

REVIEWS AND INFORMATION ON PUBLICATIONS — RECENZIJE I OBAVIJESTI O IZDANJIMA

Caryl CLARK, Editor. *The Cambridge Companion to Haydn.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

In 2005, Cambridge University Press enlarged its »Composer Companion« series by adding volumes on Elgar, Liszt and Haydn. It is surprising it took so long for Haydn to make his appearance, for he is one of the most central figures in the long history of European music. Nevertheless, the wait was well worth it; this is an excellent book, and, in many ways, a surprising one.

Let us begin with the surprise. The seventeenth (and final) chapter doesn't deal with the music, *per se*, but rather with the conditions under which we now tend to meet it. It is titled, »Recorded performances: a symphonic study,« and in it Melanie Lowe makes clear how far our current listening experience is from that of Haydn's audience. Prior to the 1950s, recording sessions generally aimed at creating »takes« of at least four or five continuous minutes of music. Thus the aesthetic of live performance was largely still in force. Since then, with the introduction first of magnetic tape, and, more recently, of digital technology, substantial editing is taken for granted. »The lack of an audience and the reliance on editing,« Lowe explains, »relieves performers from ever having to execute a complete performance.... The result, then, is not a performance of a piece of music but the rendering of a musical text.« [260-261]

The result tends to distort Haydn. As this volume makes clear, Haydn never lost sight of the fact that a score—a »musical text«—is only a stepping-stone towards a living (and moving) performance. One can imagine the composer applauding Adam Fischer, who is quoted by Lowe: »A boring performance remains a crime, even if it is historically 'correct.'« An edited, »note perfect« recording is likely to warrant equally the charge of criminality; for if »textual« correctness is achieved at the cost of emotional urgency, and continuity of aesthetic impulsion, we may have an engineer's dream, but an honest musician's nightmare. And Haydn was an honest musician.

Chapter fifteen, by Tom Beghin, deals centrally with the issue of performance: specifically, as to the keyboard sonatas. The surprise again is one of editorial philosophy: to her credit, Caryl Clark gives Beghin full reign to address the subject in »first-person«—and to do so not only from his own perspective, but also from Haydn's. These »imagined narratives« set the stage for an adventurous coordination of what are usually taken as very separate realms of musicological investigation. Beghin looks first at various »oratorical« concepts implicit within 18th-century music; goes on to consider how the identity of Haydn's dedicatees helps to explain the design of the sonatas; and finally considers organology: the nature of the keyboard instruments known to Haydn.

Beghin focuses on the music Haydn wrote in England in the 1790s, and also on the six sonatas (Hob. XVI: 21-26) which he prepared for publication, as a set, in 1774—the first publication of keyboard music Haydn personally supervised. It was, moreover, a publication done by the imperial printer Joseph Edler von Kurzböck. By considering the psychological weight of these circumstances (and Haydn dedicated the set to Esterházy), Beghin makes a persuasive case that »Haydn felt his reputation was at stake,« with these sonatas, »not just as a composer, but as a musical orator« [209]. Thus he took great pains to notate them in a way that would reflect his own skills in spontaneous improvisation and ornamentation—and in the process left us documents which provide unusually vivid insight into his performance practice.

A word now about the design of the book: after a short »Chronology,« seventeen independent essays follow, gathered into four large units. First, »Haydn in Context«—with contributions from Elaine Sisman, Rebecca Green, James Webster and David Wyn Jones. The next unit, »Stylistic and Interpretive Contexts,« has chapters by Scott Burnham and Matthew Head. Burnham deals with »Haydn and humor,« and Head with »Haydn's exoticisms.« Head, incidentally, is laudably free of the tendency many recent musicologists have to make it seem as if awareness of the »exotic« must inevitably result in a contemptuous exploitation of it. To the contrary, we learn, Haydn essentially respected the »folk material« he worked with, and honestly identified with it. He used Ottoman themes not to bolster a sense of European superiority, but rather as a means of making a »masked critique« of European aristocracy at a time when a direct critical assault might be dangerous. Haydn's 1775 opera, *L'incontro improvviso*, is an example—as is, twenty years later, and in a different genre, his 1795 »Gypsy« Rondo. Here, the author asserts, Haydn »elevates the primitive on the basis of its immediacy, »manly« force, expressive intensity, and«—(let us note)—»rejection of courtly decorum.« [90]

»Genres«—the third unit—has essays by David Schroeder, Mary Hunter, Michelle Fillion, James Dack, James Webster, Katalin Komlós, and Caryl Clark who assigns herself the task of writing about Haydn as operatic composer. The chapter is excellent. Haydn wrote over two dozen works for the theater; yet this aspect of his art remains largely *terra incognita*. Remembering that large-scale vocal music,

whether sacred or secular, was seen in the 18th-century as the most significant form of music, it follows that we can possess only a distorted view of the composer if his operas remain unknown to us.

Finally, there is »Part IV: Performance and Reception,« two chapters of which have already been considered. The remaining chapters are by Lawrence Kramer and James Garrett. Garrett looks at the complex picture the 19th-century had of Haydn; for he was imagined by that century as both »father figure« and naïve, »merry peasant«—at once old and young. Kramer's chapter is titled, »The kitten and the tiger: Tovey's Haydn,« and also looks at Haydn in terms of opposites. Kramer considers how Kantian notions of genius were reflected in Tovey's view of Haydn. For Kant, the mark of genius was freedom. Tovey saw this freedom in Haydn, and emphasized it. Still, as Kramer indicates, Tovey was too wise a musician to bifurcate aesthetics—and realized that Haydn was equally an advocate of order. No freedom without order; no true order without freedom.

This—the coming together of opposites in Haydn—is something I dealt with at length in the article I wrote for one of the last issues of the *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* (2004-35/2). In it I attempted to show how, as Tovey wrote about Haydn, he presaged, in some important regards, Eli Siegel's great understanding of what is universal in world aesthetics. »All beauty,« Siegel explained, »is a making one of opposites, and the making one of opposites is what we are going after in ourselves.«

Kramer, too, it appears is deeply affected by the co-presence of opposites in Haydn. He writes eloquently at the end of his chapter: »Tovey's Haydn is no mere rulebreaker; no maker of law, he is no mere outlaw. He is, rather, what the majority of artist-heroes since the eighteenth century were deemed unable to be, some by themselves, some by others. This Haydn is a figure not bound by social constraint yet neither outside the social fabric nor hostile to it. He challenges the pieties of the order without fomenting disorder. The kitten is the father of the Tyger. Tovey's Haydn is the creative genius as model citizen.« [248]

As I am indicating, this book offers many rewards. For example, Elaine Sisman asks a seemingly simple question—»For whom did Haydn write?«—and shows, in her chapter, how rich the true answer to it must be. She also reminds us of a core belief in the composer: that music should be written so that it »remains in the heart when one has listened to it.« [264] Rebecca Green's chapter explores the »environments« Haydn worked in during his employment by the Esterházy family—showing just how different Vienna, Eisenstadt, and Esterháza were. James Webster's chapter is on »Haydn's aesthetics,« and, like Sisman, he emphasizes the importance to Haydn of »mov[ing] the heart in a manifold way.« [31] Webster, moreover, implies that opposites are the reason why Haydn is, in fact, so heart-moving—for his music is a dramatic relation of stability and instability, earnestness and humor.

David Wyn Jones's chapter places Haydn as »First among equals,« and studies his relations with his contemporaries, including, most centrally, Mozart.

Burnham, as indicated earlier, takes humor as his topic, and sheds wonderful, technical light on the way in which Haydn achieves that humor—including by making what first seems irrelevant, later convince us of its structural necessity. From flip-pant »toss-away« to structural pillar!

David Schroeder's essay continues the evidence that Haydn has affected people these nearly two-and-a-half centuries precisely because he found a way to reconcile opposites. His chapter ends with a brief analysis of *Symphony # 103* in which he shows how the composer derived its »cheerful« music from an earlier passage of »funereal character.« This music, Schroeder writes, embodies »an extraordinarily sophisticated fusion of opposites, allowing them to coexist.....reinforcing the notion of tolerance.« Why tolerance? Because, the essayist implies, this state of mind was for Haydn, as it was earlier for Shaftsbury, the most critical value in life. »With these late symphonies,« Schroeder writes, »Haydn reaches not only the highest possible achievement of musical mastery, but he also set the standard for music addressing social and spiritual issues at the deepest possible level.« [111]

Five chapters remain, and regrettably, must be written of swiftly. Mary Hunter discusses the string quartets, and draws valuable attention to issues of performativity—including what might be called Haydn's »composed playfulness.« Michelle Fillion shows how the keyboard was, for Haydn, a meeting ground for private improvisation and public statement. James Dack writes on the sacred music—solidly enough, but, at least in the estimate of this reviewer, without bringing large new insight to the music.

This is not the case with James Webster's essay on the late oratorios; in his chapter he argues, persuasively, that *The Creation* and *The Seasons* are far more similar than different. In fact, while one is »sublime,« and the other »pastoral,« they seem to have been made to be tonally complementary, and, in effect, to explain each other.

Finally, there is Katalin Komlós' chapter on the »Miscellaneous vocal genres.« If her lavish praise of his late part-songs, Hob. XXVc: 1-9 and XXVb: 1-4, is not entirely convincing,—that they »represent the highest craftsmanship of Haydn's late style,«—she does give more than adequate evidence that these works merit rescue from the near oblivion into which they have fallen. Moreover, she suggests importantly that Haydn meant his various solo song cycles to be performed with the songs taken in the order in which they appear in the publication. This has clear implications for our understanding of the evolution of Lied and the Romantic song-cycle. Haydn may be closer to Schubert than has been realized.

All in all, this is a fine anthology: a natural place to begin if one wishes, eventually, to gain a comprehensive view of one of the greatest masters the art of music has yet seen. Every now and then the contributors to this volume »let loose,« and show their enthusiasm for the man and his music. In my view, that enthusiasm is utterly right, and utterly in keeping with true scholarship—the sine qua non of which is accuracy.

There is such a thing as accurate emotion, and to be »reserved« in the presence of great music is anything but that! Haydn is great, and he deserves a great emotional response. It is, in my view, simple accuracy. It's also emotional wisdom.

Edward GREEN
New York
egmusic@rcn.com

Edward Green is a professor at Manhattan School of Music since 1984, where he has taught courses in the humanities, musical composition, and music history.

Liz GARNETT, *The British Barbershopper. A Study in Socio-Musical Values.* Aldershot — Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2005, ISBN 0 7546 3559 7.

»During the last two decades of the twentieth century«, as Derek B. Scott states in the preface, an upheaval that occurred in musicology »has created a new urgency for the study of popular music alongside the development of new critical and theoretical models« (xi). Ashgate responded this challenge with an excellent Ashgate Popular and Folk Music Series, which aims to present the best research in the »vital and exciting« field of popular musicology. Designed to embrace »the world's popular musics from Acid Jazz to Zydeco, whether high tech or low tech, commercial or non-commercial, contemporary or traditional«, as well as, I might add, those popular musics which exist somewhere between the imaginary poles of these binary oppositions, this series has so far offered a number of interesting studies of various aspects of the constantly growing field usually called popular music. If we take into consideration the fact that the editors of the series are open to the areas of analysis, business, censorship, criticism and theory, education, film music, genre studies, the Internet, performers and performance, perception and psychology, politics, radio and television, gender and sexuality, studio production and technology (as is stated on the series' web site), we can only impatiently await the future topics that will fill the series editor's imaginary space between acid jazz and zydeco. At the very beginning of this alphabetical journey through popular musics comes a book by the British musicologist Liz Garnett entitled *The British Barbershopper. A Study in Socio-Musical Values*.

The book, which is a result of the author's years-long research, develops through nine chapters — (1) *Introduction: Barbershop singing in the UK*; (2) *Ethics and aesthetics: The social theory of barbershop harmony* (previously published in the journal *Popular Music*); (3) *The procedures of preservation: Barbershop singing and the invention of tradition*; (4) *Ridicule, religion, and the public image of barbershop*; (5) *Separate*

but equal? Sexual politics in the barbershop (previously published in *Women and Music: A Journal of Gender and Culture*); (6) *Performance mannerism and the amateur imagination*; (7) *Tag-singing: The private face of barbershop*; (8) *To 'be' a barbershopper: Theorizing music and self-identity*; (9) *Conclusion: Beyond barbershop* — in which, which is obvious from the titles alone, the author offers multi-layered analyses, readings and interpretations of various aspects of British barbershop. The central textual part is supplemented by six figures, fourteen music examples, a very useful glossary with brief explanations of the terms which are an integral part of the barbershop vocabulary, as well as a bibliography (articles in lay periodicals and unpublished sources other than dissertations are listed only in the notes, not the bibliography) and an index.

A closer reading of the bibliography alone reveals several challenges that the author has faced during the research and writing of the book. The bibliography actually contains a relatively small number of bibliographical entries closely connected with the barbershop phenomenon, while those on barbershop in Britain are even fewer. »The little scholarly attention the genre has received«, explains Garnett, »focuses almost entirely on practices in the USA and Canada, while the plentiful articles written by barbershoppers about their activity and its meanings are almost exclusively addressed to each other, to sustain the community rather than integrate it into wider musical life« (1-2). Garnett skilfully compensates for the lack of secondary sources with the abundance of primary sources — documentary, and live interaction (including participant observation as well as formal or semi-formal interviews) alongside electronic — thus also indicating that electronic media are becoming an almost obligatory part of contemporary research, which give the researcher the possibility of insight into the discursive network which is being created without their direct interference — acting »either as media for publication, and thus a form of documentary source, or media for communication, and thus a form of interaction« (8).

Although under-documented and largely hidden from musicological view, barbershop singing in Britain has developed »into an active and highly organized musical community characterized by strong social support structures and a proselytizing passion for its particular style« (1). This community, consisting of around 4000 people actively involved in around 120 choruses, precisely because of its self-enclosure, provides Garnett with »an excellent case study in the relationships between music, social values and self-identity, since it allows the pursuit of potentially very broad questions within a self-limiting field of enquiry« (2).

What are, then, the perspectives from which the author sheds light upon the subject of her research? Here I will use a somewhat longer excerpt from Richard Morrison's review of a barbershop show published in *The Times*, quoted by the author in the chapter *Ridicule, religion, and the public image of barbershop*, and which, it seems, raises most of the questions that Garnett deals with in deeper and more complex analyses in her study: »Barbershop singing on a massive scale — choruses of 60 voices or more — is a growing phenomenon in Britain, and a truly awesome

spectacle when encountered in bulk, as at the Barbican on Saturday. To see a commando force of perfectly drilled suburban ladies, of many shapes and ages, thundering out a country-and-western dance in glittering red waistcoats and Stetson hats while delivering some maudlin lyrics in saccharine close harmony ... well, this is clearly not everyone's idea of a great night out. And it is true that barbershop choruses have strange mannerisms: the odd way of gabbling as fast as possible through almost every phrase, for instance, only to drool over the lusciously chromatic cadences at the end; or the corny repertoire of body movements that are larded onto every song. Barbershop is like no other singing: a self-contained world with its own hard-fought contests, codes of dress and conduct, repertoire and stars.« (69)

Although written by an observer (not a participant observer) this derisory text points to almost all aspects of barbershop which fundamentally change depending on the interpreter. For barbershoppers these are essential parts of their identities, musical expressions and symbols of the genre's value that they are trying to preserve by their music-making. For non-barbershoppers these are precisely the elements which for both their incomprehensibility and their peculiarity become a subject of ridicule or of something which may be in some way threatening. All these aspects of barbershop — ethics and aesthetics, ridicule and public image, gender issues, performance mannerisms, rituals as well as processes of organizational structure forming and style definition transformations — Garnett questions in some chapters, basing her analysis on the theoretical frameworks and works of distinguished scholars such as Eric Hobsbawm (in the chapter *The procedures of preservation: Barbershop singing and the invention of tradition*), Ernst Troeltsch (in the chapter *Ridicule, religion, and the public image of barbershop*), Judith Butler and Anthony Giddens (in the chapter *To 'be' a barbershopper: Theorizing music and self-identity*), to mention only a few.

It should be mentioned that some of the most intriguing chapters of this study — such as *Ridicule, religion, and the public image of barbershop*; *Performance mannerism and the amateur imagination*; *Tag-singing: The private face of barbershop* and *To 'be' a barbershopper: Theorizing music and self-identity* — reveal the domains »invisible« to observers like Morrison, and thanks to Liz Garnett's thick descriptions, theoretical foundation and scientific insight give a brand new perspective on the musical and social world of the British barbershopper.

In spite of some shortcomings — such as, for instance, a slightly too easy dismissal of the issue of race imagination of British barbershop (because, despite the authors arguments, I remain haunted by the question raised by Gage Averill in the study *Four Parts, No Waiting. A Social History of American Barbershop Harmony* — »how can barbershoppers preserve the old songs and not preserve the old racism?«), or the somewhat unusual remark that »'Georgia on my Mind' remains a place to women, while for men it may be more directly an object of desire« (93) in the otherwise excellent chapter on sexual politics in barbershop — Liz Garnett's book is a very valuable study which, I am certain, will contribute to the study of other musics.

»The purpose of this book«, says Garnett, »is twofold: to document and analyse the social and musical practices of this specific community of music-makers, and thence use this analysis to theorize the relationship between music and self-identity. (...) It aims, that is, not only to ask what a musicological knowledge base can help us know about barbershop, but also what the study of barbershop can contribute to how we do musicology« (2). In this sense the closing chapter *Beyond barbershop* is extremely illuminating. By drawing attention to issues such as text and act, the relationship between intra- and extra-musical discourses, social identity and musical style, and discursive positioning and the act of writing, Garnett not only summarizes the key issues raised by this study in the context of the British barbershop, but also questions, certainly not by accident at the very end of the book, her own position, that is, more generally, the researcher's position. By addressing the problem of discursive positioning, etic and/or emic, »us« and/or »them«, doing (ethno)musicology »abroad« and/or »at home«, being a »participant« and/or an »observer« and in the end being a »barbershopper« and/or a »musicologist«, the author discloses her own solution of the positioning between the poles of these binary oppositions. To what extent her position is ideal, it remains to the readers to judge.

»Barbershop has an image problem«, states the author at the beginning of the chapter *Ridicule, religion, and the public image of barbershop*. Liz Garnett's *The British Barbershopper. A Study in Socio-Musical Values* has undoubtedly made a significant step forward towards the solution of this problem.

Mojca PIŠKOR
Zagreb
mojca@ief.hr

Mojca Piškori (mojca@ief.hr) is a research assistant at the Institute for Ethnology and Folkloristics (Institut za etnologiju i folkloristiku) in Zagreb, Croatia.