

# How public libraries deliver value online: the perception of librarians<sup>1</sup>

## Mare Lundsfryd Nielsen

University of Southern Denmark, Department of Design and Communication

Universitetsparken 1, 6000 Kolding, Denmark

marielundsfryd@gmail.com

## Marie Cecilie Lensch

University of Southern Denmark, Department of Design and Communication

Universitetsparken 1, 6000 Kolding, Denmark

marie.cecilie.lensch@live.dk

## Tove Faber Frandsen

University of Southern Denmark, Department of Design and Communication

Universitetsparken 1, 6000 Kolding, Denmark

t.faber@sdu.dk

Libellarium 14, 1 (2023): 51–68

UDK: 027.022:021:004.9=111

Prethodno priopćenje / Preliminary Scientific Report

Primljeno / Received: 29. 3. 2023.

Prihvaćeno / Accepted: 4. 7. 2023.

doi: 10.15291/libellarium.4157



## Abstract

**Purpose.** The development and usage of digital library services have accelerated. Many libraries have expanded their digital services in response to the COVID-19 pandemic. The physical locations were closed or operated with reduced capacity and libraries continued to provide services digitally. The physical locations of many libraries have reopened but the development of digital services persists. Most libraries offer a wide variety of services digitally and many libraries are expanding their digital services. It is, therefore, relevant to explore how librarians perceive the digital public library services offered at their institutions and how the digital services supplement or replace services in the physical library.

**Approach/methodology/design.** This study presents the findings of an interview-based study with five librarians from different public libraries across Denmark.

<sup>1</sup> The paper was presented at the conference LIDA – Libraries in the Digital Age that was held in Osijek in May 2023.

**Findings.** The findings show that librarians perceive the physical and digital services as means to the same end while carefully considering the content, target audience and platform when offering services to their users. They see the digital services as a critical aspect of the *raison d'être* of the library and means to attract new users.

**Research limitations.** It is important to note that this study is based on a small sample.

**Practical implications.** The implications for digital public library services are discussed and recommendations based on this study are considered.

**Originality/value.** While many studies have explored librarians' perceptions of the value of public libraries, this study focuses on librarians' perception of the value of digital libraries and how these services supplement or replace the physical library.

**KEYWORDS:** Covid-19, Denmark, digital services, public libraries, value of public libraries

## 1. Introduction

Digital resources have brought many changes in libraries and have reshaped the structure as well as the form of libraries (Kehinde, 2018). Mickiewicz (2015, 239) describes these changes as follows: "...libraries are no longer 'just libraries,' but a hybrid of different specializations and services that have come together to create a new public space." Calhoun (2014, 18) emphasizes that digital libraries support the advancement of knowledge as well as culture. Libraries play a key role in an information society as they offer services that enable the users to evaluate and use information to create knowledge (Ottonicar, da Silva, and Barboza, 2018) and public libraries are the most used cultural institutions in many countries (Audunson et al., 2019). Libraries are an integral part of the infrastructure of the public sphere, providing public access to culture and knowledge, acting as agents for enlightenment, and serving as public meeting places in their communities (Audunson et al., 2020).

Some have expressed concerns that libraries would become obsolete with the expansion of digital archives (Brindley, 2002). However, libraries play a key role in an information society as they offer services that enable users to evaluate and use information to create knowledge (Ottonicar, da Silva, and Barboza, 2018). Leorke, Wyatt, and McQuire (2018, 37) argue that "libraries have turned out to be highly adaptable institutions that have not only survived the digital revolution, but are helping to shape it."

According to Sørensen (2021) digitalization is among the reasons for examining public library values, and the studies exploring the values of libraries acknowledge the digital services as a value, however, they are not addressed explicitly. The stakeholders of the library may have varying ideas of the library, as demonstrated in many studies on the roles and perceived benefits of public libraries (for recent reviews, see Stenstrom, Cole, and Hanson, 2019; Sørensen, 2020). The value of libraries falls into three intersecting categories: support for personal advancement, support for vulnerable populations, and support for community development (Stenstrom, Hole, and Hanson, 2019). Mathiasson and Jochumsen (2020) argue that public library programs exist between the library collections and the connections they foster. Libraries are valued not only for their input, e.g. the collections, buildings and staff (Frandsen and Sørensen, 2020; Sørensen, 2020, Goulding, 2009), but

also for being a phenomenon that, according to Fowler (2016), can be seen as an experience that continues to evolve with every intentional act. Chow and Tian (2021) present a study where they build associations with library data to community-wide analytics on quality of life and find clear statistical support that public libraries in North Carolina are significantly linked to their community's quality of life.

Many public libraries can be characterized as hybrid libraries, trying to create a space where the analog and digital coexist (Palfrey, 2015). A library thus typically consists both of a physical and a digital library offering their users a wide range of physical and digital services, also known as resources. Physical and digital spaces are, therefore, often studied separately (Wilkinson and Breneman, 2020). Many digital library services, such as training, tend to be available to users only in a library facility (Audunson et al., 2020), and libraries cannot necessarily translate the physical library into a digital library (Mestre, 2022; Nowé Hedvall, Ögland, and Lindberg, 2022). Stachokas (2014) argues that the transition from print to digital needs to be planned very carefully to ensure that access to information is enhanced rather than reduced. Until recently, many library directors did not expect the fully digital library in their lifetime (e.g. Bahr, 2000), partly because the physical library offers context and provides a sensory understanding of knowledge.

In recent years, the minimization of face-to-face contact brought on by the COVID-19 pandemic has forced all types of libraries to develop a wider variety of digital services that do not require physical presence at a library facility. The lockdowns across the world during the COVID-19 pandemic have accelerated the development of digital library services, and it is, therefore, relevant to revisit the value of the public library with a specific focus on the digital public library. The aim of the present study is to explore how librarians perceive the value of digital public library services offered at their institution and how they supplement or replace services in the physical library.

The following section contains a literature review on digital library services developed during or following the COVID-19 pandemic, focusing on the experiences of librarians, management and users.

---

## 2. Related literature: library services during COVID-19

There are many studies reporting on how libraries have responded to the minimization of face-to-face contact brought on by the COVID-19 pandemic by developing a wider variety of digital services that do not require physical presence at a library facility. Nadi-Ravandi and Batooli (2022) identify 225 articles in the subject area of libraries and COVID-19 indexed in Scopus. They find that four important aspects of libraries have been considered in these studies including “the role of libraries and librarians in Covid-19,” “social activities (social media),” “online services” and “misinformation.” Similarly, an earlier review identifies 23 studies of services offered by libraries, the technological tools used, and the challenges facing libraries during the pandemic (Ayeni, Agbaje, Tippler, 2021). They find that libraries are adapting in a number of ways to meet the needs of their patrons despite the growing challenges posed by COVID-19 restrictions and lockdown. Ortega-Martínez et al. (2021) present a critical review of the digital services adapted by the Mexican libraries in response to the lockdowns caused by COVID-19, and show how libraries focused on preventive meas-

ures for the return to activities, management and use of collections, security measures, healthy distance and the implementation of digital services.

Reid and Mesjar (2022) capture the responses of public libraries in Scotland to the lockdown in 2020 and find that, despite difficulties, great efforts have been made to sustain the communities that they serve. Similarly, Kou, Chen, and Pan (2021) report on how Wuhan public libraries adapted to the forced closure of libraries during lockdowns. They find that the three libraries set up library emergency management, provided scientific information on the virus, offered online reading and cultural activities, and reached out to the communities. Jamali et al. (2021), Garner et al. (2021) and Wakeling et al. (2022) demonstrate that Australian public libraries introduced new services and expanded existing ones, particularly digital services. While facing many staffing and human resources challenges during COVID-19, the libraries learned and improved their services during the pandemic, resulting in strengthened organizational capabilities. Palumbo (2022) reports that Italian libraries offered virtual reading groups, online laboratories and social networking which attracted users. Haasio and Kannasto (2020) find that some libraries were able to react quickly during the pandemic and provide new operational forms in an online environment. Ćirić and Ćirić (2021) argue that the increased usage of digital content during the pandemic enables increased educational, informative, and cultural engagement of the communities the libraries serve.

COVID-19 can, therefore, be seen as a catalyst for the adaptation of libraries (Casselden, 2022; Dalmer, Sawchuk, and Ly, 2022). Mandel (2021) reports increased use of geographic information systems by libraries to support information sharing during the pandemic and argues that this is an example of creative solutions for remote service provision. Mehta and Wang (2020) find that digital libraries can have the potential to provide richer e-content and online services, although the digital library did not succeed in replacing the physical library. Leguina, Mihelj, and Downey (2021) argue that public libraries are among key sites for the acquisition of cultural capital and are essential for addressing inequality. They further argue that the changing technological environment may affect the ability of libraries to effectively use digitalization to tackle inequality. Casselden (2022) argues that COVID-19 has accelerated the shift towards digital technology which intensifies the digital exclusion and argues that digital skills training, support, and access to equipment and internet is needed to tackle the digital exclusion. However, a large quantitative study of Danish library users finds inequality in families' takeout of digital children's books from public libraries during COVID-19 (Jaeger and Blaabaek, 2020).

Libraries in developing countries have struggled with what Ameen (2021) terms the worst-case scenario. Many library users in developing countries have limited access to the internet, rendering online services inaccessible to them which may contribute to widening the disparity (Rafiq et al., 2021). In an interview study Kohlburn et al. (2023) finds that the five most frequently occurring challenges for libraries during the pandemic, as perceived by the librarians, were infrastructural problems, inadequate budgets, inadequate safety equipment, lack of awareness and damage of resources. Ameen (2021) argues that countries like Pakistan, among other developing countries, have realized the importance of digital equality, digital literacy and news literacy.

Library closures and the development of a wider variety of digital services obviously affected the users. Libraries remained open during the pandemic virtually, but as shown by Dalmer, Sawchuk, and Ly (2022) some library users who typically read physical mag-

azines in the library chose not to switch to digital platforms. Some lacked the technical proficiency to do so, whereas others preferred physical material and thus often stopped reading magazines completely. Ruthven, Robinson, and McMenemy (2022) explore how the increased use of replacement digital services and the forced closure of UK libraries during the pandemic affected library use. Using data from focus groups, they find that the UK library users value different aspects of digital and physical services. The study (Ruthven, Robinson, and McMenemy, 2022) explores the advantages and disadvantages of digital and physical services as perceived by the users. Among the advantages is that the digital resources are characterized by the users as being immediately available, light weight and a useful supplement to physical books. Among the disadvantages, the users mention general usability, concerns over the effect of too much screen reading on their eyes, concerns over accessibility, lack of interoperability and screen size. The advantages of the physical services are many, according to the users, and include shared community space, a community information hub, social spaces, physicality, are secure, friendly, and staffed by helpful staff. There were a small number of disadvantages expressed about the library services including being accessible only during opening hours, local management of libraries and volunteers lacking training. Consequently, the users may see the digital services complementing the physical services or even prefer them; but it matters to them if they are physical or digital. During the lockdowns, the library users in New South Wales, Australia missed many different aspects of the library, in particularly browsing the shelves, taking children for visits, studying, reading, and socializing (Hider et al., 2022). But users also missed the quiet, relaxing, and friendly environment, and the resources available. The lockdowns obviously impacted the lending of physical materials. McMenemy, Robinson, and Ruthven (2023) find that the lending, and thus likely also reading, of physical books decreased considerably during lockdowns and the rise in e-lending did not fully compensate for this decrease.

The closures also impacted the library staff. Some librarians were not prepared for or even willing to close the library and deliver digital replacement services (Tammaro, 2021). Stevenson (2022) presents the results of a survey study of frontline worker experiences with the resumption of services of their library following lockdown in 2020. The results show that communications broke down between management and frontline staff at one of North America's largest public library systems and the frontline workers described negative feelings, perceptions and assumptions. Similarly, Garner et al. (2022) explore the lived experiences of Australian public library staff during the COVID-19 library closures and find that the Australian public library workers experienced many challenges that affected their well-being during the period of library closures. On the other hand, Norwegian librarians expressed satisfaction with the responses of their institution to the pandemic as well as their own effort during the pandemic (Evjen et al., 2021).

In summary, the COVID pandemic accelerated the development of digital services in public libraries. However, it also accelerated the shift towards digital technology, widening thereby potential digital gaps. In some countries the public libraries provide access to computers and internet to people who do not have access at home. In other countries, the libraries can offer assistance with access to digital public services. However, when the libraries are in lockdown these users may not necessarily use the digital replacement services offered by the library. Therefore, libraries need to consider how to be more accessible to tackle digital exclusion. Finally, users may prefer physical materials and, therefore, choose not

to use them if only available digitally. With the acceleration of digital library services, this study finds it timely to explore how librarians perceive the value of the digital public library services offered at their institution and how they supplement or replace services in the physical library.

### 3. Methods

Interviews were conducted with five public librarians from five different Danish libraries located across the country. One of the interviewees is currently head of a library whereas the other interviewees are librarians. The interviewees in this study are considered information-rich cases for in-depth study (Gentles et al., 2015), because they all work with the development of digital services in public libraries and can share relevant information in relation to the research questions of this study.

For the purpose of this study, a semi-structured interview guide was developed in five phases following Kallio et al. (2016): (1) identifying the prerequisites for using semi-structured interviews; (2) retrieving and using previous knowledge; (3) formulating the preliminary semi-structured interview guide; (4) pilot testing the guide; and (5) presenting the complete semi-structured interview guide. Following the decision to collect data using semi-structured interviews, an interview guide was drafted and pilot tested in an interview of a recently trained librarian. The interview guide was then used for the interviews with the five librarians. The first interview was conducted in January 2022, and the last in January 2023.

All participants signed a consent document in which they consented to their conversation being recorded and used for research purposes. The interview guide consisted of an introduction to the study and a presentation of the interviewee, followed by questions falling within three themes: (1) the purpose of developing and working with digital services, (2) the librarians' perception of their users and target audience, and (3) the librarians' characterization good digital services. The first theme explores the digital services offered at the library of the interviewee and their involvement in the work with developing digital services. Furthermore, the interviewees are asked about their perception of which and why the library should offer digital services. The second theme explores how users are involved in the development of services and how the perception of the users is considered when the librarians are working with the digital services. Finally, the third theme focuses on how the interviewee would like to develop digital library services in the years to come and how the interviewee would characterize successful digital services.

The interviews were conducted in Danish and quotes were translated into English for this publication. On average, interviews lasted approximately 30 minutes (although some extended to 60 minutes). The interviews were audiotaped, transcribed, and analyzed. Following Boyatzis (1998), there are three stages of thematic analysis: Stage I involves deciding on sampling and design issues; Stage II involves developing themes and a code; and Stage III involves validating and using the code. According to Boyatzis (1998) a thematic code can be developed theory-driven, prior data driven or inductive. In this study the themes are developed inductively. More specifically, in this study, the interviews were transcribed, and the data was examined for emerging themes and patterns. The coding was inductive using

no theoretical framework to guide the coding. The codes are added to the transcript using different colours by the authors and the data under each sub-code were examined for common themes, as well as any instances of divergent views. Once the coding was complete, the codes were discussed, and the themes were developed inductively. The themes were labelled through discussions and the consensus reached.

The findings are structured according to the identified themes. In the presentation of the findings, quotes as well as examples from the interviews are added to mitigate researcher biases and to give participants a voice as recommended by Muggleton and Ruthven (2012).

## 4. Findings

Three themes emerged in the analysis of the data: (1) the digital library in or as part of the physical library, (2) the librarians trying to attract users using digital services, and (3) digital services providing unique opportunities and challenges to libraries.

### 4.1. *The digital library in or as part of the physical library*

The digital library services are of course a part of what the library offers, and one of the interviewees also refers to the aim of the library to define the aim of the digital library:

The library is here to facilitate that people can unfold their life's projects. [...] So that the people feel that they have free and equal access to knowledge and materials. And now the materials are just as much something you get on the internet. IP4

One of the interviewees even states that the library is a means to an end. Libraries are a means to create better communities and libraries aim to make an impact on people. The interviewee argues:

We need to define what we want to do and how we try to make changes to be able to succeed with changing peoples' lives. IP3

Consequently, the digital library is seen as an integral part of the library. The interviewees describe how the libraries balance the digital and physical services and how they try to merge them. Libraries try to provide inspiration for their users and consider the digital and physical services equivalent and, therefore, recommend physical materials using digital platforms and vice versa. The interviewees describe how the libraries are trying to argue that the library and its staff have unique and valuable services to offer. Offering a personal service of high quality is essential and there is less focus on the platform.

[We want] people to discover that there are digital resources available. The physical and the digital resources have the same weight. Maybe they can even be considered equal and not seen as two different types of materials. That is a change that takes place over many years. IP1

The digital library services can, in some cases, even be seen to replace the physical library services. One of the interviewees works in a music library and the interviewee argues that with music being available abundantly on various streaming services, the music library has to consider the *raison d'être* of the library:

Because music lending has declined drastically, we simply had to have a dialogue with our users about our *raison d'être*. How do we remain relevant beyond lending out notes and music? Services offered by subject-specific competent staff in the music department of the library are per definition digital services and more work is needed developing the digital services in the music department. IP4

The music library is, therefore, relevant to the users because of the services provided by the staff, and to reach these users they have to offer the services digitally.

In summary, the library typically offers physical and digital services and the librarians perceive them as a means to the same end. According to the librarians, the physical and digital services are valuable as a means to serve the communities. Some librarians aim to complement or replace physical services with digital alternatives, seeing them as equivalents.

## 4.2. Attracting users and use

The digital library services can be considered a means to both attract more users to the library and to increase the use of the library. The librarians wish to reach out to as many potential users as possible and consider the digital library services an opportunity to do exactly that. The digital platforms allow the libraries to reach users with specific interests and meet their needs, which allows for a more personal and specialized experience for the users.

Yes, well ... In so many words we try to get more users. But also, to provide inspiration for people so they know, well, okay, there's more information that you might be able to use here. There is also a digital aspect to consider as the physical library focuses on books, but we might have a database or something digitally which can supplement the information they must have. IP1

The digital library service can attract users not familiar with the physical library services. Wanting more users and increased use may not necessarily be achieved through traditional services, and the digital library services are not necessarily considered parallel to the physical library services. One of the interviewees even characterizes this as a more commercial approach to librarianship although it is emphasized that the digital services are not commercial and trustworthiness is essential for digital library services:

[T]he purpose is to sell, somehow. In the library world, you are always a little afraid of engaging with everything that is considered commercial, but that's really what we need to do. IP2

Well, we have to have some substance. We cannot use click-bates because we need to consider how this will affect our credibility. IP1

In summary, the digital library services can be used to attract new users. However, it is important to keep in mind that the library is not driven by commercial interests, and the trustworthiness of the library is important to preserve. The librarians, therefore, find it to balance their goal of serving their communities and adding value to users' lives with the perception of digital services as more commercial means.

### **4.3. Digital services providing unique opportunities and challenges to libraries**

Librarians consider very carefully how they use the digital services as a supplement to the physical services. They consider the content and target audience carefully but also how they present the material to their users and adapt it to the platform used. For example, one of the interviewees explains how they consider using more humor on social media and address their users more directly than in the physical library.

[O]n the website we are serious. Because the website is also connected to our app. You can say that SoMe is a slightly looser format, um, where you can go backstage and see what's going on with the librarian and stuff like that. [...] We can have some fun on SoMe with something like Black Friday and loan 9 books get the 10th for free, something like that. Library humour, you can get away with that, can't you. IP1

The digital services thus allow libraries to communicate more informally with the users. The interviewees emphasize the digital services being available without the need for assistance or being present at the library. Statistics are being used to identify popular content and the libraries evaluate their digital services and how they are being received by their target groups. Consequently, attracting interactions with their users is a high priority.

Our social media strategy builds on the statistics available to us. [...]. It is easy to find the usage statistics when working with social media and the website. IP2

Furthermore, the availability of the resources outside the library is also considered when planning or evaluating the digital services. Digital services can be made available to the users remotely enabling the users to use the resources from home:

Yes, we no longer provide access to digital resources that are only available at the library. This is something we insist on. IP5

There are also challenges associated with digital services. Not all libraries see sufficient usage of their digital resources, and one of the interviewees argues the librarians do not have the same experience with digital services compared to physical services.

The problem for me to see is that you can say that we have it so fundamentally that we are in reality really, really good at developing services around 10 percent of our collection, which is the physical. [...] But the 90% of our collection that is available online receives too little attention. IP5

The interviewee also describes how this work has received more attention over the years and this is increasingly important for the library to focus on.

In summary, librarians carefully consider the content, target audience and platform are considered carefully by the librarians. The librarians emphasize that the digital services are available without boundaries of place and time. They aim to reach as many users as possible without boundaries of place and time.

## 5. Discussion and conclusion

This study examines librarian perceptions of the value of digital public library services offered at their institution and how these services supplement or replace physical library services. The analysis reveals three themes. The findings suggest that librarians view digital services as a means to the same end as analog services, and they carefully consider the content, target audience and platform when offering services to their users. Librarians see digital services as a critical part of the *raison d'être* of the library and a means to attract new users. Existing literature reviews illustrate the many ways libraries have adapted to meet the needs of their patrons despite the growing challenges posed by COVID-19 restrictions and lockdown (Ayeeni, Agbaje, and Tippler, 2021; Nadi-Ravandi and Batooli, 2022; Ortega-Martínez et al., 2021). This study also finds that librarians are eager to adapt to user needs and develop new services.

A recent study on the perception public librarians regarding their professional role and the role of the library in supporting the public sphere shows that respondents from seven different countries support public libraries predominantly for the same reasons. Providing equal access to knowledge resources, literature and cultural experiences is the most important reason in six out of seven countries (Johnston et al., 2021). The study demonstrates that libraries serve as social, learning and creative spaces, both in the physical library and digitally. The interviewees in this study see the physical library and digital services as means to fulfill the purpose of library services. Librarians may, therefore, consider the resources equivalents; however, users may not necessarily see them as equivalents. The study by (Ruthven, Robinson, and McMenemy, 2022) shows that digital and physical library services are perceived differently by the users, indicating that digital services cannot necessarily replace physical services. Similarly, Dalmer, Sawchuk, and Ly (2022) found that some users prefer physical services and are not interested in digital replacements. The users value aspects of the library that are only available in the physical library (Hider et al., 2022).

The results of previous studies indicate that the transition from physical to digital services may impact the wellbeing of the library staff, although libraries in some countries are better prepared than others (Skare, 2021). Some librarians struggle with the transition (Tamaro, 2021) and the resumption of services also raised concerns (Stevenson, 2022). In this study, the interviewees focus very little on their own wellbeing which is also noted by (Garner

et al., 2022, 436): “The efforts made by library staff to maintain service provision, often at great personal cost to their own well-being, can be seen as an indicator of the valuable position they believe libraries play in the lives of their users.”

The librarians in this study emphasize that they need to build their competencies when designing and communicating digital services. Previous studies confirm that COVID-19 can be seen as a catalyst for the adaptation of libraries (Casselden, 2022; Dalmer, Sawchuk, and Ly, 2022) and librarians have found it to be an opportunity to develop new skills (Garner et al., 2022). In this study, the librarians recognize that they need to build new competencies to be able to serve their communities digitally.

The findings of this study have implications for the development of digital library services. The study reveals that there is little need to advocate the importance of digital services or online presence to librarians. Similarly, the importance of considering the users and target audience when developing digital library services does not need to be advocated either. However, librarians do not necessarily feel confident in developing and working with digital services. They may feel a lack of experience and training. Therefore, this study concludes by recommending that libraries provide more support to librarians in the development of digital services to enhance their confidence.

Through interviews, this study has explored how librarians perceive the value of digital public library services offered at their institution and how they supplement or replace physical library services. Three themes were identified in the analysis: (1) the digital library in or as part of the physical library, (2) the librarians trying to attract users using digital services, and (3) digital services providing unique opportunities and challenges to libraries. The findings demonstrate that librarians find both physical and digital services valuable as means to serve the communities and that they view them as equivalents. The digital services are not considered more or less valuable than physical services. Secondly, the study finds that digital library services can be used to attract new users. Librarians, therefore, find it difficult to serve their communities while also viewing these services as more commercially oriented. Finally, librarians carefully consider the content, target audience and platform, aiming to reach as many users as possible without the constraints of place and time.

## References

- Ameen, Kanwal. 2021. „COVID-19 Pandemic and Role of Libraries.” *Library Management* 42, no. 4-5: 302-304. <https://doi.org/10.1108/LM-01-2021-0008>.
- Audunson, Ragnar, Herbjørn Andresen, Cicilie Fagerlid, Erik Henningsen, Hans-Christoph Hobohm, Henrik Jochumsen, and Håkon Larsen. „1 Introduction – Physical Places and Virtual Spaces: Libraries, Archives and Museums in a Digital Age.” In *Libraries, Archives and Museums as Democratic Spaces in a Digital Age*, edited by Ragnar Audunson, Herbjørn Andresen, Cicilie Fagerlid, Erik Henningsen, Hans-Christoph Hobohm, Henrik Jochumsen, Håkon Larsen, and Tonje Vold, 1-22. Berlin, Boston: De Gruyter Saur, 2020. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110636628-001>.
- Audunson, Ragnar, Svanhild Aabø, Roger Blomgren, Hans-Christoph Hobohm, Henrik Jochumsen, Mahmood Khosrowjerdi, Rudolf Mumenthaler et al. 2019. „Public Libraries as Public Sphere Institutions: A comparative Study of Perceptions of the Public Library’s Role in Six European Countries.” *Journal of Documentation* 75, no. 6: 1396-1415. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JD-02-2019-0015>.
- Ayeni, Philips O., Blessed O. Agbaje, and Maria Tippler. 2021. “A Systematic Review of Library Services Provision in Response to COVID-19 Pandemic.” *Evidence Based Library and Information Practice* 16, no. 3: 67-104. <https://doi.org/10.18438/ebliip29902>.
- Bahr, Alice Harrison. 2000. „Library Buildings in a Digital Age, Why Bother?.” *College and Reserch Libraries News* 61, no. 7: 590-592. <https://doi.org/10.5860/crln.61.7.590>.
- Boyatzis, Richard. E. 1998. *Transforming Qualitative Information: Thematic Analysis and Code Development*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Brindley, Lynne. J. 2002. “The Future of Libraries and Humanities Research: New Strategic Directions for the British Library.” *Libraries & Culture* 37, no. 1: 26-36. <https://doi.org/10.1353/lac.2002.0001>.
- Calhoun, Karen. 2014. *Exploring Digital Libraries: Foundations, Practice, Prospects*. London, UK: Facet Publishing.
- Casselden, Biddy. „Not Like Riding a Bike: How Public Libraries Facilitate Older People’s Digital Inclusion During the Covid-19 Pandemic.” *Journal of Librarianship and Information Science* 0, no. 0. <https://doi.org/10.1177/09610006221101898>.
- Chow, Anthony, and Qianfei Tian. 2021. “Public Libraries Positively Impact Quality of Life: A Big Data Study.” *Public Library Quarterly* 40, no. 1: 1-32. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01616846.2019.1632105>.

- Ćirić, Jelena, and Aleksandar Ćirić. 2021. "The Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic on Digital Library Usage: A Public Library Case Study." *Journal of Web Librarianship* 15, no. 2: 53-68. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19322909.2021.1913465>.
- Dalmer, Nicole K, Dana Sawchuk, and Mina Ly. 2022. " 'I Felt There Was a Big Chunk Taken Out of My Life': COVID-19 and Older Adults' Library-Based Magazine Leisure Reading." *Leisure Studies* 42, no. 1: 1-15. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/02614367.2022.2148719>.
- Evjen, Sunniva, Terje Colbjørnsen, Idunn Bøyum, Kim Tallerås, and Heidi Kristin Olsen. 2021. „Samfunnsoppdrag under Press: Erfaringer Og Vurderinger I Norske Bibliotek under Covid-19." *Nordic Journal of Library and Information Studies* 2, no. 1: 17-37. <https://doi.org/10.7146/njlis.v2i1.125251>.
- Fowler, George J. 2016. *The Essence of the Library at a Public Research University as Seen Through Key Constituents' Lived Experiences*. [PhD dissertation]. Educational Foundations & Leadership, Old Dominion University, doi: 10.25777/97x2-x521. [https://digitalcommons.odu.edu/efl\\_etds/23](https://digitalcommons.odu.edu/efl_etds/23).
- Frandsen, Tove Faber, and Kristian Møhler Sørensen. 2020. „The Perceived Value of the Academic Library: A Systematic Review." *Information Research* 25, no. 4: 25(4). paper874. <https://doi.org/10.47989/irpaper874>.
- Garner, Jane, Philip Hider, Hamid R. Jamali, Jessie Lymn, Yazdan Mansourian, Holly Randell-Moon, and Simon Wakeling. 2021. „'Steady Ships' in the Covid-19 Crisis: Australian Public Library Responses to the Pandemic." *Journal of the Australian Library and Information Association* 70, no. 2: 102-124. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/24750158.2021.1901329>.
- Garner, Jane, Simon Wakeling, Philip Hider, Hamid R Jamali, Mary Anne Kennan, Yazdan Mansourian, and Holly Randell-Moon. 2022. „The Lived Experience of Australian Public Library Staff During the Covid-19 Library Closures." *Library Management* 43, no. 6/7: 427-438. <https://doi.org/10.1108/LM-04-2022-0028>.
- Gentles, Stephen J, Cathy Charles, Jenny Ploeg, and K Ann McKibbin. 2015. „Sampling in Qualitative Research: Insights from an Overview of the Methods Literature." *The qualitative report* 20, no. 11: 1772-1789. <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2015.2373>.
- Goulding, Anne. 2009. „Engaging with Community Engagement: Public Libraries and Citizen Involvement." *New Library World* 110, no. 1/2: 37-51. Doi:10.1108/03074800910928577.
- Hider, Philip, Jane Garner, Simon Wakeling, and Hamid R Jamali. 2023. „ 'Part of My Daily Life': The Importance of Public Libraries as Physical Spaces." *Public Library Quarterly* 42, no. 2: 190-219. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01616846.2022.2092347>.

- Haasio, Ari, and Elisa Kannasto. 2020. "Covid-19 and its Impact on Finnish Public Libraries." *Qualitative and Quantitative Methods in Libraries* 9: 3-19. <https://www.qqml-journal.net/index.php/qqml/article/view/639/576>.
- Jæger, Mads Meier, and Ea Hoppe Blaabæk. 2020. "Inequality in Learning Opportunities during Covid-19: Evidence from Library Takeout." *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility* 68, Article 100524: 1-5. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rssm.2020.100524>.
- Garner, Jane, Simon Wakeling, Philip Hider, Yazdan Mansourian, Holly Randell-Moon, and Jessie Lymn. 2021. „The Response of Public Libraries in Australia to the Covid-19 Pandemic.” In *Proceedings of the 4<sup>th</sup> I-LISS International Conference – IIC 2021*, edited by Dong-Geun Oh, B. Ramesh Babu, S. K. Asok Kumar, P. Rajendran, A. Bagavathi, and P. J. Y. Joesingh, 21-23. Chennai, Kattankulathur: International Library and Information Science Society, Office Central Library, SRM Institute of Science and Technology. <http://www.chefile.cmru.ac.th/faculty/2564/human/SAR2/KPI2.3/2.3-1-22.pdf>.
- Johnston, Jamie, Ágústa Pálsdóttir, Anna Mierzecka, Ragnar Andreas Audunson, Hans-Christoph Hobohm, Kerstin Rydbeck, Máté Tóth., Rasmussen, Casper. H., Jochumsen, Henrik, and Mahmood Khosrowjerdi, Sunniva Evjen. 2021. "Public Librarians' Perception of their Professional Role and the Library's Role in Supporting the Public Sphere: A Multi-Country Comparison." *Journal of Documentation* 78, no. 5: 1109-1130. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1108/JD-09-2021-0178>.
- Kallio, Hanna, Anna-Maija Pietilä, Martin Johnson, and Mari Kangasniemi. 2016. "Systematic Methodological Review: Developing a Framework for a Qualitative Semi-Structured Interview Guide." *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 72, no. 12: 2954-2965. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jan.13031>.
- Kehinde, Adetola. „Digital Libraries and the Role of Digital Librarians.” In *Research Anthology on Collaboration, Digital Services, and Resource Management for the Sustainability of Libraries*, edited by Information Resources Management Association, 17-38. Hershey, PA: IGI Global, 2021. <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-7998-8051-6.ch002>.
- Kohlburn, Joe, Jenny Bossaller, Hyerim Cho, Heather Moulaison-Sandy, and Denice Adkins. 2023. „Public Libraries and Covid-19: Perceptions and Politics in the United States.” *The Library Quarterly* 93, no. 1: 7-25. <https://doi.org/DOI:10.1086/722547>.
- Kou, Yin, Ping Chen, and Jie-Xing Pan. 2021. "The Service Experiences of Public Libraries during the COVID-19 Emergency in Wuhan: Three Case Studies." *Journal of the Australian Library and Information Association* 70, no. 3: 287-300. <https://doi.org/10.1080/24750158.2021.1960251>.
- Leguina, Adrian, Sabina Mihelj, and John Downey. 2021. "Public libraries as reserves of cultural and digital capital: Addressing inequality through digitalization." *Library & Information Science Research* 43, no. 3, Article 101103. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lisr.2021.101103>.

- Leorke, Dale, Danielle Wyatt, and Scott McQuire. 2018. " 'More than Just a Library' ": Public Libraries in the 'Smart City.'" *City, culture and society* 15: 37-44. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ccs.2018.05.002>.
- Mandel, Lauren. H. 2021. "Library Adoption and Use of GIS as an Information Sharing Tool during the Covid-19 Pandemic." *Journal of Map & Geography Libraries* 17, no. 1: 24-38. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/15420353.2022.2047134>.
- Mathiasson, Mia H., and Henrik Jochumsen. 2020. Between Collections and Connections: Analyzing Public Library Programs in Terms of Format, Content, and Role and Function." *The Library Quarterly* 90, no. 3: 364-379. <https://doi.org/10.1086/708963>.
- McMenemy, David, Elaine Robinson, and Ian Ruthven. 2023. "The Impact of COVID-19 Lockdowns on Public Libraries in the UK: Findings from a National Study." *Public Library Quarterly* 42, no. 1: 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01616846.2022.2058860>.
- Mehta, Dipti, and Xiaocan Wang. 2020. "COVID-19 and Digital Library Services – a Case Study of a University's Library." *Digital Library Perspectives* 36, no. 4: 352-363. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1108/DLP-05-2020-0030>.
- Mestre, Juliana. 2022. "Derrida and Digital Libraries: Exploring the (Im)Possibility of Virtual Hospitality." In *Proceedings of CoLIS, the 11th International Conference on Conceptions of Library and Information Science, Oslo, Norway, May 29 - June 1, 2022. Information Research* 27 (Special issue), paper colis2204. Retrieved from: <http://InformationR.net/ir/27-SplIssue/CoLIS2022/colis2204.html>, <https://doi.org/10.47989/colis2204>
- Mickiewicz, Paulina. 2015. "Access and Its Limits." *Space and Culture* 19, no. 3: 237-250. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1206331215596478>.
- Muggleton, Thomas. H., and Ian Ruthven. 2012. "Homelessness and Access to the Informational Mainstream." *Journal of Documentation*. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1108/00220411211209203>.
- Nadi-Ravandi, Somayyeh, and Zahra Batooli. 2022. "Libraries Respond to the COVID-19 Pandemic: Drawing a Science Map of Published Articles." *Library Hi Tech* 41, no. 1: 42-58. <https://doi.org/10.1108/LHT-04-2022-0209>.
- Hedvall, Karen Nowé, Malin Ögland, and Jenny Lindberg. 2022. "Digital First: Challenges for Public and Regional Libraries in Sweden." In *Proceedings of CoLIS, the 11th International Conference on Conceptions of Library and Information Science, Oslo, Norway, May 29 - June 1, 2022. Information Research* 27 (Special issue), paper colis2221. Retrieved from <http://InformationR.net/ir/27-SplIssue/CoLIS2022/colis2221.html>, <https://doi.org/10.47989/colis2221>.

- Ortega-Martínez, Eugenia de los Ángeles, Josmel Pacheco-Mendoza, Héctor Eduardo García Meléndez, Erik Miguel Ortiz-Díaz, and César Saavedra-Alamillas. 2021. „Digital Services Adapted by Libraries in Mexico to Covid-19 Pandemic: A Critical Review.” *Digital Library Perspectives* 37, no. 1: 3-17. . <https://doi.org/10.1108/DLP-07-2020-0063>.
- Otonicar, Selma Leticia Capinzaiki, Rafaela Carolina da Silva, and Elder Lopes Barboza. 2018. „The Contributions of Information and Media Literacy to Public Hybrid Libraries.” *The Library Quarterly* 88, no. 3: 225-236. <https://doi.org/10.1086/697703>.
- Palfrey, John. 2015. *BiblioTech: Why Libraries Matter More Than Ever in the Age of Google*. New York: Basic Books.
- Palumbo, Rocco. 2022. “Thriving in the Post-Covid-19 Era: A New Normality for Libraries’ Service Offering.” *Library Management* 43, no. 8-9: 536-562. <https://doi.org/10.1108/LM-05-2022-0051>.
- Rafiq, Muhammad, Syeda Hina Batool, Amna Farzand Ali, and Midrar Ullah. 2021. “University Libraries Response to COVID-19 Pandemic: A Developing Country Perspective.” *The Journal of Academic Librarianship* 47, no. 1: 1-10. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.acalib.2020.102280>.
- Reid, Peter H, and Lyndsay Mesjar. 2022. “ ‘Bloody Amazing Really’: Voices from Scotland’s Public Libraries in Lockdown.” *Journal of Documentation* 79, no. 2: 301-319. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JD-03-2022-0067>.
- Ruthven, Ian, Elaine Robinson, and David McMenemy. 2022. “The Value of Digital and Physical Library Services in UK Public Libraries and Why They are not Interchangeable.” *Journal of Librarianship and Information Science*, Online first. <https://doi.org/10.1177/09610006221127027>.
- Skare, Roswitha. 2021. “Public Libraries in Norway and the Covid-19 Pandemic.” In *Proceedings from the Document Academy* 8, no. 2, Article 2: 1-7. <https://doi.org/10.35492/docam/8/2/2>.
- Stachokas, George. 2014. *After the Book: Information Services for the 21st Century*. Oxford: Elsevier.
- Stenstrom, Cheryl, Natalie Cole, and Rachel Hanson. 2019. “A Review Exploring the Facets of the Value of Public Libraries.” *Library Management* 40, no. 6/7: 354-367. <https://doi.org/10.1108/lm-08-2018-0068>.
- Stevenson, Siobhan. 2022. “Learning from COVID-19: Revisiting Organizational Communications from the Bottom-Up.” *Public Library Quarterly* 41, no. 4: 365-380. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01616846.2021.1906616>.

- Sørensen, Kristian. M. 2020. "The Values of Public Libraries: A Systematic Review of Empirical Studies of Stakeholder Perceptions." *Journal of Documentation* 76, no. 4: 909-927. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JD-10-2019-0201>.
- Sørensen, Kristian. M. 2021. "Where's the Value? The Worth of Public Libraries: A Systematic Review of Findings, Methods and Research Gaps." *Library & Information Science Research* 43, no. 1: 101067. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lisr.2020.101067>.
- Tammaro, Anna. M. 2021. "The New Normal: Public Libraries in Italy Post Covid-19." *International Information & Library Review* 53, no. 1: 63-68. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10572317.2021.1869452>.
- Wakeling, Simon, Jane Garner, Philip Hider, Hamid Jamali, Jessie Lymn, Yazdan Mansourian, and Holly Randell-Moon. 2022. " 'The Challenge Now is for us to Remain Relevant' ": Australian Public Libraries and the COVID-19 Crisis." *IFLA Journal* 48, no. 1: 138-154. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1177/03400352211054115>.
- Wilkinson, Jaci, and Kyle Breneman. 2020. „Bridging the Digital and the Physical User Experience: Analysis of Academic Library Floor Plans." *Journal of Web Librarianship* 14, no. 1/2: 28-51. <https://doi.org/10.1177/03400352211054115>.

## Sažetak

### **Kako narodne knjižnice donose vrijednost *online*: percepcija knjižničara**

**Cilj.** Razvoj i korištenje digitalnih usluga knjižnica ubrzali su se. Mnoge su knjižnice proširile svoje digitalne usluge kao odgovor na pandemiju bolesti COVID-19. Fizičke su lokacije zatvorene ili su radile sa smanjenim kapacitetom, no knjižnice su nastavile pružati usluge digitalno. Kada su fizičke lokacije ponovno otvorene, razvoj se digitalnih usluga u mnogim knjižnicama nastavio. Većina knjižnica nudi širok izbor digitalnih usluga i mnoge knjižnice proširuju postojeće digitalne usluge. Stoga je važno istražiti kako knjižničari vide digitalne usluge narodnih knjižnica koje se nude u njihovim ustanovama te kako digitalne usluge nadopunjuju ili zamjenjuju usluge u fizičkoj knjižnici.

**Pristup/metodologija/dizajn.** U ovome radu predstavljaju se rezultati istraživanja temeljenog na intervjuu s pet knjižničara iz različitih narodnih knjižnica diljem Danske.

**Rezultati.** Rezultati istraživanja ukazuju na to da knjižničari doživljavaju fizičke i digitalne usluge kao sredstva postizanja istog cilja, dok pažljivo razmatraju sadržaj, ciljanu publiku i platformu kada nude usluge svojim korisnicima. Digitalne usluge vide kao ključni aspekt *raison d'être* knjižnice i kao sredstva za privlačenje novih korisnika.

**Ograničenja istraživanja.** Važno je napomenuti da se ovo istraživanje temelji na malom uzorku.

**Praktična primjena.** Razmatraju se implikacije digitalnih usluga narodnih knjižnica te se na temelju rezultata istraživanja donose preporuke.

**Originalnost/vrijednost.** Iako su se mnoga istraživanja bavila percepcijom knjižničara o vrijednosti narodnih knjižnica, ova se studija usredotočuje na percepciju knjižničara o vrijednosti digitalnih knjižnica i na to kako te usluge nadopunjuju ili zamjenjuju fizičku knjižnicu.

**KEYWORDS:** COVID-19, Danska, digitalne usluge, narodne knjižnice, vrijednost narodnih knjižnica