#### TAMAR ALEXANDER AND YAAKOV BENTOLILA

"LAS PALABRAS VUELAN, LO ESCRITO SE QUEDA" (THE WORDS FLY, THE WRITTEN STAYS): THE JUDEO-SPANISH (HAKETIC) PROVERB IN NORTHERN MOROCCO¹

Abstract: The aim of this article is to define the literary and linguistic characteristics of proverbs in Haketia in order to examine the proverb as an expression of ethnic identity. Haketia is the Judeo-Spanish language spoken in Jewish communities in northern Morocco among descendants of Jews exiled from Spain. We claim that the tradition of proverbs in Haketia possesses its own unique characteristics that express the "voice of the group." To isolate this voice, we analyzed proverbs in Haketia in comparison to their counterparts in other groups that belong to the same cultural context: (1) Proverbs from canonical Hebrew sources (Bible, Talmud, and Midrash) that are commonly shared within the whole Jewish culture. (2) Spanish proverbs: The affinities with the culture of their geographical origin (Spain) that is shared among all the communities that speak the Judeo-Spanish language; Modern Spanish had a decisive effect among Haketia speakers. (3) Another Judeo-Spanish group: the eastern Ladino speakers (we chose Salonika). (4) The Judeo-Arabic speakers in Morocco, and Muslims speaking Moroccan Arabic with whom the speakers of Haketia interacted on a daily basis. (5) Finally, we examined unique proverbs in Haketia for which we could not find a counterpart in other cultures. For every group we posed a different secondary research question (such as theme, genre, language, or context) and offered a different method of research using analytical tools taken from different disciplines, such as literature, folklore, linguistics, and history.

*Keywords:* proverb; Haketia; canonical Hebrew sources; Judeo Arabic; Ladino (Judeo-Spanish); Juha; Spanish culture; provnames (proverbs including names); ethnic identity; cultural changes, cultural adaptations.

The aim of this article is to focus on literary and linguistic characteristics of proverbs in Haketia in order to examine the proverb as an expression of ethnic identity.

**PROVERBIUM 31 (2014)** 

Haketia is the Judeo-Spanish language spoken until two or three generations ago in Jewish communities in northern Morocco among descendants of Jews exiled from Spain. Its foundation is in the language spoken by the Jews prior to the Exile, and in this it is a sister of Judezmo (Spanyolit, Ladino), used by large parts of the Jewry of Turkey and the Balkans. Haketia developed in a rather independent manner, particularly in the area of phraseology (speech formulae, including proverbs). Similar to other Jewish languages, it borrowed words from the linguistic environment, that is, from Maghreb Arabic, and it also had a Hebrew-Aramaic component. The Arabic and Hebrew words maintain their original patterns or are fused within the dominant Spanish morphology.<sup>2</sup> Today Haketia is only in partial use and only in very specific registers among members of these communities, most of whom immigrated to Israel or emigrated to various western countries. The process of the disappearance of Haketia accelerated as a result of the Spanish presence in northern Morocco, beginning in 1860, and more strongly since the establishment of the Spanish protectorate in 1912.3 The younger community members who sought education and advancement through cultural emancipation considered Haketia a low variant fit only for use within the home or within the community, and they adopted Modern Spanish as their main language.

The change in the cultural concept in Israel over the past fifty years, from a monolithic Hebrew culture to a pluralistic, multicultural one, led to an ethnic cultural revival, including attempts to revitalize Haketia, even if only to make it an expression of group identity. The characteristics of the proverb, such as its brevity, its being easy to remember in the source language even if people no longer have command of it, and the authority of the past and the collective behind it turned it into a fitting channel for expressing Haketia culture and the collective memory.

There are several factors appearing within a proverb that serve as obvious indices for identity: the use of personal pronouns "I", "you"; the position of the speaker as the addresser or addressee; the relation to reality of what is said—descriptively or critically; the usage of symbolic or figurative language; and more especially the level of presentation of reality, either literally or metaphorically. Behind the proverb lies not only the personal authority of the speaker, but—in the main—the authority of the group.

The tradition of proverbs in Haketia possesses its own unique characteristics that express the "voice of the group." To isolate this voice, we analyzed the proverbs in Haketia in comparison to their counterparts in other groups that belong to the same cultural context:

- (1) Canonical Hebrew sources (Bible, Talmud and Midrash) that are commonly shared within Jewish culture as a whole and are a part of the Jewish national memory
- (2) The affinities with the culture of their geographical origin (Spain) that is shared among all the communities that speak the Judeo-Spanish language. Unlike other communities living in the countries under Ottoman rule, modern Spanish was destined to have a decisive effect among Haketia speakers.
- (3) Another Judeo-Spanish group—the eastern Ladino speakers (we chose Salonika)
- (4) The Judeo-Arabic speakers in Morocco, and Muslims speaking Moroccan Arabic, with whom the speakers of Haketia interacted on a daily basis. The differences between the proverb groupings define the cultural and ethnic boundaries of the groups and create an awareness of self-identity.
- (5) Finally, we examined unique proverbs in Haketia for which we could not find a counterpart in other cultures.

For every group we posed a different secondary research question, used a different method of research and offered different analytical tools.

#### 1. Affinities with the Hebrew proverb

Jewish culture is based, among other things, on a stratified system of common canonic texts, such as the Bible, the Talmud, and the Midrash. These constitute a fundamental source for ideas, stories, and proverbs likely to provide many citations at different levels of precision or similarity to the original text.

The aim of the adaptation of a literary text is to transmit the nucleus of the idea inherent in the original message through a new encoding more befitting a different micro-structure or other semiotic system. The new encoding can be effected in the original sign system or in another language. In this manner a secondary text, the meta-text, develops from the original text, the proto-text.

The connections found between a portion of the Haketia proverbs and canonic Hebrew sources can be categorized into interliterary links (such as between two languages), intra-literary (such as two genres), and inter-media (such as transfer of a written text to oral performance).<sup>4</sup>

In the examination of the linkage between the Haketia proverb and the canonic sources, we ranked the proverb according to the order of the five groups, from the close to the distant. Below we cite a number of examples representative of each group.

(A) Translated Proverbs, which include Hebrew words from the source

Following is a Haketia proverb which retains Hebrew words quoted from the source:

### Cada coźźa y su maźźal, hatta el séfer en el hekhal (ABT No. 104)<sup>5</sup>

(Everything and its *mazzal* ["luck, astral sign"] including the Book of the Torah [Bible] in the Torah Ark).

In its structure and content this proverb is based on the book of the Zohar, the main kabbalistic book in Jewish mysticism (Zohar, Naso, 134). It means that even a Torah scroll needs mazzal, i.e., 'luck', so that it will be chosen for reading among the other scrolls found in the Torah ark. The Haketia proverb contains three Hebrew words, two of which represent concepts from Jewish culture: "sefer" [ "book" or "scroll"] is the Torah scroll and "hekhal" is the Torah ark in the synagogue. The Spanish elements in the proverb include one noun, coźźa ("thing"), and particles with a grammatical function (el, en), through which the expression is accepted as a Spanish one. The word hatta [even] is in Arabic. This proverb interweaves three languages. This is not a common proverb, as use of such a proverb requires familiarity with the customs relating to prayer and reading of the Torah; the Hebrew words are clear to the group members, but not everyone is aware of the shades of the meaning. Few knew the proverb; most of them attributed it to the Talmud and not to the Zohar. Erroneous attribution is typical of the use of proverbs taken from Hebrew sources.

#### (B) Translated Proverbs

More common are the Haketia proverbs that constitute a complete translation of an original Hebrew proverb. These translations are generally repetitions of the common printed Ladino translation of the Bible. Namely this is a canonic Jewish source, yet not necessarily a Hebrew one. The shift of expression may occur through a mediating written literary stage, which consists of Ladino translations of the Bible. <sup>6</sup>

One of the most common proverbs in the Judeo-Spanish and Spanish heritage, appearing in many variations in both Haketia and Ladino, is

# La mujer sabia fragua la caźa, la loca con su mano la derroca (ABT No. 537)

(The wise woman builds her house, the foolish destroys it with her own hands.)

This is a complete translation of the verse "Every wise woman buildeth her house; but the foolish plucketh it down with her own hands" (Prov. 14:1). The Haketia proverb is based on the Ladino translation of the Hebrew verse, which appears in a contrastive pattern with two hemistiches: wise/foolish builds/destroys.

The Bible, especially the Writings (which include Proverbs and Ecclesiastes), in which proverbs are available, obviously nourished the Christian repertoire. Yet, the surprising thing is to find in Spanish collections proverbs connected to post-biblical Hebrew sources, especially the Talmud and the Midrashim. It was surprising to find that the latter constitute the main source for proverbs in Haketia. In contrast, Ladino proverbs rely extensively on biblical sources.

### Dios da la llaga y da también la meleźina (ABT No. 261)

(God sends the wound and also the medicine)

The Midrashic source is

The Holy One blessed be He—with what he smites he cures (Mekhilta de R. Ishmael Be-Shalah 5)

The plethora of parallels in the Haketia and Spanish repertoire<sup>7</sup> attest to the wide distribution of these proverbs.

### (C) Proverbs Reflecting an Adaptation of the Original

This group is the most extensive one. Unlike a translator, the adapter may sever himself from the source and gain space for his literary creativity. There are, however, different levels of adaptation: paraphrastic adaptation, which preserves the source in alternative vocabulary; selective adaptation which combines different sources; and creative adaptation, which fuses various sources and fashions them with a free hand.

The following proverb represents the verse from Proverbs 25:15, "And a soft tongue breaks the bone," in a paraphrase that lowered the expression's linguistic register:

# **Buenas palabras finden piedras (BA, N° 55)**<sup>8</sup> (Good words split stones.)<sup>9</sup>

The proverb in Haketia abandons the metaphor "soft tongue" as well as the general word "bone" and commutes them into concrete descriptions, "good words" and "stones", which are more appropriate for an oral recitation of a proverb.

Commutation of words is not necessarily a paraphrase, as in the following example:

# Mismo el ḥakham se yerra en la tebá (ABT No. 696) (Even the ḥakham [rabbi] errs (when standing) on the tebah [pulpit])

This proverb is understood when standing alone, even without familiarity with the source upon which it is based:

Even Moshe Rabbenu erred (Zebahim 101a).

The Talmud is not referring to just any *hakham*, but to the greatest, Moshe Rabbenu;<sup>10</sup> it alludes to the biblical story of Moses' error of hitting the rock to draw out water. The addressee, who is confused and embarrassed because of a mistake he has made, can garner great consolation if people will tell him a proverb that reminds him that individuals greater than he have erred.

The next proverb exemplifies an addition of a whole hemistich, and a change of structure:

Mis vestidos, mis honrantes, ellos me enzalzan y ellos me abaten (ABT No. 695)

(My garments are those who honor me; they lift me up and they bring me low)

Compare this with: "R. Johanan called his garments 'those who honor me'" (Talmud, Shabbat 113a) and "the glory of men is in their garments" (Derekh Erets Zuta 86). The Haketia proverb repeats R. Yohanan's words but omits his name. Moreover, it formulates the statement using the first person pronoun, i.e., shifting it to a correlation. Finally, it adds a hemistich explaining the verb "le-khabbed" ("to honor") and stressing the contrast between "lift up" and "bring low" and repeating the pronoun ellos (they). These additions change the talmudic saying, which is not a proverb, into a structured proverb. The Derekh Erets Zuta version does have proverbial structure, but it differs more from the Haketia proverb in its formulation. The Haketia proverb, which is related to two sources, developed the more prosaic, non-proverb text.

The message of this proverb appears in a Ladino narrative telling about Juha, who was seated at a wedding banquet and poured the delicacies served at the dinner into the sleeves of his robe. When people asked him the meaning of his behavior, he explained that he had come in simple clothing and was not allowed in, but when he returned in fine clothing, they sat him in a place of honor.<sup>12</sup>

### (D) Proverbs for which Hebrew Idioms Underpin Their Formulations

Sometimes an idiom from the sources is integrated within the Haketia proverb, loading it with the contextual meaning of the proto-text.

## La hija y la madre como la uña y la carne (ABT No. 522)

(The daughter and the mother are like the nail and the flesh.)

This proverb is a simile, which describes the extreme closeness between a mother and daughter. The idiom "fingernail and flesh" occurs in Hebrew sources in three contexts: laws of ritual slaughtering, laws of *havdalah* (ceremony ending the Sabbath), and laws of ritual immersion.

The knife used for ritual slaughtering must be unblemished. Every ritual slaughterer learns to pass his finger lightly over the blade of the knife, first from the side of the flesh and then from the side of the nail (*Shulhan Arukh*, *Yoreh De'ah*, Section 18, par. 9.)

With regard to the candle ("light of the fire") in the *havdalah* ceremony, lest the blessing be in vain, people took care to make immediate use of the candlelight, and today one customarily looks at the fingernails.

Regarding ritual immersion one must be careful of interposition, for anything that poses a barrier in ritual immersion is a barrier such as under the fingernail not resting on the flesh (*Shulḥan Arukh*, *Oraḥ Ḥayyim*, Section 161, par. 1)

The pair of words "flesh and fingernail" turned into a collocation, first in the discussion among the Halacha scholars, and from there it became common in daily discourse, and finally a proverb. The proverb became separated from the original contexts and was transposed to the sphere of relations between mother and daughter.

#### (E) Proverbs that contain an echoing of sources

The pool for the drawing of parallel ideas and echoes from the sources is almost inexhaustible, and making use of it depends upon the education of the one performing the proverb and the addressee. A common phenomenon is that informants who are at home with Jewish lore offer the researcher at their own initiative identification of the source, sometimes correct, sometimes wrong.

All the proverbs we found in this group have a parallel message. <sup>13</sup> Sometimes a parallel exists in structure or wording, but when three factors appear together—message, structure, and wording—one can already see this as adaptation. Yet the differentiation between the echoing group and the adapted group is not always sharp and clear.

Below is one of the most common proverbs in Jewish culture, and it demonstrates preservation of the nucleus of the wording:

### Cambio de lughar cambio de mazal (ABT No. 117)

(Change of place, change of *mazzal* [luck])

The informants are convinced that the proverb is "from the Talmud," yet what we found in the Talmud is only the expression "change of place" (Rosh Hashanah 16b). The term "mazzal" is not mentioned, but an opinion appears that change of place "can-

cels" the doom of a person. However, in late halakhic literature we found the assertion, Change of place causes a change in *maz-zal*" (nineteenth century),<sup>14</sup> and it was even formulated as a proverb, "Changes place changes *mazzal*" (twentieth century).<sup>15</sup>

Another example deals with the idea of human covetousness:

### Lo que el ojo ve, el alma lo desea (ABT No. 584)

(What the eye sees, the soul desires)

Echoing in the background is the verse:

So the eyes of man are never satiated (Prov. 27:20).

And the words of the Bible interpreter Rashi on Numbers 15:39:

"The eye sees, the heart desires, and the body commits the sin."

The same message and the same words (the desire of the eye) appear in a famous Talmudic story about Alexander the Great who put a skull on a scale but it did not tip the balance down even against a large amount of gold. Only when he covered the eyes with dust was the skull weighed down (TB, Tamid 32b).

The Hebrew source presents covetousness as negative, but the Haketia text is non-judgmental; moreover, the word "soul" has a positive connotation. The meaning of the proverb as positive or negative depends on the circumstances of its performance: the intent of the one using the proverb, the identity of the addressee, and the reason the proverb is being uttered.

To sum up: these links to canonic Hebrew sources determine the proverb as an essential part of Jewish culture and fit in with the expression of unique group identity; even when the Hebrew elements, which represent the prestigious language, are latent, the continuity of the link to the sources is maintained.

When the collective authority of a proverb relies on a familiar Hebrew source, it gains from the authority of the sacred text, which provides for the educated user a kind of poetic strategy<sup>16</sup> that helps him attain his goal more successfully when performing a proverb in a given situation.

#### 2. Affinities with the Spanish proverb

Ties between speakers of Haketia and Spanish were maintained for generations through commerce and travel, beyond the common geographical origin, the Iberian Peninsula. No wonder Spanish had weighty cultural and linguistic influence on Haketia, including the proverb repertoire.

We compared Spanish proverbs to Haketia proverbs according to four criteria that we determined:

- (a) Message: the general idea, the intention, or the function of the proverb; the message is usually deduced or implicit, and the addressee of the proverb or the investigator must conclude its pragmatic meaning.
- (b) Subject: the issue, the proverb text addresses; the subject relates to the verbal aspect, and it is always explicit.
- (c) Formulation: Syntax and forms of language (grammar).
- (d) Lexicon: the words—mainly nouns, adjectives, and verbs—appearing in the proverb. To determine a common lexicon between proverbs, required are at least two identical words, which are not prepositions, in the two proverbs.

We did not include in the comparison proverbs that have no connection between them, such that there is nothing to compare. Therefore, the four criteria we have proposed do not include 'pattern', since the pattern is abstract and may comprise a number of proverbs that are totally unrelated.

These four criteria enabled us to categorize pairs of Haketia proverbs and Spanish proverbs and to propose twelve types of possible patterns, according to the different or similar characteristics exhibited by them.

A Haketia proverb that differs from its Spanish parallel on all four criteria is usually a proverb that has preserved its original Jewish uniqueness. Differences in the messageand the subject have the greatest effect on the degree of adaptation of the proverbs to Haketia culture.

After classifying pairs of proverbs, we divided them into three categories according to the degree of closeness or distance between the Haketia proverbs and the Spanish proverbs: uniqueness, parallelism, adaptation.

#### (A) Uniqueness

At one end stand the decidedly Jewish proverbs, either because one can identify in them, with certainty, a Hebrew textual source or because their message and theme are unique to the Jewish world, as for example:

Desbañibos, madre, que no vino padre (ABT No. 243) (Cancel, mother, your dip in the bathhouse, for father is not coming).

The word baño in Haketia has two meanings: both the bathhouse and the *mikveh* (ritual bath) which serves for purification dipping of the woman before marital relations with her husband. The "I "-speaker in the proverb addresses the "mother" in second person and informs her that she need not go to the *mikveh*, since the father, her husband, is not coming. One may assume that the speaker is the daughter, since under discussion is a very intimate sphere for which modesty is quite apt, and it is not logical that a son would be party to such a conversation. From the proverb's textual context, it is clear that it is a mikveh, a ritularium for purification, that is being spoken about and not simply bathing, which in traditional society had no special meaning related to the father's arrival. It is unclear whether the daughter's statement has a touch of sadness over the disappointment in store for the mother or whether she is rejoicing at her mother's misfortune; in any event, this is obviously a very loaded statement when directed from a daughter to her mother.

The parallel proverb in Spanish presents a similar message and formulation, and it too is populated with familial figures: father, mother, and "I"-speaker, which is a son or a daughter. But in contrast to the Jewish proverb, in the Spanish one there is a change of functions and the "I"-speaker addresses the father, not the mother:

# Tiraos, padre; posarse ha mi madre (Correas, p. 479) (Go away, Father; because mother has to sit).

From this proverb<sup>17</sup> one discerns tense, hostile relations between the father and the mother. If the son is the speaker, perhaps the saying is alluding to an unconscious wish to dispose of the father in order to gain the mother.

The similarity between the two proverbs, therefore, is noticeable in the structure, the figures (even though their functions are reversed), and the associative reverberation; all other components are different: message # subject # formulation # lexicon=

#### (B) Parallelism

At the other end stand Haketia proverbs whose comparison to their Spanish parallels attests solely to slight differences. The message, subject, formulation, and lexicon are almost identical:

Haketia: Quien madruga el Dió le ayuda (BA, p. 129)<sup>18</sup>

**Spanish: Quien madruga Dios le ayuda (CO. p. 421)**<sup>19</sup> (Whoever rises early, God helps him)

The only difference between the two proverbs is the use of el Dió in contrast to Dios. In popular perception, the expression el Dió, in the singular—in contrast to the Spanish expression, which presents a suffix that is understood as plural—stresses the unique Jewish belief and has connotations of closeness and intimacy. Both proverbs urge people to rise early, with the promise of a reward: God's help. The proverb moves between the two cultures, the Jewish and the Christian, with almost no change. Even though we are dealing with two different religions, which disagree with each other, the adaptation of the proverb to the Jewish group is expressed by the very absorption of the proverb, its selection from among many others, and its being included in the group members' proverb pool'. And since God is mentioned in a universal-general context, not necessarily Jewish or Christian, there was no need to make an essential change in the proverb.

#### (C) Adaptation

Most of the proverbs examined belong to the category of proverbs that were absorbed into the Haketia repertoire after undergoing adaptation processes at various levels as they made their way from Spanish culture to Jewish culture.

We categorized these changes into sub-groups: (c1) pancultural adaptation; (c2) gender adaptation; (C3) profession; (c4) personal adaptation in the speech of the user of the proverb.

We shall cite examples only from the first and last sub-groups:

#### (C1) Pan-Cultural Adaptation

A pan-Jewish and ideological change is found in the following comparison:

### Haketia: Da un palmo al perro, tomará cuatro (ABT No. 192)

(Give one finger to the dog, he will take four)

### Spanish: Al judío dalde un palmo, y tomará cuatro (CO, p. 32)

(The Jew, give him one finger, he will take four)

The two proverbs have one message—condemnation of avarice—but the situation is different, of course. The difference in lexicon, dog versus Jew, derives here from the cultural context and fundamentally changes the proverb's subject and its meaning. The Spanish version stresses the negative stereotype of the avaricious Jew; obviously the Haketia-speaking Jew cannot adopt this Spanish proverb as is.

In the group context of Haketia speakers, the dog is considered a threatening animal, and in Moroccan Jewish proverbs in Judeo-Arabic, it is the nickname for the non-Jews used by Jews. <sup>20</sup> Actually, one may completely ignore the Spanish proverb. Perhaps including it in the Haketia pool, with changes, is a type of correction presenting a Jewish proverb in competition with the Spanish one.

The difference between these two proverbs is actually only in one word, but this is the key word in the proverb; it is the subject of the proverb, and with it both the message of the proverb and its meaning change: message # subject # formulation = lexicon =

#### (C2) Personal Adaptation

### Haketia: El mal del Milano y el papa sano (ABT No. 329)

(Milano with the ill and the Pope among the healthy)

# Spanish: El mal del milano, las alas quebradas y el papo sano (CO p. 286)

(The disease of "Milano", the wings are broken but his crop is healthy)

The Spanish proverb appears in a tripartite pattern that contains three hemistichs and deals with cowards fearing the predatory bird called 'milano' in Spanish. Two interpretations are given for this proverb: (a) the proverb describes a coward who outwardly makes a showy display of bravery that he actually lacks; (b) a person who complains about his state of health ("broken wings")

but still exhibits a healthy appetite.<sup>21</sup> In the Haketia version, the words "Papa" and "Milan" are written in capital letters, i.e., the collector Anita Levy understood the word Milano as the name of the Italian city—and the word 'papo' (stomach, crop), she wrote as the byname Papa, for Pope. It may be that that is how she heard the proverb, but since the use of the word 'milano' meaning predatory bird was exceedingly rare among the Jews of these communities, and since the city Milano was well known, the first part drew a different interpretation, since the pope, el Papa, lives in Italy. Apparently, we are discussing a personal change made by Anita Levy, since we found no parallel of this formulation of the proverb in Haketia. In the Jewish context the proverb applies to the Jews of Milano, who are steeped in distress, while the pope is enjoying himself. This explanation links the proverb to a plethora of folktales concerning the persecuted Jewish community at a time when the Church and its leaders are apathetic to the fate of the Jews and at times responsible for it.<sup>22</sup> The slight change of two letters was enough to create a unique message and subject.

To sum up this section: Undoubtedly, Spanish culture had a great influence on the culture of Haketia speakers; this influence is quite noticeable also in the Haketia proverb repertoire for most of which there are parallels in Spanish. Some of the proverbs were taken in just as they were, with no changes from the Spanish to the Haketia, but the majority went through a process of adaptation and adjustment to Jewish society in general and Haketia society in particular.

### 3. Affinities with the Moroccan Judeo-Arabic and Moroccan Arabic proverb

The Jews who were expelled from Spain and arrived in North Africa had already maintained close relations with the Muslims during the centuries in which they had dwelled together in Spain. These relations grew stronger in an essentially Muslim country and in the close proximity of a community of Judeo-Arabic speakers. These complex affinities, which had deep historical roots and geographical range, were a very convenient basis for intercultural exchange. Indeed, it is no wonder that a substantial portion of the repertoire of Moroccan proverbs, Jewish

and Muslim, appear in the Haketian repertoire. Here, for example, is a parallel proverb which appears in the three cultures:

Haketia: Mas vale tuerto que ciego )ABT No. 659( (Better blind in one eye than blind)

Judeo-Arabic: Among the blind the one-eye person is a king (DA No. 687)<sup>23</sup>

Arabic: Better an absence of one eye than blindness (WES No. 421)<sup>24</sup>

This sharing in part of the proverbs does not prevent the creation of proverbs expressing sharp hostility of one group against another.

In examining the affinity between Haketia proverbs, proverbs in Moroccan Judeo-Arabic, and Moroccan Aabic, we chose to focus on a thematic issue: the rivalry in the relationship between Jews and Muslims. Of course, proverbs of this kind also existed between Christians and Jews.<sup>25</sup> Sometimes the reference is to the same proverb except that its subject is different: what the Muslim thinks of the Jew is what the Jew thinks of the Muslim.

Haketia proverbs scornfully equate the Muslim to an ass; even luxurious garb of gold will not hide the negative nature of the Muslim, and the aim of the Arab is only to exploit the Jew. The proverbs, however, alternate in use of the terms "Muslim" or "Arab". In Judeo-Arabic, the Muslim or the Arab is called a "dog" and advise the Jew to swindle him or to exploit him. Even if sometime one may gain benefit from him, and "there are also good Arabs," it is contemptuously said:

Haketia: Más vale un borro que un moro (ABT No. 661)

(Better one ass than one Muslim)

Haketia: Un moro vestido de oro: moro, moro (ABT No. 1017)

(A Muslim dressed with gold- Muslim, Muslim)

Haketia: Dale a Ahmed que es buen moro (ABT No. 194)

(Give Ahmed because he is a good Arab)

Arabic: Greet an Arab and you've lost a loaf of bread. (BEA p. 102)<sup>26</sup>

Judeo-Arabic: Cheat a non-Jew/the dog and you will make a nice profit. (Chetrit<sup>27</sup>)

The same stereotypes that appear in Jewish proverbs are used in Muslim proverbs in which the Jew is depicted as a swindler who only seeks a way to cheat the innocent Muslim. What the Jew says about the Muslim, the Muslim says about the Jew. Even if the Jew has a refined appearance and is wrapped in gold, he cannot hide his true nature, though at times it is possible to gain some benefit from him.

Arabic: A Jew who succeeded in cheating a Muslim, is happy that day (WES No. 469)

Arabic: Even if a Jew is made of gold, his testicles are brass (WES No. 473)

Arabic: Make friends with a Jew, he is likely to benefit you in one thing or another (WES No. 475)

The most common proverb regarding this subject, one that expresses a decisive and all-inclusive position against Moslems, is

Haketia: No confies en un moro cuarenta años despues de muerto (BC, Nº 97)<sup>28</sup>

(Do not trust a Moslim, not even forty years after death)

A parallel proverb exists in Judeo-Arabic in Morocco:

Judeo-Arabic: Do not trust a Goy (non-Jew) even forty years in grave<sup>29</sup>

The mutual hostility was so strong that both sides were not willing to forgive even those who converted to the other religion.

Judeo-Arabic: Do not trust a Jew who converted to Islam even after forty years (DA No. 2745)<sup>30</sup>

The same proverb appears also in the Muslim society of Morocco:

Arabic: Do not trust a Jew who converted to Islam even after forty years (WES No. 471)<sup>31</sup>

The conditions of distress or the temptations for a career and wealth did motivate Jews in different periods and different locations to convert to Islam. The ideal norm, however, preferred martyrdom over conversion to Islam. The most famous is the beautiful girl Sol (Suleika) Hatuel, from Tangier who made friends with a Muslim woman neighbor, who falsely accused her of conversion to Islam. Sol was therefore taken to the court of the king where she was offered a royal match, but she preferred death instead and she was beheaded.

In Haketia, the story is summarized in the form of a proverb formulated in the opening pattern of "do not trust":

### Haketia: No fiarse en ninguna mora para que no se vea como se vió Sol (ABT No. 737)

(Do not trust a Muslim woman, so you will not find yourself like Sol)

This proverb cannot be understood without acquaintance with the historical background. Except for the familiar opening pattern, the wording of the proverb is unique and it presents a typical gender relation: addressing Jewish women and warning them against Muslim women.

To sum up this section: The function of the proverb in every group as a true expression of collective multi-generational tradition turns it into a powerful social tool that carries a message of segregation and helps erect a barrier between groups. It defines in a clear manner the barriers between "us" (having positive qualities) and "them" (having negative qualities). Paradoxically, the mutual usage of the same pattern of hostility blunts its sharpness.

A comparative layout of these proverbs actually shows a kind of cooperation, which is expressed through a dialogue with the image of the "other" and the image of "oneself". These proverbs, although obviously proverbs of segregation in relation to their content, conduct a cultural dialogue by their common pattern and distribution among people of different faiths.

#### 4. Affinities with the Ladino proverb

The two Judeo-Spanish cultures, the eastern and the western, are sister cultures that have maintained contact during the generations. Books written in Ladino reached North Africa, and travelers

went back and forth between the two foci. However, the main connection was in their common past, in their Spanish origins, a link that is also expressed in the treasury of proverbs.

In this section we will analyze the relation between the proverbs in Haketia and the proverbs in Ladino from a different perspective and different methodology than in the comparisons made above, that of genre and context. We will examine humoristic proverbs about Joha, and see how they operate in the social and in the narrative context in both communities.

While the Ladino proverbs give a starring role to the double-faced figure of Joha, the naïve simpleton and the trickster, in the entire corpus of our Haketia proverbs there are only two about Joha. Instead, we have his feminine counterpart, Aisha or Hasha.

#### (A) The social context

The most common proverb, which has dozens of parallel wordings, is

# *Ladino*: Djoha se fue al banyo, tuvo de kontar mil i un anyo (Koen-Sarano, p. 370)<sup>32</sup>

(Juha went to the bath-house and found what to tell for thousand and one years)

In Haketia this proverb is attributed to Aisha (Asha, Hacha), and the duration is shortened to one year:

# Haketia: Asha fué al baño y trujo para contar para un año (ABT No. 78)

(Asha went to the bath-house and brought what to tell for one year)

All the versions, both in Ladino and Haketia, have a single pattern composed of two parts that end with rhyming words: "baño"~"año". The first part describes an ordinary action common to everyone: going to the public bathhouse. The second part undermines the expectation and causes wonder at the grave importance that the character attributes to the action. In this regard, the structure of the proverb parallels the structure of a joke that has a twist at the end.

The use of a woman figure in the Haketia proverb fits in with the conception of women as being more voluble in nature than men. If the figure of Joha is inferior, all the more so is a woman as a Joha figure. Moreover, the word "baño" in Haketia has a special meaning to the members of the group – not only "public bathhouse", as in Ladino, but also a ritual bath that women immerse in. Perhaps this is another reason that in the Haketia versions, the figure of a woman appears rather than that of a man.

The citing of proverbs on Joha or Aisha in direct reference to the addressee is usually regarded as offensive behavior towards both the addressee and the self-respecting addresser. Therefore, the use of these proverbs is always subject to the rules accepted among the members of the group.

A native Tangier woman described for me an example of the usage of this proverb: When one of her women friends came back from a trip abroad and exhausted the others with trivial details, one of those present whispered this proverb in the ears of her neighbor.

On the other hand, informants among Ladino speakers have testified that they heard this proverb in their childhood from their mothers when they used to talk and tell many stories. However, in that situation (between parents and children) the proverb was uttered out of affection and pride at the linguistic abilities of the child.

Haketia speakers explained that the proverb regarding the public bathhouse was usually told in the third person regarding someone not present, or if present, then in such a way that he would not hear what was said as it was considered a very insulting proverb. Ladino speakers suggested using it in direct address, in the second person, although from a clearly detached stance: the proverb is told by parents to their children, that is, from persons of authority with the aim to educate; the proverb is never addressed in the opposite direction, by children to parents. Both in the second and third persons, the speaker expresses his anger regarding a specific pattern of behavior. The very use of this proverb gives the speaker a critical-judgmental position, and the way it is said has an influence on the reaction of the addressee.

#### (B) The narrative context

As opposed to the use of a proverb in a social behavioral context, it is much easier to transmit the message through a story that demands less involvement than a proverb that is directed at the addressee and makes a response necessary.

Because of the widespread Joha stories, there is no need to tell the entire story as the community already knows it. It is sufficient to summarize its moral as a proverb.

The proverb can appear: (a) outside the story's inner plot: in the opening of the story, and then the plot illustrates the proverb, or at the end of the story as summarizing its moral. In these cases, a proverb can be attached to a certain story, for example, a Joha story, but it can function in other contexts as well. (b) A proverb within the story, linked essentially to it, can appear in the mouth of one of the figures or in the mouth of the intra-plot narrator. The same proverb can even function in both possibilities alternatively. For example, among Haketia speakers the following proverb is an intra-story proverb placed in Joha's mouth

### Si tu sos ajo, yo soy piedra que te majo (ABT No. 965)

(If you are garlic, I am the stone that crushes you.)

Joha sells his house at an especially low price but on the condition that there will remain on one wall of the house one nail that will belong solely to him. Every night Joha comes and hangs the carcass of an animal on the nail. The buyers, who cannot stand it anymore, leave without asking for their money back, so Joha pours salt on their wounds and recites this proverb to them.<sup>33</sup>

But in Ladino, this is an independent proverb serving as an introduction to a story about a competition of lies. The friend relates that he saw a cabbage so large that ten people could not encompass it with their hands, while Joha responds that he bought a bowl for his wife which if it is struck on one side, no one hears the hits on the other. "What will they do with such a bowl?" asks the friend. "They will put the cabbage you saw in it," replies Joha. In Ladino, the narrator chose to open this story with the above-discussed proverb:

### Si tu sos ajo, yo se piedra ke te majo<sup>34</sup>

(If you are garlic, I am the stone that crushes you.)

The proverb is not mentioned in the body of the story and is not vital to the plot. Its application to this story is one possibility of many. Conversely, there are proverbs that are essential to the story and cannot be understood without being familiar with it. Yet, the story became so well known that the proverb functions even without the story. For example, a proverb from within a

very well-known story, in both Haketia and Ladino, is the proverb in which Joha sends chickens by themselves to his home in honor of his wedding.

### Kish Kish para caza gaillnas para la boda $^{35}$

(Kish Kish to home, chickens to the wedding)

The proverb was put in Joha's mouth twice, once he says it to the chickens, and once he quotes to his mother what he said to the chickens. The proverb was so widespread among members of the community that a meta-proverb was created based on knowledge of this proverb, and it is said regarding someone who has been charged with a task that he is incapable of doing and believes things will be accomplished by themselves.

### Que te crees—? Que kish kish para caza?<sup>36</sup>

(What do you think??? That Kish kish to home)

To sum up this section: Laughter fulfills two important but contradictory social functions. On one hand, it contributes to the preservation of accepted norms in the group, and on the other, it can be used by the individual as a means of finding refuge from the tyranny of those norms. It is no wonder, therefore, that Joha and Aisha are presented with double faces: mischievous – working for their own benefit and rebelling against the norms of society, its laws and values; and naive – incapable of dealing with the complicated laws of society and caught in ridiculous situations.

#### 5. Haketia proverbs that have no parallels

We end our discussion with the proverbs for which we found no counterpart either in Hebrew, Spanish, Judeo-Arabic, Arabic, or Ladino. We focus on the group of proverbs that include personal names and we refer to them as 'provnames'.

Provnames outstandingly represent Haketian proverbs, especially those proverbs and expressions that appear in names embedded in the life of the community and relate to real characters and events. Such proverbs are not understood by people outside the community, and they therefore create a kind of a communal idiosyncratic language that clearly marks the borders of communal identity, uniting the group from within and differentiating it from other groups outside it. For example:

# Como el sastre David cosia de balde y ponia tambien el filo de su parte (ABT No. 145)

(Just as David the tailor who sewed without pay, and also gave the thread as a gift)

This proverb refers to the figure of a craftsman, a tailor, who is familiar only to members of the community and his behavior is embodied in a proverb that means a man works hard and not only that he does not gain anything, he also gives the client a gift. Thus the proverb becomes an example of everyday reality, since as a text it has no need of a personal name, and can be formulated as a general statement.

We divided all; the provnames within the corpus into two main categories: (1) names from reality divided into four groups: 1.1 names with historical reference; 1.2 historical names which refer to the community; 1.3 names which refer to the community without reference to history; 1.4 names without reference to the community or to history; (2) fictional names divided into two groups: 2.1 literary names; 2.2 "no-names"-artificial names.

#### 1. Names from reality

1.1 Names taken from Jewish history: These are known names from canonical Hebrew sources – such as Moses, Menahem, Hannah, Rachel – on condition that they appear in a proverb with the historical context. The salient characteristic of Haketian provnames, as opposed to proverbs in Ladino, is the infrequent usage of names within the historical connection. A rare example in Haketia:

### **Todos salimos de Eva (BA, Nº 532)**<sup>37</sup> (We all came from EVE)

The text of the proverb clearly refers to the biblical Eve.

1.2 Names taken from the canonic texts but in the Haketic proverb they change their function from the canonic context to the community context. In the following proverb, the names Shimon and Pinhas are mentioned, not as biblical heroes, but rather as ordinary characters, as people who deal with simple tasks:

Lo que sacó Pinhas del luban, y Ximoon de las cafeteras (BA, Nº 322)<sup>38</sup>

(What Pinhas earned from the resin and Shimon from the coffee pots)

This is told about people who waste their meager profits.

1.3 Names used in the community which are not taken from Jewish heritage are usually foreign names from Spanish or Arabic given to women, like Oriko or Jamila.

# De todo tiene Orico hat-ta alheña en el culico (ABT No. 232) (Orico has everything, even henna on her buttocks)

1.4 Sometimes the proverbs use generic names that have no historical background but are also not common in the community, such as Pedro, Juan, Miguel, or Maria.

# **De dia en dia se casa Maria (ABT No. 208= BA 155)** (From one day to day Maria weds)

Said about a repeated promise that is never fulfilled or about a hope that never comes true. The most common formulations of this proverb are the ones without a private name.

#### 2. Fictional names that have no real reference:

The second category of proverbs employing names is the use of fictional names. Here we find artificial names that were invented for the purpose of rhyme or alliteration, for example:

### Sholo y mollo y capi aburacado (ABT No. 980) (Sholo and Molo and a tattered coat)

One of the informants provided a context for the use of the proverb by the example: "Who went to this party? Sholo and Molo, the most wretched people, and in torn coats filled with holes."

Sometimes general nouns are used as personal names.

### Bazineta, donde no te llaman, no te metas (ABT No. 89)

(Bowl, if no one calls you to come to the place, don't push)

A diachronic discussion of proverbs containing names demonstrates, in our opinion, the following development: at first the name is the name of a person living and functioning in the community who has a certain characteristic that creates a proverb.

This is the biographical stage reflecting actual reality. So, for example, according to the testimony of informants, there lived in Tetuán an unfortunate streets weeper who was always crying and complaining about his bitter fate, and his name was Menahem. In the next stage, the figure is severed from reality and becomes a literary figure with a particular characteristic. This is the stage in which the name melds with the proverb.

### El bien va al bien y el cisco a Menahem (ABT Mo. 285)

(The good goes to the good and the filth to Menahem)

In the third stage, the name is disengaged from the proverb and gains independent existence based on familiarity with the proverb; this is the stage of lexicalization. The private name becomes a lexeme indicating a trait or attribute. The name Menahem becomes an indicator of wretchedness. If someone begins to cry and complain, they say to him:

### Ya esta Menahem<sup>39</sup>

(He has already become Menahem)

If someone has a distorted, sour faced, people say "cara de Menahem" (The face of Menahem). 40

In the final part of this article we would like to demonstrate the principles that we indicated above through a multi-level analysis of one proverb:

### Juró Rahel por menahem (ABT No. 500)

(Rachel swore by Menahem)

We did not find any counterpart for this proverb in other groups of Judeo-Spanish speakers. According to one explanation, the proverb was applied to a stubborn man, who does not give up until he gets what he wants. According to another explanation, the meaning of the proverb is **šebuá de balde** (an oath in vain). The use of names such as Rachel and Menachem enables us to understand the proverb on the three levels we offered in the above model:

On the historical level, the biblical Rachel is a young maiden who was cheated, who suffers while waiting for her beloved spouse; she is the preferred woman, the barren woman who was late in childbearing, and the mother who died young, whose husband is inconsolable. On this level the statement refers to "Rachel was promised a comforter." The biblical Rachel was promised comfort, someone to comfort her ('menahem' in verb form which means in Hebrew: comforter). And the comfort is given: Rachel bears two sons.

On the mythical level, Rachel becomes the symbol for the mother of all the Jewish people suffering in exile: "Rachel weeping for her children refused to be comforted for her children because they were not" (Jeremiah 31:15). In Kabbalah (Jewish mysticism), Rachel represents the emanation of Kingdom (royalty), the Shechina in exile, the Community of Israel who longs to unite with the emanation Tiferet (Beauty), which is Jacob, or the Holy One Blessed be He, in order to bring about the redemption. Rachel appears as the Mother of Israel until today, and not only on the literary level, but even in everyday behavior. The Tomb of Rachel is visited by barren women who wish to become childbearing like Rachel and receive as a charm a piece of red thread that is wound around the tomb.

The biblical Menahem, King of Israel (2 Kings 15) is far less known than Rachel. But on the mythical level of Menahem as redeemer, the name has profound meaning: Menahem is the name for the month of Av (Menahem-Av) on the basis of the belief that the Messiah would come during the month of Av, the month when the Temple was destroyed. Moreover, Menahem is one of the names for the Messiah himself.

On the communal level, the reference is to ordinary and widespread names without any significance. The name Menahem becomes for Haketia speakers the lexeme for a person who is pursued by troubles, based on the biography of a certain miserable street sweeper living in Tetuán:

#### Siempre Menahem en ayuno (ABT No. 970)

(Menahem is always fasting)

This is a pessimist who only foresees evil times, but changing the pronunciation creates an entirely different interpretation:

### Siempre Menahem hay uno (ABT No. 971)

(There is always one Menahem)

Even in this atmosphere of ridicule (the miserable Menahem), it is impossible to disregard the Jewish cultural significance echoing in the background (Menahem the Messiah). The gap between the two levels increases the irony. We expected the Messiah and here comes the miserable Menahem.

Parallel with the lowly figure of Menahem is the lowly figure of Rachel in the well-known Haketic song that opens with the words "estando Rachel lastimoza" (Rachel the poor one). Rachel is also pursued by troubles.

In spite of the opposition between the different levels, one cannot overlook the link between them. The promise to Rachel has no value; the promise made to the biblical Rachel was broken (Genesis 29:25) and she herself broke trust by stealing the idol images of her father (Genesis 31:19). The promise of messianic days has still not been fulfilled.

Through the use of these two names the hope for redemption is liable to resound also on the level of ridicule. In this way, ironic tension is created between hope and desire and between despair and sarcasm.

This proverb is hardly used any more. It seems that because of its enigmatic character for those outside the group, the proverb has not transcended the confines of time and space. This is an outstanding example for a unique Haketian proverb understood only among members of the group.

Presenting a proverb as a provname by changing a concept in a private name or by attributing a general proverb to a certain figure turns it into a means of expression of group identity. Provnames in Haketia, therefore, are an additional channel through which speakers of the language express there uniqueness as a distinct Sephardic community.

#### To summarize

The Sephardic communities in northern Morocco are a unique group which considers itself prestigious and pedigreed versus the other Jewish communities of the Maghreb. Over time and owing to geographical proximity many influences from Judeo-Arabic culture penetrated (including also Arab-Muslim culture) both the language and mores of Sephardi Moroccan

Jews. Yet, despite their linguistic distinctiveness, they maintained connections with their Ladino-speaking brethren in the eastern communities. Moreover, Haketia hold a middle position between Ladino and Judeo-Arabic. This middle standing is expressed not only in linguistic characteristics but also in the cultural details, including the choice of proverbs and their methods of literary design.

The proverb, like every folklore unit, moves between the universal and the local, between the permanent and the variable. The process of change is the process of vitality, the process that folklore undergoes to adapt itself to time and place, and in this way it becomes the cultural tool of a specific group.<sup>41</sup>

In order to determine the uniqueness of the Haketian proverb as characteristic of the members of a group, we examined its affinities with proverbs of other five cultures with which the Haketia speakers were in contact: Hebrew, Spanish, Ladino, Judeo-Arabic, and Arabic. We documented and published 1,040 proverbs in Haketia, each proverb accompanied with parallel proverbs from the five cultures noted. To each proverb we added a translation into Hebrew and an interpretation indicating the use of the proverb, as given by the members of the community. We examined those proverbs that were accepted into the Haketian repertoire and the processes of changes and modifications they underwent so as to be incorporated. The last group we examined was the proverbs for which we did not find any counterpart, most of them being understood only within communal usage, and therefore forming a kind of a communal idiosyncratic language that clearly marks the boundaries of group identity, uniting the group from within and differentiating it from other groups outside it. The complex interrelationships between all the parts within this multi-cultural cluster are what create the unique ethnic identity of Haketian speakers, an identity in which one of its most salient channels of expression is the proverb.

#### Notes

<sup>1</sup>This article is based on the book by Tamar Alexander and Yaakov Bentolila, La Palabra en su hora es oro – El refrán judeo-español en el Norte de Marruecos (Jerusalem: Ben-Zvi Institute, 2008). The book includes an analysis written in Hebrew accompanied by a summary in Spanish, 1,040 proverbs written in Judeo-Spanish (Hakitia), parallel proverbs in Hebrew, Spanish, Ladino, Arabic, and Judeo-Arabic.

<sup>2</sup>J. Benoliel. *Dialecto judeo-hispano-marroquí o hakitía*. Madrid, 1977), ed. R. Benazeraf; Alegria Bendelac, *Diccionario del Judeoespañol de los Safardíes del Norte de Marruecos*, (Caracas: Centro de estudios sefardíes de Caracas, 1995); Y. Bentolila, "Le composant hébraïque dans le judéo-espagnol marocain," in *Judeo-Romance Languages*, ed. Isaac Benabu and Joseph Sermoneta (Jerusalem: Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Misgav Yerushalayim, 1985), pp. 27–40; Y. Bentolila, "The Hebrew Elements in Hakitia" [in Hebrew], *Miqqedem Umiyyam*, Hebrew Elements in Jewish Languages, 5 (1992): 59–66.

<sup>3</sup>Y. Bentolila, "Le processus d'hispanisation de la *hakétia* à la lumière de quelques sources littéraires," in *Linguistique des langues juives et linguistique générale*, sous la direction de F. Alvarez-Péreyre et J. Baumgarten (Paris: CNRS editions, 2003), pp. 247–65. Y. Bentolila, "The Study of Moroccan Judeo-Spanish (Hakitia)," *Mikan* 8 – *Studies in Sephardic Culture*, *El Prezente* 1 (2007): 159–64; Y. Bentolila. "Haketia (in Judeo-Spanish)," *Encyclopedia of Jews in the Islamic World*, exec. ed. Norman A. Stillman (Brill, 2011). Brill Online. Ben-Gurion University of the Negev. 16 January 2011: http://brillonline.nl/subscriber/entry?entry=ejiw\_COM-0012390

<sup>4</sup>Imrich Dénes, "Toward the Typology of Literary Textual Adaptations" [in Hebrew], *Hasifrut* 28 (1979): 70–75.

<sup>5</sup>All proverbs are taken from our book: Alexander Bentolila (above n. 1). The number refers to the proverb number in our collection (pp. 91–421).

<sup>6</sup>In Morocco no editions of the Bible were printed in Ladino; the Jews usually used editions that were published in Leghorn characterized by minor phonological and lexical adjustments that made them fit for Maghrebi Sephardi communities.

<sup>7</sup>Spanish parallels: G. Correas, *Refranero Clásico Español*, ed. F.C.R. Maldonado (Madrid, 1974).

Cuando Dios da la llaga, da el remedio que la sana (Nº 492)

(When God gives the affliction, he gives the medicine that will cure us.)

J. G. Campos, A. Barella, Diccionario de Refranes (Madrid, 1993, 1995).

Dios, que da la llaga, da la medicina (N° 1373)

(God who gives the affliction, gives the medicine)

<sup>8</sup>R. Benazeraf, Refranero: Recueil de proverbes judéo-espagnols du Maroc (Madrid, 1975).

<sup>9</sup>In Spanish: Dádivas quebrantan peñas. El dar quebranta las peñas. El dar quiebra las piedras. Dádivas ablandan peñas (CB, N° 1175). Campos and Barella, *Diccionario de Refranes* (above note 7).

<sup>10</sup>See Alexander, T., and Y. Bentolila, "Personal Names in Proverbs," in *Pleasant Are Their Names, Jewish Names in the Sephardi Diaspora*, ed. A. Demsky (Bethesda, 2010), pp. 233–62.

<sup>11</sup> The concept "correlation" is taken from the article by Peter Seitel in which he proposes it as an instrument for the analysis of proverbs in whose formulation a concrete grammatical personal pronoun, such as "I", "you", or "they", was selected. P. Seitel, "Proverbs: A Social Use of Metaphor," *Genre*, 2 (1964): 143–61; also in W. Mieder, A. Dundes (eds.), *The Wisdom of the Many* (New York & London, 1981), pp. 122–39.

<sup>12</sup>M. Koén-Sarano, *Djohá ke dize? Kuentos populares djudeo-espanyoles* [What Does Joha Say? Popular Sephardic Tales] (Jerusalem: Kana, 1991), p. 330.

<sup>13</sup>This is not an imperative condition. It can be that two proverbs have an identical structure but different messages. For example, the following two proverbs are constructed on a pattern of double or triple negation, but the message and wording are completely different: Ni martes sin sol ni amor sin dolor ("No Tuesday without sun and no love without pain") (Alexander collection, from her mother); Ni obra buena ni palabra mala ("Not a good deed and not a bad word.") (Campos and Barella, *Diccionario de Refranes* (above n. 7), N° 2511).

<sup>14</sup>Responsa *Yehuda Ya'aleh*, pt. 2, Even ha-Ezer, Hoshen Mishpat 123.

<sup>15</sup>Responsa *Divrei Yatsiv*, pt. 10, par. 238.

<sup>16</sup>Seitel, 'Proverbs' (above n. 11).

<sup>17</sup>The situation in the proverb is reminiscent of the Belfagor story (AT1164), published by in 1544, in which the son's devil chases his father from the sick princess's bed, telling him that mother is coming and as a result saves the princess's life.

<sup>18</sup>Benazeraf, *Refranero* (above note 8).

<sup>19</sup>Correas, *Refranero Clásico Español* (above n. 7).

<sup>20</sup>J. Chétrit, "Tradition du discourse et discourse de la tradition dans les communutés juives du Maroc," in Communication in the Jewish Diaspora: The Pre-Modern World, ed. S. Menashe (Leiden, 1996), pp. 339–407; idem, J. Chétrit, "Dire proverbial et dire méta-textuel – Analyse socio-pragmatique de proverbs judéo-marocains," Cahiers de Littéraure Orale, 44 (1998): 143–71.

<sup>21</sup>Campos & Barella, Diccionario de Refranes (above n. 7), p. 214.

<sup>22</sup>T. Alexander, The Heart is a Mirror – The Sephardic Folktale (Detroit, 2008), pp. 478 520.

<sup>23</sup>H. Dahan, Otzar pitgamim shel yehudey Maroko [The Proverbs of the Jews from Morocco] (Tel Aviv, 1983).

<sup>24</sup>E. Westermarck, Wit and Wisdom in Morocco – A Study in Native Proverbs (London, 1930).

<sup>25</sup>For a discussion on this group of proverbs in Ladino and Spanish, see T. Alexander, "'Do Not Trust X,' Inter-Cultural Confrontation and Prejudice: Between Judeo Spanish Proverbs & Hispanic Proverbs," Shefa Tal Studies in Jewish Thought and Culture presented to Bracha Sack, (Beersheba: Ben-Gurion University Press, 2004), pp. 349–79.

<sup>26</sup>I. Ben Ami, "One thousand and One Jewish Proverbs from Morocco," in Folklore Research Center Studies, vol. 1, eds. D. Noy and I. Ben Ami (Jerusalem: The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, 1970), pp. 35–149 [in Hebrew].

<sup>27</sup>Chetrit, "Tradition du discourse."

<sup>28</sup>A. Bendelac, Voces Jaquetiescas (Caracas, 1990).

<sup>29</sup>Told by Naftali Alon, a Moroccan Je

<sup>30</sup>I. Benabu, "Humorous Tales from Morocco in Western Judeo Spanish: A Linguistic Study," Jerusalem Studies in Jewish Folklore 5-6 (1984): 123–50.

<sup>31</sup>Koen Sarano, Djohá ke dize? (above n. 32), pp. 280–81.w.

<sup>32</sup>Dahan, Proverbs of the Jews (above n. 23; No. 2745).

<sup>33</sup>Westermarck, Wit and Wisdom in Morocco (above n. 26).

<sup>34</sup>M. Koén-Sarano, Djohá ke dize? Kuentos populares djudeo-espanyoles (Jerusalem, 1991).

<sup>35</sup>In Ladino: Koen Sarano, Djohá ke dize? (above note 32), p. 138; in Haketia: G. Pimienta, "Djoha en haketia," Aki Yerushalayim, 76 (2004): 34–38.

```
<sup>36</sup>Pimienta (see note above) p. 35
```

Tamar Alexander
Gaon Center for Ladino Culture
The Hebrew Literature Department
Ben Gurion University of the Negev
P.O.B. 653
84105 Beer Sheva
Israel
E-mail: talex@bgu.ac.il

Yaakov Bentolila Kfar Maimon 85153 Doar Na Hanegev Israel

E-mail: bentoli@bgu.ac.il

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup>Benazeraf, Refrano (above n. 8).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup>Benazeraf, Refrano (above n. 8).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup>Field work.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup>Field work.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup>A model for examining folklore as an expression for ethnic identity is offered in the book by T. Alexander, Heart is a Mirror (above n. 21) pp. 3–24.