. On the other hand, in England almost all citizenship competences from the area of *Acting democratically* are present. Since the area of *Acting democratically* can have a social and political dimension, one might wonder whether Citizenship Education as a separate subject would have more than the role of political or social orientation.

Out of a total of 45 specific competences from Citizenship Education, 28 of them are represented in English documents, and in Croatian there are 34 of them. Both countries share 25 citizenship competences that are developing; most of them are related to the area of *Interacting effectively and constructively with others*. There are 14 specific citizenship competences that appear in the Croatian documents for Citizenship Education and do not appear in the English ones. The largest number of these (6) refers to competences from the area of *Acting in a socially responsible manner*. On the other hand, we find eight specific citizenship competences that appear in English documents, but not in the Croatian ones. Most of these relate to competences from the area of *Thinking critically and Acting democratically*. This points to the development of individual competences in these two countries. There are 3 specific citizenship competences that are not represented in either of the curriculums for Citizenship Education of the two countries: *Empathy*, *Creativity and Acting democratically*. Specific citizenship competences that are not present in English educational documents are: *Conflict resolution*, *Emotional awareness*, *Flexibility or adaptability*, *Inter-cultural skills*, *Multiperspectivity*, *Media literacy*, *Questioning*, *Solidarity* *Respect for other human beings*, *Sense of belonging*, *Sustainable development*, *Cultural heritage protection*, *Non-discrimination and Respect for democracy*. Citizenship competences that cannot be found in Croatian educational documents are: *Interacting effectively and constructively with others*, *Thinking critically*, *Data interpretation*, *Understanding the present world*, *Acting in a socially responsible manner*, *Interacting with political authorities*, *Knowledge of fundamental political and social concepts* and *Knowledge of or participation in civil society*. Briefly, it is apparent from the above comparisons that in English educational documents there is mostly a lack of specific citizenship competences from the areas of *Interacting effectively and constructively with others* and *Acting in a socially responsible manner*, while in Croatian educational documents there is a lack of citizenship competences from the areas of *Thinking critically and Acting democratically*.

Furthermore, in Croatia there are 23 specific citizenship competences represented at all educational levels. Unlike Croatia, England has only five of them represented at

all levels. This difference could be attributed to differences in access to Citizenship Education in the two countries. The Croatian approach to Citizenship Education is specified and focused on compulsory and systematic implementation throughout the elementary and high school education. Citizenship Education is considered as an interdisciplinary subject that extends across all subjects and all educational levels. In England, however, the implementation of Citizenship Education is mandatory in only five grades (secondary education) and it is considered as a discipline-separated content, while at other educational levels it is being implemented according to the independent school choice. In such a fragmented structure and unequal approach to Citizenship Education in England it is obviously harder to systematically develop citizenship competences, which could be explained by the fact that only five out of 45 specific citizenship competences are represented at all English educational levels. Therefore, it is not enough to teach the systematic development of civic competence within one subject at particular educational levels, but the obligation to teach it should be on all levels of education.

Comparison of learning outcomes in citizenship education

It was previously mentioned that the English education system in key stages 3 and 4 (where it is mandatory for implementation) provides only curricular guidelines for general and (specific) goals, but not learning outcomes. However, in the *Citizenship programmes of study for key stages 1 and 2* (primary education) which is not compulsory, but has been offered to schools to plan the entire curriculum, the content is listed in the form of learning outcomes. Considering that contemporary curricular planning approach is just about setting out the learning outcomes, this paper compares the learning outcomes of the two programs for Citizenship Education – *Citizenship for Key Stages 1 and 2* (ENG) and *Programme of Intercurricular and Interdisciplinary Contents of Citizenship Education for Primary and High Schools* (HR). The mentioned English Primary Education programme refers to the first six grades and the Croatian part analysed refer to the first four grades. In the Croatian programme the learning outcomes are defined within six dimensions while the English programme is defined within five chapters: *Developing confidence and responsibility and making the most of their abilities*, *Preparing to play an active role as citizens*, *Developing a healthy, safer lifestyle*, *Developing good relationships and respecting the differences between people* and *Breadth of opportunities*.

Table 1 represents a shortened version of analytical matrix of our research analysis in which some examples of related learning outcomes can be found, but also serves as an example of learning outcomes that differ in the two countries. The results are written in a shortened form which describes them in a broader sense. It can be seen from the table that similarities in the outcomes of both programmes are mainly related to knowledge and the protection of human rights, respect for diversity, knowledge of democratic structures and processes and socially responsible action. Similarities are found in the development of: critical thinking, proper interaction with others, exchanging opinions and views, combating violence, using money etc. From differences in learning outcomes in the two countries, the following outcomes can be

Table 1. Comparative view of related learning outcomes and non-related learning outcomes into the programmes of Citizenship Education in primary education of the two countries.

State	Programme (document)	Examples of related learning outcomes	Examples of non-related learning outcomes
Republic of Croatia (RC)	<i>Programme of Intercultural and Interdisciplinary Contents of Citizenship Education for Primary and High School</i> ²⁵	<p>in 1st and 2nd grade of elementary school (RC) and key stage 1 (ENG)</p> <p>in 3rd and 4th grade of elementary school (RC) and key stage 2 (ENG)</p> <p>in 1st and 2nd grade of elementary school (RC) and key stage 1 (ENG)</p>	<p>to know the rights, to take responsibility, to participate in the adoption of class rules, to collaborate in the team, to recognize and control emotions, to participate in discussions on various issues, to share their own opinions and views, to identify inappropriate behavior, to identify violent behavior, to maintain personal hygiene, to explain what money is, where it comes from and how it is used, to recognize own abilities and name own experiences to participate in decision-making in the classroom and school, to recognize the role of civil society, to discuss important issues and to express their views, to know democracy and to name the most important institutions, to identify the causes and consequences of violent behaviour, to lead a healthy lifestyle, to recognize stereotypes, to know different occupations and to understand their contribution to society, to manage responsibly with money, to respect diversity (culture, nation, etc.), to use more sources of information to explain the importance of classroom selection rules and to describe desirable candidate characteristics, to find ways to help learners with special needs, to have developed intercultural communication skills, to participate in volunteering activities, to provide their identity and to describe its characteristics, to describe cultural differences in the classroom, to evaluate their learning as work, to describe what is advertising and its impact, explain overwriting as a theft, to explain the importance of water and electricity conservation</p> <p>to propose and participate in activities related to the marking of important dates, to describe the ways of monitoring the procedures of local and state authorities, to initiate and participate in humanitarian and voluntary activities, to conclude the consequences of abuse of speech freedom, to describe the features of their identity, to possess developed skills of intercultural communication, to demonstrate commitment to the preservation of national features and cultural sights, to describe family and community procedures for sustainable development, to participate in volunteer environmental conservation activities, detect advertising impact</p>
England (ENG)	<i>Citizenship Programmes of Study: Key Stages 1 and 2</i> ²⁶		<p>to set simple goals, to make simple decisions to improve health and wellbeing, to learn ways to spread and control illness, to understand the growth process and changing of human needs, to name the major parts of the body, to use properly home products and medicines, to know the rules who protect them (in choosing meals, television content, games, using money, etc.), to meet and talk to external visitors (religious leaders, cops, nurses, and so on), to feel positive about yourself</p> <p>to recognize their values, to recognize changes in puberty, to investigate how the media present information, to detect the influence of bacteria and viruses on health and routines to reduce their spread, to observe changes in puberty, to discover legitimate and illegal substances and drugs and their causes, to notice that pressure to behave inappropriately can come from different people, to be aware of different types of relationships (family, marriage, friendship), to know places for getting help and support for individuals, families, and groups, to meet and talk to people who contribute to society, to prepare for changes (eg transition to high school)</p>

Source: This Table is authors own work made as a comparison based on the documents cited in the paper.

noticed in the Republic of Croatia: participation in volunteering activities and community activities, development of intercultural communication skills, freedom of speech, advertisement impact, personal identity, preservation of customs and cultural heritage, preservation of water, electricity and energy and the sustainable development. Unlike Croatia, there are learning outcomes in England focused on: own goals, values, abilities and decisions, spreading and controlling the diseases, changes in puberty, (non) legal substance and drugs, body parts, own security, media influence, getting help and support and meeting and talking to external visitors (religious leaders, police officers, nurses, etc.). In principle, the Croatian programme differs from the English one mostly in the set of outcomes for: preserving identity and cultural heritage, developing intercultural communication skills, environmental protection and sustainable development while the English programme differs from the Croatian in a set of outcomes for: developing positive images about themselves, their own goals and values, puberty, health preservation, getting help and support and for communication with external visitors.

Evaluation aspects of citizenship education

Evaluation of Citizenship Education in England is carried out in such a way that schools are required to write a report on students' progress and to talk to parents/carers. Likewise, a document called *Assessment Principles*²³ prescribes the principles used by schools to help evaluate students' progress towards the school curriculum. The government does not impose an assessment system, but the schools are expected to demonstrate evidence of students' progress, provide parents with information, and enable rulers to assess the effectiveness of school or school curricula and notify inspections. It is also worth mentioning that there is a document titled *Citizenship studies: GCSE*²⁴ *subject content* (from 2015) that prescribes knowledge, understanding and skills that are common to all GCSE (General Certificate of Secondary Education) specifications in the field of Citizenship Education. In this document, the knowledge that students need to acquire if they want to access the GCSE exam and the outcomes that are being realised by GCSE specifications are listed in more details. At the national level in the Citizenship studies guide: grade descriptors for GCSEs graded 9 to 1, numerical grades are prescribed in relation to the learning outcomes that the student achieves.

In the Republic of Croatia, the assessment of achievements is also an integral part of the Citizenship Education and it is realized so that teachers and students first discuss the outcomes and then determine the criteria for evaluation. According to the programme, teachers who teach Citizenship Education interdisciplinary carry into the map the teaching preparations that are aimed at developing Citizenship Education outcomes, also as the materials of how they have implemented planned activities with students. Students in the last grade of secondary education can choose the subject Politics and Economy as part of the state final examination. According to Eurydice, the European Commission (2017), in England (as one of the four countries in which) national examinations from Citizenship Education evaluate not only knowledge, but also the students' skills based on realized projects, but do not evaluate their stands. In

Croatia, as in most other countries, national examinations value only student's knowledge by standardized evaluation of Citizenship Education. England also stands out as the only country in 2010/2011 where Citizenship Education could be specialized during Initial Teaching Education. In this context, it is currently among the six countries that have existing supreme regulations or recommendations to promote competences related to Citizenship Education. Available qualification is specific to Citizenship Education - Graduate Diploma in Education/Postgraduate Certificate in Citizenship Education. These subjects from Citizenship Education can be chosen at higher education institutions and last for a year. The Republic of Croatia falls into another category of countries that still have no regulations or recommendations for the development of competences of future teachers of Citizenship Education during initial education, so higher education institutions can decide how it should be implemented (Eurydice, European Commission, 2017). As it was explained at the beginning, at the universities in the Republic of Croatia Citizenship Education is taught very sporadically and depends on the scientific-education personnel who are more or less scientific or teaching experts in that area (Diković & Piršl, 2014).

Conclusion

A country with a regulated educational system as England represents a role model, but also a serious challenge for a small country and emerging democracy as is the Republic of Croatia. This paper compares the conduction of Citizenship Education in both countries. The comparative research analysis of years of Citizenship Education conduction through various levels of education, the analysis of aims and contents and learning outcomes, as well as the analysis of competences through four areas – Efficient and constructive interaction with others, Critical thinking, Social and responsible action and Democratic action – all showing the similarities and differences in the acquisition, but also development of the aforementioned competences. The difference could be ascribed to the difference in approaching Citizenship Education in the two countries. Although the Croatian approach is specific because Citizenship Education is approached as an intercurricular topic from the first to the fourth grade of high school, in the English model the conduction of Citizenship education is only obligatory in five grades (high school) of education, it is a disciplinary separated content, and at other educational levels it is conducted if schools want to choose it individually. It could be derived from all the aforementioned that to develop the civic competence systematically it is not sufficient to teach Citizenship Education as part of one subject at certain educational levels, but teaching should be conducted at all educational levels.

The Citizenship Education content clearly indicates that, except knowledge, it is necessary (to develop and) to evaluate skills and attitudes. England which, except knowledge, evaluates skills based on the conducted projects is a step ahead of Croatia which is still at the level of knowledge evaluation at national exams. The Citizenship Education curriculum undergoes changes directed toward the effectiveness of the teaching system, but students should as early as in the teaching process show activities, while teachers should use cooperative teaching and learning methods for pupils

to be able to participate in the community in the future, i.e. promote the civic competence (Eurydice, European Commission, 2012).

The comparative analysis was used in this paper to detect differences and similarities in the acquisition of the civic competence in the Croatian and English educational system. This analysis will be used for scientific purposes and specialist discussions about Citizenship education, as to indicate possibilities of advancement of the Citizenship Education curriculum as a development document.

The research (Eurydice, European Commission, 2005 in Šalaj, 2005, 95) shows that the transition “from the concept of political education to the concept of citizenship education which occurred in England also occurs in numerous other European Countries. “As already said in this paper, Citizenship Education relates to the preparation of children and the youth for active citizenship which should develop in two directions: social and political. In the Republic of Croatia Citizenship Education has been developing for many years, and from the 2019/2020 school year a new curriculum will be taught at schools. Therefore, we believe that this will be an area in which children and young people develop with happiness, thus becoming active citizens, acquire the civic competence to promote human rights, contribute to themselves and their narrower and wider social community.

Notes

1. Ministry of Science and Education, <https://mzo.hr/en/rubrike/education> (19 February 2019)
2. More on: https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/eurydice/content/united-kingdom-england_en (19 February 2019)
3. The document is available at: http://dokumenti.ncvvo.hr/Nastavni_plan/gimnazije/obvezni/pig.pdf (19 February 2019)
4. More on the results of the two-year implementation of the Curriculum of Citizenship Education evaluation: Spajić-Vrkaš, V. (2014). *Znam, razmišljam, sudjelujem: projekt. Novo doba ljudskih prava i demokracije u školama: eksperimentalna provedba kurikuluma građanskog odgoja i obrazovanja: istraživački izvještaj*. Zagreb: Mreža mladih Hrvatske.
5. More on the: <http://www.kurikulum.hr/> (18 February 2019) and at: https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/eurydice/content/national-reforms-school-education-11_en (19 February 2019)
6. Available at: https://narodne-novine.nn.hr/clanci/sluzbeni/2019_01_10_217.html (18 February 2019)
7. See more about Politics and Economics in Croatia in chapter *Education for Citizenship (Citizenship Education) in Croatia: History and Contemporary Context*
8. An academy is a publicly funded independent school. Academies have individual funding agreements directly with the Secretary of State and enjoy certain freedoms relating to organisation and the curriculum.
9. The program was published by the Department for Education in England in 2015.
10. More about Citizenship (key stage 1 and 2) on: <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/citizenship-programmes-of-study-for-key-stages-1-and-2> (20 February 2019).
11. More about academies on: https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/eurydice/content/glossary-74_en#Academy (19 February 2019).
12. See more about in chapter *Education for Citizenship (Citizenship Education) in Croatia: History and Contemporary Context*.
13. More on: <https://www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk/> (17 February 2019).

14. The PSHE (Personal, Social, Health and Economic Education) curriculum should, according to national guidelines of state schools, be offered in schools but it is not a compulsory subject.
15. More about the reasons of later institutionalizing in Šalaj (2005).
16. According to Eurydice, the European Commission 2017 and according to the programme: <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/national-curriculum-in-england-citizenship-programmes-of-study> (28 February 2019)
17. More about on: https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/countries/member-countries/unitedkingdom_en (15 February 2019).
18. Commonwealth is a community of independent states, the United Kingdom and former British colonies. It started to exist in 1926 from the former British Empire. <https://www.hrleksikon.info/definicija/commonwealth.html> (3 November 2018)
19. More on the: <https://www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk/resource/nc-2014-resources-and-materials-support-citizenship-digest-teachers> (18 February 2019).
20. More on: <https://educateagainsthate.com/> (18 December 2018).
21. More on methodology in the Report at: <https://publications.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/6b50c5b0-d651-11e7-a506-01aa75ed71a1/language-en/format-PDF/source-56573425> (15 February 2019).
22. According to Eurydice, the European Commission (2017, 49) all curriculum guidance documents are treated equally, ignoring the precise nature of the guidance in terms of whether it provided general aims, specific objectives or learning outcomes.
23. *Assessment Principles*. <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/assessment-principles-school-curriculum> (1 November 2018).
24. *General Certificate of Secondary Education*. Više na <http://www.politics.co.uk/reference/gcse> (6 November 2018).
25. Available on: <https://www.azoo.hr/index.php?view=article&id=5459&naziv=odluku-odonoenju-i-programa-meupredmetnih-i-interdisciplinarnih-sadraja-graanskog-odgoja-i-obrazovanja-za-osnovne-i-srednje-kole> (6.March 2019).
26. Available on: <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/citizenship-programmes-of-study-for-key-stages-1-and-2> (6 March 2019).

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

ORCID

Marina Diković  <http://orcid.org/0000-0003-3828-0725>

References

- Assessment Principles*. (2014). Department for Education. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/assessment-principles-school-curriculum>.
- Citizenship programmes of study for key stages 1 and 2*. (2015). Department for Education. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/citizenship-programmes-of-study-for-key-stages-1-and-2>.
- Citizenship studies: GCSE subject content. (2015). Department for Education. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/gcse-citizenship-studies>.
- Diković, M. (2010). Hrvatska izobrazitelna politika v kontekstu vzgoje in izobraževanja za državljanstvo. *Sodobna pedagogika*, 61 (127), 192–207.
- Diković, M. (2012). Policies and Practices of Education for Citizenship in Europe and Croatia. Doctoral Thesis.

- Diković, M. (2014). Interculturalism, human rights and citizenship in compulsory education in the South Eastern Europe//IAIE Zagreb 2013. In M. Bartulović, L. Bash, V. Spajić-Vrkaš (Eds.), *Unity and disunity, connections and separations: intercultural education as a movement for promoting multiple identities, social inclusion and transformation*. Zagreb: Interkultura/IAIE, 247–258.
- Diković, M., & Piršl, E. (2014). Interkulturalizam, ljudska prava i građanstvo u inicijalnom obrazovanju nastavnika. In N. Hrvatić, A. Lukenda, S. Pavlović, V. Spajić-Vrkaš, & M. Vasilj (Eds.), *Pedagogija, obrazovanje i nastava, Zbornik radova 2. međunarodne znanstvene konferencije, 1* (pp. 226–235). Mostar: Fakultet prirodoslovno-matematičkih i odgojnih znanosti Sveučilišta u Mostaru.
- Diković, M., Piršl, E., & Antunović, J. (2016). How competent are we to teach Citizenship education? In M. Radetić-Paić, I. Blažević, Đ. Zuliani (Eds.), *Competencies of participants in citizenship education* (pp. 5–27). Pula: Sveučilište Jurja Dobrile u Puli.
- Eurydice, European Commission. (2005). *Citizenship education at school in Europe*. Luxemburg: Eurydice, European Commission.
- Eurydice, European Commission. (2012). *Citizenship education in Europe*. Brussel: Eurydice, European Commission s.
- Eurydice, European Commission. (2017). *Citizenship education at school in Europe*. Brussels: Eurydice, European Commission.
- Government of the Republic of Croatia, National Committee for the Education on Human Rights (1999). *National programme of education for human rights*.
- Guidance: Citizenship studies: grade descriptors for GCSEs graded 9 to 1. (2017). Department for Education. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/grade-descriptors-for-gcses-graded-9-to-1/grade-descriptors-for-gcses-graded-9-to-1-citizenship-studies>.
- Guidance: Personal, social, health and economic (PSHE) education. (2013). Retrieved from <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/personal-social-health-and-economic-education-pshe/personal-social-health-and-economic-pshe-education>.
- Klemenčič, E. (2007). Građanski odgoj u Europskim državama: aspekt edukacije za demokraciju. In: Z. Petak (Ed.), *Anali hrvatskog politološkog društva*, 2006, III, 283–295.
- Kovačić, M., & Horvat, M. (2016). Razvoj političkih i građanskih kompetencija mladih – pregled uvođenja građanskog odgoja i obrazovanja u hrvatski obrazovni sustav. In: M. Kovačić, M. Horvat (Eds.), *Od podanika do građana: Razvoj građanske kompetencije mladih* (pp. 15–29). Zagreb: Institut za društvena istraživanja u Zagrebu, GONG.
- Pravilnik o sadržaju i trajanju programa predškole (NN 107/14). Dostupno na: http://narodne-novine.nn.hr/clanci/sluzbeni/2014_09_107_2081.html.
- Ministarstvo znanosti, obrazovanja i sporta RH. (2011). *Nacionalni okvirni kurikulum za predškolski odgoj i obrazovanje te opće obvezno i srednjoškolsko obrazovanje*.
- Ministarstvo znanosti, obrazovanja i sporta RH, Agencija za odgoj i obrazovanje. (2012). *Kurikulum građanskog odgoja i obrazovanja*.
- Ministarstvo znanosti, obrazovanja i sporta RH. (2014). *Program međupredmetnih i interdisciplinarnih sadržaja građanskog odgoja i obrazovanja za osnovne i srednje škole*.
- Ministarstvo znanosti, obrazovanja i sporta RH. (2006). *Nastavni plan i program za osnovne škole*.
- National curriculum and assessment from September 2014: information for schools* (2014). Department for Education.
- National curriculum in England: citizenship programmes of study - key stages 3 and 4*. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/national-curriculum-in-england-citizenship-programmes-of-study>.
- Resources and materials to support the revised National Curriculum for Citizenship 2014 – a digest for teachers*. (2014). Retrieved from <https://www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk/resource/nc-2014-resources-and-materials-support-citizenship-digest-teachers>.
- Roberts, N. (2018). *The school curriculum in England*. London: House of Commons Library. Retrieved from <https://researchbriefings.parliament.uk/ResearchBriefing/Summary/SN06798>.

- Spajić-Vrkaš, V., & Čehulić, M. (2016). Istraživanja građanskog odgoja i obrazovanja: višerazinski pregled. In: M. Kovačić, M. Horvat (Eds.), *Od podanika do građana: Razvoj građanske kompetencije mladih*. (pp. 153–184). Zagreb: Institut za društvena istraživanja u Zagrebu, GONG.
- Šalaj, B. (2005). Političko obrazovanje u školama: nepotrebna politizacija obrazovanja ili važan uvjet demokracije? Slučaj Engleske. *Politička misao*, XLII(2), str., 77–100.
- The National Curriculum in England: Framework document. (2014). Department for Education. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/national-curriculum-in-england-framework-for-key-stages-1-to-4>.
- Toyoshima, M. (2007). International strategies of universities in England. *London Review of Education*, 5(3), 265–280. doi:10.1080/14748460701661328
- Zenzerović Šloser, I. (Ed.). (2014). *Znam, razmišljam, sudjelujem: Priručnik za nastavnike: Pomoć u provedbi građanskog odgoja i obrazovanja*. Zagreb: Centar za mirovne studije/ Mreža mladih Hrvatske.

ORCID

Marina Diković  <http://orcid.org/0000-0003-3828-0725>

Other network sources

- Association for Citizenship Teaching. Retrieved from <https://www.teachingcitizenship.org.uk/about-citizenship>.
- Educate against hate. Retrieved from <https://educateagainsthate.com>.
- Europska unija (2018). *Ujedinjena Kraljevina: Politički sustav*: https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/countries/member-countries/unitedkingdom_en
- Politics.co.uk.GCSEs. Available on: <http://www.politics.co.uk/reference/gcse>.
- House of Commons Library. (2018). *The school curriculum in England*. London: House of Commons Library. Retrieved from <https://researchbriefings.parliament.uk/ResearchBriefing/Summary/SN06798>
- United Kingdom – England Overview. Retrieved from https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/eurydice/content/united-kingdom-england_en.