

Group Identity in a Secondary School Classroom Constructed through Musical Creation

Carlos Lage-Gómez and Roberto Cremades-Andreu
Faculty of Education, Complutense University of Madrid

Abstract

Music plays an important role in the construction of identity in adolescence. However, few studies have explored the relationship between the formation of group identities in adolescence and musical creation as an experiential group activity in secondary school. Therefore, the aim of the present study was to shed light on the formation of group identities in the classroom and determine the factors involved in this process. An educational project focusing on participatory musical creation was carried out in three Spanish secondary schools, involving 267 students. Data were collected by means of participant and non-participant observation, a classroom diary, a questionnaire and video recordings, analysed within the framework of activity theory. The results revealed the influence of a number of interconnected determinants on the formation of group identity in the classroom: (1) student involvement in all stages of the project; (2) the construction of meaningful musical experiences through the students' role as musicians; (3) the classroom climate; (4) the emergence of positive emotions; (5) high motivation to learn; and (6) student identification with their own music. These results indicate the useful role of music creation in the formation of group identity.

Keywords: *activity theory; creative learning; music; participation; secondary education.*

Introduction

Facing a change of time (Castells, 2012), education must adapt in order to respond to the multiple transformations that are taking place in today's information and knowledge society (Fernández, 2016). In this context, self-affirmation through social relations represents an essential process in adolescence (Harter, 2012). Identification with social groups, whether chosen (Tanti et al., 2011) or assigned (Knifsend & Juvonen, 2014), is an important step in the development of adolescents' self-concept (Tarrant et al., 2006)

and self-esteem (Chen, 2019). Thus, it is possible to apply the theory of social identity based on the concept of the formation of individual identities through social creativity associated with social groups (Tajfel & Turner, 1986). In addition, there is widespread agreement that each individual may have various group identities. In this sense, Roccas and Brewer (2002) developed the concept of the complexity of social identity, whereby each of the groups to which an individual belongs may be related in various dimensions and different ways. Furthermore, identity can be viewed as a dynamic construct in constant change (Lieblich & Josselson, 2013), described by DeNora (2017) as “emergent statuses” (p. 60), which is associated with learning processes and thus includes adolescent identity. In agreement with Rogoff (2003), the processes involved in the construction of identity occur at three levels: (1) individual, with a marked development of autonomy; (2) social, through the sense of belonging to various social groups; and (3) cultural, defined as the environment in which it occurs.

From this perspective, music could be conceptualised as an identity project (MacDonald et al., 2017), which represents one of the major points of reference for adolescents in cognitive, emotional and social terms. An understanding of music as an indivisible part of people’s lives (Cremades et al., 2015; DeNora, 2000) reflects the capacity of music to contribute to the formation of identities. In this respect, MacDonald et al. (2002) have differentiated between what they define as identities in music and music in identities. The first category refers to aspects defined by cultural roles or universal categories, while the second refers to the way in which music determines our identity, i.e. how music contributes to the formation of our sense of self. In sum, musical identities are performative and social as well as psychological (Hargreaves et al., 2009); thus, social identity does not refer solely to a trait that an individual possesses but also to aspects we create through multiple ways of relating to music (i.e., places for sharing musical tastes, musical ambience). Regarding the association between music and identity, it has strong implications for education, based on a concept of the classroom as a space for socialisation.

Participation in the classroom

Ever since Plato defined participation as a metaphysical concept relating sensible objects and ideas, it has been addressed in the literature on education as (1) a means to instil democracy in the heart of education (Saiz-Linares, 2019) and (2) a means to promote student motivation and satisfaction (Lage-Gómez & Cremades-Andreu, 2019, 2020). Classroom participation involves several dimensions, ranging from teaching strategies to promote student learning to being an educational goal in its own right. Two key factors can be identified that define classroom participation: (1) decision-making by students and (2) the different degrees to which this might occur. Thus, student participation can be analysed at all stages of the teaching-learning process (curricular design, learning processes and resulting products).

In addition, students’ role in the teaching-learning process has emerged as a crucial aspect that has been widely discussed in the literature, based on the traditional dichotomy

between student- and teacher-centred learning. Wegerif (2013) has referred to dialogic education, where learning is dialogue- rather than student- or teacher-centred, paving the way for a different definition of participation in which individual experience becomes social experience, as an active and reflective means to share common ground and become co-creators and re-creators of reality (Freire, 2003).

Creative learning spaces

Since the first decade of the 21st century, creativity has been reconceptualised: once considered a complex phenomenon associated with individual minds, that are socially and culturally located (Puyear & Lamb, 2020), it is now viewed from a sociocultural perspective (Glaveanu, 2018), as a form of generative social practice that emerges in various forms (Burnard, 2012). The notion of creativity as possibility thinking (Craft et al., 2007) and Vygotsky's zone of proximal development (ZPD) open the door to the conceptualisation of creative teaching-learning spaces. Based on the view of education as dialogue, Mercer (2000) extended the ZPD to conceptualise the *Intermental Development Zone* as a continued event that emerges from a process of *interthinking* (using dialogue to think collectively) (Littleton & Mercer, 2013), and which represents the reflective, metacognitive nature of contextualised, co-regulated group work. Meanwhile, Wegerif (2013) expanded the concept towards a more open, multidirectional and previously defined perspective. Thus, the dialogic learning space is not solely an objective, but also the context in which it occurs, and therefore, from a social perspective, it could be considered a learning goal in itself. This space evidences the intersection between creative teaching, creativity and creative learning. Thus, student-centred creative learning would involve students in both the design and assessment of the teaching-learning processes (Jeffrey, 2005). Creative learning spaces in music education could be conceptualised as spaces that enable the collective creation of musical ideas through a participatory process focusing on musical creativity.

Hence, the main goal of the present study was to examine the formation of a group identity through musical creation in secondary school, among students with diverse cultural backgrounds attending three secondary schools in the Region of Madrid (Spain). An additional objective was to explore a process of educational transformation in order to shed light on the influence of forming a group identity on the learning processes aimed at developing artistic creativity, and identify the aspects that determine the sense of belonging to a community. In this study, the classroom was considered a symbolic space of social representation in which students, teachers, researchers and artists engaged in an experiential process of co-construction of meaning in order to transform the music classroom (Acaso, 2013).

Methodology

Research Method

This study employed an action research design based on the assumption of the epistemological confluence of teaching and research participation (Cochran-Smith

& Litle, 2009). In this sense, Biesta (2020) proposes a pragmatic approach, from the perspective developed in this study, integrating three distinctive purposes of the research: explanation, understanding and emancipation.

Participants and context

The study was conducted in five cycles over the course of six academic years and involved a total of 267 students (11 groups in the third year of compulsory secondary education at three state schools in the Region of Madrid) from more than ten different cultural backgrounds as regards religion, socio-cultural level and academic results. The third year was selected because of the characteristics of the corresponding curriculum, which delves further into musical composition: “Soundtracks for drama, movement and dance; still and moving images for audiovisual productions” (Decree 23/2007, p. 129). As an element common to all cycles, participants were open to educational proposals focused on procedural aspects, which proved as an important factor that exerted a positive influence throughout the project’s implementation. It is also important to note that neither in primary nor secondary education had the groups been exposed to educational approaches based on musical creativity.

Research instruments

The instruments used in the present study were designed *ad hoc* since appropriate tools were not identified in the review of similar studies on educational projects concerning the formation of identity by musical creation in secondary school and its educational implications. Another reason for such design of the research instruments was to contrast the information obtained by different agents involved in the present study. These instruments were as follows:

- Participant observation, using a classroom journal completed by the teacher-researcher and an external researcher in order to contrast the recorded information;
- Individual interviews and focus group discussions with students, which were designed with the help of various experts who improved the initial interview and ensured that it was consistent with the study aims;
- A questionnaire was also designed and validated with the help of experts and was administered to students to assess their learning by the end of each cycle;
- Non-participant observation by different teachers at the schools, who wrote reports on their observations and participated in meetings to analyse implementation of the sessions;
- Lastly, audio and video recordings were made to enable a detailed analysis of various aspects of the sessions and the students’ compositions.

Activity theory formed the basis of data analysis, using a deductive analytical perspective to yield a better understanding of the variety of related elements in the tasks in which a social group engages (Engeström, 1999). This perspective has been employed in the field of music education to analyse the characteristics of collaborative

composition activities (Burnard & Dragovic, 2014; Soares, 2012). Activity theory has its roots in the Russian social-historical tradition of Vygotsky, and was used by Engeström (1987) to propose a model for analysing activities and representing them through a unit of analysis defined as activity, which includes: tools, results, sense, meaning, subjects, object, rules, community and division of labour.

This theory can contribute to a change in educational practices and explains how these occur in accordance with the following principles (Greeno & Engeström, 2014):

- 1) Individual learning through its properties and processes within the framework of a system.
- 2) Learning through participants' mental representations and behaviours as a whole within the framework of a system.
- 3) Learning through the properties of the system itself.

Hence, in line with the objective of the present study, learning processes associated with musical creation were analysed to determine the factors that facilitated and shaped the development of group identity in the classroom.

Procedure

The projects were designed during the first trimester and the first part of the second trimester, and implemented in the second part of the second trimester until the end of the academic year, from 2007/2008 to 2012/2013. This study presents a new analysis of the relationship between identity in adolescence and musical creation from the epistemological framework of the activity theory. Informed consent to conduct each project was sought and obtained from the management teams of participating schools, and the students' families also gave the informed consent for their children to participate in the study.

Each project involved composing a soundtrack for still and moving images through collaborative musical creation, as an alternative to the more theoretical teaching typical of secondary education music classes. This initial idea underwent constant development and modification as regards: (1) the audiovisual materials used for the project; (2) the teaching and organisational strategies employed during implementation; and (3) the use of cooperative composition and group improvisation as methodological procedures. The common core to all the projects was the creation of soundtracks or, in a broader sense, composing music for moving or still images from film scenes, short films, pictures or posters, by means of collaborative composition and collective improvisation. Note that the projects were carried out collaboratively with the students involved (who were informed of the initial idea in order to subsequently participate as an integral part of the project), teachers, researchers and artist.

The educational projects that were developed are summarised below:

1. *The Orphanage Project*. Cycle I. Academic year 2007/2008. Secondary School 1. Arrangement of the soundtrack of the film *Orfanato (The Orphanage)*, using as a

reference the main theme via group improvisation. 24 lessons in each class. Original soundtrack. Group improvisation (methodology, strategy and practice).

2. *The Orphanage Project II* and *Modern Times*. Cycle II. Academic year 2008/2009. Secondary School 1. (1) Creation of a soundtrack for the film *The Orphanage*, using as a reference the main theme via cooperative composition and group improvisation. (2) The elaboration of a soundtrack for various scenes of the film *Modern Times*, via cooperative composition. 32 lessons each. Cooperative composition process of original soundtrack (experimentation). Group improvisation (methodology, strategy and practice). Cooperative composition process for *Modern Times*.

3. *The Sounds of Bullying Project*. Cycle III. Academic year 2009/2010. Secondary School 1. Elaboration of a soundtrack about bullying in schools based on a series of posters from an exhibition on the same topic, via group improvisation. 12 lessons each. Cooperative composition process (experimentation) and group improvisation (methodology, strategy and practice).

4. *The Painting Sounds Project*. Cycle IV. Academic year 2010/2011. Secondary School 2. Putting paintings by the professional painter to music via collective improvisation. 14 lessons. Group improvisation (methodology, strategy and practice).

5. *The Presto and Paperman Project*. Cycle V. Academic year 2012/2013. Secondary School 3. Creation of a soundtrack for the animated short films *Presto* and *Paperman*. 26 lessons each. Cooperative composition process (music and effects).

Results and effects of the conducted research

The creative process and group identity in the music classroom

One of the aspects that this research project revealed is that the creative learning process is gradual and constant, but uneven, although the general trend is upwards and is associated with the partial results the students perceive. Thus, a student in the fifth cycle observed: "We weren't always pleased, but we saw that, little by little, things were working out". In addition, a non-participant observer noted "the progress made in the process.". Similarly, in a joint analysis of the data obtained from the fourth cycle of the study, a non-participant observer stated: "The students' increasing satisfaction with their own improvisations was an essential element in the progress of the project, as regards emotional and musical results alike, with students placing greater demands on themselves in terms of their musical performances".

A turning point was observed in the projects, whereby the classroom climate and students' attitudes towards music improved significantly, generating synergies between the group and the teacher: "It feels like there's a moment when everything falls into place, and after that everything begins to work much better" (teacher, research journal, 1st cycle). Students became significantly more engaged in the project when they identified with it through the music they were creating and the results they obtained. At that

point, they felt confident about their musical abilities and were transformed from typical secondary school students into musicians whose learning occurred intuitively.

The results obtained from the questionnaire confirmed the students' satisfaction with the project activities: in the second study cycle, 57.6% indicated that they were quite satisfied with the activities, as did 59.1% in the third cycle, while 72.7% in the fourth cycle reported being very satisfied, as were 48.5% in the fifth cycle.

Responses to the open-ended question asking the participants why they had liked certain project activities were grouped according to the indicators presented in Table 1.

Table 1

Coding of the students' reasons

<p>1. <i>Procedural/Performance</i> "Our last improvisation brought out the best in everyone." (3rd cycle)</p>	<p>2. <i>Classroom climate</i> "What I liked most was the good atmosphere in class, and as regards the music, I was highly motivated by the strong rhythm, with the drums, trumpets and so on." (4th cycle)</p>	<p>3. <i>Results</i> "Because creation in real time sounded good and we all participated." (1st cycle)</p>
<p>4. <i>Collaborative learning</i> "Team work, making music together, being able to choose an instrument." (3rd cycle)</p>	<p>5. <i>Motivation</i> "The short film project, because it really motivated us." (4th cycle)</p>	<p>6. <i>Novelty</i> "The project, because it turned out to be interesting and I had never done it before." (4th cycle)</p>
<p>7. <i>Creativity</i> "Composing; I felt that my imagination and musical sense developed." (4th cycle)</p>		

Source: by the author

Results regarding the factors in the formation of group identity

The formation of a group identity in the classroom was determined by a number of factors that are discussed further in the paper.

Classroom climate

Good general atmosphere created in class was another of the characteristics observed throughout the study and its different projects. This was clearly reflected in the students' questionnaire responses and interviews and by the participant and non-participant observers in all cycles: "There's a good atmosphere. There's respect for everyone's work and it is quiet enough to let the others work" (non-participant observer, secondary school 1). Entries in the classroom journal also denoted an increasingly good atmosphere over the course of the projects.

This exerted a positive influence on various aspects, as detailed below:

a) General climate of trust between the students and teacher

“Pleasant climate of trust” (non-participant observer and researcher, secondary school 2).

b) Student attitude

“Most show a good attitude, paying attention, being patient and actively listening. You can see that they’re concentrating despite being tired, because this is the last class of the day” (non-participant observer and researcher, secondary school 1).

c) Student motivation

“Their musical learning has been reinforced by practice that is motivating and brings subject content together” (non-participant observer and researcher, secondary school 2).

These findings are consistent with the questionnaire’s results, where 90 % of the students in the first study cycle noted a better atmosphere in class, as did 98 % of the students in the second cycle, 91 % in the third cycle, 81.8 % in the fourth cycle and 93% in the fifth cycle. Given the level of cultural diversity in the project, it can be concluded that the good atmosphere generated in music class through the use of creative teaching-learning methods enriched the students’ process of socialisation.

Motivation to learn

According to the percentages obtained from the questionnaire, students felt highly motivated to learn, since 43.60 % of the students in the first study cycle said they were very motivated; 60 % in the second cycle said they were fairly motivated; and 40.9 %, 73 % and 58.6 % reported feeling very motivated in the third, fourth and fifth cycles respectively.

A non-participant observer in the first study cycle confirmed students’ high level of motivation: “The students are evidently interested in and enjoy doing personal work, and work well together in groups”. Meanwhile, a non-participant observer in the fourth study cycle referred to “practice that is motivating”.

An analysis of the characteristics and factors that influenced or determined student motivation revealed a variety of diverse but intrinsically inter-related forms of motivation in the classroom which were generated by two different aspects:

a) External motivation and self-motivation, corresponding to the traditional concept of intrinsic and extrinsic motivation.

b) The social context and the teaching-learning processes implemented in the classroom.

A distinction can be made both between social motivation and motivation to learn and social and initial motivation, characterised by expectations about the activities.

Positive emotions

One of the emergent themes over the course of the research was the generation of positive emotions in the classroom as a result of the learning processes. An analysis of the data suggested that the reasons for this included the following aspects:

1) The musical experience in the classroom was considered meaningful by the majority of participant students.

2) Engagement with the project as a shared challenge for the group, “their project”, associated with a developing conception of the individual and the group, and of participation as the joint and symbolic expression of a human group.

3) The positive climate generated in class.

4) Identification with their own music as an important element, whereby musical creation functioned as a vehicle that promoted development of a group identity. The music was created jointly and the students were satisfied with it.

Despite all the cultural and social constraints related to the educational context, music triggered a variety of “good vibrations” associated with the primary emotion of happiness, in terms of feeling at ease individually and above all collectively. The above were all interconnected, involving the group, individual students and the teacher. Thus, emotions emerged at a group level during the creative processes as a result of “a sense of belonging”, identification, and the symbolic construction of a shared identity based on the students’ music.

Positive emotions were detected in the following classroom situations:

1) During performance, and explicitly in the expressiveness of the music performed by the students, when they assumed the emotions conveyed as their own.

2) Another aspect was emotional emergence as a result of the relaxed, safe, easy-going and pleasant classroom climate.

3) Combined with the emotionally safe environment for the students and the music, the flow of group performances catalysed positive emotions: “We are thrilled with what we have done and the memory of our music still delights us” (student, 3rd cycle). Thus, the generated climate was an important prior factor for group flow.

Musicians in the classroom

Students were observed to assume the role of musicians. For example, one student in the first study cycle indicated the following: “I have learnt to think and behave as a musician”. This aspect was confirmed by the teacher’s observations: “There have been moments of great musicality”. A participant observer in the fifth study cycle confirmed that the students had assumed the role of musicians, as was also evidenced by the musical products. The students were happy with their roles in the group, regardless of their level of participation, which varied according to their musical skill or the instruments they played, and learning occurred as a result of:

1) Experimentation with an instrument

2) The teacher’s proposals and suggestions

3) Their peers’ proposals

4) The musical ideas that emerged from the group as a result of the sounds the group made.

Group flow

Based on the concept of flow (Csikszentmihalyi, 1998), Sawyer (2003) developed an analogous concept at group level referring to situations in which a group collectively experiences positive emotions. Such experiences bring the group together: “There were some very interesting moments today during the improvisations; I was aware of excitement and inspiration” (teacher, classroom diary). These moments are engraved in the group’s memory as particularly pleasurable, and create emotional ties, as evidenced by the participant students: “We really miss the classes, they made us feel good”. A non-participant observer in the first and second study cycle indicated the following: “The students have been surrounded by sound, their own sound, and in consequence, this experience has taken them beyond their own music to become co-creators of something shared”. In this process of “emergence”, the total experience is more important than the sum of its parts. In short, the students constructed meaningful musical experiences based on their experiences of music in the classroom, as reflected in their questionnaire responses and interviews. Thus, in a focus group discussion held two years after the fifth study cycle, the students attributed meaningfulness to their classroom experience:

“I’m thrilled to see the short film again; I remember every single thing we did” (student 1, 5th cycle).

“Going back to the music classroom brings back memories of some very good moments” (student 2, 5th cycle).

Results regarding group identity through the analysis of musical products

An analysis of the soundtracks and creative processes revealed an emerging semiotic language underlying the music, influenced by the students’ backgrounds. This occurred intuitively, in combination with the use of previous or initial themes by the composer and teacher. Given how the project was conceived, this would not have been possible without prior knowledge of music for animated cartoons, or enculturation, which enabled students to establish traditional associations between music and image and evidenced their participation in an audiovisual culture whose conventions they knew, shared and used as a point of departure and a map for the creative process.

Over the course of the cycles, students demonstrated a specific use of styles, reflecting their varied musical cultures, the musical characteristics specific to each member in the group and the musical atmosphere of the classroom. Each group was inspired to create its own sound in constant implicit or explicit negotiation between the students and the teacher, whether verbally or through performance and improvisation.

For example, one of the aspects that emerged during the project was the high level of student satisfaction with the obtained results. Thus, student 1 in the first cycle stated: “I was really pleased with how it turned out”, while student 3 felt that the result influenced the class’s attitude. A non-participant observer in this cycle was also aware

of the students' satisfaction with their results: "The instruments are old, defective and quite out of tune, which spoils the final result, but in general, it was gratifying to listen to the music and a delight to see the satisfaction on some of the students' faces with the end result". The data obtained from the questionnaire, marked on a 5-point scale from very poor to very good, confirmed a high level of student satisfaction, since 50 % of the participants in the third cycle selected the option very good, as did 65.2 % in the fourth cycle. Meanwhile, 50 % of the students in the fifth cycle selected the option good, indicating a general assessment of the project and its implementation as important and once again demonstrating the influence of classroom activities on teaching-learning processes. A student in the 5th cycle remarked: "I learnt a lot about myself from the short film". This finding reflects the students' perception of the importance of the products in the project, an aspect that was confirmed by the perceptions of participant teachers. However, it does not refer exclusively to the end results, but also to the constant feedback between partial results and satisfaction with the activity, the influence of which was reflected in the students' motivation and the classroom climate. Thus, the students assumed ownership of the products in a process of identification because they had created them and liked them, and because they generated a group identity.

Discussion and educational implications

The creative learning spaces were determined by the importance of the students' active role in their own learning, which endowed it with meaning. The creation and performance of their own music represented part of a group identity, in which students created and assimilated shared cultural universes based on a system of audiovisual conventions that formed part of their prior experiences. Students assumed tasks within the group beyond the confines of their role, according to their musical skills or the instruments they played, while at the same time constructing musical meanings from their positions as creators and performers, using an intuitive approach to musical language and style influenced by their cultural background in music and feedback from teachers.

Musical creation facilitated channels of verbal and musical communication. The groups organised the available time and space autonomously. This enabled identification of the learning processes in collaborative composition through informal procedures (Green, 2008). For example, learning from random exploration was characteristic in some stages of the process and considered typical of informal learning. Hence, a distinction can be made between school strategies of promoting collaborative learning, referred to by a non-participant observer in the fifth study cycle as a means to facilitate student progress, and the informal and collective processes of musical learning based on students' personal engagement and responsibility. In the creative process, dialogue played an important role when deciding on the structure of the piece and each of its elements.

Collaborative learning processes were also present in the negotiation implicit in the students' musical performance, when verbal exchanges on the part of the students or the teacher were virtually absent. In other words, as the groups began to identify with the music they were creating, an intuitive filtering occurred based on enhancing the musical elements that provided a group identity. Thus, collective learning improved group interaction, and music emerged as a vehicle for socialisation that facilitated the formation of a group identity in the classroom.

These creative learning processes generated a new definition of the music created in the classroom, whereby the students attributed it with a different meaning. This occurred when they experienced musical language and form through experimentation, independently of standardised social contexts beyond the classroom. Their music became autonomous through their experience of music in class. At the same time, a socially inclusive group identity was generated in which all students participated by endowing different meanings, values and experiences to the created music, a finding similar to that reported in a study by MacGregor (2020). Thus, the cultural diversity of the participant groups enriched the creative processes and musical results.

Collective musical creation in the classroom also revealed another dimension of the project, namely that participation formed an essential element of the creative processes in three ways: (1) active student participation in project decisions, from initial design to the obtained results; (2) student participation toward a common goal that in turn constructed a group identity; and (3) participation through enculturation, in other words, student participation through the musical and audiovisual culture that formed part of their background and provided a point of departure for their creative processes. Therefore, the project provided a participatory creative experience because the students shared a common goal. Furthermore, this goal was freely chosen and co-created by the students, who participated organisationally and creatively in the project design and process, and in completing "their project", albeit with different levels of involvement conditioned by their musical skill and different types of motivation. Thus, in and of itself, the project yielded an educational and consequently transformative result with regards to the learning processes. In addition, sharing the project entailed intense personal involvement at a social, affective and emotional level.

Generating a participatory context for musical creation was also shown to be important, since the result of this process was co-created by the group as a "creative unit", and could be greater—or indeed lesser—than the sum of its individual parts. This aspect may be related to the concept of group flow (Sawyer, 2003), and in this study facilitated the formation of a group identity through collective musical creation and each group's development of its own sound.

This formation of a group identity in the classroom through participatory creativity was driven by a holistic and transformative process determined by the interconnection of the following factors: (1) students' active involvement in project design, procedure and results, instilling democratic and inclusive principles in a culturally diverse classroom;

(2) high individual and social motivation; (3) the positive emotions aroused in multiple dimensions by the music, which, as noted by Seddon (2012), can be considered a form of social action rather than an internal state; (4) the climate generated in the creative learning spaces, which enabled students in their role as musicians to construct meaningful musical experiences; and (5) the students' identification with their own musical creations.

In conclusion, musical creation provided an inclusive space for social expression and development in which multidirectional dialogical relations were established with reality, and creative learning enabled students to overcome obstacles and produce a space for social contact and participation. Such spaces enable young and old alike to overcome obstacles and difficulties (physical, relational, communicative, racial or religious) and interact socially in an effective manner, through symbiosis with another language, that of music.

Funding

This work was supported by the Spanish Ministry of Science and Innovation, State Research Agency (grant number RTI2018-096532-A-I00).

References

- Acaso, M. (2013). *Reduolution*. Paidós Ibérica.
- Chen, K.H. (2019). Self-identity and self-esteem during different stages of adolescence: The function of identity importance and identity firmness. *Chinese Journal of Guidance and Counseling*, 55, 27-56.
- Biesta, G. (2020). *Educational research: An unorthodox introduction*. Bloomsbury.
- Burnard, P. (2012). *Musical creativities in practice*. Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199583942.001.0001>
- Burnard, P., & Dragovic, T. (2014). Collaborative creativity in instrumental group learning as a site for enhancing pupil wellbeing. *Cambridge Journal of Education: Special Issue 'Creativity and Wellbeing'*, 45(3), 371-392. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0305764X.2014.934204>
- Castells, M. (2012). *Networks of outrage and hope: Social movements in the Internet Age*. Polity Press.
- Cochran-Smith, M., & Litle, S. L. (2009). *Inquiry as stance: Practitioner research for the next generation*. Teachers College Press.
- Craft, A., Cremin, T., Burnard, P., & Chappell, K. (2007). Developing creative learning through possibility thinking with children aged 3-7. In A. Craft, T., Cremin, & P. Burnard (Eds.), *Creative Learning 3-11 and How We Document It*. Trentham.
- Cremades, R., Lorenzo, O., & Turcu, I. R. (2015). Rai music as a generator of cultural identity among young Maghrebies. *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music*, 175-184.

- Csikszentmihalyi, M. (1998). *Creatividad: el fluir y la psicología del descubrimiento y la invención*. Paidós.
- Csikszentmihalyi, M. (1999). Implications of a systems perspective for the study of creativity. In R. J. Sternberg (Ed.), *The Handbook of Creativity* (pp. 313-335). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511807916.018>
- Decreto 23/2007, de 10 de mayo, del Consejo de Gobierno, por el que se establece para la Comunidad de Madrid el currículo de la Educación Secundaria Obligatoria (BOCM nº. 126, de 29 de mayo de 2007).
- DeNora, T. (2000). *Music in everyday life*. Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511489433>
- DeNora, T. (2017). Music-ecology and everyday action: Creating, changing, and contesting identities. In R. MacDonald, D. J. Hargreaves, & D. Miell (Eds.), *Handbook of Musical Identities* (pp. 46-62). Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315090672>
- Dewey, J. (1995). *Democracia y educación*. Morata.
- Engeström, Y. (1987). *Learning by expanding: An activity theoretical approach to developmental research*. Orienta-Konsultit.
- Engeström, Y. (1999). Activity theory and individual and social transformation. In Y. Engeström, R. Miettinen, & R. L. Punamaki (Eds.), *Perspectives on activity theory* (pp. 19-38). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511812774.003>
- Fernández, M. (2016). *La educación en la encrucijada*. Fundación Santillana.
- Freire, P. (2003). *Pedagogía del oprimido* (17ª Ed.). Siglo veintiuno.
- Green, L. (2008). *Music, informal learning and the school: A new classroom pedagogy*. Ashgate Publishing Ltd.
- Greeno, J., & Engeström, Y. (2014). Learning in activity. In R. Sawyer (Ed.), *The Cambridge Handbook of the Learning Sciences, Cambridge Handbooks in Psychology* (pp. 128-148). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781139519526.009>
- Hargreaves, A., & Fullan, M. (2014). *Capital profesional*. Morata.
- Hargreaves, D. J., MacDonald, R., & Miell, D. (2009). Musical identities. In S. Hallam, I. Cross, & M. Thaut (Eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (pp. 759-774). Oxford University Press.
- Harter, S. (2012). *Self-perception profile for adolescents: Manual and questionnaires revision*. University of Denver. <https://doi.org/10.1037/t05703-000>
- Jeffrey, B. (2005). *Final report of the creative learning and student perspectives research project (CLASP)*. Comisión Europea.
- Knifsend C. A., & Juvonen J. (2014). Social identity complexity, cross-ethnic friendships, and intergroup attitudes in urban middle schools. *Child Development*, 85(2), 709-21. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.12157>
- Lage-Gómez, C., & Cremades-Andreu, R. (2020). Theorising 'participatory creativity' in music education: Unpacking the whole process at a Spanish secondary school. *Music Education Research*, 22(1), 54-67. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2019.1703922>
- Lage-Gómez, C., & Cremades-Andreu, R. (2019). Group improvisation as dialogue: Opening creative spaces in secondary music education. *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 31, 232-242. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2018.12.007>

- Lieblich, A., & Josselson, R. (2013). Identity and narrative as root metaphors of personhood. In J. Martin & M. Bickhard (Eds.), *The Psychology of Personhood: Philosophical, Historical, Social-Development and Narrative Perspectives* (pp. 203-222). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781139086493.015>
- Littleton, K., & Mercer, N. (2013). *Interthinking: Putting talk to work*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203809433>
- MacDonald, R., Hargreaves, D. J., & Miell, D. (Eds.) (2017). *Handbook of Musical Identities*. Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199679485.001.0001>
- Macdonald, R., Hargreaves, D. J., & Miell, D. (Eds.) (2002). *Musical identities*. Oxford University Press. Manchester University Press.
- MacGregor, E. H. (2020). Participatory performance in the secondary music classroom and the paradox of belonging. *Music Education Research*, 22(2), 229-245. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2020.1737927>
- Mercer, N. (2000). *Words and minds: How we use language to think together*. Routledge.
- Puryear, J. P., & Lamb, K.N. (2020). Defining creativity: How far have we come since Plucker, Beghetto, and Dow?, *Creativity Research Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10400419.2020.1821552>
- Tarrant, M., MacKenzie, L., & Hewitt, L. A. (2006). Friendship group identification, multidimensional self-concept, and experience of developmental tasks in adolescence. *Journal of Adolescence*, 29(4), 627-640. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.adolescence.2005.08.012>
- Roccas, S., & Brewer, M. B. (2002). Social identity complexity. *Personality and Social Psychology Review*, 6(2), 88-106. https://doi.org/10.1207/S15327957PSPR0602_01
- Rogoff, B. (2003). *The cultural nature of human development*. Oxford University Press
- Saiz-Linares, Á., Rodríguez-Hoyos, C., & Susinos-Rada, T. (2019). 'I think we are still very directive': Teachers' discourses on democratic student participation. *British Educational Research Journal*, 45(1), 83-98. <https://doi.org/10.1002/berj.3488>
- Sawyer, R. K. (2003). *Group creativity: Music, theater, collaboration*. Erlbaum.
- Seddon, F. A. (2012). Empathetic creativity in music making. In O. Odena (Ed.), *Musical creativity: Insights from music education* (pp. 133-147). Ashgate.
- Soares, J. (2012). The nature of the engagement of Brazilian adolescents in composing activities. In O. Odena (Ed.), *Musical Creativity: Insights from Music Education Research* (pp. 113-132). Ashgate.
- Tajfel, H., & Turner, J. C. (1986). The social identity theory of intergroup behavior. In S. Worchel, & W. G. Austin (Eds.), *Psychology of Intergroup Relation* (pp. 7-24). Hall Publishers.
- Tanti, C., Stukas, A. A., Halloran, M. J., & Foddy, M. (2011). Social identity change: Shifts in social identity during adolescence. *Journal of Adolescence*, 34(3), 555-567. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.adolescence.2010.05.012>
- Wegerif, R. (2013). *Dialogic: Education for the Internet Age*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203111222>

Carlos Lage-Gómez

Faculty of Education
Complutense University of Madrid
Rector Royo Villanova s/n, Ciudad Universitaria,
28040 Madrid, Spain
calage@ucm.es

Roberto Cremades-Andreu

Faculty of Education
Complutense University of Madrid
Rector Royo Villanova s/n, Ciudad Universitaria,
28040 Madrid, Spain
rcremade@ucm.es

Oblikovanje grupnoga identiteta glazbenim stvaranjem u srednjoj školi

Sažetak

Glazba ima važnu ulogu u izgradnji identiteta tijekom adolescencije. Unatoč tome, malo je studija istraživalo odnos između oblikovanja grupnih identiteta u adolescenciji i glazbenoga stvaranja kao iskustvene grupne aktivnosti u srednjoj školi. Stoga je cilj ovoga istraživanja bio osvijetliti oblikovanje grupnih identiteta u razredu i utvrditi čimbenike uključene u taj proces. Proveden je obrazovni projekt s fokusom na participacijsko glazbeno stvaranje u tri srednje škole u Španjolskoj. U projektu je sudjelovalo 267 učenika. Podatci su sakupljeni metodama sudioničkoga promatranja, promatranja bez sudjelovanja, razrednoga dnevnika, upitnika i videozapisa, a analizirani su unutar okvira teorije aktivnosti. Rezultati pokazuju utjecaj određenoga broja međusobno povezanih faktora na oblikovanje grupnoga identiteta u učionici: (1) učenički angažman u svim stadijima projekta, (2) stvaranje značajnih glazbenih iskustava kroz učeničke uloge glazbenika, (3) razredno ozračje, (4) javljanje pozitivnih emocija, (5) visoka motivacija za učenje i (6) poistovjećivanje učenika s vlastitom glazbom. Navedeni rezultati otkrivaju pozitivno djelovanje glazbenoga stvaralaštva na oblikovanje grupnoga identiteta.

Ključne riječi: glazba; kreativno učenje; sudjelovanje; srednjoškolsko obrazovanje; teorija aktivnosti.

Uvod

Suočavajući se s novim, promjenjivim vremenima (Castells, 2012), obrazovanje se mora prilagoditi kako bi pratilo višestruke promjene u današnjem društvu informacija i znanja (Fernández, 2016). U tom kontekstu samoafirmacija u društvenim odnosima predstavlja esencijalni proces u adolescenciji (Harter, 2012). Identifikacija sa socijalnim grupama, bilo odabrana (Tanti i sur., 2011) ili dodijeljena (Knifsend i Juvonen, 2014), važan je korak u razvoju samopoimanja (Tarrant i sur., 2006) i samopouzdanja adolescenata (Chen, 2019). Stoga je moguće primijeniti teoriju socijalnoga identiteta zasnovanu na konceptu oblikovanja individualnih identiteta kroz društvenu kreativnost povezanu sa socijalnim skupinama (Tajfel i Turner, 1986). Nadalje, općenito je prepoznato da svaki

pojedinaac može imati razne grupne identitete. U tom su smislu Roccas i Brewer (2002) razvili koncept složenosti društvenih identiteta prema kojemu svaka skupina kojoj pojedinac pripada može biti povezana u raznim dimenzijama i na različite načine. Osim toga, identitet se može promatrati kao dinamični konstrukt u stalnoj mijeni (Lieblich i Josselson, 2013); DeNora ga opisuje (2017) kao „iskrsavajuće statute” (str. 60), a povezan je s procesima učenja i stoga ubuhvaća identitet adolescenata. Prema Rogoffu (2003), procesi uključeni u izgradnju identiteta imaju tri pojavne razine: (1) individualnu, s naglašenim razvojem autonomije, (2) društvenu, kroz osjećaj pripadnosti raznim društvenim grupama i (3) kulturološku, koja se odnosi na okolinu u kojoj se događa.

Iz ove perspektive glazba se može konceptualizirati kao projekt identiteta (MacDonald i sur., 2017) koji predstavlja jednu od mnogih referentnih točaka za adolescente u kognitivnom, emocionalnom i društvenom smislu. Razumijevanje glazbe kao neodjeljive od ljudskoga života (Cremades i sur., 2015; DeNora, 2000) odražava njezin utjecaj na oblikovanje identiteta. U tom pogledu, MacDonald i sur. (2002) razlikuju identitete u glazbi i glazbu u identitetima. Prva se kategorija odnosi na aspekte koje definiraju kulturološke uloge ili univerzalne kategorije, dok se druga odnosi na način na koji glazba određuje naše identitete, tj. doprinosi oblikovanju samopoimanja. Sažeto, glazbeni identiteti su izvedbeni i društveni kao i psihološki (Hargreaves i sur., 2009), stoga ne podrazumijevaju samo karakteristike osobe, već i aspekte koje sami stvaramo kroz višestruke odnose prema glazbi (mjesto na kojima dijelimo glazbene ukuse, glazbeni ambijenti itd.). U odnosu na vezu između glazbe i identiteta, navedeno ima snažne posljedice za obrazovanje, zasnovano na konceptu razreda kao prostora socijalizacije.

Sudjelovanje u učionici

Od Platonove definicije sudjelovanja kao metafizičkoga koncepta koji povezuje opipljive predmete i ideje, sudjelovanje se u literaturi o obrazovanju spominje kao (1) sredstvo usađivanja demokracije u srce obrazovanja (Saiz-Linares i sur., 2019) i (2) sredstvo promocije motivacije i zadovoljstva učenika (Lage-Gómez i Cremades-Andreu, 2019, 2020). Učioničko sudjelovanje uključuje nekoliko dimenzija: od strategija poučavanja s ciljem promocije učenja do samog obrazovnoga cilja. Dva ključna čimbenika definiraju učioničko sudjelovanje: (1) donošenje odluka učenika i (2) različiti intenziteti u kojima se ono može događati. Stoga je učeničko sudjelovanje moguće analizirati u svim stadijima procesa učenja i poučavanja (dizajn kurikula, procesi učenja i rezultati).

Nadalje, učeničke uloge u procesu poučavanja i učenja javljaju se kao krucijalan aspekt koji je u literaturi bio značajan predmet rasprava zbog tradicionalne dihotomije učenja usredotočenoga na učenika i onog fokusiranoga na učitelja. Wegerif (2013) spominje dijaloško obrazovanje u kojemu je učenje usmjereno na dijalog prije nego na učenika ili učitelja: ono utire put različitim definicijama sudjelovanja u kojem iskustvo pojedinca postaje društveno iskustvo, tj. aktivno ili misaono sredstvo dijeljenja zajedničkoga temelja i kreiranja ili rekreiranja stvarnosti (Freire, 2003).

Kreativni prostori učenja

Kreativnost se rekonceptualizira od prvog desetljeća 21. stoljeća: jednom smatrana složenom pojavom povezanom s individualnim umovima, koji su socijalno i društveno locirani (Puyear i Lamb, 2020), danas se promatra iz društveno-kulturalne perspektive (Glaveanu, 2018) kao oblik generativne društvene prakse raznih pojava oblika (Burnard, 2012). Zamisao kreativnosti kao razmišljanja o mogućnostima (Craft i sur., 2007) i zona proksimalnoga razvoja (ZPR) Vygotskog otvaraju vrata konceptualizaciji kreativnih prostora za poučavanje-učenje. Na osnovi koncepta obrazovanja kao dijaloga, Mercer (2000) je proširio ZPR i konceptualizirao *intermentalnu zonu razvoja* kao produženi događaj koji je rezultat procesa *zajedničkog razmišljanja* (korištenje dijaloga za kolektivno mišljenje) (Littleton i Mercer, 2013), zonu koja predstavlja misaonu, metakognitivnu prirodu kontekstualiziranoga, zajednički reguliranoga grupnog rada. U međuvremenu, Wegerig (2013) je proširio spomenuti koncept prema otvorenijoj, višesmjernoj i prethodno definiranoj perspektivi. Stoga dijaloški prostor učenja nije samo cilj već i kontekst u kojem se učenje događa i zato se, iz društvene perspektive, može smatrati ciljem učenja sam po sebi. U tom prostoru presijecaju se kreativno poučavanje, kreativnost i kreativno učenje. Stoga bi kreativno učenje usmjereno na učenika trebalo uključivati učenike i u osmišljavanju i u procjeni procesa poučavanja i učenja (Jeffrey, 2005). Prostori kreativnoga učenja u glazbenom obrazovanju mogli bi se konceptualizirati kao oni koji omogućuju stvaranje glazbenih ideja kroz sudionički proces usredotočen na glazbenu kreativnost.

Sukladno tome, glavni je cilj ove studije istražiti oblikovanje grupnoga identiteta kroz glazbeno stvaranje u srednjoj školi među učenicima raznolikih kulturoloških pozadina u regiji Madrid (Španjolska). Dodatni cilj bio je istražiti proces obrazovnoga preoblikovanja kako bi objasnili utjecaj formiranja grupnoga identiteta na procese učenja koji nastoje razviti umjetničku kreativnost i utvrditi aspekte pripadanja zajednici. Učionica glazbenog je u ovom istraživanju simbolični prostor socijalnoga predstavljanja u kojemu su učenici, učitelji, istraživači i umjetnici angažirani u iskustvenom procesu zajedničke izgradnje značenja, s ciljem njezine transformacije (Acaso, 2013).

Metodologija

Metoda istraživanja

Ova studija zasnovana je na dizajnu akcijskoga istraživanja utemeljenom na pretpostavci epistemološkoga stjecišta poučavanja i sudjelovanja u istraživanju (Cochran-Smith i Little, 2009). U tom smislu, iz perspektive razvijene u ovoj studiji, Biesta (2020) predlaže pragmatični pristup koji integrira tri prepoznatljive istraživačke svrhe: objašnjenje, razumijevanje i emancipaciju.

Sudionici i kontekst

Istraživanje je provedeno u pet ciklusa, tijekom šest školskih godina, s ukupno 267 učenika (11 grupa učenika trećih razreda tri obavezne državne srednje škole u regiji

Madrid), desetak različitih kulturoloških porijekla s obzirom na religiju, društveno-kulturalnu razinu i akademske rezultate. Treća je godina odabrana zbog osobina kurikula koji se pobliže bavi glazbenom kompozicijom: „Tonski zapisi za dramu, pokret i ples; te fotografije i pokretne slike kao poticaj audiovizualnom stvaralaštvu” (Decree 23/2007, str. 129). Kao zajednički element svih ciklusa ističe se otvorenost sudionika za obrazovne prijedloge proceduralnih aspekata, što se pokazalo kao važan čimbenik koji je imao pozitivan utjecaj tijekom projekta. Također je važno napomenuti da grupe prethodno nisu bile izložene obrazovnim pristupima zasnovanim na glazbenoj kreativnosti ni u osnovnom ni srednjoškolskom obrazovanju.

Instrumenti istraživanja

Instrumenti korišteni u istraživanju dizajnirani su samo za tu svrhu jer nisu pronađeni primjereni alati prilikom pregleda sličnih studija provedenih o obrazovnim projektima oblikovanja identiteta glazbenim stvaranjem u srednjoj školi i njegovim obrazovnim posljedicama. Osim toga, ovakav nacrt istraživačkih instrumenata primijenjen je i zato da bi se usporedile informacije dobivene od različitih sudionika uključenih u ovu studiju. Ti su instrumenti sljedeći:

- sudioničko promatranje putem razrednoga dnevnika koji ispunjava učitelj-istraživač i vanjski istraživač, kako bi usporedili zabilježene informacije
- žarišne grupne rasprave s učenicima i individualni intervjui osmišljeni uz pomoć raznih stručnjaka koji su rafinirali inicijalni intervju sukladno ciljevima istraživanja
- također je uz pomoć stručnjaka osmišljen upitnik čija je valjanost provjerena i koji je zatim primijenjen na učenicima radi evaluacije učenja na kraju svakog ciklusa
- promatranje bez sudjelovanja raznih školskih učitelja koji su pisali izvješća o svojim opservacijama i sudjelovali na sastancima na kojima se analizirala provedba nastave
- na kraju, učinjeni su audio i videozapisi kako bi se detaljno analizirali razni aspekti nastave i skladbe učenika.

Teorija aktivnosti bila je osnova za analizu podataka. U njoj je korištena deduktivna analitička perspektiva kako bi se bolje razumjeli raznoliki, povezani elementi u zadacima na kojima je angažirana socijalna grupa (Engeström, 1999). Ova je perspektiva korištena u polju glazbenoga obrazovanja da bi se analizirale značajke suradničkih aktivnosti skladanja (Burnard i Dragovic, 2014; Soares, 2012). Teorija aktivnosti ima korijene u ruskoj socijalno-povijesnoj tradiciji Vygotskog, a koristio ju je Engeström (1987) kako bi predložio model za analiziranje aktivnosti i njihovo predstavljanje kroz sredstva, rezultate, smisao, značenja, aktere, cilj, pravila, zajednicu i podjelu rada.

Navedena teorija može doprinijeti promjeni obrazovnih praksi te objašnjava njihovo odvijanje u skladu sa sljedećim principima (Greeno i Engeström, 2014):

- 1) individualno učenje kroz svojstva i procese učenja unutar okvira sustava
- 2) učenje na osnovi mentalnih predodžbi sudionika i njihova ponašanja kao zajednice unutar sustava
- 3) učenje kroz svojstva samog sustava.

U skladu s ciljem ovoga istraživanja, analizirani su procesi učenja povezani s glazbenim stvaranjem radi utvrđivanja čimbenika koji su omogućili i oblikovali razvoj grupnoga identiteta u učionici.

Postupak

Projekti su osmišljeni tijekom prvog tromjesečja i prvog dijela drugog tromjesečja, a provedba je počela u drugom dijelu drugog tromjesečja i trajala do kraja akademske godine, od 2007./2008. do 2012./2013. Ovo istraživanje predstavlja nove analize odnosa između identiteta u adolescenciji i glazbenoga stvaranja unutar epistemološkoga okvira teorije aktivnosti. Pristanak za provedbu projekta zatražen je i dobiven od uprave škola sudionica, a također i od obitelji onih učenika koji su sudjelovali u istraživanju.

Svaki projekt uključivao je skladanje glazbe za nepomične ili pokretne slike kroz suradničko glazbeno stvaranje kao alternativu postojećoj teorijskoj nastavi glazbene kulture u srednjoj školi. Ova početna ideja kontinuirano se razvijala i mijenjala u pogledu: (1) korištenih audiovizualnih materijala u projektu, (2) strategije učenja i organizacije koje su korištene tijekom provedbe i (3) upotrebe suradničkoga skladanja i grupne improvizacije kao metodičkih postupaka. Zajednička jezgra svim projektima bilo je stvaranje glazbe ili, u širem smislu, komponiranje glazbe za nepokretne slike ili filmske prizore, kratke filmove, slike ili postere, metodom suradničkoga skladanja i kolektivne improvizacije. Napominjemo da su projekti provedeni u suradnji s uključenim učenicima (koji su bili informirani o toj zamisli, kako bi posljedično sudjelovali kao integralni dio projekta), učiteljima, istraživačima i umjetnicima.

Razvijeni obrazovni projekti sažeti su u nastavku:

1. Projekt *Orfanato*. Ciklus I. školska godina 2007./2008. Srednja škola 1. Aranžman glazbe za film *Orfanato (Sirotište)*, uz glavnu temu kao referencu za grupne improvizacije. 24 sata u svakom razredu. Originalni tonski zapis. Grupna improvizacija (metodologija, strategija i praksa).
2. Projekt *Orfanato II i Moderna vremena*. Ciklus II. školska godina 2008./2009. Srednja škola 1. (1) Stvaranje glazbe za film *Sirotište*, koristeći kao reference glazbenu temu, putem suradničkoga skladanja i grupne improvizacije. (2) Elaboracija glazbe za razne prizore iz filma *Moderna vremena* putem suradničkoga komponiranja. 32 sata za svaku aktivnost: proces suradničkoga komponiranja originalnoga tonskog zapisa (eksperimentiranje). Grupna improvizacija (metodologija, strategija i praksa). Proces suradničkoga komponiranja za *Moderna vremena*.
3. Projekt *Zvukovi zlostavljanja*. Ciklus III. školska godina 2009./2010. Srednja škola 1. Razrada glazbe o zlostavljanju u školama, zasnovana na nizu postera s izložbe o istoj temi, putem grupne improvizacije. 12 sati za svaki suradnički proces komponiranja (eksperimentiranje) i grupnu improvizaciju (metodologija, strategija i praksa).
4. Projekt *Uglazbljivanje slika*. Ciklus IV. školska godina 2010./2011. Srednja škola 2. Uglazbljivanje slika profesionalnih slikara putem kolektivne improvizacije. 14 sati, grupna improvizacija (metodologija, strategija i praksa).

5. Projekt *Presto* i *Paperman*. Ciklus V. školska godina 2012./2013. Srednja škola 3. Stvaranje glazbe za kratke animirane filmove *Presto* i *Paperman*. 26 sati za svaki suradnički proces komponiranja (glazba i efekti).

Rezultati i učinci provedenoga istraživanja Kreativni proces i grupni identitet u glazbenoj učionici

Jedan od aspekata otkrivenih u ovom istraživačkom projektu je postupnost i konstantnost, ali također neujednačenost kreativnoga procesa, iako je opći trend uzlazni i povezan s parcijalnim rezultatima koje učenici percipiraju. Stoga, učenik u petom ciklusu primijetio je: „Nismo uvijek zadovoljni, ali vidjeli smo da, malo po malo, stvari funkcioniraju”. Osim toga, jedan je od promatrača koji nisu sudjelovali primijetio „napredak u procesu.” Slično tome, u zajedničkoj analizi podataka dobivenih u četvrtom ciklusu studije, promatrač bez sudjelovanja izjavio je: „Sve veće zadovoljstvo učenika vlastitim improvizacijama bilo je esencijalni element u napretku projekta, kako u vezi s emocionalnim tako i glazbenim rezultatima, uz to što su zahtjevi učenika od vlastitih glazbenih izvedbi bili sve veći”.

Primijećena je prekretnica u projektima u kojoj su se razredna klima i učenički stavovi prema glazbi značajno poboljšali, stvarajući sinergiju između grupe i učitelja: „Kao da postoji trenutak kada sve sjedne na svoje mjesto i nakon toga sve počne mnogo bolje funkcionirati.” (učitelj, istraživački dnevnik, prvi ciklus). Učenici su bili znatno angažiraniji u projektu kada su se s njim poistovjetili kroz stvaranu glazbu i postignute rezultate. U tom trenutku osjećali su samopouzdanje, tj. vjeru u vlastite glazbene sposobnosti i doživjeli preobrazbu iz učenika u tipičnoj srednjoškolskoj nastavi u glazbenike koji uče intuitivno.

Rezultati dobiveni primjenom upitnika potvrdili su zadovoljstvo učenika projektnim aktivnostima: u drugom studijskom ciklusu 57,6 % učenika izjavilo je da su vrlo zadovoljni aktivnostima, kao što je to učinilo i 59,1 % u trećem ciklusu, dok je 72,7 % njih u četvrtom ciklusu izjavilo da su vrlo zadovoljni, kao i 48,5 % u petom ciklusu.

Odgovori na pitanje otvorenoga tipa o tome zašto su im se sviđele određene projektne aktivnosti, grupirani su prema indikatorima predstavljenima u Tablici 1.

Tablica 1

Rezultati utvrđivanja čimbenika u oblikovanju grupnoga identiteta

Oblikovanje grupnoga identiteta u razredu rezultat je djelovanja brojnih čimbenika o kojima će se raspravljati u nastavku.

Razredna klima

Općenito dobra klima nastala u razredu još je jedna osobina uočena tijekom istraživanja i njegovih integralnih projekata. Navedeno se jasno odražava u učeničkim odgovorima na pitanja upitnika i u intervjuima s promatračima i s promatračima sudionicima u svim ciklusima: „Dobra je atmosfera. Postoji poštovanje svačijeg rada

i dovoljno je tiho da svi mogu raditi” (promatrač bez sudjelovanja, srednja škola 1). Navodi u razrednom dnevniku također ukazuju na sve bolju klimu tijekom projekta.

Navedeni rezultat je pozitivno utjecao na razne aspekte:

a) Opće ozračje povjerenja između učenika i učitelja

„Ugodno ozračje povjerenja” (promatrač bez sudjelovanja i istraživač, srednja škola 2).

b) Stav učenika

„Većina pokazuje dobar stav, pazi, strpljiva je i aktivno sluša. Zamjetno je da se učenici koncentriraju unatoč umoru jer je ovo danas zadnji sat.” (promatrač bez sudjelovanja i istraživač, srednja škola 1).

c) Motivacija učenika

„Njihovo glazbeno učenje osnaženo je praksom koja je motivirajuća i spaja sadržaje predmeta.” (promatrač bez sudjelovanja i istraživač, srednja škola 2).

Ovi rezultati sukladni su rezultatima upitnika, u kojem 90 % učenika u prvom ciklusu primjećuje bolju razrednu atmosferu, kao što to čini 98 % učenika u drugom ciklusu, 91 % u trećem ciklusu, 81,8 % u četvrtom i 93 % u petom. S obzirom na razinu kulturološke raznolikosti u projektu, može se zaključiti da je dobra atmosfera na nastavi stvorena upotrebom kreativnih metoda poučavanja-učenja obogaćenim procesom socijalizacije učenika.

Motivacija za učenje

Prema postotcima dobivenim primjenom upitnika, učenici su bili vrlo motivirani za učenje: 43,60 % u prvom ciklusu izjavilo je da su vrlo motivirani, 60 % u drugom ciklusu da su prilično motivirani; 40,9 %, 73 % i 58,6 % izjavilo je da su vrlo motivirani u trećem, četvrtom i petom ciklusu, tim redom.

Promatrač bez sudjelovanja u prvom ciklusu istraživanja potvrdio je visoku razinu motivacije učenika: „Učenici su očito zainteresirani rad, uživaju u njemu i dobro surađuju u grupama”. U međuvremenu, promatrač bez sudjelovanja u četvrtom studijskom ciklusu referirao se na „motivirajuću praksu”.

Analiza osobina i čimbenika koji su utjecali ili odredili učeničku motivaciju otkrila je brojne raznolike, ali intrinzične i međusobno povezane oblike motivacije u učionici koji su nastali zbog dva različita aspekta:

a) Vanjska motivacija i samomotivacija, što odgovara tradicionalnom konceptu intrinzične i ekstrinzične motivacije.

b) Socijalni kontekst i procesi poučavanja i učenja primijenjeni u učionici.

Može se uočiti razlika između socijalne motivacije i motivacije za učenje te socijalne i inicijalne motivacije koju karakteriziraju očekivanja od aktivnosti.

Pozitivne emocije

Jedna od tema koje su se javljale tijekom istraživanja bilo je stvaranje pozitivnih emocija u razredu kao rezultat procesa učenja. Analiza podataka pokazala je da su razlozi u korijenu te pojave sljedeći:

- 1) Većina učenika koji su sudjelovali, smatrali su glazbeno iskustvo u razredu značajnim.
- 2) Angažman na projektu kao zajednički izazov grupe, „njihov projekt”, s razvojem koncepta pojedinca i grupe te sudjelovanje kao zajednička i simbolična ekspresija grupe.
- 3) Pozitivna atmosfera u razredu.
- 4) Identifikacija učenika s vlastitom glazbom kao važan element za funkcioniranje glazbenoga stvaranja, tj. sredstva promocije razvoja grupnoga identiteta. Glazba je skladana zajednički i učenici su njome bili zadovoljni.

Unatoč svim kulturološkim i socijalnim ograničenjima vezanim uz obrazovni kontekst, glazba je pokrenula raznolike „dobre vibracije” povezane s osnovnom emocijom, srećom, u smislu osjećaja individualne opuštenosti, ali iznad svega i kolektivne. Sve prije spomenuto međusobno je povezano i uključuje grupu, pojedinačne učenike i učitelja. Iz tog razloga, emocije su se pojavile tijekom kreativnoga procesa na grupnoj razini kao rezultat „osjećaja pripadanja”, identifikacije i simbolične izgradnje zajedničkoga identiteta zasnovanoga na učeničkoj glazbi. Pozitivne emocije utvrđene su u sljedećim razrednim situacijama:

- 1) Tijekom izvedbe i, eksplicitno, u ekspresivnosti glazbe koju su izvodili učenici, kada su prihvatili emocije koje prenosi glazba kao vlastite.
- 2) Sljedeći aspekt je bio pojavljivanje emocija kao rezultat opuštenosti, sigurne, uviđavne i ugodne razredne atmosfere.
- 3) U kombinaciji s emocionalno sigurnom okolinom za učenike i glazbom, tijekom grupnih izvedbi katalizirao je pozitivne emocije: „Oduševljeni smo onim što smo napravili i sjećanje na našu glazbu još uvijek nas raduje.” (učenik, 3. ciklus). Sukladno tome, stvorena klima bila je važan preduvjet za grupni tijek.

Glazbenici u učionici

Prilikom promatranja primijećeno je da su učenici preuzimali uloge glazbenika. Na primjer, jedan je učenik u prvom studijskom ciklusu izjavio: „Naučio sam razmišljati i ponašati se kao glazbenik”. Taj je aspekt potvrđen učiteljskim opservacijama: „Bilo je trenutaka velike muzikalnosti”. Sudionik promatrač u petom studijskom ciklusu potvrdio je da su učenici preuzimali uloge glazbenika, kao što su pokazali i glazbeni produkti. Bez obzira na razinu sudjelovanja, učenici su bili zadovoljni svojim ulogama u grupi koje je varirale ovisno o njihovoj glazbenoj vještini ili instrumentima koje su svirali, a učenje se događalo kao rezultat:

- 1) eksperimentiranja s instrumentom
- 2) prijedloga i sugestija učitelja
- 3) prijedloga vršnjaka
- 4) glazbenih ideja koje su se pojavile u skupini kao rezultat zvukova koje je stvorila grupa.

Grupni tijek

Na osnovi koncepta tjeka (Csikszentmihalyi, 1998), Sawyer (2003) je na razini grupe razvio analogni koncept koji se odnosi na situacije u kojima grupa kolektivno doživljava

pozitivne emocije. Takva iskustva zbližavaju grupu: „Bilo je vrlo zanimljivih trenutaka danas tijekom improvizacija: bila sam svjesna uzbuđenja i inspiracije” (učiteljica, razredni dnevnik). Ovi trenutci upisani su u grupnu memoriju kao posebno ugodni i oni koji stvaraju emocionalne veze, kao što svjedoče učenici sudionici: „Zaista nam nedostaje nastava: osjećali smo se dobro”. Promatrač u prvom i drugom studijskom ciklusu ukazao je na sljedeće: „Učenici su bili okruženi zvukom, vlastitim zvukom, i to ih je iskustvo na kraju izdiglo izvan granica vlastite glazbe te su postali sustvaratelji nečeg zajedničkog”. U tom procesu „postanka” ukupno iskustvo je važnije od zbroja njegovih dijelova. Ukratko, učenici su izgradili značajna glazbena iskustva zasnovana na svojim doživljajima glazbe u učionici, kao što su pokazali njihovi odgovori na pitanja upitnika. Zbog toga, u žarišnoj raspravi skupine održanoj dvije godine nakon petog studijskog ciklusa, učenici su svojem učioničkom iskustvu pripisali smisao:

„Uzbuđena sam što ponovo vidim kratki film, sjećam se svake stvari koju smo radili.” (učenica 1, 5. ciklus);

„Povratak u glazbenu učionicu budi uspomene na vrlo lijepe trenutke.” (učenik 2, 5. ciklus).

Rezultati u odnosu na grupni identitet kroz analizu glazbenih produkata

Analiza zvučnih zapisa i kreativnih procesa otkrila je novonastali semiotički jezik u podlozi glazbe, jezik pod utjecajem porijekla učenika. Ovaj proces je intuitivan i događa se u kombinaciji s upotrebom prošlih ili inicijalnih tema od strane kompozitora ili učitelja. S obzirom na to kako je projekt zamišljen, ovo ne bi bilo moguće bez predznanja o glazbi iz crtanih filmova ili inkulturacije, što je učenicima omogućilo da uspostave tradicionalne veze između glazbe i slike i sudjeluju u audio-vizualnoj kulturi čije konvencije poznaju, dijele i koriste kao polaznu točku i mapu kreativnoga procesa.

Tijekom ciklusa učenici su pokazali specifičnu upotrebu stilova, odražavajući svoje raznolike glazbene kulture, glazbene karakteristike, specifične za svakog člana skupine i glazbenu atmosferu učionice. Svaka skupina bila je nadahnuta za stvaranje vlastitoga zvuka u konstantnom implicitnom ili eksplicitnom pregovaranju između učenika i učitelja, bilo verbalno ili kroz izvedbu i improvizaciju.

Na primjer, jedan od aspekata koji su se pojavili tijekom projekta bila je visoka razina učeničkoga zadovoljstva dobivenim rezultatima. Stoga je učenik 1 u prvom ciklusu izjavio: „Bio sam zaista zadovoljan s tim kako je sve ispalo”, dok je učenik 3 osjećao da su rezultati „utjecali na stav razreda”. Promatrač koji nije sudjelovao je također bio svjestan učeničkoga zadovoljstva rezultatima: „Instrumenti su stari, neispravni i prilično neuštimani, što kvari finalni rezultat, ali općenito je bilo zadovoljavajuće slušati glazbu i užitek vidjeti zadovoljstvo konačnim rezultatom na licima nekih učenika”. Podatci sakupljeni upotrebom upitnika, bilježeni na petostupanjskoj Likertovoj skali, od vrlo loše do vrlo dobro, potvrdili su visoku razinu zadovoljstva učenika budući da je 50 % sudionika trećeg ciklusa odabralo opciju vrlo dobro, kao što je to učinilo

i 65,2 % sudionika četvrtog ciklusa. Nadalje, 50 % učenika petog ciklusa odabralo je opciju dobro, ukazujući na procjenu općenite važnosti projekta i njegove primjene i još jednom demonstrirajući utjecaj učioničkih aktivnosti na procese učenja i poučavanja. „Naučila sam mnogo o sebi iz kratkog filma” (učenica, 5. ciklus), izjava je koja odražava učeničke percepcije važnosti produkata u projektu, aspekta koji je potvrđen i percepcijama učitelja sudionika. Ipak, ovi se rezultati ne odnose isključivo na završne proizvode, već i na stalnu povratnu informaciju o djelomičnim rezultatima i zadovoljstvo aktivnošću, što se odrazilo na učeničku motivaciju i razrednu klimu. Stoga, učenici su preuzeli zasluge za produkte tijekom procesa identifikacije jer su ih sami stvorili i sviđali su im se, i zato što su oblikovali grupni identitet.

Rasprava i obrazovne implikacije

Važnost uloge učenika u vlastitom učenju tijekom provedbe projekata stvorila je prostore kurativnoga učenja i obogatila ih značenjem. Stvaranje i izvedba vlastite glazbe predstavljala je dio grupnoga identiteta unutar kojeg su učenici stvarali i asimilirali zajedničke kulturološke svjetove zasnovane na sustavu audiovizualnih konvencija koje su oblikovale dio njihovih prijašnjih iskustava. Unutar grupe učenici su, ovisno o vlastitim glazbenim vještinama ili instrumentima koje su svirali, preuzimali zadatke izvan granica vlastite uloge. U isto vrijeme su oblikovali glazbena značenja iz pozicija stvaraoca i izvođača, koristeći intuitivni pristup glazbenom jeziku i stilu pod utjecajem vlastitoga glazbenog, kulturnog porijekla i povratne informacije učitelja.

Glazbeno stvaranje predstavljalo je kanale verbalne i glazbene komunikacije. Grupe su autonomno organizirale dostupno vrijeme i prostor, što je omogućilo proces učenja u suradničkom komponiranju kroz neformalne postupke (Green, 2008). Na primjer, učenje putem nasumičnoga istraživanja bilo je karakteristično za neke faze procesa i smatralo se tipičnim za neformalno učenje. Stoga, mogu se razlikovati školske strategije promocije suradničkoga učenja koje promatrač u petom ciklusu opisuje kao sredstvo omogućavanja učeničkoga napretka, od neformalnih kolektivnih procesa glazbenoga učenja zasnovanog na osobnom angažmanu i odgovornosti učenika. Dijalog je igrao važnu ulogu u kreativnom procesu pri odlučivanju o strukturi djela i svakom od njegovih elemenata.

Suradnički procesi učenja također su prisutni u učeničkoj glazbenoj izvedbi, tijekom koje su verbalne izmjene učenika ili učitelja bile gotovo odsutne. Drugim riječima, kako se grupa počela poistovjećivati s glazbom koju su stvarali, počelo se događati intuitivno filtriranje zasnovano na intenziviranju glazbenih elemenata koji su formirali grupni identitet. Stoga, kolektivno učenje poboljšalo je grupnu interakciju, a glazba se javila kao sredstvo socijalizacije koje je omogućilo oblikovanje grupnoga identiteta u razredu.

Ti suradnički procesi učenja stvorili su novu definiciju glazbe nastale u razredu. Učenici su toj glazbi pripisali različita značenja prilikom doživljavanja glazbenoga jezika i forme kroz eksperimentiranje, neovisno o standardiziranim socijalnim kontekstima izvan učionice. Učenički doživljaj glazbe koju su stvarali na nastavi učinio

ju je autonomnom. U isto vrijeme je stvoren socijalno inkluzivni grupni identitet u kojemu su sudjelovali svi učenici, pridajući stvaranoj glazbi različita značenja, vrijednosti i iskustva, što predstavlja rezultat sličan onome iz studije MacGregora (2020). Iz tog razloga, kulturološka raznolikost sudionika grupe obogatila je kreativne procese i glazbene rezultate.

Kolektivno glazbeno stvaralaštvo u učionici otkrilo je još jednu dimenziju projekta, poglavito tri načina na koje je sudjelovanje oblikovalo bitan element kreativnih procesa: (1) aktivno sudjelovanje učenika u projektnim odlukama, od početnoga nacрта do postignutih rezultata, (2) učeničko sudjelovanje u postizanju zajedničkoga cilja koje je dovelo do izgradnje grupnoga identiteta i (3) sudjelovanje kroz inkulturaciju, drugim riječima, učeničko sudjelovanje kroz glazbenu i audiovizualnu kulturu koja je dio njihovoga porijekla i predstavljala je polaznu točku za kreativne procese. Iz tog razloga, projekt je predstavljao sudionički kreativni doživljaj jer su učenici dijelili zajednički cilj koji je bio slobodno odabran i učenici su zajednički stvarali te organizirano i kreativno sudjelovali u dizajnu projekta i samom procesu, tj. realizaciji „vlastitoga projekta”, iako s različitim razinama angažmana koje su bile uvjetovane glazbenim vještinama ili različitim oblicima motivacije učenika. Sukladno tome, u sebi i od sebe, projekt je polučio obrazovne i, posljedično, transformacijske rezultate s obzirom na procese učenja. Povrh toga, dijeljenje projekta podrazumijevalo je intenzivni osobni angažman na socijalnoj, afektivnoj i emocionalnoj razini.

Stvaranje sudioničkoga konteksta za glazbeno stvaranje također se pokazalo važnim jer je rezultat ovoga procesa - zajedničko stvaranje grupe kao „kreativne cjeline” - mogao biti veći, ili svakako manji, od sume pojedinih dijelova. Ovaj aspekt povezan je s konceptom grupnoga tijeka (Sawyer, 2003), a u istraživanju je omogućio formiranje grupnoga identiteta kroz kolektivno glazbeno stvaranje, odnosno stvaranje vlastitoga zvuka svake grupe.

U podlozi oblikovanja grupnoga identiteta u učionici kroz sudioničku kreativnost nalazi se holistički, transformativni proces određen međusobnom povezanosti sljedećih čimbenika: (1) učenički aktivni angažman u nacrtu projekta koji je uveo demokratske i inkluzivne principe u kulturološki raznoliku učionicu, (2) visoka individualna i socijalna motivacija, (3) pozitivne emocije izazvane višestrukim svojstvima glazbe, za koje Seddon (2012) tvrdi da se prije mogu smatrati oblikom socijalne aktivnosti nego unutarnjim stanjem, (4) klima stvorena u kreativnim prostorima učenja, što je omogućilo učenicima da u ulozi glazbenika oblikuju značajna glazbena iskustva i (5) poistovjećivanje učenika s vlastitim glazbenim kreacijama.

Zaključno, glazbeno stvaranje osiguralo je inkluzivan prostor za socijalno izražavanje i razvoj unutar kojega se uspostavljaju višesmjerni dijaloški odnosi sa stvarnosti, a kreativno učenje omogućuje učenicima savladavanje prepreka i stvaranje prostora za socijalni kontakt i sudjelovanje. Takvi prostori omogućuju mladima i starima da premoste prepreke i teškoće (fizičke, u odnosima, komunikacijske, rasne ili vjerske) i ostvare učinkovitu socijalnu interakciju kroz simbiozu s drugim jezikom – glazbom.